

Sargassum* blooms in the Caribbean alter the trophic structure of the sea urchin *Diadema antillarum

Nancy Cabanillas-Terán^{1,2*}, Héctor A. Hernández-Arana², Miguel A. Ruiz-Zárate², Alejandro Vega-Zepeda², Alberto Sánchez-González³

¹Conacyt–El Colegio de la Frontera Sur, Avenida Centenario km 5.5, Quintana Roo, Chetumal 77014, Mexico

² El Colegio de la Frontera Sur. Av. Centenario Km. 5.5 C.P. 77014, Chetumal, Quintana Roo, México

³Centro Interdisciplinario de Ciencias Marinas del Instituto Politécnico Nacional. (CICIMAR). Av. IPN SN. Col. Playa Palo de Sta. Rita. CP 23096 La Paz, Baja California Sur, México

Corresponding Author:

Nancy Cabanillas Terán

Conacyt- El Colegio de la Frontera Sur

Email address: ncabanillas@ecosur.mx +5219831648284 <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1268-5900>

Abstract

The recent arrival of large masses of drifting *Sargassum* has caused changes in the natural dynamics of Caribbean coastal ecosystems. Atypical and massive mats of *S. fluitans* and *S. natans* with exceptional accumulations ashore were observed in the summer of 2015. This study ~~provides a trophic sketch using~~ stable isotopes to assess for the impact of generated by *Sargassum* blooms on the ~~natural flow of the trophic structure in~~ trophic dynamics of the *Diadema antillarum* ~~urchin, a keystone herbivore one of the main on many~~ Caribbean ~~reefs~~ sea ~~urchin species~~. Bayesian models were used to estimate the variations in the relative proportions of carbon and nitrogen of assimilated algal resources. At three lagoon reef sites, the niche breadth of *D. antillarum* was analysed and compared under massive influx of drifting *Sargassum* spp. vs no influx of *Sargassum* blooms. The effects of the leachates generated by the decomposition of *Sargassum* led to hypoxic conditions on these reefs and reduced the taxonomic diversity of macroalgal food sources available to *Diadema* ~~modified the organic matter in the environment, with negative consequences in the benthic trophic structure~~. Our trophic data support the hypothesis that the processes of assimilation of carbon and nitrogen were modified limiting the

Commented [kc1]: Vague wording – please state more specific results

31 natural herbivory of *D. antillarum*. The Stable Isotopes Analysis in R (SIAR) indicated that under
32 the influence of *Sargassum* blooms certain assimilated algal resources (*Dictyota*, *Halimeda* and
33 *Udotea*) were higher because of the limiting available resources. The Stable Isotope Bayesian
34 Ellipses in R (SIBER) analysis suggested a reduction in trophic niche particularly in a protected
35 reef lagoon.

Commented [kc2]: Vague wording

36 **Keywords:** Echinoids, pelagic macroalgae, stable isotopes, trophic ecology, coral reefs; Niche
37 breadth, Mexican Caribbean.

38

39 Introduction

40 The arrival of massive amounts of pelagic *Sargassum* spp. has caused changes in the natural
41 benthic dynamics of Caribbean coastal ecosystems for the last eight years (Gower, Young &
42 King, 2013; Schell, Goodwin & Siuda, 2015). Pelagic *Sargassum* is a complex of two species,
43 namely *S. fluitans* and *S. natans* (Oyesiku & Egunyomi, 2014). The Mexican Caribbean shores
44 have faced atypical massive mats of pelagic *Sargassum* in the summer of 2015 (van Tussenbroek
45 et al., 2017; Cuevas, Uribe-Martínez & Liceaga-Correa, 2018) and almost all of 2018. Several
46 studies revealed that these atypical massive mats of *Sargassum* have a new possible distribution
47 source different to the historic North Atlantic Recirculation Region (NARR) known as “The
48 Sargasso Sea” (Schell, Goodwin & Siuda, 2015). The massive influx on the Caribbean shores
49 have its most likely explanation of new origin in the North Equatorial Recirculation Region
50 (NERR) (Johnson et al., 2013; Schell, Goodwin & Siuda, 2015).

Commented [kc3]: Please re-word

51
52 High oceanic temperatures and nutrient inputs (Franks, Johnson & Ko, 2016; Wang et al., 2018),
53 among other oceanographic coupled patterns like changes in patterns of surface currents are the
54 probable cause of a new region of *Sargassum* flourishing (Johnson et al., 2013; Gower, Young
55 & King, 2013; Sissini et al., 2017).

Commented [kc4]: Please incorporate this into the previous paragraph

56 Since 2011, extensive masses of *Sargassum* appeared in unusual ways in oceanic waters off
57 northern Brazil (De Széchy et al., 2012; Sissini et al., 2017), along the West Indies and Caribbean
58 coasts (Gower, Young & King, 2013) from Trinidad to the Dominican Republic (Rodríguez-

59 Martínez, van Tussenbroek & Jordán-Dahlgren, 2016; van Tussenbroek et al., 2017), and along
60 the west African coast from Sierra Leone to Ghana (Smetacek & Zingone, 2013).

61 During 2015 the accumulation reached up to 2.4 m³ per linear meter of beach (Rodríguez-
62 Martínez, van Tussenbroek & Jordán-Dahlgren, 2016). Changes ~~in habitat structure of the~~
63 ~~original habitat can directly~~ influences ~~directly on~~ trophic dynamics (Hunter & Price, 1992;
64 Sweatman, Layman & Fourqurean, 2017), ~~have been shown to cause~~with synergistic effects on
65 coral reefs (Smetacek & Zingone, 2013). ~~such as the~~ ~~For example, Harmful harmful~~ macroalgae
66 blooms ~~that~~ have been recognized as drivers of degradation in coral reef habitats (Lapointe et al.,
67 2005) and have effects on the diversity of reef biota (Bauman et al., 2010; Louime, Fortune &
68 Gervais, 2017), like variations in the sea urchin populations (Lapointe et al., 2010). The
69 decomposition of the *Sargassum* biomass that reached the coast is a disturbance agent that can
70 modify the physical, physiological and ecological processes in near-shore coral reef communities.
71 The modified flow of carbon and nitrogen by this disturbance could have ~~adverse~~ ~~negative~~ effects
72 at different scales. *Sargassum* disturbance, coupled with the pre-existing threat on coral reefs, add
73 to the drivers of Anthropocene reefs degradation (Alvarez-Filip et al., 2011; Cramer et al., 2012).
74 The massive decomposition of *Sargassum* is a disturbance that can alter the ecological processes
75 in near-shore coral reef communities (Arellano-Verdejo, Lazcano-Hernandez & Cabanillas-
76 Terán, 2019). The main ~~detrimental~~ effect would be on the trophic chain of the benthic
77 communities, but the negative effects would ~~be~~ also act on tourism and local fisheries (Ferreira et
78 al., 2009; Solarin et al., 2014; Louime, Fortune & Gervais, 2017; Cuevas, Uribe-Martínez &
79 Liceaga-Correa, 2018). The effect of *Sargassum* and their leachates on the diet of *D. antillarum*
80 can improve our understanding on the impact on trophic ecology of one of the most important sea
81 urchins of the Mexican Caribbean.

82 Evaluating consumers and resources through a trophic approach by tracking the relationships
83 between consumers and prey provides relevant information on the trophic structure and dynamics
84 of a benthic community (Minagawa & Wada, 1984; Vanderklift, Kendrick & Smit, 2006; Behmer
85 & Joern, 2008). Stable isotopes of Carbon ($\delta^{13}\text{C}$) and Nitrogen ($\delta^{15}\text{N}$) have been used in marine
86 ecosystems to determine the feeding habits of species (Peterson & Fry, 1987), nutrient migrations
87 within food webs, the trophic position of organisms and their contribution at all trophic levels
88 (Vander Zanden & Rasmussen, 1996). It is also possible to trace the origin and transformation of

Commented [kc5]: Run-on sentence – please shorten or split into two sentences.

Commented [kc6]: Can you please be more specific – exactly how would *Sargassum* influx be expected to *negatively* affect coral reef trophic dynamics?

Commented [kc7]: Please explicitly state why you are focusing on *Diadema* – because it is a keystone herbivore whose dieoff is linked to coral-macroalgal phase shifts, and whose recent recovery seems to be causing coral recovery.

NOTE: I see you have added a paragraph stating the above, but it is in the Discussion. Please move it here.

the ingested organic matter and also to detect changes in the trophic positions of organisms that coexist in the same habitat (Hobson, 1999; Vanderklift, Kendrick & Smit, 2006; Rodríguez-Barreras et al., 2016).

Stable carbon and nitrogen isotope ratios provide time-integrated information regarding feeding relationships and energy flow through food webs (DeNiro & Epstein, 1981; Peterson & Fry, 1987; Vander Zanden & Rasmussen, 2001). Moreover, stable isotopes can be used to study the trophic niche breadth(?) of a species (Bearhop et al., 2004; Parnell et al., 2010; Phillips et al., 2014) which is directly influenced by consumers and resource input, providing quantitative information, so it can be treated as a niche for isotopic ecology as defined by Newsome et al. (2007) and Boecklen et al. (2011). Stable isotope analyses are useful for assessing the health of

ecosystems because it is possible to associate consumers trophodynamics and niche width with habitat disturbances (Layman et al., 2007b; Hamaoka et al., 2010) ~~and to study the trophic ecology of species with foraging habits like sea urchins (Tomas et al., 2006; Vanderklift, Kendrick & Smit, 2006; Prado, Alcoverro & Romero, 2010; Rodríguez-Barreras et al., 2016).~~ It

is also possible to detect changes in the trophic spectrum in the event of anthropogenic impacts or unusual conditions that cause a shift in the ecosystem (Wing et al., 2008; Prado, Alcoverro & Romero, 2010; Tomas, Box & Terrados, 2011; Cabanillas-Terán et al., 2016). Under this view of the massive arrival of pelagic macroalgae, sea urchins are a good model to understand the variability in the benthic trophic chain, as they are considered generalist consumers with a plastic feeding habit (Lawrence, 1975; Vanderklift, Kendrick & Smit, 2006). Echinoids have the capability to modify the community structure through foraging behavior (Carpenter, 1986; Hay & Fenical, 1988; Sala et al., 1998; Eklöf et al., 2008). The main reason to focus this study on *D. antillarum* is that this species is and was the major shallow-hard-bottom grazer in our study sites.

(Jorgensen, Espinoza-Ávalos & Bahena-Basave, 2008; Jordán-Garza et al., 2008). The relative position of $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ vs $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ echinoids displayed in a bi-plot can give insights about organism responses to niche shifts, diet variability and habitat modification (Layman et al., 2007a,b, 2012; Sweatman, Layman & Fourqurean, 2017).

~~The stable isotopes of Carbon ($\delta^{13}\text{C}$) and Nitrogen ($\delta^{15}\text{N}$) have been used in marine ecosystems to determine the feeding habits of species (Peterson & Fry, 1987), nutrient migrations within food webs, the trophic position of organisms and their contribution at all trophic levels (Vander~~

Commented [kc8]: Run-on sentence – please shorten or split into two sentences.

Commented [kc9]: Is this the same as niche width?

Commented [kc10]: Please move this up to beginning of intro, where you state that your study is focused on *D. antillarum*.

Zanden & Rasmussen, 1996). It is also possible to trace the origin and transformation of the ingested organic matter and also to detect changes in the trophic positions of organisms that coexist in the same habitat (Hobson, 1999; Vanderklift, Kendrick & Smit, 2006; Rodríguez-Barreras et al., 2016).

Stable carbon and nitrogen isotope ratios provide time integrated information regarding feeding relationships and energy flow through food webs (DeNiro & Epstein, 1981; Peterson & Fry, 1987; Vander Zanden & Rasmussen, 2001). Stable isotopes moreover can be used to study the trophic niche of a species (Bearhop et al., 2004; Parnell et al., 2010; Phillips et al., 2014) which is directly influenced by consumers and resource input, providing quantitative information, so it can be treated as a niche for isotopic ecology as defined by Newsome et al. (2007) and Boecklen et al. (2011).

The overarching aim of this study was to determine the variations in the relative proportions of carbon and nitrogen of assimilated algal resources and the niche breadth of *D. antillarum* under massive influx of drifting *Sargassum* spp. vs no influx of *Sargassum* blooms at back reefs. We also aimed to determine whether pelagic *Sargassum* was a substantial source of energy for *D. antillarum*.

The approach used was to compare the $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values before and after the influx of *Sargassum* and to track changes in the trophic ecology of *D. antillarum* (diet and trophic position) based on the evidence that $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ are strongly influenced by their food resources (Phillips et al., 2014), and the relative position in $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ vs $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ bi plot from consumers displays information about food web structure (Layman et al., 2012), and provides providing consumer's responses to niche shifts and source variations (Layman et al., 2007b). Hence, our hypotheses were that a significant change in the available algal sources and a shift on the trophic structure were expected as a result of the *Sargassum* subsidy.

Commented [kc11]: Please incorporate into previous paragraph, and remove redundant statements.

Commented [kc12]: No ecological mechanism is given for how *Sargassum* would specifically be expected to shift available algal food sources – please provide this earlier in the intro.

Material & Methods

Study sites

We determined the stable isotopes of carbon and nitrogen of *D. antillarum* at three reef lagoons with different distances ~~from the beach to the reef crest~~ and strategies for managing *Sargassum* influx (figure 1).

Commented [kc13]: Were sites intentionally selected to span different distances, or was this just coincidence?

Mahahual (18°42'16.96"N 87° 42.619"W) is located in the northern part of the Mesoamerican Barrier Reef System in the state of Quintana Roo (MBRS). Mahahual is a former fishing village but during the last two decades has undergone reef degradation due to anthropogenic impact (Martínez-Rendis et al., 2016). It has a narrow reef lagoon (230-450 m).~~with restrictive circulation~~ *Sargassum* management in this locality was active through removing it out of beach and its *ex situ* disposition.

Xahuayxol (18°30'21.78"N; 87°45'24.84"W) has a larger reef lagoon than Mahahual, 300 to 500 m ~~from the beach to the reef crest, active circulation and higher algal masses by the coastal dynamics that apparently accumulated them gradually. However,~~ *Sargassum* was not removed from the beach (at least not in a systematic way) and remained accumulated on the shore. Xahuayxol is located south of Mahahual. This reef is the northern limit of the Marine Protected area Parque Nacional Arrecifes de Xcalak (PNAX) and human activities are less important than in Mahahual (Schmitter-Soto et al., 2017).

Xcalak (18°14'7.68"N; 87°50'1.46"W), at the southern limit of the Mexican Caribbean, is part of PNAX since 2000. It is also part of the Mesoamerican Barrier Reef System, MBRS (Hoffman, 2009). It has a wide reef lagoon (950-1200 m) ~~with active circulation~~, and *Sargassum* was accumulated in large amounts. There was an active but less intense and localized *Sargassum* management and its final disposal was *in situ* (on the highest part of beach).

The main strategy implemented by local authorities at some beaches with massive arrival of macroalgae, included the removal and its disposal in the highest part of the beach or in places destined *ex profeso*, ~~but the *Sargassum* removal was not quantified and the information about that included here is only preliminary.~~

Commented [kc14]: Please move this to end of first paragraph in Methods

~~At all sampled sites, reef lagoon circulation from wave action because of wave breaking is the dominant forcing mechanism within many wave-exposed reef systems (Mariño-Tapia et al., 2011), and d~~ During the period from June to August in our study area, the wave orbital velocity is

174 over the threshold of motion (Maldonado-Sánchez et al. 2019), indicating active circulation in the
175 reef lagoons.

Commented [kc15]: How does this relate to your study questions – would this affect the residence time of Sargassum?

176

177 Collecting and processing data

178 This study covers two periods: Under *Sargassum* effect (USE) during the months of July-August
179 2015 and without *Sargassum* effect (WSE) in July-August 2016. USE sampling for stable isotope
180 analysis included drifting *Sargassum* (mixture of *S. fluitans* and *S. natans*), turf associated to
181 pelagic *Sargassum*, benthic macroalgae, local turf and 19 individuals of *D. antillarum*. WSE
182 Sampling included benthic macroalgae, local turf and 15 individuals of *D. antillarum* (see
183 sampling details ST1). ~~Samples sizes –were– based –on –previous– studies–~~ (Rodríguez, 2003;
184 Tomas et al., 2006; Wing et al., 2008; Rodríguez-Barreras et al., 2016). The sampling sites were
185 at coastal lagoons in the back reef zone (Section c, Fig. 2), zone with no visible presence of
186 *Sargassum* leachates (van Tussenbroek, et al. 2017) and where *D. antillarum* is distributed
187 (Steneck & Lang, 2003; Jorgensen, Espinoza-Ávalos & Bahena-Basave, 2008; Jordán-Garza et
188 al., 2008; Maldonado-Sánchez, 2018).

Commented [kc16]: Please be more specific

189 USE measurements

190 USE included measurements of dissolved oxygen (mg l^{-1}) recorded with a calibrated Multi-
191 parameter water quality checker HORIBA 50 at Mahahual, Xahuayxol and Xcalak.
192 Measurements of dissolved oxygen were made at points distributed in three sections from areas
193 with decomposing *Sargassum* spp. (section a), leachates (section b -dark brown water-) and reef
194 lagoon areas without *Sargassum* leachates (section c) (figure 2).

Commented [kc17]: For clarity, I suggest you do away with the acronyms, and just use "pre-Sargassum" and "with Sargassum", or something similar.

Commented [kc18]: In the intro, only stable isotope analyses are mentioned. Please state in the Intro that oxygen measurements were also taken, and why this information was collected.

195 Pelagic *Sargassum* spp., turf (benthic turf and the associated turf to pelagic *Sargassum*) and
196 macroalgae samples were collected in coral reef patches of section c (back reef zone) for each
197 sampling site.

198 USE and WSE measurements

199 We collected algal samples to obtain biomass, and for stable isotope analysis using nine quadrats
200 (50 x 50 cm) per site. Pelagic *Sargassum* biomass was calculated based on sunken thalli and

201 overlaid on reef substrates inside the quadrats. The quadrats were located randomly within the sea
202 urchin habitat (radius of 15 m from collected echinoids). The substrate inside each quadrat was
203 scrapped, carefully removed, collected in bags, and frozen for later analysis.

204 Macroalgae were identified according to Littler and Littler (2000). Analysis were performed to
205 genus level. For biomass estimates samples were dried for 48 h in an oven at 60°C. Samples were
206 weighed with a digital balance (standard error =0.0001 g). To determine *D. antillarum*
207 differential algae assimilation considering USE and WSE, algae samples were pooled per site.
208 The sampled echinoids and algal species for this study are not threatened. The collection permit
209 was obtained from the CONAPESCA (PPF/DGOPA-002/17).

210 The collected individuals of *D. antillarum* were at the same depth range (1.5-2.5 m) and only
211 individuals greater than 5.0 cm in test diameter were collected to avoid any ontogenic effect.
212 Samples were frozen shortly after collection and processed later at the laboratory. The muscles of
213 Aristotle's lanterns were carefully removed and washed from the stomach contents to estimate
214 algal assimilation by *D. antillarum* because this tissue offers a time-integrated measure of carbon
215 and nitrogen assimilated sources (Polunin et al., 2001; Ben-David & Schell, 2001; Phillips &
216 Koch, 2002).

217 Macroalgae and local turf, pelagic *Sargassum* species (*S. fluitans* and *S. natans*), turf associated
218 to pelagic *Sargassum*, and echinoids muscle samples were rinsed with filtered water, dried at 50°
219 C during 48 h, grounded to a fine powder and placed in glass vial for isotope analyses. To
220 remove carbonates from some algal species (eg. *Halimeda* spp. *Penicillus* spp. etc), the samples
221 were washed with diluted HCl at 1 N prior to drying to avoid disturbance in the mass
222 spectrometer reading.

223 A subsample of each algae and muscle (1mg) was taken to evaluate the $^{13}\text{C}/^{12}\text{C}$ and $^{15}\text{N}/^{14}\text{N}$ ratios
224 using a Delta V Plus Mass Spectrometer. Catalysts silvered cobaltous/cobaltic oxide and
225 chromium oxide were used. Carbon and nitrogen samples were analysed in a dual isotope mode
226 at the Centro Interdisciplinario de Ciencias Marinas from Instituto Politécnico Nacional. Isotope
227 samples were loaded into tin-capsules and placed in a 50-position automated Zero Blank sample
228 carousel on a COSTECH 4020 elemental analyzer. The carbon and nitrogen isotopic results were

expressed in standard delta notation relative to Vienna Pee Dee Belemnite (VPDB) and to atmospheric air.

$$\delta^{13}_C = \left[\left(\frac{\left(\frac{^{13}_C}{^{12}_C} \right)_{Sample}}{\left(\frac{^{13}_C}{^{12}_C} \right)_{Standard}} \right) - 1 \right] \times 1000 (‰)$$

and

$$\delta^{15}_N = \left[\left(\frac{\left(\frac{^{15}_N}{^{14}_N} \right)_{Sample}}{\left(\frac{^{15}_N}{^{14}_N} \right)_{Standard}} \right) - 1 \right] \times 1000 (‰)$$

The standard deviations of δ^{13}_C and δ^{15}_N replicate analyses were estimated; the precision values were 0.2‰ for carbon and nitrogen isotope measurements. In addition, we calculated the trophic level (TL) according to Hobson and Welch (1992) for every individual of *D. antillarum* in each site, expressed as:

$$TL = \frac{1 + (Nm - Nb)}{TEF}$$

Where Nm is the mean δ^{15}_N ratio of each sea urchin, Nb is average basis δ^{15}_N value of the algal community, and TEF is the given value for the trophic enrichment factor (TEF). We assumed a TEF of 2.4 following Moore and Semmens (2008).

Data analysis

The relative contribution of algae to the diet of the sea urchins *D. antillarum* was estimated with a Bayesian isotopic mixing model (SIAR, Parnell & Jackson, 2013), which included the isotopic signatures, fractionation and variability to estimate the probability distribution of the contribution of the food source to a mixture. This procedure supplied accurate information about the contribution of algal species to the sea urchin tissues, as it provided the proportion for every source and recognized the main sources as important components of the diet under different circumstances (Peterson, 1999; Fry, 2006; Wing et al., 2008). To run the model, the isotopic discrimination factor values used were 2.4 ± 1.6 ‰ (mean $\pm$ SD) for δ^{15}_N , and 0.4 ± 1.3 ‰ (mean $\pm$

Commented [kc19]: Please be more specific

SD) for $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ (Minagawa & Wada, 1984; Fry & Sherr, 1989; Moore & Semmens, 2008; Cabanillas-Terán et al., 2016).

The following algal taxa/groups were ~~pooled~~ considered for the mixing models analysis, *Caulerpa*, *Codium*, *Dictyota*, *Halimeda*, *Laurencia*, *Lobophora*, *Padina*, *Penicillus*, *Sargassum polyceratum*, *Stypopodium*, turf, and *Udotea* ~~with the exception of the morpho-functional group turf~~. The sources for the model were selected following the theoretical geometric assumptions of the mixing model according to Phillips et al. (2014) and Rodríguez-Barreras et al. (2015) to ensure reliable resources. Samples of *D. antillarum* did not require lipid extraction since C:N ratios of Aristotle lantern's muscle were lower than 3.5 (Post et al., 2007).

We performed a comparison USE and WSE between the niche width and overlap for *D. antillarum* by using Stable Isotope Bayesian Ellipses in R (SIBER) (Jackson et al., 2011) from the SIAR package (Parnell & Jackson, 2013). This procedure performs metrics based on ellipses and provides the standard ellipse corrected area (SEAc) used as the trophic niche breadth and the overlap between ellipses, presuming that values close to 1 exhibit a higher trophic overlap. Models were run with 200 000 iterations and a burn in of 50 000.

~~Prior to the statistical analyses, the~~ homogeneity and normality of variance were tested by performing a Kolmogorov-Smirnov and a Cochran's test (Zar, 1999). ~~Nitrogen data followed the premises of parametric analysis, but the carbon data and biomass required a power transformation for reaching normality and homogeneity of variance~~ (Box & Cox, 1964). We ran two-way ANOVA using the functions aov and glm from the Gaussian family to test the differences on the isotopic ratios of carbon and nitrogen values to compare the effect (WSE and USE) between sites and their interaction. Statistics were performed with $\alpha < 0.05$ (R Core Team, 1.0.153, 2017).

Results

The dissolved oxygen values USE indicated that the effects of the leachates generated by the decomposition process, together with the organic material carried in their vegetal structures, ~~modified the reduced the~~ values of dissolved oxygen in the benthic ecosystem, ~~with negative consequences in the benthic structure~~. The reef lagoons of Mahahual, Xahuayxol and Xcalak displayed dissolved overall oxygen values ranged from 0.67mg l^{-1} at Xahuayxol to 7.05mg l^{-1} at Xcalak. The overall values of dissolved oxygen displayed the lowest concentrations for section a

Commented [kc20]: Please state the values for all three reefs, and that values (significantly?) decline as sites are closer to shore/Sargassum accumulations.

281 near the shoreline (Figure 3). The lowest mean value was exhibited in Xcalak ($1.0 \pm 0.1 \text{ mg l}^{-1}$)
282 and higher values beyond offshore section c. The highest mean value was displayed for Xcalak
283 ($4.7 \pm 0.4 \text{ mg l}^{-1}$).

284 Analysis of macroalgal $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$

285 Prior the stable isotope analysis was carried out, macroalgal biomass per site was considered to
286 have additional information about the reliable sources used for the resources contribution to *D.*
287 *antillarum*. Biomass data for benthic taxa displayed no significant differences between USE and
288 WSE per effect, but significant differences were found among localities (ANOVA, $\text{df}=2$, $F=8.24$,
289 $p<0.0001$). Mahahual had the highest mean benthic biomass values ($55.2 \text{ dry weight m}^{-2}$)
290 followed by Xahuayxol with ($38.8 \text{ dry weight m}^{-2}$) and Xcalak ($16 \text{ dry weight m}^{-2} \pm$). WSE
291 biomass average values for local benthic algae ranged from $3.01 \text{ dry weight m}^{-2} \pm 0.95$ (*Codium*
292 spp. at Xcalak) to $133.50 \text{ dry weight m}^{-2} \pm 30.29$ (*Halimeda* spp. at Mahahual). USE values ranged
293 from $7.75 \text{ dry weight m}^{-2} \pm 5.4$ (*Caulerpa* at Xcalak) to $145.99 \text{ dry weight m}^{-2} \pm 36.21$ (*Halimeda*
294 spp. at Mahahual, Table 1). Genus-level Biomass-biomass of pelagic taxa showed no significant
295 differences per site neither at genus level, however *Sargassum fluitans* displayed the highest
296 biomass values.

Commented [kc21]: This is very vague and confusing wording - please clarify and be more specific about your exact predictions.

Formatted: Font: Not Italic

297 Pre- and with-Sargassum values Based on the established categories WSE and USE significant
298 differences were found in overall benthic algae values of $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ (ANOVA, $\text{df}=1$, $F=20.27$,
299 $p<0.0001$). Specifically, Therefore under *Sargassum* blooms USE most of the algae exhibited
300 isotopic signatures with significantly depleted $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ (Table 2).

Commented [kc22]: Signifying..... PLEASE PROVIDE CLEAR ECOLOGICAL INTERPETATIONS FOR EACH OF YOUR RESULTS!

301 As for $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ USE ratios fluctuated from -21.98 to -9.23‰ and WSE from -20.90 to -5.65‰ .
302 Considering only the algae presented in both sampling periods (WSE and USE) there was no
303 significant difference in $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ among sites (ANOVA, $\text{df}=2$, $F=0.55$, $p>0.05$) neither was
304 significant difference analysing the effect (ANOVA, $\text{df}=1$, $F=1.14$, $p>0.05$) and their interaction
305 (ANOVA, $\text{df}=2$, $F=0.86$, $p>0.05$).

306 The overall algal $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ (WSE) fluctuated from 0.60‰ to 5.68‰ . Xcalak displayed the highest
307 mean value of $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ with turf ($4.59 \pm 0.64 \text{‰}$). The overall macroalgal $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ (USE) fluctuated from
308 0.023 to 2.08‰ . At Xcalak *Caulerpa* displayed the highest mean values of nitrogen with $2.02 \pm$
309 0.08‰ (Table 2). Local Turf USE displayed negative values and overall turf values fluctuated

Commented [kc23]: Over time? Across reefs? Please specify

310 from -0.97‰ to 0.42‰. Xahuayxol displayed the most negative $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ mean value of local turf (-
311 0.51 ± 0.02 ‰).

312 USE overall pelagic *Sargassum* $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values fluctuated from -17.95‰ to -15.24‰. *S. natans*
313 exhibited the most negative mean values of $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ (-17.44 ± 0.71 ‰) at Mahahual (Table 2). There
314 was no difference in $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ among sites (ANOVA, $df=2$, $F=0.05$, $p>0.05$) but there were
315 significant differences $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ between species (ANOVA, $df=2$, $F=7.57$, $p=0.01$). *Sargassum*'s
316 associated turf $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values fluctuated from -18.65‰ to -15.37‰. The most negative $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ mean
317 value was displayed at Mahahual (-18.3 ± 0.5 ‰) for *Sargassum*'s associated turf.

318 Overall pelagic *Sargassum* $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ values ranged from -2.87‰ to -0.30‰. The less negative mean
319 value was exhibited at Mahahual (-0.53 ± 0.26 ‰) for *S. fluitans*. There was no significant
320 difference for $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ among sites (ANOVA, $df=2$, $F=3.90$, $p=0.05$), but there was a remarkable
321 trend to depleted $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ at Xcalak where *S. fluitans* displayed the lowest mean values of $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ (-
322 2.51 ± 0.52 ‰). Turf associated to floating *Sargassum* $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ values fluctuated from -0.42‰ to -
323 1.17‰. The most depleted $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ was exhibited at Mahahual (-1.13 ± 0.05 ‰) and the less negative
324 mean value was displayed in Xahuayxol (-0.47 ± 0.07 ‰).

325 **Sea urchins**

326 There were significant differences $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ among sites (ANOVA $df=2$, $F=6.473$, $p=0.005$) and the
327 interaction between site*effect (USE and WSE) showed significant differences (ANOVA, $df=2$,
328 $F=7.321$, $p=0.003$).

329 *D. antillarum* exhibited no differences among sites for $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values $p>0.05$. However, we found
330 significant differences analysing the USE and WSE effect (ANOVA $df=1$, $F=5.301$, $p=0.03$).
331 The isotopic ratios of *D. antillarum* (USE) varied from 3.83‰ to 6.13‰ for $\delta^{15}\text{N}$, while $\delta^{13}\text{C}$
332 ranged from -9.41‰ to -13.62‰. Mahahual was the site with the highest average values for $\delta^{15}\text{N}$
333 5.80 ± 0.30 ‰, while Xcalak displayed the lowest average value 4.38 ± 0.29 ‰. The isotopic
334 ratios of *D. antillarum* (WSE) ranged from 4.69‰ to 6.16 for $\delta^{15}\text{N}$, while $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ fluctuated from -
335 8.83‰ to -13.42‰. We found significant differences for $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ for sea urchins between sites
336 (USE, ANOVA, $df=2$, $F=6.47$, $p<0.005$). Xcalak showed particularly low values Under
337 *Sargassum* Effect (USE-average value 4.38 ± 0.29 ‰ versus WSE average value 5.44 ± 0.36 ‰).

338 Nevertheless, $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ exhibited no significant differences although we noticed a negative trend in
339 the values of $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ under *Sargassum* effect (USE).

340

341 **SIAR, trophic levels and isotopic niches**

342 Mixing models provided evidence for the contribution of different algal resources for three sites
343 USE and WSE (Table 3). SIAR analysis showed that *D. antillarum* behaved as an opportunistic
344 grazer under the *Sargassum* blooms, it is important to notice that there was a reduction of food
345 sources USE. Nevertheless, the species displayed differential resource assimilation and pelagic
346 *Sargassum*, despite of being one of the most abundant available resource, was not the most
347 assimilated resource (Figure 4).

348 *Caulerpa* was the most important resource for *D. antillarum* in Mahahual WSE (up to 37%),
349 followed by Turf (up to 34%) and by *Halimeda* and *Udotea* (up to 29% for both). USE the most
350 important resource was *Halimeda* (up to 44%) followed by *Caulerpa* and *Dictyota* (both up to
351 31% of contribution) *S. fluitans* and *S. natans* were no important sources (0-28% and 0-23%
352 respectively), and turf associated to *Sargassum* blooms was the lesser assimilated resources by *D.*
353 *antillarum* from 0 up to 22% (Table 3).

354 At Xahuayxol WSE *D. antillarum* showed *Caulerpa* was the most important resource for *D.*
355 *antillarum* (from 2 up to 25%) and for the rest of algae there were very similar algal contribution
356 (from 0 up to 23%). The main macroalgal contributor of USE was *Udotea* with up to 61%,
357 followed by *Halimeda* and *Lobophora* (with up to 35% and 38% respectively) as secondary
358 resources. Turf associated to *Sargassum* blooms showed evidence of low contribution (from 0 up
359 to 21%) and *S. fluitans*, *S. natans* had negligible contribution to *D. antillarum* diet with a
360 maximum of 17% of the proportional contributor (Table 3).

361

362 Turf was the main algal resources for *D. antillarum* in Xcalak WSE (up to 45%) followed by
363 *Caulerpa*, *Codium* and *Padina* as secondary resources (close to 30% maximum of contribution);
364 contrasting USE the main macroalgal contributors in Xcalak were *Penicillus* and *Caulerpa* with
365 up to 39% and 40% respectively. Likewise *Dictyota* and *Sargassum polyceratum* (benthic
366 *Sargassum*) were secondary resources up to 26% and 29%, respectively. The pelagic components
367 in the other reef lagoons were negligible contributors for *D. antillarum* diet with just 18-23% of
368 maximum contribution (Table 3, Figure 4).

Commented [kc24]: Indicated by....??? WHICH RESULT?

Trophic Levels

The overall trophic level data for *D. antillarum* (TL) ranged from 1.97 to 3.22. The species exhibited significant differences among sites (ANOVA df=2, F=10.63, $p=0.0004$), also exhibited significant differences between WSE and USE (ANOVA, df=1, F=17.7, $p=0.0003$). Likewise calculating the interaction between site*effect (USE and WSE) there were significant differences (ANOVA, df=2, F=12.65, $p=0.0001$). The highest TL values were reported for Mahahual USE, while the lowest one was recorded in Xahauayxol WSE. At Mahahual TL mean value of *D. antillarum* was 2.35 ± 0.18 WSE and 3.08 ± 0.13 USE; at Xahuayxol TL mean value was 2.13 ± 0.30 WSE and 2.49 ± 0.27 USE and at Xcalak TL mean value was 2.62 ± 0.15 WSE and 2.45 ± 0.12 USE (Table 4).

Isotopic Niches

Table 5 shows data on isotopic niche breadth as measured by the corrected standard ellipse area (SEAc). The Stable Isotope Bayesian Ellipses in R (SIBER) analysis suggested a reduction in trophic niche particularly in Xcalak. This site showed the main difference in the trophic niche breadth with SEAc of 3.48 and 0.14 (WSE and USE respectively) overlap of isotopic niches between WSE and USE was found just in Xahuayxol; (Figure 5). SEAc was higher USE in this site with 3.57 versus 2.68 SEAc WSE (Figure 5).

Discussion

Our results provide evidence of the detrimental effect of *Sargassum* blooms ~~over the physical on the physicochemical water properties~~ and ecological processes in near-shore coral reef communities as recently has been shown in our study area (Rodríguez-Martínez, van Tussenbroek & Jordán-Dahlgren, 2016; van Tussenbroek et al., 2017; Cuevas, Uribe-Martínez & Liceaga-Correa, 2018). Particularly, the results give evidence of ~~over~~ the input of external carbon and nitrogen, related to *Sargassum* blooms ~~on towards~~ benthic communities ~~with unfavorable and differential effect for nutrient fluxes in *D. antillarum*~~. These findings contribute to the growing recognition of the role of exogenous nutrient enrichment in modifying natural sources in a food web. ~~Hence this leads to~~ ~~nutrient limitation of herbivorous sea urchins~~.

Sargassum ~~onshore exhibit~~ physical processes of fragmentation, decomposition and remineralization by bacteria, meiofauna and grazers (Colombini & Chelazzi, 2003). The algae-derived organic matter, product of that decomposition, has an effect on in situ oxygen availability (Haas et al., 2010). *Sargassum* blooms clearly showed a negative impact by hypoxia conditions

Commented [kc25]: Very vague – please be specific

Commented [kc26]: I just don't follow this – how has an influx of nutrients from *Sargassum* influx caused nutrient limitation for *Diadema*? Please explicitly state the mechanism here.

400 found at the three studied reef lagoons (Figure 3). This ultimately could drive to the success of
401 the communities' nitrogen fixation. Even in the section c (back reef) dissolved oxygen values for
402 this study were lower than the standard values for coral reefs sites with areas dominated by algae
403 ($7.9 \pm 0.5 \text{ mg l}^{-1}$) according to Haas et al. (2010) and values of 8.1 to 9.1 mg l^{-1} for Xahuayxol
404 and Mahahual, respectively recorded by (Camacho-Cruz et al., 2019). This agrees with Kendrick
405 et al. (2000) and Haas et al. (2010), who argued that benthic communities linked to reef lagoons
406 are very susceptible to environmental degradation despite fluctuations in dissolved oxygen.
407 ~~Oxygen is a critical element that structures benthic coral reef habitats (Nelson & Altieri, 2019).~~
408 ~~Oxygen is a critical element that structures can be structuring in benthic coral reef habitats~~
409 ~~(Nelson & Altieri, 2019).~~ Some benthic algae can be catalyzers of physical environment in reefs
410 due to coral reef associated algae-derived organic matter (Wild et al., 2010). We considered that
411 is likely that USE potentially lead to phase shifts in organic matter cycles, caused by changes in
412 the oxygen dynamics, which were consistently reflected in the low isotopic signatures of the
413 primary producers.

414

415 Isotopic variations in the algal resources

416

417 We found that the composition of benthic macroalgae assemblages were different before and with
418 ~~Sargassum between among both conditions (WSE and USE).~~ ~~Sargassum~~ USE conditions showed
419 a clear reduction of algae composition and isotope values presented by clearly lower $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ values
420 (Table 2). The fact that there were fewer available algal sources in the USE condition implies that
421 the trophic chain becomes less complex as the interaction of primary consumers with their
422 resources is reduced (Phillips & Gregg, 2003).

423

424 Overall $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values ranged from -21.98 to -5.65‰ and agreed with the ranges reported by Fry &
425 Sherr (1984). Those authors reviewed the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ data of benthic algae, noting that values ranged
426 between -30 and 5‰. $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ overall algae values fluctuated from 0.023 to 5.68‰. Despite these
427 values agree with the variation reported in other studies like Owens (1987) and France (1995), we
428 found USE very low, ergo according to Lapointe et al. (2005) and France et al. (1998). Lower
429 limit values can be indicative of macroalgae living in oligotrophic reefs which experience N
430 sources as nitrogen fixation. In the presence of *Sargassum*, anaerobic bacteria acquired

Commented [kc27]: This needs to be stated in the results as well

Commented [kc28]: Please state the mechanism here

Commented [kc29]: Please move this to the results section.

Commented [kc30]: Again, this is vague wording – please be specific

Commented [kc31]: Unclear – do you mean reduction in species richness?

Commented [kc32]: All results should go in RESULTS

Commented [kc33]: Are these other studies' values from all benthic habitats, coral reefs, Mexican Caribbean reefs, something else?

Commented [kc34]: Confusing wording

significance comparable to ~~on~~ other benthic groups (Carpenter & Cox, 1974; Rooker, Turner & Holt, 2006), and could be the cause of the low macroalgal isotopic signatures, while high values of $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ of macroalgae are linked to land-based N enrichment sources. These are good indicators of anthropogenic nitrogen inputs ~~like enhancers of coral reef degradation (Umezawa et al., 2002) such as and temporal and spatial drivers of~~ sewage discharges (Risk et al., 2009; Lapointe et al., 2011).

Commented [kc35]: Which result indicates this? Please clearly state the trophic implications of each result presented in the Results section.

France (1995) reported nitrogen ranges of marine macroalgae from -3 to 18‰. The inconsistencies in this pattern with values of $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ close to atmospheric signature of 0‰ suggest a fixation of nitrogen. Dorado et al. (2012) associated the depleted values of $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ with nitrogen fixation and its impact on the trophic position of consumers. So, temporal difference between values in this study WSE and USE might be explained by the influence of organic input derived from floating *Sargassum* dragged components. Although more evidence is required to confirm this statement, but in general, lower limit values of $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ in marine macroalgae are indicative of macroalgae living in oligotrophic reefs ~~which experience nitrogen sources as nitrogen fixation.~~ Hence, in the presence of *Sargassum*, the anaerobic bacteria took on importance on the benthos, being responsible for the low macroalgal isotopic signatures.

Commented [kc36]: Confusing (and somewhat incoherent) wording! Are you trying to say that with *Sargassum* present, the microbial loop is more important for energy flow?

Trophic parameters of *D. antillarum* Sea urchin values, SIAR and Trophic level

Our results supported the evidence that *Sargassum* blooms impacted $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ differentially among sites, as the ratios of $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ are determined by their resources (Phillips & Gregg, 2003). It was conspicuous that ~~the isotopic values of the algae were lower USE, while, *D. antillarum*~~ showed higher $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ values USE at Mahahual.

Although some available resources (e.g. *Dictyota* and turf) were present in both conditions (WSE and USE) the contribution of algae to the sea urchin tissues can display key information about how consumers assimilate habitat resources and this could exhibit information on the degree of disturbance (Layman et al., 2007b). So, it is possible that the ecological role of *D. antillarum* was different in each site and could be explained by the variation in the number of available resources and a differential assimilation (Table 3). The higher $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ values in the muscle of *D. antillarum* were due to the synergistic effect among the resource availability and the disturbance condition. Pelagic sources may provide new sources of food and the possible nitrogen fixation carried out

462 by turf attached to pelagic *Sargassum* undoubtedly brought a new source of organic matter to
463 basal trophic levels (Rooker et al. 2006). However those sources were not major contributors for
464 *D. antillarum* and appear to avoid the invasive pelagic macroalgae. This is consistent with the
465 feeding ecology by marine generalist herbivores (Boudouresque & Verlaque, 2001) and such
466 feeding response is in line with evidence from other sea urchin species in the face of other
467 invasive resources. The experiments carried out by Tomas et al. (2011) provide evidence that
468 some seaweed invaders were strongly avoided by *Paracentrotus lividus* and therefore escape
469 enemy control by reducing herbivore preference.

470
471 ~~Sea urchins are assumed as predominantly herbivorous with preference to algal turf and~~
472 ~~macroalgae (Macintyre, Glynn & Hinds, 2005). However under low availability of resources any~~
473 ~~other sources can be found in their diet as benthic invertebrates, even corals (Randall, Schroeder~~
474 ~~& Starek, 1964; Reaka-Kudla, Feingold & Glynn, 1996; Muthiga & McClanahan, 2007). The~~
475 ~~trophic level~~ metric of TL is very useful because the classical ~~classifications that add organisms~~
476 ~~into~~ discrete trophic level ~~definitions s~~ isare a reduction that ignores ~~the value of food web~~
477 ~~connections, the~~ omnivory and diet changes (Polis & Strong, 1996; Vanderklift, Kendrick &
478 Smit, 2006). The sea urchin *D. antillarum* has been considered as a generalist herbivore (Ogden
479 & Lobel, 1978; Sammarco, 1980; Solandt & Campbell, 2001; Weil, Torres & Ashton, 2005).
480 However, invertebrate samples in their stomach contents have been described for that species in
481 the Caribbean (Rotjan & Lewis, 2008; Rodríguez-Barreras et al., 2015, 2016).

482
483 The mean ~~TL~~ trophic level for *D. antillarum* exhibited at Mahahual was 2.35 ± 0.18 WSE up to
484 3.08 ± 0.13 USE. Hence, WSE agreed with a herbivorous position. USE *D. antillarum* showed that
485 the species can occupy different trophic niches due to resource limitation. Under *Sargassum*
486 blooms, *D. antillarum* performed a position more related to omnivorous conditions, so the
487 estimated trophic level indicated a herbivorous behaviour tending to omnivory according to
488 Vander Zanden & Rasmussen (1999), who stated that primary consumers have a trophic position
489 of 2.0 (strictly herbivorous); but if organisms assimilate primary consumers, they are considered
490 in a TL of 3.0. The results for Mahahual are consistent with Andrew (1989) who argued that sea
491 urchins can take advantage through omnivory if variation exist in the availability of resources.
492 Our results suggest that *D. antillarum* behaves as facultative omnivore related to patterns of

Commented [kc37]: Run-on sentence – please re-word

493 nutrient availability. $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ signatures for *D. antillarum* in Mahahual suggest a different carbon
494 source USE, but also anthropogenic nitrogen inputs, which seems coherent as this site has a high
495 eutrophication, being an area with elevated touristic demand (Martínez-Rendis et al., 2016; Arias-
496 González et al., 2017) plus the possible nitrogen fixation by anaerobic bacteria as an important
497 factor in the variation of available sources of food.

498
499 Regarding for the TL values exhibited for *D. antillarum* in Mahahual USE 3.08 ± 0.13 versus
500 2.35 ± 0.18 for WSE would place *D. antillarum* in an omnivorous position tending to carnivory.
501 Similar values were obtained in Mediterranean sea urchins as a strategy to avoid exclusion by
502 sympatric species (Wagensteen et al. 2011). However, we cannot state that *D. antillarum* is
503 carnivorous in Mahahual. This would require a more complete temporal study, and an adjustment
504 of a new $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ baseline of primary producers, considering that $^{15}\text{N}/^{14}\text{N}$ ratios can vary spatially
505 and temporarily (Jennings et al. 1997, Vanderklift et al. 2006).

506
507 The results for Xahuayxol showed also a trend to higher $\delta^{15}\text{N}$. However by analyzing the
508 condition of *D. antillarum* in Xahuayxol no significant differences were obtained. We can
509 assume that this locality that least changed in its foraging behavior position against the nutrients
510 modification and the species occupied a lower trophic level WSE. Meanwhile, Xcalak displayed
511 the opposite trend compared to Mahahual and Xahuayxol and USE *D. antillarum* trophic level
512 was lower than WSE. Our results suggest that for Xcalak the effect of *Sargassum* blooms was
513 completely modified and reduced the possibility of finding available resources, displayed a
514 trophic level around 2.5 between the two scenarios of *Sargassum* blooms. This corresponds to a
515 predominantly herbivorous-tending to omnivorous condition. Moreover this was confirmed with
516 the isotopic niche breadth data where a reduced niche was observed for Xcalak (Fig. 3).

517
518 The rank found for *D. antillarum* in this study agreed with the study conducted by Rodríguez-
519 Barras et al. (2015) in Puerto Rico where microinvertebrates were used as source of organic
520 matter by the sea urchin. Finally, TL values found in our results support the premise that
521 echinoids are able to modify their foraging behavior depending on the availability of resources
522 (Randall, Schroeder & Starck, 1964; Muthiga & McClanahan, 2007) and in this case (USE) was
523 not only explained by macroalgae.

524
525 It is important to remark that we analysed the most abundant species at the three localities and the
526 most important shallow-bottom herbivore on Caribbean reefs (Carpenter, 1981; Hughes, 1994;
527 Aronson & Precht, 2006; Kissling et al., 2014). One of the most dramatic events in the Caribbean
528 resulted from the pathogen-driven reduction in the populations of *D. antillarum* (Lessios et al.,
529 1984; Cramer et al., 2018) with detrimental ecological consequences like coral-algal phase-shifts.
530 The southern part of Quintana Roo is not an exception encompassing with the effects of the
531 abrupt coastal development and watershed pollution as key drivers along the Costa Maya (Arias-
532 González et al., 2017). For the Mexican Caribbean, there has been considerable variation in *D.*
533 *antillarum* population data. Jordán-Garza et al. (2008) showed a high presence of *D. antillarum*
534 with densities of more than 7 ind m⁻² in several areas, including our study area. Jorgensen et al.
535 (2008) reported densities of 12.6 ind m⁻² after hurricane Dean. According to Maldonado-Sánchez
536 (2018) population density of *D. antillarum* displayed <1 ind m⁻² for five different habitats of the
537 Parque Nacional Arrecifes de Xcalak (PNAX) reef lagoon (back reef, seagrasses, sandy bottoms
538 and reef patches) and the fore reef. The back reef exhibited the highest abundance with an
539 average of 0.5 ind m⁻². However for Mahahual, we registered an average density of 0.6 ind m⁻²
540 (unpublished data), because of the broad variability exhibited from *D. antillarum* populations in
541 the back reef. It is necessary to strengthen the sampling effort to evaluate their population current
542 status. A more comprehensive discussion would have to include the interactions with other
543 herbivore/omnivore species, which coexist in each site and whether, and how they carry out the
544 resource partitioning.

545
546 **Isotopic niche breadth**
547 The ellipses ~~provide give us the~~ integrated information ~~one of~~ the relationship between the
548 availability of sources and the niche ~~width~~ ~~amplitude (the relationship of the consumer with their~~
549 ~~consumed sources)~~. The results of Mahahual indicated that in USE. *D. antillarum* consumes
550 different carbon and nitrogen sources (Fig.4).
551 Several studies (Lawrence, 1975; Carpenter, 1981; Sammarco, 1982; Hay & Fenical, 1988) noted
552 that echinoids have the ability to adapt their foraging behavior depending on algae availability as
553 well as their population density and site characteristics (Bak, Carpay & de Ruyter van
554 Steveninck, 1984; Bak, 1994; Alvarado et al., 2016). We observed at Mahahual that USE *D.*

Commented [kc38]: Thank you for adding this section, but it is out of place. Please put in Introduction or at beginning of Discussion

555 *antillarum* exhibited a broader trophic niche than WSE. Despite the limited resources this could
556 lead to trophic overlap and stronger habitat degradation. SIAR results showed a resource shift and
557 this could be explained in terms of omnivory as stated by France et al. (1998) “omnivory is a
558 prevalent attribute of aquatic food webs”.

559
560 The trophic niche of Xahuayxol reflects that there was no difference in the use of carbon and
561 nitrogen sources. It is noteworthy that for the case of Xcalak, the resulting isotopic niche of *D.*
562 *antillarum* was significantly smaller with *Sargassum* effect. This is consistent with the metric that
563 associates smaller niche amplitude with disturbed ecosystems (Layman et al., 2007b).

564

565 **Limitations of the study**

566

567 To assess the effect of differential management of *Sargassum* and to effectively evaluate the
568 effect of the management disposal, quantitative information on the beach disposal would be
569 necessary.

570 It is clear that ~~succession of~~ algae communities were modified due to *Sargassum*. Therefore, the
571 structuring role of sea urchins, and, considering that algae respond to a temporal variability
572 ~~naturally~~, it would be necessary to study changing gradients at different time scales. This would
573 provide us with more conclusive information about the effect of *Sargassum* spp. on the benthic
574 communities.

575

576 Metric values based on an instantaneous characterization of a single food web provide a limited
577 view of the food web. Therefore, ~~in order~~ to evaluate the trophic structure and consequently its
578 functional structure, the most promising evaluations would have to include a comparison of
579 multiple gradients, in order to examine the same food web on a longer temporal perspective. The
580 metrics used in this study allowed us to evaluate the variation of the isotopic signatures that
581 formed the trophic spectrum of *D. antillarum* under two different scenarios.

582 The ~~deposited~~ biomass ~~values~~ regarding to *S. fluitans* and *S. natans* did not include a
583 measurement of the total arrived *Sargassum* blooms. However, our results established a baseline
584 of the amounts that were more available for the echinoids, which inhabit in the back section of
585 the Caribbean shallow reefs.

586 It would be challenging to evaluate the ecological role of other coexisting species (*Echinometra*
587 *viridis*, *E. lucunter* and *Eucidaris tribuloides*), and to include samples of micro-invertebrates.
588 This could offer new clues to the connectivity between sympatric species, including trophic loops
589 and successional states of algal communities (Camus, Daroch & Opazo, 2008) within the benthic
590 communities of coral reefs.

591

592 **Conclusions**

593 The present study provides a first look how trophic parameters of *D. antillarum* were modified by
594 the impact of pelagic *Sargassum* blooms in the Caribbean. The results indicated that the effects of
595 the leachates generated by the decomposition process, the input of organic material and
596 deposition in its vegetal structures modify the organic matter in the environment and hence the
597 isotopic signatures. This has negative consequences in the benthic trophic structure, limiting the
598 natural herbivory of *D. antillarum*. The source of available carbon and nitrogen was modified,
599 and the isotopic signatures of macroalgae associated with the reef sites exhibited significantly
600 lower values of $\delta^{15}\text{N}$. Consequently the trophic niches were changed and in the case of Xcalak,
601 significantly reduced. However, feeding behavior preferences in *D. antillarum* was not driven by
602 pelagic macroalgae masses.

603

604 **Acknowledgements**

605 The first author is grateful to María G. Alfaro-Padilla, Roberto Herrera-Pavón, James Boon,
606 Abigail Ruíz and Humberto Bahena for their logistic help during fieldwork and laboratory work,
607 to Alejandro Aragon for his help in editing Figures 1 and 2. We acknowledge Katie Cramer and
608 two anonymous reviewers for their valuable and helpful comments on the manuscript. We thank
609 Alberto de Jesus-Navarrete for lending the multi-parameter water quality checker. Comisión
610 Nacional de Áreas Naturales Protegidas is acknowledged for logistic support. This work was
611 funded by Secretaría de Medio Ambiente y Recursos Naturales (SEMARNAT) through the
612 project: OGRMIS- DAC-UCR #001/2015 ECOSUR/SEMARNAT.

613

614

615 **References**

616 Alvarado JJ, Cortés J, Guzman H, Reyes-Bonilla H. 2016. Bioerosion by the sea urchin *Diadema*
617 *mexicanum* along Eastern Tropical Pacific coral reefs. *Marine Ecology* 37:1088–1102. DOI:
618 10.1111/maec.12372.

619 Alvarez-Filip L, Gill JA, Dulvy NK, Perry AL, Watkinson AR, Côté IM. 2011. Drivers of region-
620 wide declines in architectural complexity on Caribbean reefs. *Coral Reefs* 30:1051.

621 Andrew NL. 1989. Contrasting ecological implications of food limitation in sea urchins and
622 herbivorous gastropods. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 51:189–193.

623 Arellano-Verdejo J, Lazcano-Hernandez HE, Cabanillas-Terán N. 2019. ERISNet: deep neural
624 network for *Sargassum* detection along the coastline of the Mexican Caribbean. *PeerJ* 7:e6842.

625 Arias-González JE, Fung T, Seymour RM, Garza-Pérez JR, Acosta-González G, Bozec Y-M,
626 Johnson CR. 2017. A coral-algal phase shift in Mesoamerica not driven by changes in
627 herbivorous fish abundance. *PLoS one* 12:e0174855.

628 Aronson RB, Precht WF. 2006. Conservation, precaution, and Caribbean reefs. *Coral*
629 *Reefs* 25:441–450. DOI: 10.1007/s00338-006-0122-9.

630 Bak RPM, Carpay M, de Ruyter van Steveninck ED. 1984. Densities of the sea urchin *Diadema*
631 *antillarum* before and after mass mortalities on the coral reefs of Curacao. *Marine Ecology*
632 *Progress Series*:105–108.

633 Bak RPM. 1994. Sea urchin bioerosion on coral reefs: place in the carbonate budget and relevant
634 variables. *Coral Reefs* 13:99–103. DOI: 10.1007/BF00300768.

635 Bauman AG, Burt JA, Feary DA, Marquis E, Usseglio P. 2010. Tropical harmful algal blooms: an
636 emerging threat to coral reef communities? *Marine Pollution Bulletin* 60:2117–2122. DOI:
637 10.1016/j.marpolbul.2010.08.015.

638 Bearhop S, Adams CE, Waldron S, Fuller RA, MacLeod H. 2004. Determining trophic niche width:
639 a novel approach using stable isotope analysis. *The Journal of Animal Ecology* 73:1007–1012.

640 Behmer ST, Joern A. 2008. Coexisting generalist herbivores occupy unique nutritional feeding
641 niches. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*
642 105:1977–1982. DOI: 10.1073/pnas.0711870105.

643 Ben-David M, Schell DM. 2001. Mixing models in analyses of diet using multiple stable isotopes: a
644 response. *Oecologia* 127:180–184. DOI: 10.1007/s004420000570.

645 Boecklen WJ, Yarnes CT, Cook BA, James AC. 2011. On the Use of Stable Isotopes in Trophic
646 Ecology. *Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics* 42:411–440. DOI:
647 10.1146/annurev-ecolsys-102209-144726.

648 Boudouresque CF, Verlaque M. 2001. Ecology of *Paracentrotus lividus*. *Developments in*
649 *Aquaculture and Fisheries Science* 32:177–216.

650 Box GEP, Cox DR. 1964. An Analysis of Transformations. *Journal of the Royal Statistical Society.*
651 *Series B, Statistical Methodology* 26:211–243.

652 Cabanillas-Terán N, Looor-Andrade P, Rodríguez-Barreras R, Cortés J. 2016. Trophic ecology of sea
653 urchins in coral-rocky reef systems, Ecuador. *PeerJ* 4:e1578. DOI: 10.7717/peerj.1578.

654 Camacho-Cruz KA, Ortiz-Hernández MC, Sánchez A, Carrillo L, De Jesús Navarrete A. 2019.
655 Water quality in the eastern karst region of the Yucatan Peninsula: nutrients and stable nitrogen
656 isotopes in turtle grass, *Thalassia testudinum*. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*
657 *International*. DOI: 10.1007/s11356-019-04757-3.

658 Camus PA, Daroch K, Opazo LF. 2008. Potential for omnivory and apparent intraguild predation in
659 rocky intertidal herbivore assemblages from northern Chile. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*
660 361:35–45.

661 Carpenter EJ, Cox JL. 1974. Production of pelagic Sargassum and a blue-green epiphyte in the
662 western Sargasso Sea. *Limnology and Oceanography* 19:429–436.

663 Carpenter RC. 1981. Grazing by *Diadema antillarum* (Philippi) and its effects on the benthic algal
664 community. *Journal of Marine Research* 39:749–765.

665 Carpenter RC. 1986. Partitioning herbivory and its effects on coral reef algal communities.
666 *Ecological Monographs* 56:345–364.

667 Colombini I, Chelazzi L. 2003. Influence of marine allochthonous input on sandy beach
668 communities. *Oceanography and Marine Biology: An Annual Review* 41:115–159.

669 Cramer KL, Jackson JBC, Angioletti CV, Leonard-Pingel J, Guilderson TP. 2012. Anthropogenic
670 mortality on coral reefs in Caribbean Panama predates coral disease and bleaching. *Ecology*
671 *Letters* 15:561–567.

672 Cramer KL, O’dea A, Carpenter C, Norris RD. 2018. A 3000 year record of Caribbean reef urchin
673 communities reveals causes and consequences of long-term decline in *Diadema antillarum*.
674 *Ecography*.

675 Cuevas E, Uribe-Martínez A, Liceaga-Correa M de LÁ. 2018. A satellite remote-sensing multi-
676 index approach to discriminate pelagic Sargassum in the waters of the Yucatan Peninsula,
677 Mexico. *International Journal of Remote Sensing* 39:3608–3627. DOI:
678 10.1080/01431161.2018.1447162.

679 De Széchy MTM, Guedes PM, Baeta-Neves MH, Oliveira EN. 2012. Verification of Sargassum
680 natans (Linnaeus) Gaillon (Heterokontophyta: Phaeophyceae) from the Sargasso Sea off the coast
681 of Brazil, western Atlantic Ocean. *Check list* 8:638–641. DOI: 10.15560/8.4.638.

682 DeNiro MJ, Epstein S. 1981. Influence of diet on the distribution of nitrogen isotopes in animals.
683 *Geochimica et cosmochimica acta* 45:341–351. DOI: 10.1016/0016-7037(81)90244-1.

684 Dorado S, Rooker JR, Wissel B, Quigg A. 2012. Isotope baseline shifts in pelagic food webs of the
685 Gulf of Mexico. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 464:37–49.

686 Eklöf JS, de la Torre-Castro M, Gullström M, Uku J, Muthiga N, Lyimo T, Bandeira SO. 2008. Sea
687 urchin overgrazing of seagrasses: A review of current knowledge on causes, consequences, and

688 management. *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science* 79:569–580. DOI:
689 10.1016/j.ecss.2008.05.005.

690 Ferreira CEL, de Oliveira Ribeiro Junqueira A, Villac MC, Lopes RM. 2009. Marine Bioinvasions
691 in the Brazilian Coast: Brief Report on History of Events, Vectors, Ecology, Impacts and
692 Management of Non-indigenous Species. In: Rilov G, Crooks JA eds. *Biological Invasions in
693 Marine Ecosystems: Ecological, Management, and Geographic Perspectives*. Berlin, Heidelberg:
694 Springer Berlin Heidelberg, 459–477. DOI: 10.1007/978-3-540-79236-9_27.

695 France R, Chandler M, Peters R. 1998. Mapping trophic continua of benthic foodwebs: body size- δ
696 ^{15}N relationships. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 174:301–306.

697 France R, Holmquist J, Chandler M, Cattaneo A. 1998. $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ evidence for nitrogen fixation
698 associated with macroalgae from a seagrass-mangrove-coral reef system. *Marine Ecology
699 Progress Series* 167:297–299. DOI: 10.3354/meps167297.

700 France RL. 1995. Differentiation between littoral and pelagic food webs in lakes using stable carbon
701 isotopes. *Limnology and Oceanography* 40:1310–1313. DOI: 10.4319/lo.1995.40.7.1310.

702 Franks JS, Johnson DR, Ko DS. 2016. Pelagic Sargassum in the tropical North Atlantic. *Gulf and
703 Caribbean Research* 27:SC6–SC11.

704 Fry B, Sherr EB. 1984. $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ measurements as indicators of carbon flow in marine and freshwater
705 ecosystems, *Contributions to Marine Science* 27, 13–47.

706 Fry B, Sherr EB. 1989. $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ Measurements as Indicators of Carbon Flow in Marine and Freshwater
707 Ecosystems. In: Rundel P.W., Ehleringer J.R., Nagy K.A. ed. *Stable Isotopes in Ecological
708 Research*. New York: Springer, 196–229. DOI: 10.1007/978-1-4612-3498-2_12.

709 Fry B. 2006. *Stable Isotope Ecology*. New York: Springer. DOI: 10.1007/0-387-33745-8.

710 Gower J, Young E, King S. 2013. Satellite images suggest a new Sargassum source region in 2011.
711 *Remote Sensing Letters* 4:764–773. DOI: 10.1080/2150704X.2013.796433.

712 Haas AF, Jantzen C, Naumann MS, Iglesias-Prieto R, Wild C. 2010. Organic matter release by the
713 dominant primary producers in a Caribbean reef lagoon: implication for in situ O_2 availability.
714 *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 409:27–39. DOI: 10.3354/meps08631.

715 Haas AF, Smith JE, Thompson M, Deheyn DD. 2014. Effects of reduced dissolved oxygen
716 concentrations on physiology and fluorescence of hermatypic corals and benthic algae. *PeerJ*
717 2:e235. DOI: 10.7717/peerj.235.

718 Hamaoka H, Okuda N, Fukumoto T, Miyasaka H, Omori K. 2010. Seasonal dynamics of a coastal
719 food web: stable isotope analysis of a higher consumer. In: Ohkouchi, N., Tayasu, I., Koba, K.
720 ed. *Earth, life, and isotopes*. Kyoto University Press, 161–181.

721 Hay ME, Fenical W. 1988. Marine Plant-Herbivore Interactions: The Ecology of Chemical Defense.
722 *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics* 19:111–145. DOI:
723 10.1146/annurev.es.19.110188.000551.

724 Hobson KA, Welch HE. 1992. Determination of trophic relationships within a high Arctic marine
725 food web using $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ analysis. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*:9–18.

726 Hobson KA. 1999. Tracing origins and migration of wildlife using stable isotopes: a review.
727 *Oecologia* 120:314–326. DOI: 10.1007/s004420050865.

728 Hoffman DM. 2009. Institutional Legitimacy and Co-Management of a Marine Protected Area:
729 Implementation Lessons from the Case of Xcalak Reefs National Park, Mexico. *Human*
730 *organization* 68:39–54.

731 Hughes TP. 1994. Catastrophes, phase shifts, and large-scale degradation of a Caribbean coral reef.
732 *Science* 265:1547–1551. DOI: 10.1126/science.265.5178.1547.

733 Hunter MD, Price PW. 1992. Playing chutes and ladders: heterogeneity and the relative roles of
734 bottom-up and top-down forces in natural communities. *Ecology* 73:724–732.

735 Jackson AL, Inger R, Parnell AC, Bearhop S. 2011. Comparing isotopic niche widths among and
736 within communities: SIBER--Stable Isotope Bayesian Ellipses in R. *The Journal of Animal*
737 *Ecology* 80:595–602.

738 Johnson DR, Ko DS, Franks JS, Moreno P, Sanchez-Rubio G. 2013. The Sargassum Invasion of the
739 Eastern Caribbean and Dynamics of the Equatorial North Atlantic Invasión de Sargazo en el
740 Caribe Oriental y la Dinámica en la Zona Ecuatorial del Atlántico Norte L’Invasion de Sargasse
741 dans les Caraïbes Orientales et leur Dynamique dans la. In: *Proceedings of the 65th Gulf and*
742 *Caribbean Fisheries Institute*. 102–103.

743 Jordán-Garza AG, Maldonado MA, Baker DM, Rodríguez-Martínez RE. 2008. High abundance of
744 *Diadema antillarum* on a Mexican reef. *Coral Reefs* 27:295–295.

745 Jorgensen P, Espinoza-Ávalos J, Bahena-Basave H. 2008. High population density survival of the
746 sea urchin *Diadema antillarum* (Philippi 1845) to a category 5 hurricane in southern Mexican
747 Caribbean. *Hidrobiológica* 18.

748 Kendrick GA, Hegge BJ, Wyllie A, Davidson A, Lord DA. 2000. Changes in Seagrass Cover on
749 Success and *Parmelia* Banks, Western Australia Between 1965 and 1995. *Estuarine, Coastal and*
750 *Shelf Science* 50:341–353. DOI: 10.1006/ecss.1999.0569.

751 Kissling DL, Precht WF, Miller SL, Chiappone M. 2014. Historical reconstruction of population
752 density of the echinoid *Diadema antillarum* on Florida Keys shallow bank-barrier reefs. *Bulletin*
753 *of Marine Science* 90:665–679.

754 Lapointe BE, Barile PJ, Littler MM, Littler DS. 2005. Macroalgal blooms on southeast Florida coral
755 reefs: II. Cross-shelf discrimination of nitrogen sources indicates widespread assimilation of
756 sewage nitrogen. *Harmful Algae* 4:1106–1122. DOI: 10.1016/j.hal.2005.06.002.

757 Lapointe BE, Langton R, Bedford BJ, Potts AC, Day O, Hu C. 2010. Land-based nutrient
758 enrichment of the Buccoo Reef Complex and fringing coral reefs of Tobago, West Indies. *Marine*
759 *Pollution Bulletin* 60:334–343. DOI: 10.1016/j.marpolbul.2009.10.020.

760 Lapointe BE, Thacker K, Hanson C, Getten L. 2011. Sewage pollution in Negril, Jamaica: effects on
761 nutrition and ecology of coral reef macroalgae. *Chinese Journal of Oceanology and Limnology*
762 29:775–789. DOI: 10.1007/s00343-011-0506-8.

763 Lawrence JM. 1975. On the relationships between marine plants and sea urchins. *Oceanography*
764 *and Marine Biology: An Annual Review* 13:213–286.

765 Layman CA, Araujo MS, Boucek R, Hammerschlag-Peyer CM, Harrison E, Jud ZR, Matich P,
766 Rosenblatt AE, Vaudo JJ, Yeager LA, Others. 2012. Applying stable isotopes to examine food-
767 web structure: an overview of analytical tools. *Biological reviews of the Cambridge*
768 *Philosophical Society* 87:545–562.

769 Layman CA, Arrington DA, Montaña CG, Post DM. 2007a. Can stable isotope ratios provide for
770 community-wide measures of trophic structure? *Ecology* 88:42–48.

771 Layman CA, Quattrochi JP, Peyer CM, Allgeier JE. 2007b. Niche width collapse in a resilient top
772 predator following ecosystem fragmentation. *Ecology letters* 10:937–944. DOI: 10.1111/j.1461-
773 0248.2007.01087.x.

774 Lessios HA, Cubit JD, Robertson DR, Shulman MJ, Parker MR, Garrity SD, Levings SC. 1984.
775 Mass mortality of *Diadema antillarum* on the Caribbean coast of Panama. *Coral Reefs* 3:173–
776 182.

777 Littler DS, Littler MM. 2000. *Caribbean reef plants*. Washington, DC. : OffShore Graphics.

778 Louime C, Fortune J, Gervais G. 2017. Sargassum Invasion of Coastal Environments: A Growing
779 Concern. *American Journal of Environmental Sciences* 13:58–64. DOI:
780 10.3844/ajessp.2017.58.64.

781 Macintyre IG, Glynn PW, Hinds F. 2005. Evidence of the role of *Diadema antillarum* in the
782 promotion of coral settlement and survivorship. *Coral Reefs* 24:273–273. DOI: 10.1007/s00338-
783 005-0492-4.

784 Maldonado-Sánchez J, Mariño-Tapia I, Teresa Herrera-Dorantes M, Ardisson P-L. 2019.
785 Hydrodynamic conditions that favor the settlement of *Diadema antillarum* to a western Caribbean
786 coral reef. *Bulletin of Marine Science* 95:251–264.

787 Maldonado-Sánchez MA. 2018. Influencia ecológica del erizo de mar *Diadema antillarum* (Philippi,
788 1845) sobre la estructuración de la comunidad bentónica de la laguna arrecifal de Xcalak,
789 Quintana Roo. PhD thesis, Centro de Investigación y de Estudios avanzados del Instituto
790 Politécnico Nacional Unidad Mérida.

791 Mariño-Tapia I, Silva R, Enriquez C, Mendoza-Baldwin E, Escalante-Mancera E, Ruiz-Rentería F.
792 2011. Wave transformation and wave-driven circulation on natural reefs under extreme hurricane
793 conditions. *Coastal Engineering Proceedings* 1:28.

794 Martínez-Rendis M, Acosta-González G, Hernández-Stefanoni JL, Arias González JE. 2016.
795 Quantifying the reefscape transformation of a coastal Caribbean coral reef during a phase shift
796 and the associated coastal landscape change. *Marine Ecology* 37:697–710. DOI:
797 10.1111/maec.12334.

798 Minagawa M, Wada E. 1984. Stepwise enrichment of ^{15}N along food chains: Further evidence and
799 the relation between $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ and animal age. *Geochimica et cosmochimica acta* 48:1135–1140.
800 DOI: 10.1016/0016-7037(84)90204-7.

801 Moore JW, Semmens BX. 2008. Incorporating uncertainty and prior information into stable isotope
802 mixing models. *Ecology letters* 11:470–480. DOI: 10.1111/j.1461-0248.2008.01163.x.

803 Muthiga NA, McClanahan TR. 2007. Ecology of *Diadema*. In: *Developments in Aquaculture and*
804 *Fisheries Science*. Elsevier, 205–225.

805 Nelson HR, Altieri AH. 2019. Oxygen: the universal currency on coral reefs. *Coral Reefs*. DOI:
806 ~~10.1007/s00338-019-01765-0~~.

807 Newsome SD, Martinez del Rio C, Bearhop S, Phillips DL. 2007. A niche for isotopic ecology.
808 *Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment* 5:429–436. DOI: 10.1890/060150.1.

809 Ogden JC, Lobel PS. 1978. The role of herbivorous fishes and urchins in coral reef communities.
810 *Environmental Biology of Fishes* 3:49–63. DOI: 10.1007/BF00006308.

811 Owens NJP. 1987. Natural Variations in ^{15}N in the Marine Environment. In: Blaxter JHS,
812 Southward AJ eds. *Advances in Marine Biology*. Academic Press, 389–451. DOI:
813 10.1016/S0065-2881(08)60077-2.

814 Oyesiku OO, Egunyomi A. 2014. Identification and chemical studies of pelagic masses of
815 *Sargassum natans* (Linnaeus) Gaillon and *S. fluitans* (Borgessen) Borgesen (brown algae), found
816 offshore in Ondo State, Nigeria. *African Journal of Biotechnology* 13:1188–1193.

817 Parnell A, Jackson A. 2013. siar: Stable Isotope Analysis in R. R package version 4.2. Available
818 from: Available from: [http://CRAN.R-project.org/package= siar](http://CRAN.R-project.org/package=siar). (23 March 2014). [Links].

819 Parnell AC, Inger R, Bearhop S, Jackson AL. 2010. Source partitioning using stable isotopes:
820 coping with too much variation. *PLoS One* 5:e9672. DOI: 10.1371/journal.pone.0009672.

821 Peterson BJ, Fry B. 1987. Stable Isotopes in Ecosystem Studies. *Annual Review of Ecology and*
822 *Systematics* 18:293–320.

823 Peterson BJ. 1999. Stable isotopes as tracers of organic matter input and transfer in benthic food
824 webs: A review. *Acta Oecologica* 20:479–487. DOI: 10.1016/S1146-609X(99)00120-4.

825 Phillips DL, Gregg JW. 2003. Source partitioning using stable isotopes: coping with too many
826 sources. *Oecologia* 136:261–269. DOI: 10.1007/s00442-003-1218-3.

827 Phillips DL, Inger R, Bearhop S, Jackson AL, Moore JW, Parnell AC, Semmens BX, Ward EJ.
828 2014. Best practices for use of stable isotope mixing models in food-web studies. *Canadian*
829 *Journal of Zoology* 92:823–835.

830 Phillips DL, Koch PL. 2002. Incorporating concentration dependence in stable isotope mixing
831 models. *Oecologia* 130:114–125. DOI: 10.1007/s004420100786.

832 Polis GA, Strong DR. 1996. Food Web Complexity and Community Dynamics. *The American*
833 *Naturalist* 147:813–846. DOI: 10.1086/285880.

834 Polunin NVC, Morales-Nin B, Pawsey WE, Cartes JE, Pinnegar JK, Moranta J. 2001. Feeding
835 relationships in Mediterranean bathyal assemblages elucidated by stable nitrogen and carbon
836 isotope data. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 220:13–23.

837 Post DM, Layman CA, Arrington DA, Takimoto G, Quattrochi J, Montaña CG. 2007. Getting to the
838 fat of the matter: models, methods and assumptions for dealing with lipids in stable isotope
839 analyses. *Oecologia* 152:179–189. DOI: 10.1007/s00442-006-0630-x.

840 Prado P, Alcoverro T, Romero J. 2010. Influence of nutrients in the feeding ecology of seagrass
841 (*Posidonia oceanica* L.) consumers: a stable isotopes approach. *Marine Biology* 157:715–724.
842 DOI: 10.1007/s00227-009-1355-2.

843 Randall JE, Schroeder RE, Starck WA. 1964. Notes on the biology of the echinoid *Diadema*
844 *antillarum*. *Caribbean Journal of Science* 4:421–433.

845 Reaka-Kudla ML, Feingold JS, Glynn W. 1996. Experimental studies of rapid bioerosion of coral
846 reefs in the Galapagos Islands. *Coral Reefs* 15:101–107.

847 Risk MJ, Lapointe BE, Sherwood OA, Bedford BJ. 2009. The use of $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ in assessing sewage
848 stress on coral reefs. *Marine Pollution Bulletin* 58:793–802. DOI:
849 10.1016/j.marpolbul.2009.02.008.

850 Rodríguez SR. 2003. Consumption of drift kelp by intertidal populations of the sea urchin
851 *Tetrapygus niger* on the central Chilean coast: possible consequences at different ecological
852 levels. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 251:141–151.

853 Rodríguez-Barreras R, Cuevas E, Cabanillas-Terán N, Branoff B. 2016. Understanding trophic
854 relationships among Caribbean sea urchins. *Revista de Biología Tropical* 64:837–848.

855 Rodríguez-Barreras R, Cuevas E, Cabanillas-Terán N, Sabat AM. 2015. Potential omnivory in the
856 sea urchin *Diadema antillarum*? *Regional Studies in Marine Science* 2:11–18. DOI:
857 10.1016/j.rsma.2015.08.005.

858 Rodríguez-Martínez RE, van Tussenbroek B, Jordán-Dahlgren E. 2016. Afluencia masiva de
859 sargazo pelágico a la costa del Caribe mexicano (2014–2015). *Florecimientos Algales Nocivos en*
860 *México. Ensenada: CICESE*:352–365.

861 Rooker JR, Turner JP, Holt SA. 2006. Trophic ecology of Sargassum-associated fishes in the Gulf
862 of Mexico determined from stable isotopes and fatty acids. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*
863 313:249–259.

864 Rotjan RD, Lewis SM. 2008. Impact of coral predators on tropical reefs. *Marine Ecology Progress*
865 *Series* 367:73–91.

866 Sala E, Ribes M, Hereu B, Zabala M, Alvà V, Coma R, Garrabou J. 1998. Temporal variability in
867 abundance of the sea urchins *Paracentrotus lividus* and *Arbacia lixula* in the northwestern
868 Mediterranean: comparison between a marine reserve and an unprotected area. *Marine Ecology*
869 *Progress Series* 168:135–145.

870 Sammarco PW. 1980. Diadema and its relationship to coral spat mortality: Grazing, competition,
871 and biological disturbance. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 45:245–272.
872 DOI: 10.1016/0022-0981(80)90061-1.

873 Sammarco PW. 1982. Echinoid grazing as a structuring force in coral communities: Whole reef
874 manipulations. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 61:31–55. DOI:
875 10.1016/0022-0981(82)90020-X.

876 Schell JM, Goodwin DS, Siuda ANS. 2015. Recent Sargassum inundation events in the Caribbean:
877 Shipboard observations reveal dominance of a previously rare form. *Oceanography* 28:8–11.

878 Schmitter-Soto JJ, Aguilar-Perera A, Cruz-Martínez A, Herrera-Pavón RL, Morales-Aranda AA,
879 Cobián-Rojas D. 2017. Interdecadal trends in composition, density, size, and mean trophic level
880 of fish species and guilds before and after coastal development in the Mexican Caribbean.
881 *Biodiversity and Conservation*:1–16. DOI: 10.1007/s10531-017-1446-1.

882 Sissini MN, de Barros Barreto MBB, Széchy MTM, de Lucena MB, Oliveira MC, Gower J, Liu G,
883 de Oliveira Bastos E, Milstein D, Gusmão F, Martinelli-Filho JE, Alves-Lima C, Colepicolo P,
884 Ameka G, de Graft-Johnson K, Gouvea L, Torrano-Silva B, Nauer F, Marcos de Castro Nunes J,
885 Barufi JB, Rörig L, Riosmena-Rodríguez R, Mello TJ, Lotufo LVC, Horta PA. 2017. The
886 floating Sargassum (Phaeophyceae) of the South Atlantic Ocean – likely scenarios. *Phycologia*
887 56:321–328. DOI: 10.2216/16-92.1.

888 Smetacek V, Zingone A. 2013. Green and golden seaweed tides on the rise. *Nature* 504:84–88. DOI:
889 10.1038/nature12860.

890 Solandt JL, Campbell AC. 2001. Macroalgal feeding characteristics of the sea urchin *Diadema*
891 *antillarum* Philippi at Discovery Bay, Jamaica. *Caribbean Journal of Science* 37:227–238.

892 Solarin BB, Bolaji DA, Fakayode OS, Akinnigbagbe RO. 2014. Impacts of an invasive seaweed
893 *Sargassum hystrix* var. *fluitans* (borgesen 1914) on the fisheries and other economic implications
894 for the nigerian coastal waters. *IOSR Journal of Agriculture and Veterinary Science* 7:1–6.

895 Steneck RS, Lang JC. 2003. Mexico. Rapid Assessment of Mexico's Yucatan Reef in 1997 and
896 1999: Pre-and Post-1998 Mass Bleaching and Hurricane Mitch (Stony Corals, Algae and Fishes).
897 *Atoll research Bulletin*.

898 Sweatman JL, Layman CA, Fourqurean JW. 2017. Habitat fragmentation has some impacts on
899 aspects of ecosystem functioning in a sub-tropical seagrass bed. *Marine Environmental Research*
900 126:95–108. DOI: 10.1016/j.marenvres.2017.02.003.

901 Tomas F, Alvarez-Cascos D, Turon X, Romero J. 2006. Differential element assimilation by sea
902 urchins *Paracentrotus lividus* in seagrass beds: implications for trophic interactions. *Marine*
903 *Ecology Progress Series* 306:125–131.

904 Tomas F, Box A, Terrados J. 2011. Effects of invasive seaweeds on feeding preference and
905 performance of a keystone Mediterranean herbivore. *Biological Invasions* 13:1559–1570. DOI:
906 10.1007/s10530-010-9913-6.

907 Umezawa Y, Miyajima T, Yamamuro M, Kayanne H, Koike I. 2002. Fine-scale mapping of land-
 908 derived nitrogen in coral reefs by $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ in macroalgae. *Limnology and Oceanography* 47:1405–
 909 1416.

910 van Tussenbroek BI, Hernández-Arana HA, Rodríguez-Martínez RE, Espinoza-Avalos J, Canizales-
 911 Flores HM, González-Godoy CE, Barba-Santos MG, Vega-Zepeda A, Collado-Vides L. 2017.
 912 Severe impacts of brown tides caused by *Sargassum* spp. on near-shore Caribbean seagrass
 913 communities. *Marine Pollution Bulletin* 122:272–281. DOI: 10.1016/j.marpolbul.2017.06.057.

914 Vander Zanden M, Rasmussen JB. 1999. Primary consumer $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ and the trophic position
 915 of aquatic consumers. *Ecology* 80:1395–1404.

916 Vander Zanden M, Rasmussen JB. 2001. Variation in $\delta^{15}\text{N}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ trophic fractionation:
 917 implications for aquatic food web studies. *Limnology and Oceanography* 46:2061–2066.

918 Vander Zanden MJ, Rasmussen JB. 1996. A Trophic Position Model of Pelagic Food Webs: Impact
 919 on Contaminant Bioaccumulation in Lake Trout. *Ecological monographs* 66:451–477. DOI:
 920 10.2307/2963490.

921 Vanderklift MA, Kendrick GA, Smit AJ. 2006. Differences in trophic position among sympatric sea
 922 urchin species. *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science* 66:291–297. DOI:
 923 10.1016/j.ecss.2005.09.004.

924 Wang M, Hu C, Cannizzaro J, English D, Han X, Naar D, Lapointe B, Brewton R, Hernandez F.
 925 2018. Remote sensing of *Sargassum* biomass, nutrients, and pigments. *Geophysical Research*
 926 *Letters*. DOI: 10.1029/2018GL078858.

927 Weil E, Torres JL, Ashton M. 2005. Population characteristics of the sea urchin *Diadema antillarum*
 928 in La Parguera, Puerto Rico, 17 years after the mass mortality event. *Revista de Biología Tropical*
 929 53 Suppl 3:219–231.

930 Wild C, Haas A, Naumann M, Mayr C, El-Zibdah M. 2010. Comparative investigation of organic
 931 matter release by corals and benthic reef algae--implications for pelagic and benthic microbial
 932 metabolism. *Coral reefs in a time of change--case studies to understand potential*
 933 *biogeochemical consequences of phase shifts from corals to benthic algae*:121.

934 Wing SR, McLeod RJ, Clark KL, Frew RD. 2008. Plasticity in the diet of two echinoderm species
 935 across an ecotone: microbial recycling of forest litter and bottom-up forcing of population
 936 structure. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 360:115–123.

937 Zar JH. 1999. *Biostatistical analysis*. India: Pearson Education.

938