# A peer-reviewed version of this preprint was published in PeerJ on 18 October 2016.

<u>View the peer-reviewed version</u> (peerj.com/articles/2584), which is the preferred citable publication unless you specifically need to cite this preprint.

Rognes T, Flouri T, Nichols B, Quince C, Mahé F. 2016. VSEARCH: a versatile open source tool for metagenomics. PeerJ 4:e2584 <u>https://doi.org/10.7717/peerj.2584</u>

# VSEARCH: a versatile open source tool for metagenomics

- 3
- 4 **Short title:**
- 5 VSEARCH: a versatile metagenomics tool
- 6
- 7 Torbjørn Rognes<sup>1,2,\*</sup>, Tomáš Flouri<sup>3,4</sup>, Ben Nichols<sup>5</sup>, Christopher Quince<sup>5,6</sup>, Frédéric Mahé<sup>7,8</sup>
- 8
- 9 <sup>1</sup> Department of Informatics, University of Oslo, Oslo, Norway
- 10 <sup>2</sup> Department of Microbiology, Oslo University Hospital, Rikshospitalet, Oslo, Norway
- <sup>3</sup> Heidelberg Institute for Theoretical Studies (HITS), Heidelberg, Germany
- <sup>4</sup> Karlsruhe Institute of Technology, Institute for Theoretical Informatics, Karlsruhe, Germany
- <sup>5</sup> School of Engineering, University of Glasgow, Glasgow, UK
- <sup>6</sup> Warwick Medical School, University of Warwick, Coventry, UK
- <sup>7</sup> Department of Ecology, University of Kaiserslautern, Germany
- 16 <sup>8</sup> CIRAD, UMR LSTM, Montpellier, France
- 17

18 \* Corresponding author. Address: Department of Informatics, University of Oslo, PO Box 1080

- 19 Blindern, NO-0316 Oslo, Norway.
- 20

# 21 Email addresses:

- 22 torognes@ifi.uio.no
- 23 tomas.flouri@h-its.org
- 24 b.nichols.1@research.gla.ac.uk
- 25 c.quince@warwick.ac.uk
- 26 frederic.mahe@cirad.fr

# 27 Abstract

28

29 **Background.** VSEARCH is an open source and free of charge multithreaded 64-bit tool for

30 processing metagenomics nucleotide sequence data. It is designed as an alternative to the widely

- 31 used USEARCH tool (Edgar 2010) for which the source code is not publicly available, algorithm
- 32 details are only rudimentarily described, and only a memory-confined 32-bit version is freely
- 33 available for academic use.
- 34
- 35 Methods. When searching nucleotide sequences, VSEARCH uses a fast heuristic based on
- 36 words shared by the query and target sequences in order to quickly identify similar sequences, a
- 37 similar strategy is probably used in USEARCH. VSEARCH then performs optimal global
- 38 sequence alignment of the query against potential target sequences, using full dynamic
- 39 programming instead of the seed-and-extend heuristic used by USEARCH. Pairwise alignments
- 40 are computed in parallel using vectorisation and multiple threads.
- 41

42 **Results.** VSEARCH includes most commands for analysing nucleotide sequences available in

- 43 USEARCH version 7 and several of those available in USEARCH version 8, including searching
- 44 (exact or based on global alignment), clustering by similarity (using length pre-sorting,
- 45 abundance pre-sorting or a user-defined order), chimera detection (reference-based or *de novo*),
- 46 dereplication (full length or prefix), pairwise alignment, reverse complementation, sorting, and
- 47 subsampling. VSEARCH also includes commands for FASTQ file processing, i.e. format
- 48 detection, filtering, read quality statistics, and merging of paired reads. Furthermore, VSEARCH
- 49 extends functionality with several new commands and improvements, including shuffling,
- 50 rereplication, masking of low-complexity sequences with the well-known DUST algorithm, a
- 51 choice among different similarity definitions, and FASTQ file format conversion. VSEARCH is
- 52 here shown to be more accurate than USEARCH when performing searching, clustering, chimera
- 53 detection and subsampling, while on a par with USEARCH for paired-ends read merging.
- 54 VSEARCH is slower than USEARCH when performing clustering and chimera detection, but
- significantly faster when performing paired-end reads merging and dereplication. VSEARCH is
- 56 available at https://github.com/torognes/vsearch under either the BSD 2-clause license or the
- 57 GNU General Public License version 3.0.
- 58
- 59 **Discussion.** VSEARCH has been shown to be a fast, accurate and full-fledged alternative to
- 60 USEARCH. A free and open-source versatile tool for sequence analysis is now available to the
- 61 metagenomics community.

# 62 Subjects

Biodiversity, Bioinformatics, Computational Biology, Genomics, Microbiology
 64

# 65 Keywords

- 66 alignment, clustering, chimera detection, dereplication, metagenomics, searching, sequences,
- 67 masking, shuffling, parallelization
- 68

# 69 Introduction

- 70 Rockström et al. (2009) and Steffen et al. (2015) presented biodiversity loss as a major threat for
- the short-term survival of humanity. Recent progress in sequencing technologies have made
- 72 possible large scale studies of environmental genetic diversity, from deep sea hydrothermal vents
- to Antarctic lakes (Karsenti et al., 2011), and from tropical forests to Siberian steppes (Gilbert,
- 74 Jansson and Knight, 2014). Recent clinical studies have shown the importance of the
- 75 microbiomes of our bodies and daily environments for human health (Human Microbiome
- 76 Project Consortium, 2012). Usually focusing on universal markers (e.g., 16S rRNA, ITS, COI),
- these targeted metagenomics studies produce many millions of sequences, and require open-
- source, fast and memory efficient tools to facilitate their ecological interpretation.
- 79
- 80 Several pipelines have been developed for microbiome analysis, among which mothur (Schloss
- et al., 2009), QIIME (Caporaso et al., 2010), and UPARSE (Edgar, 2013) are the most popular.
- 82 QIIME and UPARSE are both based on USEARCH (Edgar, 2010), a set of tools designed and
- 83 implemented by Robert C. Edgar, and available at <u>http://drive5.com/usearch/</u>. USEARCH offers
- a great number of commands and options to manipulate and analyse FASTQ and FASTA files.
- 85 However, the source code of USEARCH is not publicly available, algorithm details are only
- rudimentarily described, and only a memory-confined 32-bit version is freely available for
- 87 academic use.
- 88
- 89 We believe that the existence of open-source solutions is beneficial for end-users and can
- 90 invigorate research activities. For this reason, we have undertaken to offer a high quality open-
- 91 source alternative to USEARCH, freely available to users without any memory limitation.
- 92 VSEARCH includes most of the USEARCH functions in common use, and further development
- 93 may add additional features. Here we describe the details of the VSEARCH implementation. To
- 94 assess its performance in terms of speed and quality of results, we have evaluated some of the
- 95 most important functions (searching, clustering, chimera detection and subsampling) and
- 96 compared them to USEARCH. We find that VSEARCH delivers results that are better or on a
- 97 par with USEARCH results.

# 98 Materials and Methods

#### 99 Algorithms and implementation

- 100 Below is a brief description of the most important functions of VSEARCH and details of their
- 101 implementation. VSEARCH command line options are shown in italics, and should be preceded
- 102 by a single (-) or double dash (--) when used.
- 103

#### 104 Reading FASTA and FASTQ files

- 105 Most VSEARCH commands read files in FASTA or FASTQ format. The parser for FASTQ files
- 106 in VSEARCH is compliant with the standard as described by Cock et al. (2010) and correctly
- 107 parses all their tests files. FASTA and FASTQ files are automatically detected and many
- 108 commands accept both as input. Files compressed with gzip or bzip2 are automatically detected
- and decompressed using the zlib library by Gailly and Adler (2016) or the bzip2 library by
- 110 Seward (2016), respectively. Input may also be piped into or out of VSEARCH, allowing for
- 111 instance many separate FASTA files to be piped into VSEARCH for simultaneous dereplication,
- 112 or allowing the creation of complex pipelines without ever having to write on slow disks.
- 113
- 114 VSEARCH is a 64-bit program and allows very large datasets to be processed, essentially
- 115 limited only by the amount of memory available. The free USEARCH versions are 32-bit
- 116 programs that limit the available memory to somewhere less than 4GB, often seriously
- 117 hampering the analysis of realistic datasets.
- 118

### 119 Writing result files

- 120 VSEARCH can output results in a variety of formats (FASTA, FASTQ, tables, alignments,
- 121 SAM) depending on the input format and command used. When outputting FASTA files, the line
- 122 width may be specified using the *fasta width* option, where 0 means that line wrapping should
- 123 be turned off. Similar controls are offered for pairwise or multiple sequence alignments.
- 124

### 125 Searching

- 126 Global pairwise sequence comparison is a core-functionality of VSEARCH. Several commands
- 127 compare a query sequence against a database of sequences: all-vs-all alignment
- 128 (allpairs\_global), clustering (cluster\_fast, cluster\_size, cluster\_smallmem), chimera detection
- 129 (uchime denovo and uchime ref) and searching (usearch global). This comparison function
- 130 proceeds in two phases: an initial heuristic filtering based on shared words, followed by optimal
- 131 alignment of the query with the most promising candidates.
- 132
- 133 The first phase is presumably quite similar to USEARCH (Edgar, 2010). Heuristics are used to
- 134 identify a small set of database sequences that have many words in common with the query
- 135 sequence. Words (or *k*-mers) consist of a certain number *k* of consecutive nucleotides of a
- 136 sequence (8 by default, adjustable with the *wordlength* option). All overlapping words are

- 137 included. A sequence of length *n* then contains at most n k + 1 unique words. VSEARCH
- 138 counts the number of shared words between the query and each database sequence. Words that
- appear multiple times are counted only once. To count the words in the database sequences
- 140 quickly, VSEARCH creates an index of all the  $4^k$  possible distinct words and stores information
- about which database sequences they appear in. For extremely frequent words, the set of
- 142 database sequences is represented by a bitmap; otherwise the set is stored as a list. A finer
- 143 control of *k*-mer indexing is possible by introducing the *pattern* (binary string indicating which
- 144 positions must match) and *slots* options. USEARCH has such options but seems to ignore them.
- 145 Currently, VSEARCH ignores these two options too. The minimum number of shared words
- required may be specified with the *minwordmatches* option (10 by default), but a lower value is
- automatically used for short or simple query sequences with less than 10 unique words.
- 148

149 Comparing sequences based on statistics of shared words is a common method to quickly assess

150 the similarity between two sequences without aligning them, which is often time-consuming. The

151  $D_2$  statistic and related metrics for alignment-free sequence comparison have often been used for

152 rapid and approximate sequence matching and their statistical properties have been well studied

153 (Song et al., 2014). The approach used here has similarities to the  $D_2$  statistic, but multiple

- 154 matches of the same word are ignored.
- 155

156 In the second phase, searching proceeds by considering the database sequences in a specific

157 order, starting with the sequence having the largest number of words in common with the query,

and proceeding with a decreasing number of shared words. If two database sequences have the

159 same number of words in common with the query, the shortest sequence is considered first. The

- 160 query sequence is compared with each database sequence by computing the optimal global
- alignment. The alignment is performed using a multi-threaded and vectorised full dynamic
- 162 programming algorithm (Needleman and Wunsch, 1970) adapted from SWIPE (Rognes, 2011).
- 163 Due to the extreme memory requirements of this method when aligning two long sequences, an
- alternative algorithm described by Hirschberg (1975) and Myers and Miller (1988) is used when
- 165 the product of the length of the sequences is greater than 25,000,000, corresponding to aligning
- 166 two 5,000 bp sequences. This alternative algorithm uses only a linear amount of memory but is

167 considerably slower. This second phase is probably where USEARCH and VSEARCH differ the
 168 most, as USEARCH by default presumably performs a heuristic seed-and-extend alignment

similar to BLAST (Altschul et al., 1990), and only performs optimal pairwise alignments when

the option *fulldp* (full dynamic programming) is used. Computing the optimal pairwise alignment

in each case gives more accurate results but is also computationally more demanding. The

172 efficient and vectorised full dynamic programming implementation in VSEARCH compensates

- 173 that extra cost, at least for sequences that are not too long.
- 174

175 If the resulting alignment indicates a similarity equal to or greater than the value specified with 176 the *id* option, the database sequence is accepted. If the similarity is too low, it is rejected. Several 177 other options may also be used to determine how similarity is computed (*iddef*, as USEARCH

- 178 used to offer up to version 6), and which sequences should be accepted and rejected, either
- 179 before (e.g. *self, minqsize*) or after alignment (e.g. *maxgaps, maxsubs*). The search is terminated
- 180 when either a certain number of sequences have been accepted (1 by default, adjustable with the
- 181 *maxaccepts* option), or a certain number of sequences have been rejected (32 by default,
- adjustable with the *maxrejects* option). The accepted sequences are sorted by sequence similarity
- and presented as the search results.
- 184

185 VSEARCH also includes a *search\_exact* command that only identifies exact matches to the

- query. It uses a hash table in a way similar to the full-length dereplication command describedbelow.
- 188

# 189 Clustering

190 VSEARCH includes commands to perform *de novo* clustering using a greedy and heuristic

- 191 centroid-based algorithm with an adjustable sequence similarity threshold specified with the *id*
- 192 option (e.g., 0.97). The input sequences are either processed in the user supplied order
- 193 (*cluster\_smallmem*) or pre-sorted based on length (*cluster\_fast*) or abundance (the new
- 194 *cluster\_size* option). Each input sequence is then used as a query in a search against an initially
- 195 empty database of centroid sequences. The query sequence is clustered with the first centroid
- 196 sequence found with similarity equal to or above the threshold. The search is performed using
- 197 the heuristic approach described above which generally finds the most similar sequences first. If
- 198 no matches are found, the query sequence becomes the centroid of a new cluster and is added to 199 the database. If *maxaccepts* is higher than 1, several centroids with sufficient sequence similarity
- may be found and considered. By default, the query is clustered with the centroid presenting the
- highest sequence similarity (distance-based greedy clustering, DGC), or, if the *sizeorder* option
- is turned on, the centroid with the highest abundance (abundance-based greedy clustering, AGC)
- 203 (He et al., 2015; Westcott and Schloss, 2015; Schloss, 2016). VSEARCH performs multi-
- 204 threaded clustering by searching the database of centroid sequences with several query sequences
- 205 in parallel. If there are any non-matching query sequences giving rise to new centroids, the
- 206 required internal comparisons between the query sequences are subsequently performed to
- 207 achieve correct results. For each cluster, VSEARCH can perform a simple center-star multiple
- 208 sequence alignment to compute consensus sequences and sequence profiles.
- 209

# 210 Dereplication and rereplication

- 211 Full-length dereplication (*derep\_fulllength*) is performed using a hash table with an open
- addressing and linear probing strategy based on the Google CityHash hash functions (written by
- 213 Geoff Pike and Jyrki Alakuijala, and available at https://github.com/google/cityhash). The hash
- table is initially empty. For each input sequence, the hash is computed and a lookup in the hash
- table is performed. If an identical sequence is found, the input sequence is clustered with the
- 216 matching sequence; otherwise the input sequence is inserted into the hash table.

218 Prefix dereplication (*derep\_prefix*) is also implemented. As with full-length dereplication,
219 identical sequences are clustered. In addition, sequences that are identical to prefixes of other

- sequences will also be clustered together. If a sequence is identical to the prefix of multiple
- sequences, it is generally not defined how prefix clustering should behave. VSEARCH resolves
- this ambiguity by clustering the sequence with the shortest of the candidate sequences. If they are
- equally long, priority will be given to the most abundant, the one with the lexicographically
- smaller identifier or the one with the earliest original position, in that order.
- 225

226 To perform prefix dereplication, VSEARCH first creates an initially empty hash table. It then

- sorts the input sequences by length and identifies the length *s* of the shortest sequence in the
- dataset. Each input sequence is then processed as follows, starting with the shortest: If an exact
- 229 match to the full input sequence is found in the hash table, the input sequence is clustered with
- the matching hash table sequence. If no match to the full input sequence is found, the prefixes of
- the input sequence are considered, starting with the longest prefix and proceeding with shorter
- 232 prefixes in order, down to prefixes of length *s*. If a match is now found in the hash table, the
- 233 sequences are clustered, the matching sequence is deleted from the hash table and the full input
- sequence is inserted into the hash table instead. If no match is found for any prefix, the full
- sequence is inserted into the hash table. In the end, the remaining sequences in the hash table will
- be output with accumulated abundances for all sequences in each cluster.
- 237

In order to identify matches in the hash table during prefix dereplication, a hash is computed for
each full-length input sequence and all its prefixes. The hash function used is the 64-bit Fowler–
Noll–Vo 1a hash function (Fowler et al., 1991), which is simple and quick to compute for such a

- 241 series of sequences by adding one nucleotide at a time.
- 242

The sequences resulting from dereplication and many other commands may be relabeled with a given prefix followed by a sequentially increasing number. VSEARCH exclusively also offers the possibility of relabelling each sequence with the SHA-1 (Eastlake and Jones, 2001) or MD5

- (Rivest, 1992) message digest (hash) of the sequence. These are strings that are highly likely to
- be unique for each sequence. Before the digest is computed, the sequence is normalized by
- 248 converting U's to T's and converting all symbols to upper case. VSEARCH includes public
- domain code for the MD5 algorithm written by Alexander Peslyak, and for SHA1 by Steve Reid
- 250 and others.
- 251

VSEARCH also includes a new command (*rereplicate*) to perform rereplication that can be used
 to recreate datasets has they were before full-length dereplication, but of course original labels
 cannot be recreated.

255

#### 256 Chimera detection

- 257 Chimeras are detected either *de novo* (*uchime\_denovo* command) or with a reference database
- 258 (*uchime\_ref* command) using the UCHIME algorithm described by Edgar et al. (2011).
- 259 VSEARCH will divide each query sequence into four segments and look for similarity of each
- segment to sequences in the set of potential parents using the heuristic search function described
- 261 earlier. It will consider the four best candidates for each segment using *maxaccepts* 4 and
- 262 maxrejects 16, and an id threshold of 0.55. VSEARCH optionally outputs borderline sequences,
- that is, sequences having a high enough score (as specified with the *minh* option) but with too
- small a divergence from the closest parent (as specified with the *mindiv* option). Multi-threading
- 265 is supported for reference-based chimera detection.
- 266

### 267 Low-complexity sequence masking

- 268 VSEARCH includes a highly optimized and parallelized implementation of the Dust algorithm
- 269 by Tatusov and Lipman for masking of simple repeats and low-complexity nucleotide sequences,
- that is considerably faster than the implementation of the same algorithm in USEARCH. Their
- 271 code available at <u>ftp://ftp.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pub/tatusov/dust/version1/src/</u> is in the public
- domain. VSEARCH uses this algorithm by default, while USEARCH by default uses an
- 273 undocumented rapid masking algorithm called *fastnucleo*. VSEARCH performs soft-masking
- automatically for the pairwise alignment, search, clustering and chimera detection commands.
- 275 This behaviour can be controlled with the *hardmask* option to replace masked symbols with N's
- instead of lower-casing them, and the *dbmask* and *qmask* options, which selects the masking
- algorithm (none, dust or soft) used for the database and query sequences, respectively. Masking
- 278 may also be performed explicitly on an input file using the *fastx\_mask* and *maskfasta* commands.
- 279

### 280 FASTQ file processing

- 281 VSEARCH includes commands to detect the FASTQ file version and the range of quality scores
- used (*fastq\_chars*), as well as two commands for computing sequence quality statistics
- 283 (fastq\_stats and fastq\_eestats). It can also truncate and filter sequences in FASTQ files based on
- various criteria (*fastq filter*). A new command is added to convert between different FASTQ file
- versions and quality encodings (fastq\_convert), e.g. from the old Phred+64 encoded Illumina
- 286 FASTQ files to the newer Phred+33 format.
- 287

# 288 Merging of paired-end reads

- 289 Merging of paired-end reads is supported by VSEARCH using the *fastq\_mergepairs* command.
- 290 The method used has some similarity to PEAR (Zhang et al., 2014) and recognises options
- similar to USEARCH. The algorithm computes the optimal ungapped alignment of the
- 292 overlapping region of the forward sequence and the reverse-complemented reverse sequence.
- 293 The alignment requires a minimum overlap length (specified with the *fastq\_minovlen* option,
- default 10), a maximum number of mismatches (*fastq\_maxdiffs* option, default 5), and a
- 295 minimum and maximum length of the merged sequence (*fastq\_minmergelen* option, default 1,

and *fastq\_maxmergelen* option, default infinite). Staggered read pairs, i.e. read pairs where the 3'

- 297 end of the reverse read has an overhang to the left of the 5' end of the forward read, are not
- allowed by default, but may be turned on by the *fastq\_allowmergestagger* option. VSEARCH
- uses a match score (alpha) of +4 and a mismatch score (beta) of -5 for perfect quality residues.
- These scores are weighted by the probability that these two residues really match or mismatch, respectively, taking quality scores into account. These probabilities are computed in a way
- 302 similar to PEAR score method 2 described in section 2.1 of the PEAR paper (Zhang et al., 2014),
- 303 but VSEARCH assumes all nucleotide background frequencies are 0.25. When merging
- 304 sequences, VSEARCH computes posterior quality scores for the overlapping regions as
- 305 described by Edgar and Flyvbjerg (2015). For speed, scores and probabilities are pre-computed
- 306 for all possible quality scores.
- 307

### 308 Sorting and shuffling

- 309 VSEARCH can sort FASTA files by decreasing sequence length (*sortbylength*) or abundance
- 310 (sortbysize). VSEARCH can also perform shuffling of FASTA files in random order (shuffle). A
- 311 seed value for the pseudo random number generator may be provided by the *randseed* option to
- 312 obtain replicable results.
- 313

### 314 Subsampling

- 315 Sequences in FASTA and FASTQ files can be subsampled (*fastx\_subsample*) by randomly
- 316 extracting a certain number (*sample\_size*) or percentage (*sample\_pct*) of the input sequences.
- 317 Abundances may be taken into account, giving results as if the input sequences were
- 318 rereplicated, subsampled and then dereplicated.
- 319

# 320 **Results and Discussion**

# 321 Supported commands and options

- 322 VSEARCH implements the following commands available in USEARCH version 7:
- 323 *allpairs\_global, cluster\_fast, cluster\_smallmem, derep\_fullength, derep\_prefix, fastq\_chars,*
- 324 *fastq\_filter, fastq\_mergepairs, fastq\_stats, fastx\_mask, maskfasta, sortbylength, sortbysize,*
- 325 *uchime\_denovo*, *uchime\_ref* and *usearch\_global*. In addition, the following commands available
- 326 in USEARCH version 8 have been implemented: *fastq eestats, fastx revcomp, fastx subsample*
- 327 and *search exact*. VSEARCH additionally includes a few new commands that do not exist in
- 328 USEARCH: cluster size, fastq convert, rereplicate and shuffle.
- 329
- 330 Some USEARCH version 7 commands have not yet been implemented in VSEARCH. We have
- 331 not prioritized commands related to amino acid sequences (*findorfs*), local alignment
- 332 (*allpairs\_local, pairs\_local, search\_local, ublast*), brute-force search (*search\_global*,
- 333 pairs\_global), UDB databases (makeudb\_ublast, makeudb\_usearch, udb2fasta, udbinfo,
- 334 *udbstats*), and the UPARSE pipeline (*cluster\_otus, uparse\_ref*).

- Almost all USEARCH 7 options are supported, except for those related to non-standard database
- indexing (*alpha*, *dbaccelpct*, *dbstep*, *pattern*, *slots*) as well as local alignments and alignment
- 338 heuristics (*band*, *hspw*, *lext*, *lopen*, *matrix*, *minhsp*, *xdrop\_g*, *xdrop\_nw*, *xdrop\_u*).
- 339
- 340 The same command and option names as in USEARCH version 7 has generally been used in
- 341 order to make VSEARCH an almost drop-in replacement. In fact, in QIIME most commands will
- run fine if an alias or link from usearch to vsearch is made. Detailed documentation of
- 343 VSEARCH is available as a man page. We will consider adding further commands and options
- to VSEARCH in the future.
- 345

### **Performance Assessment**

347 The performance of the most important functions of VSEARCH version 2.0.3 was evaluated and

- 348 compared to USEARCH version 7.0.1090 and 8.1.1861. Chimera detection was also compared
- to UCHIME version 4.2. All tests were run on GNU/Linux CentOS 6.7 compute nodes with 16
- 350 physical cores (Intel(R) Xeon(R) CPU E5-2670 0 @ 2.60GHz) and 64GB RAM. Programs were
- run with 8 threads, if possible. All times indicated are wall-clock times. All scripts and data
- necessary to perform the evaluations are available in the GitHub repository at
- 353 <u>https://github.com/torognes/vsearch-eval/</u> to enable independent replication.
- 354

# 355 Searching

Evaluation of search accuracy was carried out as described in the USEARCH paper (Edgar,

- 357 2010), its supplementary, and on the website (http://drive5.com/usearch/benchmark\_rfam.html),
- 358 by assessing the ability of the programs to identify RNA sequences belonging to the same family
- in RFAM (Burge et al., 2013). The 383,004 sequences in Rfam version 11 were randomly
- 360 shuffled and then the first sequence from each of the 2,085 (out of 2,208) families that contained
- 361 at least 2 members was selected as a representative and used as a query against the remaining
- 362 380,919 sequences. The programs were run with options *id* 0.0, *minseqlength* 1, *maxaccepts* 1,
- 363 maxrejects 32, and strand plus. If the matching sequence found belonged to the same family, it
- 364 was considered a true positive, otherwise it was considered as a false positive. We combined the
- results from 20 shufflings and plotted the results in the ROC-like curve shown in Fig. 1. For a
- 366 false discovery rate comprised between 0.010 and 0.015, VSEARCH is more accurate than
- 367 USEARCH's latest version. For lower values, the three programs have similar accuracies. At
- 368 higher false discovery rates, USEARCH version 8 has an advantage.
- 369
- The time to search the Rfam database as described above was measured. To avoid extremely
- 371 short running times, 1,000 replicates of the datasets were used. USEARCH version 7 required on
- average 5 min 29 seconds for the search, USEARCH version 8 took 5 min 57 seconds, while
- 373 VSEARCH took 5 min 26 seconds.



Figure 1 Search accuracy on the RFAM v11 dataset. USEARCH version 7 (blue), USEARCH

376 version 8 (orange) and VSEARCH (black) was run using the *usearch global* command on

377 subsets of the RFAM dataset to identify members of the same families. The plot shows the true

378 positive rate (also known as the recall or sensitivity) as a function of the false discovery rate at

379 varying sequence similarity levels. This curve is based on data from 20 shufflings of the dataset.

#### 380 Clustering

381 Westcott and Schloss (2015) have already carried out an evaluation of the clustering

- 382 performance of VSEARCH. They tested the ability of several tools to assign OTUs for 16S
- 383 rRNA sequences and "demonstrated that for the greedy algorithms VSEARCH produced
- assignments that were comparable to those produced by USEARCH making VSEARCH a viable
- 385 free and open source alternative to USEARCH." Schloss (2016) also evaluated *de novo*
- 386 clustering by VSEARCH.
- 387
- 388 We independently evaluated the clustering accuracy of USEARCH and VSEARCH as described
- 389for Swarm (Mahé et al., 2014) using two mock datasets, one with an even and one with uneven
- 390 composition of 57 archaea and bacteria. The datasets were first dereplicated. Then the taxonomy
- 391 of the unique sequences was assigned by a search against the set of rRNA reference sequences
- representing the species in the mock datasets, carried out with the *usearch\_global* command of
- 393 USEARCH. The sequences were shuffled randomly 10 times and clustering was performed at 20
- different similarity levels ranging from 80% to 99% in steps of 1%. Clustering was carried out in
- two ways, first using the *cluster\_fast* command that pre-sorts the sequences by length, and then
- using the *cluster\_smallmem* command after first sorting the sequences by abundance using the
- *sortbysize* command. We then compared the clusters obtained to the assigned species and
   computed the recall, precision and the adjusted Rand index of the classifications. The average
- 398 computed the recall, precision and the adjusted Rand index of the classifications. The average 399 values over the all shufflings are presented in Fig. 2 and Fig. 3 for the even and uneven datasets,
- 400 respectively. For abundance-sorted sequences, the difference between VSEARCH and
- 401 USEARCH version 8 is negligible. The difference is larger for length-sorted sequences. When
- 402 using length sorting, USEARCH 8 (as well as version 7 on the even dataset) shows better
- 403 precision than VSEARCH for similarity levels below 93%. However, since we are comparing to
- 404 species we expect the correspondence with OTUs to occur at high similarities, and in fact overall
- 405 accuracy as measured by the adjusted Rand index is maximised at 95-97% similarity, this is
- 406 precisely the region where for length sorting at least VSEARCH outperforms USEARCH.
- 407
- 408 The time used for clustering is shown in Fig. 4. The time used depended on the dataset,
- 409 algorithm and clustering threshold. The USEARCH programs were in general 2-3 times faster
- 410 than VSEARCH. In general the difference in speed was smaller for higher thresholds, especially
- 411 at 99% similarity.





and VSEARCH (black) was run using abundance sorting (*cluster\_smallmem*) (left) and length
 sorting (*cluster fast*) (right) on the even dataset. The performance is indicated with the adjusted

416 Rand index (top), recall (middle) and precision (bottom) metrics.



417

418 Figure 3 Clustering accuracy on the uneven dataset. USEARCH version 7 (blue) and 8 (orange)

and VSEARCH (black) was run using abundance sorting (*cluster\_smallmem*) (left) and length
 sorting (*cluster fast*) (right) on the uneven dataset. The performance is indicated with the

421 adjusted Rand index (top), recall (middle) and precision (bottom) metrics.

# Peer Preprints



422



424 (bottom) datasets using USEARCH version 7 (blue) and 8 (orange) and VSEARCH (black)

425 using abundance sorting (*cluster\_fast*) (left) and length sorting (with *cluster\_smallmem*) (right).

#### 426 **Dereplication**

- 427 Measurements of dereplication speed were performed on the even and uneven datasets described
- 428 earlier as well as on the BioMarKs dataset (Karsenti et al., 2011). For full-length dereplication
- 429 (derep\_fullength) VSEARCH was about 40-50% faster than USEARCH version 7 and 50-70%
- 430 faster than version 8 on all three datasets. All programs were approximately equally fast on
- 431 prefix dereplication (*derep\_prefix*) of the even and uneven datasets. However, prefix
- 432 dereplication of the BioMarKs dataset was extremely slow with USEARCH. USEARCH version
- 433 7 used more than 4 minutes and version 8 more than 27 minutes, while VSEARCH used less
- than 4 seconds. The prefix dereplication algorithm used in USEARCH appears ineffective when
- 435 dealing with short sequences. Removing the 811 sequences shorter than 200 bp out of the
- 436 312,503 sequences of the BioMarKs dataset reduces the running time of USEARCH version 7
- 437 and 8 down to just 5 and 6 seconds, respectively.
- 438

#### 439 Chimera detection

- 440 We evaluated the chimera detection accuracy of VSEARCH and USEARCH in two ways, first
- 441 using a method similar to that performed for UCHIME, and then using a new chimera simulation
- 442 procedure from Greengenes and SILVA sequences.
- 443
- 444 First we repeated the evaluation of the *uchime\_ref* command described in the UCHIME paper
- 445 (Edgar, 2011) using the SIMM dataset downloaded from
- 446 <u>http://drive5.com/uchime/uchime\_download.html</u>. The dataset consists of 900 simulated
- 447 chimeras that are approximately 250 bp long. The chimeras were generated from 2, 3 or 4
- segments selected randomly from 86 original sequences and have similarities in the ranges 90-
- 449 95%, 95-97% and 97-99% to the original sequences. They were either used unmodified or with
- 450 1-5% indels or 1-5% substitutions. We assessed the performance of i) the original open-source
- 451 UCHIME version 4.2 program, ii) USEARCH version 7, iii) USEARCH version 8, and iv)
- 452 VSEARCH. The results are shown in Table 1 and indicate that VSEARCH is superior to the
- 453 other tools in almost all cases, and in particular when indels were added. The original UCHIME
- 454 program was found to be quite effective, but also considerably slower than all the other tools.
- 455 USEARCH was better than VSEARCH in only 3 out of 99 cases.

- 456 **Table 1** Chimera detection performance with the SIMM dataset. UCHIME (UC), USEARCH
- 457 version 7 (U7) and 8 (U8), and VSEARCH (V) was run using the *uchime\_ref* algorithm on the
- 458 SIMM dataset that was originally also used to evaluate the UCHIME algorithm. Divergence is
- the percentage of similarity to the original sequences. Noise is either zero (-) or the percentage of
- 460 indels (i1-i5) or substitutions (m1-5) added. The number of chimeras detected out of 100 of each
- 461 type is shown. The best results in each category are shaded.
- 462

|            |       | 2 segments |     |     |     | 3 segments |    |    |    | 4 segments |    |    |    |
|------------|-------|------------|-----|-----|-----|------------|----|----|----|------------|----|----|----|
| Divergence | Noise | UC         | U7  | U8  | V   | UC         | U7 | U8 | V  | UC         | U7 | U8 | V  |
| 97-99%     | -     | 89         | 88  | 88  | 89  | 56         | 52 | 52 | 55 | 38         | 33 | 34 | 35 |
|            | i1    | 79         | 79  | 77  | 85  | 46         | 44 | 43 | 53 | 32         | 27 | 24 | 34 |
|            | i2    | 64         | 57  | 56  | 77  | 33         | 32 | 31 | 56 | 24         | 20 | 18 | 33 |
|            | i3    | 48         | 45  | 36  | 72  | 37         | 35 | 29 | 45 | 16         | 17 | 16 | 21 |
|            | i4    | 29         | 24  | 23  | 65  | 18         | 11 | 13 | 40 | 9          | 9  | 8  | 25 |
|            | i5    | 27         | 22  | 16  | 53  | 15         | 12 | 12 | 39 | 7          | 8  | 6  | 17 |
|            | m1    | 83         | 83  | 83  | 81  | 53         | 48 | 48 | 53 | 33         | 29 | 29 | 30 |
|            | m2    | 73         | 71  | 71  | 72  | 49         | 44 | 44 | 50 | 28         | 22 | 22 | 27 |
|            | m3    | 66         | 66  | 66  | 68  | 40         | 40 | 39 | 44 | 21         | 20 | 21 | 21 |
|            | m4    | 55         | 54  | 53  | 57  | 28         | 24 | 23 | 28 | 21         | 18 | 18 | 19 |
|            | m5    | 44         | 44  | 42  | 48  | 20         | 19 | 18 | 28 | 16         | 14 | 12 | 12 |
| 95-97%     | -     | 100        | 100 | 100 | 100 | 80         | 77 | 76 | 79 | 64         | 60 | 59 | 63 |
|            | i1    | 100        | 98  | 98  | 100 | 77         | 75 | 72 | 75 | 54         | 55 | 53 | 61 |
|            | i2    | 96         | 94  | 93  | 99  | 60         | 55 | 55 | 71 | 48         | 44 | 44 | 60 |
|            | i3    | 86         | 82  | 82  | 95  | 61         | 50 | 52 | 70 | 38         | 36 | 31 | 53 |
|            | i4    | 75         | 66  | 64  | 95  | 48         | 41 | 39 | 64 | 29         | 29 | 22 | 47 |
|            | i5    | 64         | 58  | 53  | 86  | 37         | 32 | 25 | 60 | 24         | 19 | 19 | 46 |
|            | m1    | 99         | 99  | 99  | 99  | 76         | 73 | 73 | 76 | 60         | 57 | 57 | 60 |
|            | m2    | 98         | 97  | 97  | 97  | 71         | 69 | 69 | 71 | 50         | 48 | 46 | 48 |
|            | m3    | 93         | 94  | 94  | 96  | 63         | 61 | 61 | 64 | 41         | 41 | 41 | 42 |
|            | m4    | 92         | 92  | 90  | 93  | 56         | 55 | 54 | 57 | 39         | 39 | 37 | 41 |
|            | m5    | 86         | 86  | 85  | 86  | 53         | 51 | 51 | 56 | 35         | 35 | 34 | 34 |
| 90-95%     | -     | 100        | 100 | 100 | 100 | 93         | 93 | 93 | 93 | 88         | 88 | 88 | 86 |
|            | i1    | 100        | 100 | 100 | 100 | 88         | 88 | 87 | 91 | 86         | 86 | 87 | 88 |
|            | i2    | 99         | 97  | 99  | 99  | 83         | 79 | 78 | 88 | 74         | 72 | 72 | 84 |
|            | i3    | 100        | 100 | 100 | 100 | 79         | 76 | 75 | 88 | 74         | 69 | 70 | 82 |
|            | i4    | 99         | 94  | 96  | 99  | 80         | 71 | 72 | 84 | 66         | 62 | 61 | 79 |
|            | i5    | 95         | 84  | 86  | 99  | 74         | 65 | 65 | 88 | 55         | 48 | 48 | 71 |
|            | m1    | 100        | 100 | 100 | 100 | 89         | 89 | 89 | 92 | 87         | 87 | 86 | 85 |
|            | m2    | 100        | 100 | 100 | 100 | 87         | 87 | 87 | 89 | 78         | 78 | 78 | 79 |
|            | m3    | 100        | 99  | 99  | 100 | 86         | 86 | 86 | 89 | 76         | 76 | 78 | 80 |
|            | m4    | 100        | 100 | 100 | 100 | 82         | 82 | 84 | 83 | 73         | 73 | 72 | 78 |
|            | m5    | 99         | 98  | 98  | 99  | 82         | 81 | 82 | 84 | 75         | 73 | 75 | 79 |

# Peer Preprints

464 Next, we tested reference-based (uchime ref) and de novo (uchime denovo) chimera detection 465 using sequences from the 2011 version of Greengenes downloaded from http://greengenes.lbl.gov/Download/Sequence Data/Fasta data files/ (DeSantis et al., 2006) and 466 467 from version 106 (May 2011) of the SILVA database downloaded from https://www.arbsilva.de/no cache/download/archive/release 106/Exports/ (Quast et al., 2013). Sequences from 468 469 the 16S rRNA V4 region was computationally extracted using the 515F (5'-GTGNCAGCMGCCGCGGTAA-3') and 806R (5'-GGACTACHVGGGTWTCTAAT-3') 470 471 primers, and 8,000 reads were randomly selected from each database. PCR was simulated using 472 a new simulation algorithm known as Simera (Nichols and Ouince, 2016) (available at https://github.com/bnichols1979/Simera) that includes amplification and creation of PCR 473 474 artefacts like chimeras. We sampled 30,000 reads (-s 30000) and generated 20,000 potential chimeras (-c 20000). Defaults were used for other options to Simera. The output sequences were 475 then fed into an Illumina MiSeq noise simulator (Schirmer et al., 2015) ending up with 14,966 476 477 reads based on Greengenes and 14,952 reads based on SILVA, of which 1,262 and 1,640 reads 478 contain chimeric sequences, respectively. Next, the sequences were either clustered using the 479 cluster fast command at 97% identity or dereplicated. VSEARCH and USEARCH version 7 and 480 8 were run using the *uchime denovo* command and then using the *uchime ref* command with the 481 Gold database downloaded from http://drive5.com/uchime/uchime download.html as the 482 reference database. To assess the performance, the results were sorted based on the chimera 483 score, and then the ability to classify individual sequences correctly into chimeric and non-484 chimeric was plotted as ROC curves. The curves reflect the accuracy of classifying individual 485 reads, not clusters, as abundances were taken into account. The plots in Fig. 5 and Fig. 6 show 486 that de novo chimera detection performs better than reference-based detection, with the SILVA dataset in particular, but it does of course depend on the reference database used. VSEARCH 487 performs better than both versions of USEARCH for de novo chimera detection. For reference-488 489 based detection VSEARCH also performs better for the Greengenes dataset, while none of the programs works well with the SILVA dataset. Clustering at 97% appears to be more appropriate 490 491 than dereplication. In this test, the USEARCH programs were about twice as fast as VSEARCH 492 for de novo detection, while they were about 10-30% faster than VSEARCH for reference-based 493 detection.

# NOT PEER-REVIEWED

# Peer Preprints



494 495

496 **Figure 5** Chimera detection performance with the Greengenes dataset shown with ROC curves.

497 USEARCH version 7 (blue) and 8 (orange) and VSEARCH (black) was run using the

498 *uchime\_denovo* (top) and the *uchime\_ref* (bottom) commands on simulated Illumina data based

499 on the Greengenes database that has either been clustered with a 97% identity threshold (using

500 the *cluster\_fast* command in VSEARCH) (left) or dereplicated (using the *derep\_fulllength* 

501 command in VSEARCH) (right).

# NOT PEER-REVIEWED

# Peer Preprints





504 **Figure 6** Chimera detection performance on the SILVA dataset shown with ROC curves.

505 USEARCH version 7 (blue) and 8 (orange) and VSEARCH (black) was run using the

506 *uchime\_denovo* (top) and the *uchime\_ref* (bottom) commands on simulated Illumina data based

507 on the SILVA database that has either been clustered with a 97% identity threshold (using the

508 *cluster\_fast* command in USEARCH) (left) or dereplicated (using the *derep\_fulllength* command

509 in VSEARCH) (right).

#### 510 Merging of paired-end reads

- 511 Evaluation of paired-end reads merging performance was carried out in a manner similar to that
- 512 described for the evaluation of PEAR (Zhang et al., 2014). We used whole genome sequencing
- 513 data from *Staphylococcus aureus* subspecies aureus strain USA 300 TCH 1516 sequenced by
- 514 MacCallum et al. (2009) and retrieved from the GAGE-B repository (<u>http://ccb.jhu.edu/gage\_b/</u>).
- 515 The *S.aureus* reads were 101 bp long from on average 180 bp long fragments, giving a 45X
- 516 coverage of the genome. We also used *Methylococcus capsulatus* strain Bath 16S rRNA V3
- region amplicon reads sequenced by Masella et al. (2012). These reads were 108 bp long and the
- 518 pairs should have an overlap of exactly 18 bp. Merging options were set to allow a minimum
- overlap of 10 bp and a maximum of 5 mismatches (USEARCH 7 and 8 have different default
- values for those), while other options were left at defaults. All programs were run with 8 threads.
- 521 Merged sequences that could be perfectly aligned to their respective reference sequences (either
- the entire genome or the specific rRNA region) using BWA MEM (Li et al., 2009) were
- 523 considered correctly merged. The results are shown in Table 2. The numbers indicate that
- 524 USEARCH version 7 merges the most reads for both bacteria, but also has the lowest percentage
- of correctly merged pairs of those merged. USEARCH version 8 merges the fewest reads, but
- bas the highest percentage of correctly merged reads of those merged. VSEARCH is in the
- 527 middle by merging more reads than USEARCH 8 with only a small decrease in the percentage of
- 528 correct merges. VSEARCH is about twice as fast as USEARCH 8 and 4-5 times faster than529 USEARCH version 7.
- 530

- 531 **Table 2.** Paired-end reads merging performance. The number of sequence pairs, merged pairs,
- and correctly merged pairs are shown for each bacterium and program. The percentage of reads
- 533 merged, as well as the percentage of correctly merged reads both of the merged reads and of all
- reads are also shown. Times are in seconds using 8 threads.

| Bacterium                | Program   | Pairs   | Merged  | Correct | %Merged | %Cor/Mer | %Cor/All | Time (s) |
|--------------------------|-----------|---------|---------|---------|---------|----------|----------|----------|
| Staphylococcus aureus    | USEARCH 7 | 647,052 | 273,438 | 270,849 | 42.26   | 99.05    | 41.86    | 11.65    |
|                          | USEARCH 8 | 647,052 | 203,729 | 202,003 | 31.49   | 99.15    | 31.22    | 4.69     |
|                          | VSEARCH   | 647,052 | 214,988 | 213,103 | 33.23   | 99.12    | 32.93    | 2.15     |
| Methylococcus capsulatus | USEARCH 7 | 673,845 | 643,903 | 642,720 | 95.56   | 99.82    | 95.38    | 14.43    |
| suam bam                 | USEARCH 8 | 673,845 | 554,099 | 553,747 | 82.23   | 99.94    | 82.18    | 6.27     |
|                          | VSEARCH   | 673,845 | 581,752 | 581,346 | 86.33   | 99.93    | 86.27    | 3.61     |

536

#### 537 Subsampling

- 538 We evaluated the subsampling commands of USEARCH version 8 and VSEARCH to check if
- the results obtained correspond to those expected. We performed 10,000 random subsamplings
- of 5% of the 9.5 million unique sequences in the TARA V9 dataset (Karsenti et al., 2011). To
- 541 make this possible with the 32-bit USEARCH, we first downsampled the dataset once to 10%
- 542 using VSEARCH and then randomly subsampled it again at 50% with either USEARCH or
- 543 VSEARCH. Plots of the distribution of the abundance of the most abundant sequence in each
- 544 subsampling are shown in Fig. 7. The highest amplicon abundance in the original dataset is
- 545 15,638,316. After the initial 10% subsampling, the highest abundance was 1,564,267. After the
- second subsampling, the top abundances should therefore have a distribution centred on a value
- of 782,133.5. As can be seen from the figure, the USEARCH distribution has a mean that is
- about 2,000 too small, while the VSEARCH distribution is correctly centred on the expected
- value. Subsampling experiments were also performed at 2.5%, 1.5% and 0.5% with similar
- results, although the errors were of decreasing size. USEARCH seems to under-sample abundant
- amplicons and to over-sample rare amplicons.



552 553

**Figure 7** Subsampling performance. The observed distribution of the maximum amplicon

abundance in 10,000 random subsamplings of 5% of the TARA V9 dataset results using

- 555 VSEARCH (top, black) and USEARCH version 8 (bottom, orange) is shown. The expected
- 556 mean abundance is 782,133.5 (blue dashed line).

# 557 **Conclusions**

- 558 VSEARCH supports almost all of the commands and options for nucleotide sequence analysis in
- 559 USEARCH version 7 as well several new features. It has a 64-bit design and handles large
- 560 datasets virtually only limited by the amount of available memory. We have demonstrated that
- 561 VSEARCH is in general more accurate than USEARCH when performing searching, clustering,
- 562 chimera detection and subsampling. The accuracy is on a par with USEARCH for paired-end
- reads merging. VSEARCH is faster than USEARCH when performing dereplication and
- 564 merging of paired-end reads, but slower for clustering and chimera detection. We will continue
- to improve the accuracy, speed and robustness of VSEARCH in the future, as well as adding new
- 566 features.
- 567

### 568 Availability

- 569 VSEARCH is freely available at <u>https://github.com/torognes/vsearch</u> under a dual license, either
- 570 the GNU General Public License version 3, or the BSD 2-clause license. Binaries are provided
- 571 for x86-64 systems running GNU/Linux or OS X (10.7 or higher).
- 572
- 573 Thanks to the work of several people, there is now a vsearch package in Debian and a vsearch
- 574 package for Homebrew, as well as a Galaxy wrapper for VSEARCH in the Galaxy ToolShed.
- 575

# 576 Acknowledgements

- 577 We highly appreciate the feedback from numerous people who submitted bug reports and 578 suggestions for features.
- 579
- 580 Thanks to Melanie Schirmer for noise generation on sequences for chimera detection.
- 581

# 582 **References**

583 Altschul SF, Gish W, Miller W, Myers EW, Lipman DJ. 1990. Basic local alignment search tool.

- 584 Journal of Molecular Biology, 215:403-410. DOI: 10.1016/S0022-2836(05)80360-2
- 585
- 586 Burge SW, Daub J, Eberhardt R, Tate J, Barquist L, Nawrocki EP, Eddy SR, Gardner PP,
- 587 Bateman A. 2013. Rfam 11.0: 10 years of RNA families. Nucleic Acids Research, 41(D1):D226-
- 588 D232. DOI: 10.1093/nar/gks1005
- 589
- 590 Caporaso JG, Kuczynski J, Stombaugh J, Bittinger K, Bushman FD, Costello EK, Fierer N, Peña
- 591 AG, Goodrich JK, Gordon JI, Huttley GA, Kelley ST, Knights D, Koenig JE, Ley RE, Lozupone
- 592 CA, McDonald D, Muegge BD, Pirrung M, Reeder J, Sevinsky JR, Turnbaugh PJ, Walters WA,
- 593 Widmann J, Yatsunenko T, Zaneveld J, Knight R. 2010. QIIME allows analysis of high-
- throughput community sequencing data. Nature Methods, 7:335–336. DOI: 10.1038/nmeth.f.303

595 596 Cock PJA, Fields CJ, Goto N, Heuer ML and Rice PM. 2010. The Sanger FASTQ file format for 597 sequences with quality scores, and the Solexa/Illumina FASTQ variants. Nucleic Acids 598 Research, 38(6):1767-1771. DOI: 10.1093/nar/gkp1137 599 600 DeSantis TZ, Hugenholtz P, Larsen N, Rojas M, Brodie EL, Keller K, Huber T, Dalevi D, Hu P, 601 Andersen GL. 2006. Greengenes, a Chimera-Checked 16S rRNA Gene Database and Workbench 602 Compatible with ARB. Applied and Environmental Microbiology, 72(7):5069-72. DOI: 603 10.1128/AEM.03006-05 604 605 Eastlake D, Jones P. 2001. US Secure Hash Algorithm 1 (SHA). Internet RFC 3174. Available at 606 ftp://ftp.rfc-editor.org/in-notes/rfc3174.txt 607 608 Edgar RC. 2010. Search and clustering orders of magnitude faster than BLAST. Bioinformatics, 609 26(19):2460-2461. DOI: 10.1093/bioinformatics/btg461 610 611 Edgar RC. 2013. UPARSE: highly accurate OTU sequences from microbial amplicon reads. 612 Nature Methods, 10(10):996-8. DOI: 10.1038/nmeth.2604 613 614 Edgar RC, Flyvbjerg H. 2015. Error filtering, pair assembly and error correction for next-615 generation sequencing reads. Bioinformatics, 31(21):3476-3482. DOI: 616 10.1093/bioinformatics/btv40 617 618 Edgar RC, Haas BJ, Clemente JC, Quince C, Knight R. 2011. UCHIME improves sensitivity and 619 speed of chimera detection. Bioinformatics, 27(16):2194-2200. DOI: 620 10.1093/bioinformatics/btr381 621 622 Fowler G, Noll LC, Vo P. 1991. Fowler / Noll / Vo (FNV) hash. Available at 623 http://www.isthe.com/chongo/tech/comp/fnv/index.html 624 625 Gailly JL, Adler M. 2016. zlib: A Massively Spiffy Yet Delicately Unobtrusive Compression 626 Library. Available at http://www.zlib.net/ (accessed 3 August 2016) 627 628 Gilbert JA, Jansson JK, Knight R. 2014. The Earth Microbiome project: successes and 629 aspirations. BMC Biology, 12:69. DOI: 10.1186/s12915-014-0069-1 630 631 Guillou L, Bachar D, Audic S, Bass D, Berney C, Bittner L, Boutte C, Burgaud G, de Vargas C, 632 Decelle J, del Campo J, Dolan J, Dunthorn M, Edvardsen B, Holzmann M, Kooistra W, Lara E, 633 Lebescot N, Logares R, Mahé F, Massana R, Montresor M, Morard R, Not F, Pawlowski J,

Probert I, Sauvadet A.-L, Siano R, Stoeck T, Vaulot D, Zimmermann P, Christen R. 2013. The

635 Protist Ribosomal Reference database (PR2): a catalog of unicellular eukaryote Small Sub-Unit

- rRNA sequences with curated taxonomy. Nucleic Acids Research, 41(D1):D597-D604. DOI:
- 637 10.1093/nar/gks1160 638
- 639 He Y, Caporaso JG, Jiang XT, Sheng HF, Huse SM, Rideout JR, Edgar RC, Kopylova E,
- 640 Walters WA, Knight R and Zhou HW. 2015. Stability of operational taxonomic units: an
- 641 important but neglected property for analyzing microbial diversity. Microbiome, 3:20. DOI:
- 642 10.1186/s40168-015-0081-x
- 643
- Hirschberg DS. 1975. A linear space algorithm for computing maximal common subsequences.
  Communications of the ACM, 18(6):341-343. DOI: 10.1145/360825.360861
- 646
- Human Microbiome Project Consortium. 2012. Structure, function and diversity of the healthy
  human microbiome. Nature, 486:207-214. DOI: 10.1038/nature11234
- 649
- 650 Karsenti E, González Acinas S, Bork P, Bowler C, de Vargas C, Raes J, Sullivan M. B, Arendt
- 651 D, Benzoni F, Claverie J.-M, Follows M, Jaillon O, Gorsky G, Hingamp P, Iudicone D, Kandels-
- Lewis S, Krzic U, Not F, Ogata H, Pesant S, Reynaud E. G, Sardet C, Sieracki M. E, Speich S,
- 653 Velayoudon D, Weissenbach J, Wincker P, the Tara Oceans Consortium. 2011. A holistic
- approach to marine eco-systems biology. PLoS Biology, 9(10):e1001177. DOI:
- 655 10.1371/journal.pbio.1001177
- 656
- 657 Kopylova E, Navas-Molina JA, Mercier C, Xu ZZ, Mahé F, He Y, Zhou HW, Rognes T,
- 658 Caporaso JG, Knight R. 2016. Open-Source Sequence Clustering Methods Improve the State Of
- 659 the Art. mSystems, 1(1):e00003-15. DOI: 10.1128/mSystems.00003-15
- 660
- Li H, Durbin R. 2009. Fast and accurate short read alignment with Burrows-Wheeler transform.
  Bioinformatics, 25(14):1754-60. DOI: 10.1093/bioinformatics/btp324
- 663
- Logares R, Audic S, Bass D, Bittner L, Boutte C, Christen R, Claverie J.-M, Decelle J, Dolan J.
- R, Dunthorn M, Edvardsen B, Gobet A, Kooistra W. H. C. F, Mahé F, Not F, Ogata H,
- 666 Pawlowski J, Pernice M. C, Romac S, Shalchian-Tabrizi K, Simon N, Stoeck T, Santini S, Siano
- 667 R, Wincker P, Zingone A, Richards T, de Vargas C, Massana R. 2014. The patterning of rare and
- abundant community assemblages in coastal marine-planktonic microbial eukaryotes. Current
- 669 Biology, 24(8):813-821. DOI: 10.1016/j.cub.2014.02.050
- 670
- 671 Mahé F, Rognes T, Quince C, de Vargas C, Dunthorn M. 2014. Swarm: robust and fast
- 672 clustering method for amplicon-based studies. PeerJ, 2:e593. DOI: 10.7717/peerj.593
- 673

# Peer Preprints

Masella AP, Bartram AK, Truszkowski JM, Brown DG and Neufeld JD. 2012. PANDAseq: 674 675 paired-end assembler for illumina sequences. BMC Bioinformatics. 13:31. DOI: 10.1186/1471-676 2105-13-31 677 678 Myers EW, Miller W. 1988. Optimal alignments in linear space. Computer Applications in the 679 Biosciences, 4(1):11-17. DOI: 10.1093/bioinformatics/4.1.11 680 681 Needleman SB, Wunsch CD, 1970. A general method applicable to the search for similarities in the amino acid sequence of two proteins. Journal of Molecular Biology, 48(3):443-53. DOI: 682 683 10.1016/0022-2836(70)90057-4. 684 685 Nichols B, Quince C. 2016. Simera: Modelling the PCR Process to Simulate Realistic Chimera 686 Formation. bioRxiv, 072447. DOI: 10.1101/072447 687 688 Quast C, Pruesse E, Yilmaz P, Gerken J, Schweer T, Yarza P, Peplies J, Glöckner FO. 2013. The SILVA ribosomal RNA gene database project: improved data processing and web-based tools. 689 Nucleic Acids Research, 41(D1):D590-D596. DOI: 10.1093/nar/gks1219 690 691 692 Rivest R. 1992. The MD5 Message-Digest Algorithm. Internet RFC 1321. Available at 693 ftp://ftp.rfc-editor.org/in-notes/rfc1321.txt 694 695 Rockström J, Steffen W, Noone K, Persson A, Chapin FS 3rd, Lambin EF, Lenton TM, Scheffer 696 M, Folke C, Schellnhuber HJ, Nykvist B, de Wit CA, Hughes T, van der Leeuw S, Rodhe H, 697 Sörlin S, Snyder PK, Costanza R, Svedin U, Falkenmark M, Karlberg L, Corell RW, Fabry VJ, 698 Hansen J, Walker B, Liverman D, Richardson K, Crutzen P, Foley JA. 2009. A safe operating 699 space for humanity. Nature, 461(7263):472-5. DOI: 10.1038/461472a 700 701 Rognes T. 2011. Faster Smith-Waterman database searches by inter-sequence SIMD 702 parallelisation. BMC Bioinformatics, 12:221. DOI: 10.1186/1471-2105-12-221 703 704 Schirmer M, Ijaz UZ, D'Amore R, Hall N, Sloan WT, Quince C. 2015. Insight into biases and 705 sequencing errors for amplicon sequencing with the Illumina MiSeq platform. Nucleic Acids 706 Research, 43(6):e37. doi: 10.1093/nar/gku1341 707 708 Schloss PD (2016) Application of a Database-Independent Approach To Assess the Quality of 709 Operational Taxonomic Unit Picking Methods. mSystems, 1(2):e00027-16. DOI: 710 10.1128/mSystems.00027-16 711 712 Schloss PD, Westcott SL, Ryabin T, Hall JR, Hartmann M, Hollister EB, Lesniewski RA,

713 Oakley BB, Parks DH, Robinson CJ, Sahl JW, Stres B, Thallinger GG, Van Horn DJ, Weber CF.

| 714 | 2009. Introducing mothur: open-source, platform-independent, community-supported software             |
|-----|---|
| 715 | for describing and comparing microbial communities. Applied and Environmental Microbiology,           |
| 716 | 75:7537–7541. DOI: 10.1128/AEM.01541-09.  |
| 717 |   |
| 718 | Seward J. 2016. bzip2 and libbzip2. Available at <u>http://www.bzip.org/</u> (accessed 3 August 2016) |
| 719 |   |
| 720 | Song K, Ren J, Reinert G, Deng M, Waterman MS, Sun F. 2014. New developments of                       |
| 721 | alignment-free sequence comparison: measures, statistics and next-generation sequencing.              |
| 722 | Briefings in Bioinformatics, 15(3):343–53. DOI: 10.1093/bib/bbt067                                    |
| 723 |   |
| 724 | Steffen W, Richardson K, Rockström J, Cornell SE, Fetzer I, Bennett EM, Biggs R, Carpenter            |
| 725 | SR, de Vries W, de Wit CA, Folke C, Gerten D, Heinke J, Mace GM, Persson LM, Ramanathan               |
| 726 | V, Reyers B, Sörlin S. 2015. Sustainability. Planetary boundaries: guiding human development          |
| 727 | on a changing planet. Science, 347(6223):1259855. DOI: 10.1126/science.1259855                        |
| 728 |   |
| 729 | Westcott SL, Schloss PD. 2015. De novo clustering methods outperform reference-based                  |
| 730 | methods for assigning 16S rRNA gene sequences to operational taxonomic units. PeerJ, 3:e1487          |
| 731 | DOI: 10.7717/peerj.1487   |
| 732 |   |
| 733 | Zhang J, Kobert K, Flouri T, Stamatakis A. 2014. PEAR: a fast and accurate Illumina Paired-End        |
| 734 | reAd mergeR. Bioinformatics, 30(5):614-20. DOI: 10.1093/bioinformatics/btt593                         |
| 735 |   |
|     |   |
| 736 | Declarations  |
| 737 | Competing Interests   |
| 738 | The authors declare there are no competing interests.   |

# 740 **Funding statement**

- 741 This research was supported in part with computational resources at the University of Oslo
- 742 provided by NOTUR project NN9383K and funded by the Research Council of Norway.
- 743
- 744 BN was funded by BBSRC CASE studentship supported by Unilever.
- 745
- 746 CQ was funded through the MRC Cloud Infrastructure for Microbial Bioinformatics (CLIMB)
- 747 project (MR/L015\-080/1) through fellowship (MR/M50161X/1)
- 748
- FM was supported by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (grant #DU1319/1-1).
- 750

### 751 Author contributions

- 752 Which authors conceived and designed the experiments? TR, TF, BN, CQ, FM
- 753 Which authors performed the experiments? TR, TF, BN, FM
- 754 Which authors analyzed the data? TR, TF, BN, CQ, FM
- 755 Which authors contributed reagents/materials/analysis tools? TR, TF, BN, CQ, FM
- 756 Which authors wrote the manuscript? TR, TF, BN, CQ, FM
- 757 Which authors prepared the figures and/or tables? TR, BN, FM
- 758 Which authors reviewed drafts of the paper? TR, TF, BN, CQ, FM
- 759 Which authors made other contributions? None