

Mandatory Corrections

- 1- The numerical results obtained should be included in the Conclusion section.
- 2- The number of references should be increased.
- 3- The use of "proposed method" should be preferred instead of the word "Ours" both in the text and in Figures.
4. The names of the axes of Figure 4 should be written on the figure.
5. The names of the axes of Figure 5 should be written on the figure.
6. ACO, ABC, PSO and "proposed method" convergence graphs should be drawn and compared accordingly.
7. Parameter values used for optimization runs in ACO, ABC, PSO and "proposed method" algorithms should be given in a separate Table.
- 8) Problem and objective function should be defined?
- 9) R1 and R2 are used as problems in the article. The problems given in the Tables below (R1, R2, C1, RC1, C2 RC2) should be used for the algorithms in the article. In addition, the comparisons in the Tables below must be made for the algorithms you use for R1, R2, C1, RC1, C2 RC2 problems. The table below is given as an example.

TABLE 5: Comparison of the experimental results of the proposed method with other methods.

G	D	Avg. vehicle number			Avg. total distance			Avg. insertion time			Ratio refuse service		
		HSVND	ILNS	GVNS	HSVND	ILNS	GVNS	HSVND	ILNS	GVNS	HSVND	ILNS	GVNS
R1	90	13.58	14.25	14.67	1214.29	1335.94	1250.38	4.91	1743	14.50	3.08	2.33	3.83
	70	13.50	14.33	14.75	1223.57	1331.34	1267.78	6.55	21.73	10.95	2.58	1.75	3.08
	50	13.92	14.08	14.58	1224.42	1295.81	1267.47	9.28	28.27	11.84	2.00	0.67	1.92
	30	13.58	13.92	14.25	1214.46	1286.63	1256.04	13.99	46.59	15.70	1.25	0.58	1.58
	10	13.75	13.50	14.17	1216.82	1257.08	1250.16	21.64	67.99	15.29	0.33	0.17	0.50
C1	90	10.44	10.78	10.67	907.93	1039.77	963.33	3.04	6.60	7.81	0.11	0.22	0.00
	70	10.44	10.78	11.33	888.79	1031.68	1009.47	4.59	10.79	7.67	0.11	0.22	0.00
	50	10.33	10.89	11.00	865.28	1001.18	992.97	6.91	19.01	6.22	0.11	0.22	0.00
	30	10.22	10.56	11.56	870.22	962.08	949.95	10.51	28.03	9.13	0.11	0.33	0.00
	10	10.33	10.56	10.56	852.33	895.77	898.30	16.69	15.40	13.74	0.11	0.22	0.00
RC1	90	14.13	14.00	14.63	1465.45	1513.94	1470.45	3.13	17.31	15.39	1.13	2.00	1.88
	70	13.88	13.88	14.88	1469.64	1511.29	1489.28	4.17	25.32	13.43	1.00	1.88	2.13
	50	13.63	13.63	14.50	1428.24	1514.72	1484.01	6.77	48.78	13.72	1.00	1.38	1.75
	30	13.50	13.88	14.38	1426.26	1492.22	1471.00	9.96	45.26	16.51	0.50	1.13	1.00
	10	13.38	13.38	13.50	1394.37	1436.23	1417.07	16.49	83.52	23.01	0.50	1.13	0.50
R2	90	4.73	3.55	4.00	989.84	1047.82	1086.78	6.56	13.20	16.47	0.00	0.09	0.00
	70	4.82	3.64	4.36	973.08	1032.04	1078.03	10.47	20.15	12.74	0.00	0.09	0.00
	50	4.82	3.82	4.55	960.29	1016.52	1071.83	16.51	30.03	11.96	0.00	0.00	0.00
	30	4.91	4.91	4.73	937.70	985.59	1035.60	26.73	57.07	10.18	0.00	0.00	0.00
	10	4.45	6.36	5.27	938.06	950.00	1000.00	47.68	68.58	9.48	0.00	0.09	0.00
C2	90	3.13	3.25	3.38	615.67	636.79	668.99	2.93	6.12	16.67	0.00	0.00	0.00
	70	3.13	3.13	3.38	613.49	636.47	672.95	3.63	10.01	14.03	0.00	0.00	0.00
	50	3.00	3.13	3.13	601.62	604.98	623.10	6.46	16.80	20.25	0.00	0.00	0.00
	30	3.13	3.63	3.25	599.93	651.42	624.81	9.05	29.87	34.82	0.00	0.00	0.00
	10	3.13	3.00	3.25	596.03	594.67	615.93	15.30	59.70	80.78	0.00	0.00	0.00
RC2	90	6.00	4.00	4.63	1122.00	1257.19	1275.93	4.35	11.34	28.05	0.00	0.13	0.00
	70	6.00	3.88	5.13	1095.71	1239.46	1234.36	6.88	19.26	16.07	0.00	0.00	0.00
	50	6.13	4.25	5.88	1078.33	1190.54	1200.26	10.82	27.84	11.46	0.00	0.13	0.00
	30	5.88	5.38	5.88	1064.58	1166.04	1172.33	18.51	41.51	11.68	0.00	0.25	0.00
	10	5.63	6.75	6.13	1059.94	1103.30	1153.43	32.96	55.55	13.27	0.00	0.00	0.00
Avg.		8.58	8.50	8.88	1030.28	1100.62	1098.40	11.92	31.64	16.76	0.46	0.50	0.61

TABLE 6: The average performance comparison of HSVND and GVNS.

<i>G</i>	<i>D</i>	Ratio of refuse		Avg. vehicle number		Avg. total distance		Avg. insertion time	
		HSVND	GVNS	HSVND	GVNS	HSVND	GVNS	HSVND	GVNS
R1	90	2.83	3.33	14.43	15.34	1253.57	1328.74	4.65	15.89
	70	2.26	2.42	14.36	15.31	1262.20	1340.38	6.75	12.45
	50	1.67	1.67	14.29	15.33	1256.42	1340.17	9.32	12.32
	30	1.16	1.17	14.13	14.96	1243.40	1312.73	14.01	17.21
	10	0.33	0.33	14.02	14.73	1240.66	1296.59	22.09	16.69
C1	90	0.11	0.00	10.78	11.37	935.06	1092.18	2.96	8.94
	70	0.11	0.00	10.80	11.92	926.97	1150.27	4.36	8.51
	50	0.11	0.00	10.57	11.81	901.09	1129.58	6.88	7.32
	30	0.11	0.00	10.47	11.81	895.69	1081.52	10.19	10.17
	10	0.11	0.00	10.50	11.36	878.01	986.99	16.50	14.87
RC1	90	1.04	1.50	14.73	15.62	1511.27	1587.89	3.12	15.89
	70	0.93	1.25	14.61	15.88	1515.20	1614.43	4.26	14.72
	50	0.73	0.88	14.29	15.51	1476.00	1579.34	6.63	14.05
	30	0.46	0.63	14.28	15.22	1470.15	1551.93	9.64	16.89
	10	0.31	0.25	13.99	14.25	1438.48	1474.09	14.54	24.52
R2	90	0.00	0.00	4.92	3.88	1022.27	1181.31	6.37	17.05
	70	0.00	0.00	4.87	4.22	1008.85	1161.98	9.83	13.41
	50	0.00	0.00	4.83	4.49	992.01	1153.79	16.44	12.58
	30	0.00	0.00	4.80	4.77	974.35	1112.92	26.66	10.86
	10	0.00	0.00	4.34	5.49	972.57	1054.82	45.81	10.75
C2	90	0.00	0.00	3.26	3.66	634.73	749.33	2.78	17.85
	70	0.00	0.00	3.30	3.71	637.30	722.45	3.91	14.91
	50	0.00	0.00	3.31	3.53	615.68	670.23	6.32	22.34
	30	0.00	0.00	3.04	3.36	610.82	670.88	9.32	35.92
	10	0.00	0.00	3.05	3.53	603.39	660.93	15.20	85.73
RC2	90	0.00	0.00	6.01	8.02	1165.36	2032.46	4.40	29.51
	70	0.00	0.00	6.04	4.94	1134.00	1359.18	6.70	17.18
	50	0.00	0.00	5.85	5.39	1113.19	1311.97	10.90	12.86
	30	0.00	0.00	5.94	5.83	1101.98	1278.62	18.27	13.54
	10	0.00	0.00	5.29	6.01	1104.00	1240.55	31.22	13.98
Avg.		0.41	0.45	8.84	9.38	1063.16	1207.61	11.67	17.96