# **Peer**J

# Effects of temperature on metabolic scaling in black carp

Qian Li, Xiaoling Zhu, Wei Xiong, Yanqiu Zhu, Jianghui Zhang, Pathe Karim Djiba, Xiao Lv and Yiping Luo

Key Laboratory of Freshwater Fish Reproduction and Development, Ministry of Education, School of Life Sciences, Southwest University, Chongqing, China

# ABSTRACT

The surface area (SA) of organs and cells may vary with temperature, which changes the SA exchange limitation on metabolic flows as well as the influence of temperature on metabolic scaling. The effect of SA change can intensify (when the effect is the same as that of temperature) or compensate for (when the effect is the opposite of that of temperature) the negative effects of temperature on metabolic scaling, which can result in multiple patterns of metabolic scaling with temperature among species. The present study aimed to examine whether metabolic scaling in black carp changes with temperature and to identify the link between metabolic scaling and SA at the organ and cellular levels at different temperatures. The resting metabolic rate (RMR), gill surface area (GSA) and red blood cell (RBC) size of black carp with different body masses were measured at 10 °C and 25 °C, and the scaling exponents of these parameters were compared. The results showed that both body mass and temperature independently affected the RMR, GSA and RBC size of black carp. A consistent scaling exponent of RMR (0.764, 95% CI [0.718-0.809]) was obtained for both temperatures. The RMR at 25  $^{\circ}$ C was 2.7 times higher than that at 10 °C. At both temperatures, the GSA scaled consistently with body mass by an exponent of 0.802 (95% CI [0.759-0.846]), while RBC size scaled consistently with body mass by an exponent of 0.042 (95% CI [0.010-0.075]). The constant GSA scaling can explain the constant metabolic scaling as temperature increases, as metabolism may be constrained by fluxes across surfaces. The GSA at 10 °C was 1.2 times higher than that at 25 °C, which suggests that the constraints of GSA on the metabolism of black carp is induced by the higher temperature. The RBC size at 10 °C was 1.1 times higher than that at 25 °C. The smaller RBC size (a larger surfaceto-volume ratio) at higher temperature suggests an enhanced oxygen supply and a reduced surface boundary limit on  $b_{\rm R}$ , which offset the negative effect of temperature on  $b_{\rm R}$ .

**Subjects** Aquaculture, Fisheries and Fish Science, Ecology, Zoology **Keywords** Metabolism, Allometric, Fish, Gill, Red blood cell

# **INTRODUCTION**

The relationship between the metabolic rate (MR) and body mass (*M*) of organisms can be expressed as a power-law function,  $MR = aM^b$ , where *a* is a constant and *b* is the scaling exponent. The mechanisms of metabolic scaling have been attributed to the ontogenetic changes in the components of active organs (the organ size theory)

Submitted 15 January 2020 Accepted 5 May 2020 Published 27 May 2020

Corresponding author Yiping Luo, luoguo@swu.edu.cn

Academic editor María Ángeles Esteban

Additional Information and Declarations can be found on page 11

DOI 10.7717/peerj.9242

Copyright 2020 Li et al.

Distributed under Creative Commons CC-BY 4.0

#### **OPEN ACCESS**

(*Itazawa & Oikawa, 1983; Oikawa, Takemori & Itazawa, 1992*), the fractal patterns of resource distributions (the metabolic theory of ecology) (*West, Brown & Enquist, 1997; Brown et al., 2004*), the limitations on surfaces for mass and/or energy exchange (the surface area (SA) hypothesis) (*Rubner, 1883; Okie, 2013*), the ontogenetic change in the ratio of cell SA to volume (cell metabolic hypothesis) (*Davison, 1955; Kozłowski, Konarzewski & Gawelczyk, 2003; Starostová et al., 2009*), and the effects of SA vs. the volume-related metabolic processes of organisms mediated by metabolic level (the metabolic level boundaries hypothesis) (*Glazier, 2005, 2008, 2009, 2010*). However, the underlying mechanisms of metabolic scaling remain unclear. Recently, a growing number of studies have implied that, in addition to the SA and metabolic level of whole organisms, SA at the organ level and the cellular level and their scaling may contribute to the allometric scaling of MR (*Okie, 2013; Hirst, Glazier & Atkinson, 2014; Luo et al., 2015, 2020; Gillooly et al., 2016; Li et al., 2018*). It is of interest to investigate whether the changes in SA at the organ and cellular levels affect the metabolic scaling of the whole body of an organism.

Temperature is a major factor that affects MR and its scaling with body mass. Generally, the resting MR (RMR) of ectotherms increases with increasing temperature (*Jobling*, 1994; Clarke & Johnston, 1999). In fish, RMR increases with temperature by a coefficient (Q10) ranging from 1.65 to 2.70 (Jobling, 1994; Clarke & Johnston, 1999; Peck, Buckley & Bengtson, 2005; Ohlberger, Staaks & Hölker, 2007). However, the changes in the exponent b of the RMR  $(b_{\rm R})$  with temperature vary among species. In most cases,  $b_{\rm R}$  is reduced by increasing temperature (Xie & Sun, 1990; Ohlberger, Staaks & Hölker, 2007; Ohlberger et al., 2008, 2012; Killen, Atkinson & Glazier, 2010; Li et al., 2018), which can be explained according to the metabolic level boundaries hypothesis (Glazier, 2005, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2014a, 2014b). At high temperatures, high metabolic demand results in metabolic scaling being primarily determined by fluxes across surfaces (scaling as  $M^{2/3}$ ). However, at low temperatures, low metabolic demand can be met by surface-related processes, and therefore metabolic scaling is determined more by the energy demand required to sustain the tissues (scaling as  $M^1$ ). Thus,  $b_R$  should decrease as temperature increases (*Glazier*, 2005, 2008, 2009, 2010, 2014a, 2014b). However, increased and/or unchanged  $b_{\rm R}$  with temperature was observed in studies of the gastropod Littorina littorea (Newell, 1973), cuttlefish (Sepia officinalis) (Melzner, Bock & Pörtner, 2007; Grigoriou & Richardson, 2009), krill (Euphausia pacifica) (Paranjape, 1967), and several salamanders (Gifford, *Timothy & William, 2013*). In fishes, fluctuating and/or unchanged  $b_{\rm R}$  with temperature has been reported in several species of cyprinids and was speculated to be due to species-specific phenotypically plastic responses or to increasing spontaneous activity with temperature (Hölker, 2003, 2006; Luo & Wang, 2012; Ohlberger et al., 2012). It remains unclear why  $b_{\rm R}$  can change with temperature in different patterns.

Previous studies have shown that the gill surface area (GSA) of fish may vary with temperature. For example, a thermally plastic increase in GSA has been observed in several species of cyprinids and has been suggested to be an adaptation of the fish to cope with its high metabolic demand with limited oxygen availability in warmer water (*Sollid, Weber & Nilsson, 2005; Sollid & Nilsson, 2006; Chen et al., 2019*). However, temperature may not

affect the mass scaling exponents of GSA ( $b_G$ ) of fish (*Li et al.*, 2018). It remains under debate whether GSA reflects metabolic demands (*Lefevre, McKenzie & Nilsson*, 2017, 2018) or, in contrast, is a constraint on the metabolic rates of fish (*Pauly*, 1981; *Pauly & Cheung*, 2018a, 2018b). In any case, GSA and its scaling should be relevant to metabolic rate and metabolic scaling. For example,  $b_G$  is very close to  $b_R$  in several species of carp, especially when controlling the effect of ventilation rate (*Luo et al.*, 2020). Therefore, the determination of the GSA of fish at different temperatures may supply explanations for the effect of temperature on  $b_R$ .

The cell sizes of ectotherms can vary with temperature. The reduced cell size at warmer temperatures may increase the relative SA and improve the oxygen supply (*Audzijonyte et al., 2019*). The red blood cell (RBC) size is usually adopted as a proxy for the general cell size of an organism (*Starostová et al., 2009, 2013; Luo et al., 2015*). Many studies have observed that the sizes of RBCs decrease with increasing temperature in ectotherms (*Van Voorhies, 1996; Goodman & Heah, 2010; Hermaniuk, Rybacki & Taylor, 2016*). It remains unclear whether the thermally reduced cell size compensates for the negative effect of temperature on  $b_R$ . The RBC size of fish generally scales with body mass by a very small exponent ( $b_C$ , 0–0.1) with a weak correlation with body mass (*Huang et al., 2013; Zhang et al., 2014; Luo et al., 2015*). It can be expected that temperature change may not induce a remarkable change in the  $b_C$  of fish.

It can be predicted from the above backgrounds that the thermal plastic changes in SA at both the organ and cellular levels may change the limitation of the exchange surface on metabolic flows and therefore change the influence of temperature on metabolic scaling. If SA decreases with temperature, the limiting effect of SA further intensifies the negative effect of temperature on metabolic scaling, which results in decreased  $b_R$  values as temperature increases. In contrast, if SA increases with temperature, the reduced limiting effect of SA compensates for the negative effect of temperature on metabolic scaling, which may result in unchanged and/or increased  $b_R$  values as temperature increases.

Black carp (*Mylopharyngodon piceus*), a freshwater cyprinid fish native to rivers and lakes of China, was selected as the experimental animal in the present study. This species has been introduced into multiple regions of the world, including Europe, West-Central Asia and North America, and has been suggested to have serious adverse impacts on native aquatic communities due to predation on mollusc species (*Nico & Neilson, 2019*). This fish is tolerant of water temperatures from approximately 0.5–40 °C, and its optimum water temperatures range from 18 to 30 °C for adults (*CABI, 2019*). Information on the physiological response of black carp to temperature change would be useful for understanding its wide spread and for controlling its negative impacts on aquatic ecosystems. However, little is known regarding the effects of temperature on the physiology of this fish. A previous study showed that black carp could remodel their gill morphology to increase GSA under hypoxic conditions (*Dhillon et al., 2013*). Our recent studies have determined the metabolic scaling of black carp and suggested that both GSA and RBC size may affect the metabolic scaling of carp (*Lv et al., 2018*;

*Luo et al.*, 2020). It remains unclear how temperature affects the RMR and  $b_{\rm R}$  of black carp and how temperature affects its GSA and RBC size and scaling.

The present study aimed to examine whether metabolic scaling in black carp changes with temperature and to determine the link between metabolic scaling and SA at the organ and cellular levels at different temperatures. Therefore, the RMR, GSA and RBC size of black carp were determined at 10 °C and 25 °C, and their scaling exponents were analyzed. We hypothesized that as temperature increases, (1) RMR increases, and  $b_R$  decreases; (2) GSA increases, and  $b_G$  does not change; and (3) RBC size decreases, but  $b_C$  does not change.

# **MATERIALS AND METHODS**

#### **Experimental processes**

Black carp (body mass ranging from 5 to 250 g, n = 70) were obtained from Xiema aquaculture farm in Beibei, Chongqing, China and transferred to the laboratory. All experimental processes were performed according to the ethical requirements for animal care of the School of Life Sciences of Southwest University, China (LS-SWU/012/ 2016), and the requirements for the living environment and housing facilities for laboratory animals in China (Gb/T14925-2001). The fish were acclimated in a rearing system at their original temperature (17.0 °C) for 2 weeks, and the variations in temperature were kept within ±0.2 °C using a heater (JRB-250, Sunsun CO., Ltd., Zhejiang, China) regulated by an automatic temperature controller (PY-SM5, Pinyi CO., Ltd., Zhejiang, China). The dissolved oxygen concentration was kept above 95% saturation by continuous air pumping. Water temperature and oxygen concentration were checked twice daily (08:30 and 18:30) using a fiber-optic oxygen sensor probe connected with a portable multimeter (HQ30D, Hach Company, Loveland CO, USA). The ammonia concentration of the rearing water was monitored once daily (08:30) using the salicylate-hypochlorite method (Verdouw, Van Echteld & Dekkers, 1978). One-third of the volume of the rearing water was refreshed with aerated tap water every day (09:00) to keep the ammonia-N level below 0.01 mg  $L^{-1}$ . The photoperiod was 12h:12h light: dark. During acclimation, the fish were fed a commercial diet to satiation once daily (18:00), and the residual pellets were sucked out with a siphon one hour after feeding to ensure that the water was clean. The main chemical composition of the commercial diet was 12.5% moisture, 33.0% protein, 3.0% fat and 10.0% digestible carbohydrate (Tongwei Company, Sichuan, China). At the end of acclimation, the fish were randomly divided into two groups (n = 35 for each group) for the temperature treatments. The fish of each group were reared in five tanks with seven individuals per tank. The tank sizes were  $80 \text{ cm} \times 60 \text{ cm} \times 50 \text{ cm}$ , and the water volume was 192 L in each tank. The water in each tank was recirculated through a filtration system (HBL803, Sunsun CO., Ltd., Zhejiang, China). One group was warmed to 25 °C by 1 °C per day using a heater (JRB-250, Sunsun CO., Ltd., Zhejiang, China) and an automatic temperature controller (PY-SM5, Pinyi CO., Ltd., Zhejiang, China). The other group was cooled by 1  $^{\circ}$ C per day to 10  $^{\circ}$ C using a cooling water machine (CW1000A, Risheng CO., Ltd., Guangdong, China) and an automatic temperature controller (PY-SM5, Pinyi CO., Ltd., Zhejiang, China).

Thereafter, the fish were reared at  $10.0 \pm 0.2$  °C and  $25.0 \pm 0.2$  °C for 2 weeks. The water quality monitoring and feeding processes were the same as those adopted during the abovementioned acclimation period. As one individual died during the 25 °C trial period, the final numbers of fish specimens were 34 for the 25 °C treatment and 35 for the 10 °C treatment.

The oxygen consumption rate was measured by a continuous flow-through respirometer and was used to represent the MR of individual fish (Wang et al., 2012). The structure of the respirometer is described in Fu, Xie & Cao (2005). At the end of the temperature trial period, the fish were fasted for 48 h and individually placed into the respirometer chambers overnight before the determination of oxygen consumption. Chambers of different sizes (0.03, 0.13, 0.52, 0.86 and 1.20 L) were used depending on the size of the experimental individual, ensuring that the fish body could stretch to its full length but could not be inverted. Fifteen chambers were used at the same time for measurements, and one chamber without fish was used as the control to determine the background oxygen consumption. All chambers were placed in a water bath (110 cm  $\times$  70 cm  $\times$  30 cm). The visual field of the fish was shielded by the water bath to avoid visual disturbance by the experimental operation. The water flow rate was adjusted by regulating the valve at the inlet of each chamber prior to measurements. The outflow water from the respiration chamber was collected using a volumetric flask of a given volume, for which the time duration was recorded by a stopwatch. Then, the water flow velocity  $(v, 1 h^{-1})$  was calculated. The flow rate was regulated to ensure that the dissolved oxygen in the outlet water of each breathing chamber was approximately  $0.5-1 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$  lower than that of the control chamber but higher than 70% saturation concentration to avoid stress on the experimental fish due to lack of oxygen (Blaikie & Kerr, 1996; Fu & Xie, 2004). The dissolved oxygen concentration was measured at the outlet of the chamber using a probe connected with a portable multimeter (HQ30D, Hach Company, Loveland CO, USA). The oxygen consumption rate of each fish  $(\dot{M}O_2, mg O_2 h^{-1})$  was calculated by the following formula:

### $\dot{M}O_2 = \Delta O_2 \times v$

where  $\Delta O_2$  is the difference between the dissolved oxygen concentrations (mg  $O_2 L^{-1}$ ) of the outlets of the experimental chamber and the control chamber, and  $\nu$  is the water flow rate through the chamber (L h<sup>-1</sup>). The individual oxygen consumption rate was measured hourly from 09:00 to 15:00, and the mean value of the lowest two measurements was used as the RMR for that individual. The mean value of  $Q_{10}$  of RMR over the range 10–25 °C was calculated by  $Q_{10} = [(RMR_{25}/RMR_{10})]^{10/15}$ , where RMR<sub>25</sub> and RMR<sub>10</sub> are the mass-corrected mean values of the RMRs at 25 °C and 10 °C, respectively.

After the determination of RMR, the fish were anesthetized for blood and gill arch sampling with 0.15 g  $L^{-1}$  tricaine methanesulfonate (MS-222) for five minutes. Blood was taken from the caudal vessel using an anticoagulant-treated (0.04 mg m $L^{-1}$  sodium heparin) syringe and was transferred to an anticoagulant-treated centrifuge tube on ice. The blood sampling procedure was finished within 1 min. Then, blood smears were made

immediately. A blood smear failed for one individual at 25 °C because of the difficulty of sampling blood from a very small individual. The left four gill arches were dissected, kept in Bouin's fluid for 2 days and stored in 70% alcohol for several days (less than 1 week) before the GSA was measured. After blood and gill arch sampling, the fish were killed while anesthetized by quick freezing in liquid nitrogen since the fish were not capable of suffering while unconscious. Since the experimental animals were farmed fish, criteria for euthanizing the animals did not need to be established prior to the planned end of the experiment.

Blood smears were made with Wright-Giemsa dye solution (Gao et al., 2007; Huang et al., 2013). Fifty erythrocytes were randomly selected from the stained blood smears to determine the cell length (LC, µm) and cell width (WC, µm) using a microscope (EV5680B, Aigo Company, China) and Image-Pro Plus 6.0 software (Media Cybernetics, Rockville, MD, USA). The RBC area ( $S_{RBC}$ ,  $\mu m^2$ ) was calculated as  $S_{RBC} = LC \times WC \times \pi/4$ . The GSAs were determined according to the methods described by Li et al. (2018). Briefly, the GSA was calculated by a standardized gill morphology assessment (*Hughes*, 1966, 1984). The filament number on each gill arch was counted, and six filaments were sampled from each arch to measure the filament length and the secondary lamellae frequency. Three secondary lamellae were chosen from each of the six sampled filaments of the second arch to determine the bilateral areas of the lamella. The bilateral lamellae areas were determined using a microscope (EV5680B, Aigo Digital Technology Co., Beijing, China) and Image-Pro Plus 6.0 software (Media Cybernetics, Rockville, MD, USA). The total length of all the gill filaments (TL, mm), the mean lamella frequency (LF, mm<sup>-1</sup>), and the mean lamella area (LA mm<sup>2</sup>) were obtained. The GSA (mm<sup>2</sup>) of an individual was calculated by the following formula:  $GSA = 4 \times TL \times LF \times LA$ . The GSA determination failed for one individual at each temperature because of the difficulty of working with very small individuals. The raw data are in the Supplemental Files.

# Statistical analysis

The data were calculated using Microsoft Excel 2003 (Microsoft Corporation, Redmond, WA, USA) and were analyzed using R (*R Development Core Team, 2018*). The original data for variables including RMR,  $S_{RBC}$  and GSA were log10 transformed. An ANCOVA (aov) was performed to analyze the effects of temperature and body mass on RMR,  $S_{RBC}$ , and GSA, using temperature as the categorical factor and body mass as the covariate. If the interaction between body mass and temperature was significant, ordinary least squares regression (lm) was performed on the RMR,  $S_{RBC}$  and GSA data with body mass as the independent variable for each temperature. If the interaction between body mass and temperature as independent variables. The linear regression slopes for the RMR and the GSA were compared at each temperature. The *b* values were expressed with 95% confidence intervals (CIs) and compared to given values using a *t*-test. The ordinary least squares regression (lm) was used to analyze the mass-independent correlations between the residual values of RMR,  $S_{RBC}$  and GSA.



Figure 1 The relationship between resting metabolic rate (RMR, mg  $O_2 h^{-1}$ ) and body mass (*M*, g) of the black carp *Mylopharyngodon piceus* treated by two temperatures (*T*, °C) for 2 weeks. The original data for variables including RMR and *M* were log10 transformed. No significant interaction between *M* and *T* on RMR was observed using the general linear model (glm). Then, the ordinary least squares regression (lm) was performed on the RMR with *M* and *T*. Red open circles and dashed line: 25 °C; black filled circles and solid line: 10 °C. Full-size  $\Box$  DOI: 10.7717/peerj.9242/fig-1

# RESULTS

The results showed that both body mass (F = 1,021.04, P < 0.001) and temperature (F = 648.44, P < 0.001) affected the RMR of black carp, with no significant interaction between body mass and temperature (F = 1.02, P = 0.317). Therefore, a consistent  $b_R$  (0.764, 95% CI [0.718–0.809]) between temperatures was obtained based on the regression with log body mass and temperature as independent variables (Fig. 1). The value of  $b_R$  was significantly larger than 2/3 (t = 4.31, P < 0.001) but not larger than 3/4 (t = 0.62, P = 0.537). The mass-specific RMR ranged from 81.8 to 216.6 mg O<sub>2</sub> kg<sup>-1</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> at 25 °C and from 22.3 to 96.9 mg O<sub>2</sub> kg<sup>-1</sup> h<sup>-1</sup> at 10 °C. The RMR at 25 °C was 2.7 times higher than that at 10 °C when corrected to the mean values for the body masses, representing a Q<sub>10</sub> value of 1.95.

The interaction between body mass and temperature had no significant effect on GSA (F = 0.005, P = 0.943). Both body mass (F = 1389.42, P < 0.001) and temperature (F = 33.27, P < 0.001) significantly affected GSA. GSA scaled consistently with body mass at both temperatures (Fig. 2), and  $b_{GSA}$  (0.802, 95% CI [0.759–0.846]) was significantly higher than 2/3 (t = 6.21, P < 0.001) but was not different from the  $b_R$  value (F = 1.87, P = 0.176 at 10 °C; F = 1.39, P = 0.24 at 25 °C). When controlling for the effects of body mass, the GSA at 10 °C was 1.2 times higher than that at 25 °C. No significant correlation was found between GSA and RMR when controlling for body mass ( $r^2 = -0.0134$ , P = 0.719) (Fig. S1).



Figure 2 The relationship between gill surface area (GSA, mm<sup>2</sup>) and body mass (*M*) of the black carp *Mylopharyngodon piceus* treated by two temperatures (*T*, °C) for 2 weeks. No significant interaction between *M* and *T* on GSA was observed using the general linear model (glm). Then, the ordinary least squares regression (lm) was performed on the GSA with *M* and *T*. Red open circles and dashed line: 25 °C; black filled circles and solid line: 10 °C. Full-size  $\Box$  DOI: 10.7717/peerj.9242/fig-2

The interaction between body mass and temperature had no significant effect on  $S_{\text{RBC}}$  (F = 0.01, P = 0.921). Both body mass (F = 7.68, P = 0.007) and temperature (F = 12.61, P < 0.001) significantly affected  $S_{\text{RBC}}$ .  $S_{\text{RBC}}$  scaled consistently with body mass at both temperatures by a  $b_{\text{C}}$  of 0.042 (95% CI [0.010–0.075]) (Fig. 3). However, there was only a weak correlation between  $S_{\text{RBC}}$  and body mass ( $r^2 = 0.217$ ). When controlling for the effects of body mass, the  $S_{\text{RBC}}$  at 10 °C was 1.1 times higher than that at 25 °C. No significant correlation was found between  $S_{\text{RBC}}$  and RMR when controlling for body mass ( $r^2 = -0.0133, P = 0.728$ ) (Fig. S2).

# DISCUSSION

In the present study, the RMR of black carp increased with increasing temperature. The  $Q_{10}$  value (1.95) was within the  $Q_{10}$  value range (1.65–2.70) of the RMR of most previously reported fish (*Jobling, 1994*; *Peck, Buckley & Bengtson, 2005*; *Ohlberger, Staaks & Hölker, 2007*), suggesting that the metabolic level of black carp is moderately sensitive to temperature. However, inconsistent with our prediction, the results showed that the effect of body mass on the RMR of black carp was independent of temperature, that is, the increased metabolic level with increasing temperature did not reduce the  $b_R$  of the black carp.

In addition, in contrast to our prediction, the GSA of black carp decreased with increasing temperature. Therefore, black carp does not increase its GSA to cope with



Figure 3 The relationship between red blood cell size ( $S_{RBC}$ ,  $\mu m^2$ ) and mass of the black carp *Mylopharyngodon piceus* treated by two temperatures (T, °C) for 2 weeks. No significant interaction between M and T on  $S_{RBC}$  was observed using the general linear model (glm). Then, the ordinary least squares regression (lm) was performed on the  $S_{RBC}$  with M and T. Red open circles and dashed line: 25 °C; black filled circles and solid line: 10 °C. Full-size  $\Box$  DOI: 10.7717/peerj.9242/fig-3

the high metabolic demand in warmer water, in contrast to previously reported fish (Sollid, Weber & Nilsson, 2005; Sollid & Nilsson, 2006; Chen et al., 2019). Changes in the GSA of fish have relevance not only to oxygen supply/demand but also to ion exchange and parasitic infections (Pauly, 1981; Lefevre et al., 2017, 2018; Pauly & Cheung, 2018a, 2018b). Reducing GSA can help decrease losses of ions and risk of infections in warmer water. In addition to GSA, the ventilation rate could regulate oxygen supplies (Luo et al., 2020; Xiong et al., 2020). Therefore, an increase in RMR with increasing temperature is not necessarily accompanied by an increase in GSA. The results suggest that GSA may not reflect metabolic demands, as proposed by Lefevre et al. (2017, 2018). In contrast, the constraints of GSA on the metabolism of black carp may be enhanced at higher temperatures. However, the  $b_{\rm R}$  of the fish did not decrease with increasing temperature. There are several possible causes that can counteract the negative effect of temperature on the  $b_{\rm R}$ . First, the spontaneous activity of the fish may increase at high temperatures, which causes the metabolic rate to be increasingly dominated by the energy demands of muscular tissue, which is directly proportional to muscle mass (b = 1) and can result in a positive effect on  $b_{\rm R}$  at high temperatures (*Luo & Wang, 2012; Glazier*, 2014b). Second, similar to previous results in many ectotherms (Van Voorhies, 1996; Goodman & Heah, 2010; Hermaniuk, Rybacki & Taylor, 2016), our study found that black carp have a smaller RBC size (a larger surface-to-volume ratio) at higher temperatures, which may enhance the oxygen supply and weaken the effect of the surface boundary

limit on  $b_{\rm R}$  (*Glazier, 2005, 2010; Luo et al., 2015*). Thus, the negative effect of temperature on  $b_{\rm R}$  was compensated. Third, the metabolic rate should be determined by fluxes across surfaces; therefore, metabolic scaling should be determined by SA scaling (*Wells & Pinder, 1996a, 1996b; Reich, 2001; Yoshiyama & Klausmeier, 2008; Kooijman, 2009; Phillips et al., 2009; Glazier, Hirst & Atkinson, 2015; Luo et al., 2020*). Therefore, when SA scaling remains unchanged as temperature increases, metabolic scaling should remain constant. Accordingly, our results showed no difference between the  $b_{\rm R}$  and  $b_{\rm GSA}$  of black carp at either temperature. Indeed, even though the  $b_{\rm R}$  of many fishes decrease with increasing temperature (*Xie & Sun, 1990; Ohlberger, Staaks & Hölker, 2007; Ohlberger et al., 2008, 2012; Li et al., 2018*), a fluctuating and/or unchanged  $b_{\rm R}$  was observed in several fishes, for example, *Coreius guichenoti (Luo & Wang, 2012), Abramis brama* and *Rutilus rutilus (Hölker, 2003, 2006; Ohlberger et al., 2012*).

The temperature-induced change in exchange surfaces at the individual level may play a role in the metabolic scaling of fish (Li et al., 2018). In the present results, the different GSA and  $S_{RBC}$  at different temperatures suggest that plasticity in exchange surfaces may occur both at the individual level and at the cellular level. The cell metabolic hypothesis proposed that metabolic level negatively correlates with the cell size of organisms (Davison, 1955; Kozłowski, Konarzewski & Gawelczyk, 2003; Starostová et al., 2013). However, the present results showed no negative correlation between RMR and  $S_{\rm RBC}$  in black carp. The results were not surprising, as correlations between RMR and  $S_{\rm RBC}$ vary among fish species (Maciak et al., 2011; Huang et al., 2013; Zhang et al., 2014; Luo et al., 2015; Lv et al., 2018). According to the cell metabolic hypothesis,  $b_{\rm R}$  equals 1 when the cell size scales as  $M^0$  and 2/3 when the cell size scales as  $M^{2/3}$  (*Davison*, 1955; Szarski, 1983; Kozłowski, Konarzewski & Gawelczyk, 2003). In the present study, the RBC size scaled with body mass by a very small exponent (0.042), which predicts a metabolic scaling exponent very close to 1 according to the cell metabolic hypothesis. However, the observed  $b_{\rm R}$  value in black carp was 0.764. Therefore, ontogenetic changes in cell size may not contribute much to the metabolic scaling of black carp.

# **CONCLUSION**

In conclusion, the present study provides comparative data on SA parameters and RMR at the organismal and cellular level, as well as the mass scaling exponents of black carp at different temperatures. These RMRs increased while both GSA and  $S_{RBC}$  decreased with increasing temperature. No significant difference in  $b_R$ ,  $b_G$ , or  $b_C$  exists between temperatures. This indicates that the negative effect of temperature on the metabolic scaling exponent is offset by other factors, for example, increasing spontaneous activity, decreasing cell size and constant GSA scaling at higher temperatures.

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We thank Mr. Bo Zhang for his help with fish collection. We sincerely thank the anonymous reviewers for their helpful suggestions and comments.

# **ADDITIONAL INFORMATION AND DECLARATIONS**

### Funding

This work was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (No. 31672287). The funders had no role in study design, data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript.

### **Grant Disclosures**

The following grant information was disclosed by the authors: National Natural Science Foundation of China: 31672287.

#### **Competing Interests**

The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

# **Author Contributions**

- Qian Li performed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper, and approved the final draft.
- Xiaoling Zhu performed the experiments, analyzed the data, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper, and approved the final draft.
- Wei Xiong analyzed the data, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper, and approved the final draft.
- Yanqiu Zhu analyzed the data, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper, and approved the final draft.
- Jianghui Zhang analyzed the data, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper, and approved the final draft.
- Pathe Karim Djiba analyzed the data, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper, and approved the final draft.
- Xiao Lv conceived and designed the experiments, performed the experiments, prepared figures and/or tables, and approved the final draft.
- Yiping Luo conceived and designed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper, and approved the final draft.

# **Animal Ethics**

The following information was supplied relating to ethical approvals (i.e., approving body and any reference numbers):

The School of Life Sciences, Southwest University provided full approval for this research (LS-SWU/012/2016).

#### **Data Availability**

The following information was supplied regarding data availability: The raw data are available in the Supplemental Files.

### **Supplemental Information**

Supplemental information for this article can be found online at http://dx.doi.org/10.7717/ peerj.9242#supplemental-information.

# REFERENCES

- Audzijonyte A, Barneche DR, Baudron AR, Belmaker J, Clark T, Marshall CT, Morrongiello JR, Van Rijn I. 2019. Is oxygen limitation in warming waters a valid mechanism to explain decreased body sizes in aquatic ectotherms. *Global Ecology and Biogeography* 28(2):64–77 DOI 10.1111/geb.12847.
- Blaikie HB, Kerr SR. 1996. Effect of activity level on apparent heat increment in Atlantic cod, *Gadus morhua. Canadian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Sciences* 53:2093–2099.
- Brown JH, Gillooly JF, Allen AP, Savage VM, West GB. 2004. Toward a metabolic theory of ecology. *Ecology* 85(7):1771–1789 DOI 10.1890/03-9000.
- **CABI. 2019.** *Mylopharyngodon piceus (black amur), invasive species compendium.* Wallingford: CAB International.
- **Chen B, Fu S, Cao Z, Wang Y. 2019.** Effect of temperature on critical oxygen tension (P<sub>crit</sub>) and gill morphology in six cyprinids in the Yangtze River. *China Aquaculture* **508**:137–146 DOI 10.1016/j.aquaculture.2019.04.057.
- Clarke A, Johnston NM. 1999. Scaling of metabolic rate with body mass and temperature in teleost fish. *Journal of Animal Ecology* **68**(5):893–905 DOI 10.1046/j.1365-2656.1999.00337.x.
- Davison J. 1955. Body weight, cell surface and metabolic rate in anuran Amphibia. *Biological Bulletin* 109(3):407–419 DOI 10.2307/1539173.
- Dhillon RS, Yao L, Matey V, Chen B, Zhang A, Cao ZD, Fu SJ, Brauner CJ, Wang YX, Richards JG. 2013. Interspecific differences in hypoxia-induced gill remodeling in carp. *Physiological and Biochemical Zoology* 86(6):727–739 DOI 10.1086/673180.
- Fu SJ, Xie XJ. 2004. Nutritional homeostasis in carnivorous southern catfish (*Silurus meridionalis* Chen): is there a mechanism for increased energy expenditure during carbohydrate overfeeding? *Comparative Biochemistry & Physiology Part A* 139:359–363.
- Fu SJ, Xie X, Cao ZD. 2005. Effect of dietary composition on specific dynamic action in southern catfish *Silurus meridionalis* Chen. *Aquaculture Research* 36(14):1384–1390 DOI 10.1111/j.1365-2109.2005.01356.x.
- Gao ZX, Wang WM, Abbas K, Zhou XY, Yang Y, Diana JS, Wang HP, Wang HL, Li Y, Sun YH.
  2007. Haematological characterization of loach *Misgurnus anguillicaudatus*: comparison among diploid, triploid and tetraploid specimens. *Comparative Biochemistry & Physiology Part A* 147(4):1001–1008 DOI 10.1016/j.cbpa.2007.03.006.
- Gifford M, Timothy AC, William EP. 2013. The effects of temperature and activity on intraspecific scaling of metabolic rates in a lungless salamander. *Journal of Experimental Zoology Part A: Ecological Genetics and Physiology* 319(4):230–236 DOI 10.1002/jez.1787.
- Gillooly JF, Gomez JP, Mavrodiev EV, Rong Y, Mclamore ES. 2016. Body mass scaling of passive oxygen diffusion in endotherms and ectotherms. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 113(19):5340–5345 DOI 10.1073/pnas.1519617113.
- **Glazier DS. 2005.** Beyond the '3/4-power law': variation in the intra-and interspecific scaling of metabolic rate in animals. *Biological Reviews* **80(04)**:611–662 DOI 10.1017/S1464793105006834.
- **Glazier DS. 2008.** Effects of metabolic level on the body size scaling of metabolic rate in birds and mammals. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* **275(1641)**:1405–1410 DOI 10.1098/rspb.2008.0118.

- **Glazier DS. 2009.** Activity affects intraspecific body-size scaling of metabolic rate in ectothermic animals. *Journal of Comparative Physiology B* **179**(7):821–828 DOI 10.1007/s00360-009-0363-3.
- **Glazier DS. 2010.** A unifying explanation for diverse metabolic scaling in animals and plants. *Biological Reviews* **85(1)**:111–138 DOI 10.1111/j.1469-185X.2009.00095.x.
- Glazier DS. 2014a. Metabolic scaling in complex living systems. *Systems* 2(4):451–540 DOI 10.3390/systems2040451.
- **Glazier DS. 2014b.** Scaling of metabolic scaling within physical limits. *Systems* **2(4)**:425–450 DOI 10.3390/systems2040425.
- Glazier DS, Hirst AG, Atkinson D. 2015. Shape shifting predicts ontogenetic changes in metabolic scaling in diverse aquatic invertebrates. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 282(1802):20142302 DOI 10.1098/rspb.2014.2302.
- **Goodman RM, Heah TP. 2010.** Temperature-induced plasticity at cellular and organismal levels in the lizard *Anolis carolinensis. Integrative Zoology* **5(3)**:208–217 DOI 10.1111/j.1749-4877.2010.00206.x.
- Grigoriou P, Richardson CA. 2009. Effect of body mass, temperature and food deprivation on oxygen consumption rate of common cuttlefish *Sepia officinalis*. *Marine Biology* 156(12):2473–2481 DOI 10.1007/s00227-009-1272-4.
- Hermaniuk A, Rybacki M, Taylor JRE. 2016. Low temperature and polyploidy result in larger cell and body size in an ectothermic vertebrate. *Physiological and Biochemical Zoology* 89(2):118–129 DOI 10.1086/684974.
- Hirst AG, Glazier DS, Atkinson D. 2014. Body shape shifting during growth permits tests that distinguish between competing geometric theories of metabolic scaling. *Ecology Letters* 17(10):1274–1281 DOI 10.1111/ele.12334.
- Huang QD, Zhang YR, Liu ST, Wang W, Luo YP. 2013. Intraspecific scaling of the resting and maximum metabolic rates of the crucian carp (*Carassius auratus*). PLOS ONE 8(12):e82837 DOI 10.1371/journal.pone.0082837.
- Hughes GM. 1966. The dimensions of fish gills in relation to their function. *Journal of Experimental Biology* 45:177–195.
- Hughes GM. 1984. Scaling of respiratory areas in relation to oxygen consumption of vertebrates. *Cellular and Molecular Life Sciences* 40(6):519–524 DOI 10.1007/BF01982313.
- Hölker F. 2003. The metabolic rate of roach in relation to body size and temperature. *Journal of Fish Biology* 62(3):565–579 DOI 10.1046/j.1095-8649.2003.00048.x.
- Hölker F. 2006. Effects of body size and temperature on metabolism of bream compared to sympatric roach. *Animal Biology* 56(1):23–37 DOI 10.1163/157075606775904713.
- Itazawa Y, Oikawa S. 1983. Metabolic rates in excised tissues of carp. *Experientia* 39(2):160–161 DOI 10.1007/BF01958874.
- Jobling M. 1994. Fish bioenergetics. London: Chapman and Hall.
- Killen SS, Atkinson D, Glazier DS. 2010. The intraspecific scaling of metabolic rate with body mass in fishes depends on lifestyle and temperature. *Ecology Letters* 13(2):184–193 DOI 10.1111/j.1461-0248.2009.01415.x.
- **Kooijman SALM. 2009.** *Dynamic energy budget theory for metabolic organization.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Kozłowski J, Konarzewski M, Gawelczyk AT. 2003. Cell size as a link between noncoding DNA and metabolic rate scaling. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 100(24):14080–14085 DOI 10.1073/pnas.2334605100.

- Lefevre S, McKenzie DJ, Nilsson GE. 2017. Models projecting the fate of fish populations under climate change need to be based on valid physiological mechanisms. *Global Change Biology* 23:3449–3459 DOI 10.1111/gcb.13652.hal-01928499.
- Lefevre S, McKenzie DJ, Nilsson GE. 2018. In modelling effects of global warming, invalid assumptions lead to unrealistic projections. *Global Change Biology* 24:553–556 DOI 10.1111/gcb.13978.
- Li G, Lv X, Zhou J, Shen C, Xia DY, Xie H, Luo YP. 2018. Are the surface areas of the gills and body involved with changing metabolic scaling with temperature? *Journal of Experimental Biology* 221(8):174474 DOI 10.1242/jeb.174474.
- Luo YP, He DC, Li G, Xie H, Zhang YR, Huang QD. 2015. Intraspecific metabolic scaling exponent depends on red blood cell size in fishes. *Journal of Experimental Biology* 218(10):1496–1503 DOI 10.1242/jeb.117739.
- Luo YP, Li Q, Zhu XL, Zhou J, Shen C, Xia DY, Djiba PK, Xie H, Lv X, Jia J, Li G. 2020. Ventilation frequency reveals the roles of exchange surface areas in metabolic scaling. *Physiological and Biochemical Zoology* **93**(1):13–22 DOI 10.1086/706115.
- Luo YP, Wang QQ. 2012. Effects of body mass and temperature on routine metabolic rate of juvenile largemouth bronze gudgeon *Coreius guichenoti*. *Journal of Fish Biology* **80(4)**:842–851 DOI 10.1111/j.1095-8649.2012.03229.x.
- Lv X, Xie H, Xia DY, Shen C, Li J, Luo YP. 2018. Mass scaling of the resting and maximum metabolic rates of the black carp. *Journal of Comparative Physiology B* 188(4):591–598 DOI 10.1007/s00360-018-1154-5.
- Maciak S, Janko K, Kotusz J, Choleva L, Boron A, Juchno D, Kujawa R, Kozłowski J, Konarzewski M. 2011. Standard metabolic rate (SMR) is inversely related to erythrocyte and genome size in allopolyploid fish of *Cobitis taenia* hybrid complex. *Functional Ecology* 25(5):1072–1078 DOI 10.1111/j.1365-2435.2011.01870.x.
- Melzner F, Bock C, Pörtner HO. 2007. Allometry of thermal limitation in the cephalopod Sepia officinalis. Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology Part A: Molecular & Integrative Physiology 146(2):149–154 DOI 10.1016/j.cbpa.2006.07.023.
- Newell RC. 1973. Factors affecting the respiration of intertidal invertebrates. *American Zoologist* 13(2):513–528 DOI 10.1093/icb/13.2.513.
- Nico LG, Neilson ME. 2019. *Mylopharyngodon piceus (Richardson, 1846)*. Gainesville: U.S. Geological Survey, Nonindigenous Aquatic Species Database.
- **Ohlberger J, Mehner T, Staaks G, Hölker F. 2008.** Temperature-related physiological adaptations promote ecological divergence in a sympatric species pair of temperate freshwater fish, *Coregonus* spp. *Functional Ecology* **22(3)**:501–508 DOI 10.1111/j.1365-2435.2008.01391.x.
- Ohlberger J, Mehner T, Staaks G, Hölker F. 2012. Intraspecific temperature dependence of the scaling of metabolic rate with body mass in fishes and its ecological implications. *Oikos* 121(2):245–251 DOI 10.1111/j.1600-0706.2011.19882.x.
- **Ohlberger J, Staaks G, Hölker F. 2007.** Effects of temperature, swimming speed and body mass on standard and active metabolic rate in vendace (*Coregonus albula*). *Journal of Comparative Physiology B* **177(8)**:905–916 DOI 10.1007/s00360-007-0189-9.
- **Oikawa S, Takemori M, Itazawa Y. 1992.** Relative growth of organs and parts of a marine teleost, the porgy, *Pagrus major*, with special reference to metabolism size relationships. *Japanese Journal of Ichthyology* **39(3)**:243–249 DOI 10.1007/BF02905482.
- Okie JG. 2013. General models for the spectra of surface area scaling strategies of cells and organisms: fractality, geometric dissimilitude, and internalization. *American Naturalist* 181(3):421–439 DOI 10.1086/669150.

- **Paranjape MA. 1967.** Molting and respiration respiration of *Euphausiids*. *Journal of the Fisheries Research Board of Canada* **24(6)**:1229–1240 DOI 10.1139/f67-105.
- Pauly D. 1981. The relationships between gill surface area and growth performance in fish: A generalization of von Bertalanffy's theory of growth. *Berichte der Deutschen Wissenschaftlichen Kommission für Meeresforschung* 28(4):251–282.
- Pauly D, Cheung WW. 2018a. Sound physiological knowledge and principles in modeling shrinking of fishes under climate change. *Global Change Biology* 24:15–26 DOI 10.1111/gcb.13831.
- Pauly D, Cheung WW. 2018b. On confusing cause and effect in the oxygen limitation of fish. Global Change Biology 24:743–744 DOI 10.1111/gcb.14383.
- Peck MA, Buckley LJ, Bengtson DA. 2005. Effects of temperature, body size and feeding on rates of metabolism in young-of-the-year haddock. *Journal of Fish Biology* 66(4):911–923 DOI 10.1111/j.0022-1112.2005.00633.x.
- **Phillips RB, Kondev J, Theriot J, Orme N, Garcia H. 2009.** *Physical biology of the cell.* New York: Garland Science.
- **R Development Core Team. 2018.** *R: a language and environment for statistical computing.* Vienna: The R Foundation for Statistical Computing. *Available at https://www.R-project.org.*
- Reich PB. 2001. Body size, geometry, longevity and metabolism: do plant leaves behave like animal bodies? *Trends in Ecology & Evolution* 16(12):674–680 DOI 10.1016/S0169-5347(01)02306-0.
- Rubner M. 1883. Über den einfluss einfluss der kökörpergrösse auf stoffstoff- und kraftwechselkraftwechsel. *Zeitschrift für Biologie* 19:535–562.
- Sollid J, Nilsson GE. 2006. Plasticity of respiratory structures—adaptive remodeling of fish gills induced by ambient oxygen and temperature. *Respiratory Physiology & Neurobiology* 154(1-2):241-251 DOI 10.1016/j.resp.2006.02.006.
- Sollid J, Weber RE, Nilsson GE. 2005. Temperature alters the respiratory surface area of crucian carp Carassius carassius and goldfish Carassius auratus. Journal of Experimental Biology 208(6):1109–1116 DOI 10.1242/jeb.01505.
- Starostová Z, Konarzewski M, Kozłowski J, Kratochvíl L. 2013. Ontogeny of metabolic rate and red blood cell size in eyelid geckos: species follow different paths. *PLOS ONE* 8(5):e64715 DOI 10.1371/journal.pone.0064715.
- Starostová Z, Kubička L, Konarzewski M, Kozłowski J, Kratochvíl L. 2009. Cell size but not genome size affects scaling of metabolic rate in eyelid geckos. *American Naturalist* 174(3):100–105 DOI 10.1086/603610.
- Szarski H. 1983. Cell size and the concept of wasteful and frugal evolutionary strategies. *Journal of Theoretical Biology* 105(2):201–209 DOI 10.1016/S0022-5193(83)80002-2.
- Van Voorhies WA. 1996. Bergmann size clines: a simple explanation for their occurrence in ectotherms. *Evolution* 50(3):1259–1264 DOI 10.1111/j.1558-5646.1996.tb02366.x.
- Verdouw H, Van Echteld CJA, Dekkers EMJ. 1978. Ammonia determination based on indophenol formation with sodium salicylate. *Water Research* 12(6):399–402 DOI 10.1016/0043-1354(78)90107-0.
- Wang Q, Wang W, Huang Q, Zhang Y, Luo YP. 2012. Effect of meal size on the specific dynamic action of the juvenile snakehead (*Channa argus*). *Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology Part A: Molecular & Integrative Physiology* 161(4):401–405 DOI 10.1016/j.cbpa.2011.12.015.

- Wells PR, Pinder AW. 1996a. The respiratory development of Atlantic salmon. I. Morphometry of gills, yolk sac and body surface. *Journal of Experimental Biology* 199:2725–2736.
- Wells PR, Pinder AW. 1996b. The respiratory development of Atlantic salmon. II—partitioning of oxygen uptake among gills, yolk sac and body surfaces. *Journal of Experimental Biology* 199:2737–2744.
- West GB, Brown JH, Enquist BJ. 1997. A general model for the origin of allometric scaling laws in biology. *Science* 276(5309):122–126 DOI 10.1126/science.276.5309.122.
- Xie XJ, Sun RY. 1990. The bioenergetics of the southern catfish (*Silurus meridionalis* Chen): resting metabolic rate as a function of body weight and temperature. *Physiological Zoology* 63(6):1181–1195 DOI 10.1086/physzool.63.6.30152639.
- Xiong W, Zhu Y, Zhu X, Li Q, Luo YP. 2020. Effects of gill excision and food deprivation on metabolic scaling in the goldfish *Carassius auratus*. *Journal of Experimental Zoology Part A: Ecological and Integrative Physiology* 333(3):194–200 DOI 10.1002/jez.2341.
- Yoshiyama K, Klausmeier CA. 2008. Optimal cell size for resource uptake in fluids: a new facet of resource competition. *American Naturalist* 171(1):59–70 DOI 10.1086/523950.
- Zhang YR, Huang QD, Liu ST, He DC, Wei G, Luo YP. 2014. Intraspecific mass scaling of metabolic rates in grass carp (*Ctenopharyngodon idellus*). *Journal of Comparative Physiology B* 184(3):347–354 DOI 10.1007/s00360-014-0802-7.