# PeerJ

# Latitudinal variation in phlorotannin contents from Southwestern Atlantic brown seaweeds

Glaucia Ank<sup>1</sup>, Bernardo Antônio Perez da Gama<sup>1</sup> and Renato Crespo Pereira<sup>1,2</sup>

Departamento de Biologia Marinha, Universidade Federal Fluminense, Niterói, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

<sup>2</sup> Instituto de Pesquisas Jardim Botânico do Rio de Janeiro, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

# ABSTRACT

Phlorotannins are primary and/or secondary metabolites found exclusively in brown seaweeds, but their geographic distribution and abundance dynamic are not very well understood. In this study we evaluated the phlorotannin concentrations among and within-species of brown seaweeds in a broad latitudinal context (range of 21°) along the Brazilian coast (Southwestern Atlantic), using the Folin-Ciocalteau colorimetric method. In almost all species (16 out of 17) very low phlorotannin concentrations were found (<2.0%, dry weight for the species), confirming reports of the typical amounts of these chemicals in tropical brown seaweeds, but with significantly distinct values among seven different and probably highly structured populations. In all 17 seaweed species (but a total of 25 populations) analyzed there were significant differences on the amount of phlorotannins in different individuals (*t*-test, p < 0.01), with coefficients of variation (CV) ranging from 5.2% to 65.3%. The CV, but not the total amount of phlorotannins, was significantly correlated with latitude, and higher values of both these variables were found in brown seaweeds collected at higher latitudes. These results suggest that brown seaweeds from higher latitudes can produce phlorotannins in a wider range of amounts and probably as response to environmental variables or stimuli, compared to low latitude algae.

SubjectsEcology, Marine BiologyKeywordsPhlorotannins, Latitudinal trend, Phaeophyceae, Tropical seaweeds

# **INTRODUCTION**

Phlorotannins are polymers derived from a simple monomer, phloroglucinol, found exclusively in brown seaweeds (*Targett & Arnold, 1998, 2001*). These water-soluble secondary metabolites constitute a special class of polyphenols that may exhibit multifunctional ecological roles, acting as a herbivore deterrent (*Pereira & Yoneshigue-Valentin, 1999*), antifouling agent (*Plouguerné et al., 2012*), antioxidant (*Cruces, Huovinen & Gómez, 2012*), UV protector (*Henry & Van Alstyne, 2004*), and a chelating agent of toxic heavy metal ions (*Karez & Pereira, 1995*). However, these chemicals may also be classified as primary metabolites when they are structural components of cell walls (*Schoenwaelder & Clayton, 1999*). In fact, phlorotannins found inside the cells of brown seaweeds are stored in small vesicles called physodes, and these chemicals may exude into

Submitted 6 February 2019 Accepted 29 June 2019 Published 14 August 2019

Corresponding author Renato Crespo Pereira, rcrespo@id.uff.br

Academic editor Blanca Figuerola

Additional Information and Declarations can be found on page 12

DOI 10.7717/peerj.7379

Copyright 2019 Ank et al.

Distributed under Creative Commons CC-BY 4.0

#### **OPEN ACCESS**

the environment due to their water solubility (*Jennings & Steinberg, 1994*) where they can have several vital ecological roles (*Pereira et al., 1990*). As cell wall components, where they form a complex with alginic acid, they are insoluble (*Schoenwaelder, 2002; Koivikko et al., 2005*). Given the smaller amounts of cell-wall-bound phlorotannins compared to soluble phlorotannins, the major function of these chemicals appears to be secondary metabolites (*Koivikko et al., 2005*).

The concentration of phlorotannins in brown seaweeds is known to be highly variable in several modes and at various scales, supposedly in response to the dynamics of biotic and abiotic environmental conditions (*Jormalainen et al., 2003*). For example, concentrations may vary in response to environmental factors, either biotic—such as herbivory (*Hemmi, Honkanen & Jormalainen, 2004*) and epibiosis (*Plouguerné et al., 2010*)—or abiotic—such as temperature (*Cruces, Huovinen & Gómez, 2012*), irradiance (*Cruces, Huovinen & Gómez, 2013*), nitrogen concentrations (*Pavia & Toth, 2000*), bathymetric variation, and immersion time in the intertidal range (*Connan et al., 2004*). Phlorotannin content can also vary according to intrinsic aspects of brown seaweeds, such as individual size and age (*Pavia et al., 2003*), and tissue type (*Plouguerné et al., 2012*).

Another interesting aspect relating to the distribution, abundance, and function of phlorotannins is the latitudinal differences in content of these chemicals among brown seaweeds living along large temperate-tropical gradients (*Steinberg, 1989*; *Van Alstyne & Paul, 1990*). High concentrations of these compounds have been found in species from high latitudes (*Ragan & Glombitza, 1986*; *Steinberg & Paul, 1990*; *Steinberg & Van Altena, 1992*; *Hay & Steinberg, 1992*; *Steinberg, 1992*). For example, species of Fucales and Laminariales that are abundant in temperate benthic communities, and Dictyotales found both in temperate and tropical regions, exhibit this biogeographic trend. The most common brown seaweed species in temperate Australasia exhibit more than 10% of total phlorotannins (*Steinberg, 1989*), whereas there are both phlorotannin-rich and -poor species in some temperate regions of South Africa (*Anderson & Velimirov, 1982; Tugwell & Branch, 1989*), northwestern Pacific (*Katayama, 1951; Estes & Steinberg, 1988*), and the European North Atlantic (*Ragan & Glombitza, 1986*).

Many species of brown seaweeds from North America exhibit low levels of phlorotannins, ranging from 0% to 2% of algal dry weight (DW) (*Ragan & Glombitza*, 1986). This range is found mainly in kelps dominating both the sublittoral and lower littoral environments (*Steinberg*, 1992). In contrast, as the most abundant organisms found in littoral and upper sublittoral regions, fucoids commonly contain higher phlorotannin contents (more than 4% DW) (*Steinberg*, 1985; *Van Alstyne*, 1988; *Denton*, *Chapman & Markham*, 1990; *Targett et al.*, 1992). In general, brown seaweeds from North America exhibit broad variation in phlorotannin contents linked to the bathymetric gradient, with littoral fucoids and subtidal kelps showing high and low levels of these compounds, respectively (*Estes & Steinberg*, 1988; *Steinberg*, 1992).

In general, the intensity of selective pressures on organisms increases with decreasing latitude, including higher herbivory and epibiosis (*Railkin, 2004; Targett & Arnold, 1998*). Consequently, tropical seaweeds are hypothesized to have evolved more effective chemical defenses (*Van Alstyne & Paul, 1990; Targett et al., 1992*). Contrary to this trend,

phlorotannins are sometimes absent or present in very low concentrations in seaweeds from tropical environments (*Steinberg, 1989; Van Alstyne & Paul, 1990; Pereira & Yoneshigue-Valentin, 1999*). There is only one report of high amounts of these compounds in brown seaweeds from low latitudes (*Targett et al., 1995*).

However, in almost all studies, the quantification of phlorotannins is based on an analysis of distinct specimens of brown seaweed species extracted together, masking possible variability in amounts of these chemicals in each individual of a population. However, intra-populational variation in seaweed-derived chemicals can be of great magnitude and ecological significance (*Oliveira et al., 2013*).

Along the Brazilian coast, the few studies on phlorotannin contents in brown seaweeds are united in the fact that they typically reveal low concentrations (Fleury et al., 1994), and that they may be capable of inhibiting grazing when they occur at higher concentrations (Pereira & Yoneshigue-Valentin, 1999). The extensive Brazilian coast covers a broad latitudinal range of the Southwestern Atlantic and harbors numerous species of brown seaweeds. It comprises several environments suitable for exploring chemical defenses via a biogeographic approach. To date, most studies in Brazil have only reported average phlorotannin concentrations, so there is no information concerning the variation within populations or among populations from different latitudes. Thus, more in-depth analysis is needed, as tropical species could have the same mean value as temperate seaweeds, but exhibit greater standard deviation. Here, we hypothesized that contents of brown seaweed phlorotannins would exhibit latitudinal variation along the Brazilian coast. Our aim was to compare the mean phlorotannin concentration, as well as the coefficient of variation, among and within species of brown seaweeds across a broad latitudinal context along the Brazilian coast to evaluate the hypothesis that species from low latitudes exhibit lower amounts of these chemicals relative to those from high latitudes.

# MATERIALS AND METHODS

#### Study organisms and collection localities

Brown seaweeds were collected from along the Brazilian coast (Instituto Chico Mendes de Conservação da Biodiversidade—Authorization Number 27001-2) in order to best represent various populations of the same species and individuals in each population from the different localities (Fig. 1; Table 1): Giz Beach (6°10'S; 35°05'W) at Tibau do Sul, RN; Itapuama (08°17'S; 34°57'W), Calhetas (08°20'S; 34°56'W), Paraíso (08°21'S; 34°57'W) and Suape beaches (08°22'S; 34°56'W) at Recife, PE; Itapuã Beach (12°57'S; 38°22'W) at Salvador, BA; Pé de Serra Beach (14°28'S; 39°01'W) at Uruçuca, BA; Morro de Pernambuco (14°48'S; 39°01'W) and Back Door beaches (14°56'S; 39°00'W) at Ilhéus, BA; Ponta Beach (16°24'S; 39°02'W) at Porto Seguro, BA; Três Praias (20°38'S; 40°28'W) at Guarapari, ES; Rasa (22°44'S; 41°57'W) and Forno beaches (22°45'S; 41°52'W) at Armação dos Búzios, RJ; and Canasvieiras Beach (27°25'S; 48°28'W) at Florianópolis, SC. We collected individuals of the following species: *Canistrocarpus cervicornis* (Kützing) De Paula & De Clerck, *Colpomenia sinuosa* (Mertens ex Roth) Derbés & Solier, *Dictyopteris delicatula* J.V. Lamouroux, *Dictyopteris polypodioides* (A.P. De Candolle) J.V. Lamouroux, *Dictyota ciliolata* Sonder ex Kützing, *Dictyota crispata* J.V. Lamouroux,



Figure 1 Sampling sites.Sampling sites of collect of the brown seaweeds studied along the Brazilian<br/>littoral, in a latitudinal range of 21°.Full-size 🖾 DOI: 10.7717/peerj.7379/fig-1

Dictyota dichotoma (Hudson) J.V. Lamouroux, Dictyota mertensii (Martius) Kützing, Dictyota pfaffii Schnetter, Lobophora variegata (J.V. Lamouroux) Womersley ex E.C. Oliveira, Padina gymnospora (Kützing) Sonder, Sargassum filipendula C. Agardh, Sargassum stenophyllum Martius, Sargassum ramifolium Kützing, Sargassum vulgare C. Agardh, Sargassum vulgare var. nanum E. De Paula, Sargassum vulgare var. vulgare, Spatoglossum schroederi (C. Agardh) Kützing, and Stypopodium zonale (J.V. Lamouroux) Papenfuss.

### Extraction

After collection, the seaweeds were freeze-dried, ground to powder and, before extraction, subjected to a lipid-removal treatment using one mL hexane for 3 min (*Koivikko et al., 2007*). Extraction was then carried out for 2 h using 10 mL of acetone:water (7:3) for 100 mg of each sample of dry alga. Each extract was centrifuged for 10 min at 3,500 rpm and filtered. Acetone was evaporated off at room temperature and the aqueous extract was again centrifuged. The supernatant was frozen for further quantification.

#### Phlorotannin quantification

We used the Folin-Ciocalteau (FC) colorimetric method to quantify phlorotannin concentration, by which 1 N FC reagent was added to a diluted aliquot of the extract and, after 3 min, 20% sodium carbonate was added. After 45 min in the dark, phlorotannins were quantified in a Shimadzu UV1800 spectrophotometer, at 750 nm, using a

zonale

Seaweed species	Sampling sites									
	1. Tibau do Sul—RN	2. Recife— PE	3. Salvador— BA	4. Uruçuca— BA	5. Ilhéus— BA	6. Porto Seguro—BA	7. Guarapari— ES	8. Búzios— RJ	9. Florianópolis— SC	
Canistrocarpus cervicornis		7						Х		
Colpomenia sinuosa						4		х		
Dictyopteris delicatula		8	10			х	X			
Dictyopteris polypodioides							X			
Dictyota ciliolata						11				
Dictyota crispata						19				
Dictyota dichotoma						х				
Dictyota mertensii		7					x	10		
Dictyota pfaffii			10							
Lobophora variegata		10	х			10				
Padina gymnospora	x	10		х	х	7	x	х	8	
Sargassum filipendula			9	10						
Sargassum ramifolium							7			
Sargassum stenophyllum									7	
Sargassum vulgare		15		6	10	22		5		
Spatoglossum schroederi							10			
Stypopodium								32		

Table 1Brown seaweeds studied, number of specimens and corresponding collection places (x = The individuals were analyzed togetherbecause of the small size/biomass of the specimens; while in the remaining species, the analyzes were performed in each individual).

standard curve obtained with phloroglucinol ( $r^2 = 0.99$ ), which is a monomer that absorbs under the same patterns as the polymers (phlorotannins) derived from it (*Steinberg*, 1988). Three aliquots of each extract were prepared for quantification, and the total phlorotannin concentration is expressed in % per DW of the seaweed.

#### Statistical analysis

The coefficient of variation was calculated as the ratio of the standard deviation to the mean (coefficients of variation (CV) =  $\delta/\mu$ ·100) in order to compare the amount of variation in phlorotannin contents observed within different populations of seaweeds. Total phlorotannin content of different populations from the same species was assessed

(DW) for the populations of seaweeds studied from different collection sites, including the coordinates, coefficient of variation (CV) and the ANOVA results for intra-populational variation (IV).									
Seaweeds	Time of year	Location	Latitude (°S)	Ν	TPC (%DW)	IV	CV (%)		
C. cervicornis	Spring/09	2	8	7	$0.13 \pm 0.01$	F = 45.3; p < 0.001	8.5		
C. cervicornis	Summer/11	9	22	+	$0.18\pm0.00$	+	+		
C. sinuosa	Summer/11	7	16	4	$0.07\pm0.01$	+	+		
C. sinuosa	Summer/11	9	22	+	$0.24\pm0.02$	+	+		
D. ciliolata	Summer/11	7	16	11	$0.14\pm0.02$	F = 126.3; p < 0.001	13.9		
D. crispata	Summer/11	7	16	19	$0.14 \pm 0.04$	F = 646.9; p < 0.001	25.7		
D. delicatula	Spring/09	2	8	8	$0.14\pm0.01$	F = 31.8; p < 0.001	7.7		
D. delicatula	Summer/11	3	12	10	$0.08\pm0.01$	F = 6.8; p < 0.001	19.1		
D. delicatula	Summer/11	7	16	+	$0.13 \pm 0.01$	+	+		
D. delicatula	Summer/11	8	20	+	$0.12 \pm 0.02$	+	+		
D. dichotoma	Summer/11	7	6	+	$0.11 \pm 0.01$	+	+		
D. mertensii	Spring/09	2	8	7	$0.19\pm0.01$	F = 15.7; p < 0.001	5.2		
D. mertensii	Summer/11	8	20	+	$0.10\pm0.01$	+	+		
D. mertensii	Summer/11	9	22	10	$0.18 \pm 0.03$	F = 73.9; p < 0.001	15.4		
D. pfaffii	Summer/11	3	12	10	$0.10\pm0.02$	F = 34.1; p < 0.001	16.6		
D. polypodioides	Summer/11	8	20	+	$0.22 \pm 0.01$	+	+		
L. variegata	Spring/09	2	8	10	$0.91 \pm 0.22$	F = 366.0; p < 0.001	24.1		
L. variegata	Summer/11	3	2	+	$0.13\pm0.00$	+	+		
L. variegata	Summer/11	7	16	10	$0.81 \pm 0.53$	F = 3765.0; p < 0.001	65.3		
P. gymnospora	Autumn/11	1	6	+	$0.40\pm0.02$	+	+		
P. gymnospora	Spring/09	2	8	10	$0.07 \pm 0.01$	F = 58.1; p < 0.001	13.1		
P. gymnospora	Summer/11	4	14	+	$0.19 \pm 0.01$	+	+		
P. gymnospora	Summer/11	5	14	+	$0.26 \pm 0.02$	+	+		
P. gymnospora	Summer/11	6	14	+	$0.05 \pm 0.00$	+	+		
P. gymnospora	Summer/11	7	16	7	$0.13\pm0.05$	F = 127.3; p < 0.001	42.7		
P. gymnospora	Summer/11	8	20	+	$0.09 \pm 0.02$	+	+		
P. gymnospora	Summer/11	9	22	+	$0.22 \pm 0.09$	+	+		
P. gymnospora	Autumn/10	10	7	8	$0.58 \pm 0.30$	F = 802.3; p < 0.001	51.8		
S. filipendula	Summer/11	3	12	9	$0.09\pm0.00$	F = 48.9; p < 0.001	7.6		
S. filipendula	Summer/11	4	14	10	$0.38 \pm 0.10$	F = 1166.8; p < 0.001	25.6		
S. ramifolium	Summer/11	8	20	7	$0.17 \pm 0.06$	F = 166.5; p < 0.001	36.5		

Table 2 Number of individuals (N), and mean total phlorotannin content (TPC) measured in % (average ± standard deviation) of dry weight

Notes:

S. schroederi

S. vulgare

S. vulgare

S. vulgare

S. vulgare

S. vulgare

S. vulgare

S. zonale

S. stenophyllum

1, Tibau do Sul; 2, Recife; 3, Salvador; 4, Uruçuca; 5, Ilhéus (Morro de Pernambuco); 6, Ilhéus (Back Door); 7, Porto Seguro; 8, Guarapari; 9, Armação dos Búzios; 10, Florianópolis.

10

7

15

6

12

10

10

5

32

 $4.30\pm0.78$ 

 $0.45\,\pm\,0.19$ 

 $0.13\,\pm\,0.01$ 

 $0.14 \pm 0.04$ 

 $0.73 \pm 0.15$ 

 $0.20\,\pm\,0.11$ 

 $0.10\,\pm\,0.02$ 

 $1.10\,\pm\,0.31$ 

 $1.72 \pm 0.49$ 

+ Insufficient biomass for individual analysis.

Summer/11

Autumn/10

Spring/09

Summer/11

Summer/11

Summer/11

Summer/11

Summer/11

Summer/12

8

10

2

4

5

6

7

9

9

20

27

8

14

14

14

16

22

22

18.1

42.0

9.6

26.3

20.7

53.9

18.1

30.9

28.3

F = 180.1; p < 0.001

F = 109.9; p < 0.001

F = 85.8; p < 0.001

F = 90.5; p < 0.001

F = 89.9; p < 0.001

F = 212.8; p < 0.001

F = 37.2; p < 0.001

F = 4335.0; p < 0.001

F = 1428.1; p < 0.001

by independent *t*-test or, when n was unequal, with an independent *t*-test with separate variances, which is more appropriate when considering groups of different sample sizes. In the case of more than two populations from the same species, we conducted a unifactorial ANOVA followed by the post-hoc Student Newman-Keuls test.

# RESULTS

#### Amounts of phlorotannins and their inter-populational variability

Total phlorotannins ranged from 0.05% to 4.30% (average  $\pm$  standard deviation) for the 17 brown seaweed species we studied (DW), encompassing a total of 25 populations (Table 2).

*Lobophora variegata* was the only species that did not show significant interpopulational variation, with mean phlorotannin contents of 0.91% (±0.22), 0.13% (±0.00) and 0.81% (±0.53) for the populations from Recife, Salvador and Porto Seguro, respectively (p = 0.06; F(2.17) = 3.29; ANOVA).

We found 0.13% (±0.01) and 0.18% (±0.00) of phlorotannins per DW of seaweed in the populations of *Canistrocarpus cervicornis* from Recife and Armação dos Búzios, respectively, with these values being significantly different (p < 0.0001; t (8) = 6.75; t-test for independent samples with separated variances). Populations of *Colpomenia sinuosa* collected at Porto Seguro and Armação dos Búzios had average phlorotannin contents of 0.07% (±0.01) and 0.24% (±0.02), respectively, with significant inter-populational variation (p < 0.0001; t (5) = 16.62; t-test for independent samples with separate variances).

In *Dictyopteris delicatula*, we recorded significant differences in the amounts of phlorotannins between the studied populations (p = 0; F(3.19) = 45.76; ANOVA). Individuals from Recife contained a mean phlorotannin content of 0.14% (±0.01), whereas specimens from Salvador, Porto Seguro and Guarapari had mean contents of 0.08% (±0.01), 0.13% (±0.01) and 0.12% (±0.02), respectively.

Individuals of *Dictyota mertensii* from three collection sites also contained significantly different phlorotannins contents (p < 0.0001; F(2.24) = 16.71; ANOVA). The Recife population exhibited a mean phlorotannin content of 0.19% (±0.01), whereas populations from Guarapari and Armação dos Búzios presented mean values of 0.10% (±0.01) and 0.18% (±0.03), respectively.

Populations of *Padina gymnospora* also differed in their mean phlorotannin contents (p < 0.0001; F(8,34) = 9.78; ANOVA), with the highest amount found in specimens from Florianópolis at 0.58% (±0.30). In the population of that same species from Tibau do Sul, we recorded 0.40% (±0.02) of phlorotannins per DW, whereas the mean value for the population from Recife was 0.07% (±0.01). At Ilhéus, the population from Uruçuca exhibited 0.19% (±0.01) phlorotannin content, whereas those from Morro de Pernambuco Beach and Back Door Beach had values of 0.26% (±0.02) and 0.05% (±0.00), respectively. Mean phlorotannin content of the population at Porto Seguro was 0.13% (±0.05), whereas it was 0.22% (±0.09) and 0.58% (±0.30) for those at Armação dos Búzios and Florianópolis, respectively.

We also observed significant variation in amounts of phlorotannins for populations of *Sargassum filipendula* (p = 0; t(17) = -8.75; t-test for independent samples with



Figure 2 Correlation: coefficient of variation (%) in content of phlorotannins and latitude. Correlation between the coefficient of variation (%) in content of phlorotannins found in brown seaweeds and latitude (sampling site of the seaweeds).
Full-size Image: Full-simage: Full-simage: Full-size Image: Full-size Image: Full-size Ima

separate variances), with individuals of the population from Salvador having significantly less phlorotannins 0.09% (±0.00) than those from Uruçuca 0.38% (±0.10). Similarly, populations of *Sargassum vulgare* were significantly different in terms of their phlorotannin contents (p = 0; F(5.52) = 80.01; ANOVA), with mean contents of 0.13% (±0.01) and 0.14% (±0.04) for the Recife and Uruçuca populations, respectively. Individuals of *Sargassum vulgare* from Morro de Pernambuco Beach (Ilheus) presented a phlorotannin content of 0.73% (±0.15), whereas specimens from Back Door Beach, also at Ilhéus, had 0.20% (±0.11). Exemplifying the diversity in phlorotannin contents, the population of *Sargassum vulgare* from Porto Seguro had the lowest value at 0.10% (±0.02) and the highest value was found for the population from Armação dos Búzios at 1.10% (±0.31).

Only one population was sampled for each of the following species: *Dictyopteris polypodioides* and *Sargassum ramifolium* from Guarapari showed a mean phlorotannin content of 0.22% ( $\pm 0.01$ ) and 0.17 ( $\pm 0.06$ ), respectively. For *Dictyota ciliolata* it was 0.14% ( $\pm 0.02$ ), for *Dictyota crispata* it was 0.14% ( $\pm 0.04$ ), for *Dictyota dichotoma* it was 0.11% ( $\pm 0.01$ ), all hailing from Porto Seguro. *Dictyota pfaffii* from Salvador—BA presented 0.10% ( $\pm 0.02$ ) of phlorotannins per DW, and for *Sargassum stenophyllum* from Florianópolis—SC it was 0.45% ( $\pm 0.19$ ). Mean phlorotannin content of *Stypopodium zonale* was 1.72% ( $\pm 0.49$ ), and the highest concentration of phlorotannins found for all studied species was in *Spatoglossum schroederi* at 4.30% ( $\pm 0.78$ ).



**Figure 3 Correlation: total content of phlorotannins x latitude.** Correlation between total content of phlorotannins found in the brown seaweeds and latitude (sampling site of the seaweeds). Full-size DOI: 10.7717/peerj.7379/fig-3

# Variation in phlorotannin contents within populations and across a latitudinal gradient

Intra-populational analyses were carried out for 25 populations (Table 2) of 14 seaweed species (Table 1). For all analyzed populations, we identified a significant difference in the amount of phlorotannins among the individuals that comprised them (*t*-test, p < 0.01), with CV ranging from 5.2% to 65.3% (Table 2). CV was higher in populations collected from higher latitudes, but the correlation though significant (p < 0.005) was relatively weak (r = 0.55) (Fig. 2).

We assessed phlorotannin contents in brown seaweeds sampled along a broad latitudinal range, from  $2^{\circ}$  to  $22^{\circ}$  of southern latitude, representing from Recife to Rio de Janeiro, respectively (Table 2). The highest phlorotannin contents were found in brown seaweeds collected at higher latitudes, but the correlation between amounts and latitude was weak and non-significant (Fig. 3, r = 0.23; p = 0.15).

# DISCUSSION

The phlorotannin contents found in the brown seaweeds we investigated were typically very low (<2.0% DW), with only one exception, *Spatoglossum schroederi* for which we recorded 4.30% DW. These results reinforce a pattern that seems to be typical of tropical areas, including the Brazilian coast, in which low values of phlorotannins have

been reported for several brown seaweeds belonging to different orders, ranging from 0.2% to 2.17% DW (*Pereira & Yoneshigue-Valentin, 1999; Pereira et al., 1990; Fleury et al., 1994*). Low contents of these chemicals, varying from 0.19% to 1.62% DW, were also found in some brown seaweeds from Guam and neighboring areas of the tropical Pacific (*Steinberg & Paul, 1990; Van Alstyne & Paul, 1990*). Moreover, low levels of phlorotannins (ranging from 0.2% to 1.77% DW) have been found in *Sargassum* spp. and *Turbinaria* spp. at two tropical sites, Tahiti and the Great Barrier Reef, Australia, respectively (*Steinberg, 1986*).

Brown seaweed phlorotannins have been reported as defensive chemicals against herbivores in some studies (Jormalainen & Ramsay, 2009), but only when they occur at concentrations higher than 2.0% DW, that is, levels commonly found in species from temperate regions (Ragan & Glombitza, 1986). However, the evidence for this defensive property of phlorotannins remains disputed, with reports supporting (Van Alstyne & Paul, 1990) and refuting (Steinberg & Paul, 1990) this role. The low levels of phlorotannins in tropical seaweeds may be due to these chemicals having limited impact on tropical fish herbivory, given that fishes from the Great Barrier Reef do not consume more phenolic-poor tropical species than phenolic-rich species (Steinberg & Paul, 1990). However, contradicting this latter finding, phlorotannin-rich seaweeds were not consumed by fishes in Guam (tropical Pacific region), though extracts from phlorotannin-poor species were also not eaten (Van Alstyne & Paul, 1990). Moreover, phlorotannins in amounts higher than those usually found in the Brazilian brown seaweed Sargassum furcatum can inhibit herbivory (Pereira & Yoneshigue-Valentin, 1999). However, according to our results, almost all of the seaweeds we studied probably do not employ this kind of chemical defense to prevent herbivory, since phlorotannin contents were usually lower than 2.0% DW.

The hypothesis of a latitudinal gradient of phlorotannin contents is based on the assumption that herbivory pressure increases with decreasing latitude and that production of seaweed chemical defenses is selected by the action of herbivores. Accordingly, defensive chemicals should be more common and effective in tropical seaweeds. Although chemical defenses are commonly associated with herbivore abundance and pressure, no study has conclusively demonstrated that herbivores impose selective pressures on the production of secondary metabolites (*Van Alstyne & Paul, 1990*). Moreover, phlorotannins may be present in brown seaweeds for reasons other than herbivore defense, since they have been suggested to exhibit other ecological roles, such as protecting against short-wave UV radiation (*Pavia et al., 1997*), and as anti-fouling agents (*Plouguerné et al., 2010, 2012*).

It would be difficult to establish a clear correlation between the latitudinal variability in phlorotannin production by brown seaweeds solely with the different pressures of herbivory along the Brazilian coast, even knowing that this kind of variation exists and that the seaweeds we studied were collected from a broad latitudinal range (ca. 21°). Importantly, it remains controversial if herbivory pressure selects for chemical defense production (*Pereira & Da Gama, 2008*), even across a global tropical-temperate latitudinal gradient or along the Brazilian coast (*Longo, Ferreira & Floeter, 2014*). In addition, it is known that concentrations of secondary metabolites may vary according to temperature (*Sudatti et al., 2011*), nutrient availability (*Puglisi & Paul, 1997*), light (*Pavia et al., 1997*), salinity (*Kamiya et al., 2010*; *Sudatti et al., 2011*), and herbivory (*Weidner et al., 2004*). Thus, since the seaweeds we studied are also subjected to unknown variability in all these external conditions, it is perhaps not surprising that we did not establish a direct causal effect between phlorotannin content and latitude.

The extent of genetic control over chemical defense production remains poorly understood. For example, phlorotannin content was demonstrated to be due to genotypic variation in *Fucus vesiculosus (Jormalainen et al., 2003; Jormalainen & Honkanen, 2008; Koivikko et al., 2008)*, as well as for terpenes in the red seaweeds *Laurencia nipponica* (*Masuda et al., 1997; Abe et al., 1999*) and *Delisea pulchra (Wright et al., 2004)*. If phlorotannin production is genetically modulated, geographic distance and gene flow would likely contribute to the variation in the content of these phenols in our studied species. In general, seaweeds are considered poor dispersers because their gametes and spores only survive for a few days in the water column (*Santelices, 1990; Sosa & Garcia-Reina, 1993*). Limited gene flow has been reported for diverse seaweed species (*Wright, Zuccarello & Steinberg, 2000; Faugeron et al., 2001, 2004; Zuccarello, Sandercock & West, 2002; Van der Strate et al., 2003*), and small-scale dispersal distances are a significant factor in the differentiation of seaweeds (*Tatarenkov et al., 2007*). Thus, if secondary metabolite production is an inherited character, geographic distance should act as a barrier to gene flow and give rise to quantitative differences in phlorotannin production.

Abiotic differences among collection sites could also support the hypothesis that different field conditions contribute to the between-site variability in phlorotannin concentrations for each of the algal species we studied. Temperature is a determining factor for the survival, geographic distribution, and reproduction of seaweeds (*Padilla-Gamiño & Carpenter*, 2007), and it is also responsible for many responses of their primary metabolism, such as photosynthesis, growth (*Nishihara, Terada & Noro, 2004*), nutrient absorption (*Tsai et al., 2005*), and secondary metabolism (*Sudatti et al., 2011*). Thus, given the reduced gene flow known for seaweeds (*Wright, Zuccarello & Steinberg, 2000*) and the different environmental conditions along the Brazilian littoral coast, populations of the same species we studied here could be highly structured, explaining in part the results we obtained. Accordingly, our field data reinforce the idea that genetic heterogeneity contributes to quantitative variation of secondary metabolism and that our sampled populations may represent ecotypes.

The intra-populational variability in the amounts of defensive chemicals we report here corroborates the findings of the few previous studies that investigated this topic in the red seaweeds *Portieria hornemannii* (*Matlock, Ginsburg & Paul, 1999*), *Delisea pulchra* (*Wright, Zuccarello & Steinberg, 2000*) and *Laurencia dendroidea* (*Sudatti, Rodrigues & Pereira, 2006*). However, those studies did not assess as broad a latitudinal context as we did. Our study also reinforces the importance of analysis at the intra-population level (i.e., variation among specimens), since most studies of seaweed chemical ecology overlook this element of chemical variation by examining pooled extracts and/or substances obtained from groups of individuals. Developmental (*Bowers & Stamp, 1993*), environmental (*Agrell, McDonald & Lindroth, 2000*), and genetic (*Berenbaum & Zangerl, 1992*) traits all represent sources of variation that can explain the diversity of plant chemical phenotypes. Moreover, in

seaweeds, life-history phases (see *Verges, Paul & Steinberg, 2008*), ontogenetics (*Paul & Van Alstyne, 1988*), and chemical races (*Abe et al., 1999*) may also be included as sources of secondary metabolite variability. In our analysis, the specimens belonged to the sporophytic life-history phase and were approximately of the same size. However, we cannot rule out the possibility that chemical races exist among the individuals of each population we studied.

# CONCLUSION

Overall, our results show that latitude does not explain the variability in total amounts of phlorotannins found in each population of the brown seaweeds we studied along the Brazilian coast, but the significant intra-specific differences in production of these chemicals we report may be important to understanding the ecological drivers of this defensive chemistry in seaweeds. Based on characteristics of the Brazilian coast (*Floeter & Soares-Gomes, 1999*), the higher phlorotannin levels we recorded in populations from higher latitudes may represent a greater capacity for these seaweeds to respond to seasonal stimuli. Since environments in low latitudes exhibit little seasonal variation, the need for seaweeds in these zones to vary production of these chemicals may be lessened. Thus, brown seaweeds at higher latitudes are more likely to modulate chemical defense production in response to stimuli than those in tropical regions where the environmental conditions are more constant. However, we assert that further studies of intra-populational variability in chemical defense are warranted in the context of marine chemical ecology.

# **ADDITIONAL INFORMATION AND DECLARATIONS**

#### Funding

This work was supported by Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico (CNPq) and Fundação de Amparo à Pesquisa do Estado do Rio de Janeiro (FAPERJ). There was no additional external funding received for this study. The funders had no role in study design, data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript.

# **Grant Disclosures**

The following grant information was disclosed by the authors: Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico: CNPq. Fundação de Amparo à Pesquisa do Estado do Rio de Janeiro: FAPERJ.

#### **Competing Interests**

The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

#### Author Contributions

• Glaucia Ank conceived and designed the experiments, performed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper.

- Bernardo Antônio Perez da Gama conceived and designed the experiments, analyzed the data, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper.
- Renato Crespo Pereira conceived and designed the experiments, analyzed the data, contributed reagents/materials/analysis tools, authored or reviewed drafts of the paper, approved the final draft.

# **Field Study Permissions**

The following information was supplied relating to field study approvals (i.e., approving body and any reference numbers):

Field experiments were approved by the Instituto Chico Mendes de Conservação da Biodiversidade (Authorization Number 27001-2).

### **Data Availability**

The following information was supplied regarding data availability:

The raw data is available as a Supplemental File.

## **Supplemental Information**

Supplemental information for this article can be found online at http://dx.doi.org/10.7717/ peerj.7379#supplemental-information.

# REFERENCES

- Abe T, Masuda M, Suzuki T, Suzuki M. 1999. Chemical races in the red alga *Laurencia nipponica* (Rhodomelaceae, Ceramiales). *Phycological Research* **47(2)**:87–95 DOI 10.1111/j.1440-1835.1999.tb00288.x.
- Agrell J, McDonald EP, Lindroth RL. 2000. Effects of CO<sub>2</sub> and light on tree phytochemistry and insect performance. *Oikos* 88(2):259–272 DOI 10.1034/j.1600-0706.2000.880204.x.
- Anderson RJ, Velimirov B. 1982. An experimental investigation of the palatability of kelp bed algae to the sea urchin *Parechinus angulosus* Leske. *Marine Ecology* 3(4):357–373 DOI 10.1111/j.1439-0485.1982.tb00284.x.
- Berenbaum MR, Zangerl AR. 1992. Genetics of secondary metabolism and herbivore resistance in plants. In: Rosenthal GA, Berenbaum MR, eds. *Ecological and Evolutionary Processes*. New York: Academic Press, 415–438.
- Bowers MD, Stamp NE. 1993. Effects of plant age, genotype, and herbivory on *Plantago* performance and chemistry. *Ecology* 74(6):1778–1791 DOI 10.2307/1939936.
- **Connan S, Goulard F, Stiger V, Deslandes E, Ar Gall E. 2004.** Interspecific and temporal variation in phlorotannin levels in an assemblage of brown algae. *Botanica Marina* **47(5)**:410–416 DOI 10.1515/BOT.2004.057.
- **Cruces E, Huovinen P, Gómez I. 2012.** Phlorotannin and antioxidant responses upon short-term exposure to UV radiation and elevated temperature in three South Pacific kelps. *Photochemistry and Photobiology* **88(1)**:58–66 DOI 10.1111/j.1751-1097.2011.01013.x.
- **Cruces E, Huovinen P, Gómez I. 2013.** Interactive effects of UV radiation and enhanced temperature on photosynthesis, phlorotannin induction and antioxidant activities of two sub-Antarctic brown algae. *Marine Biology* **160(1)**:1–13 DOI 10.1007/s00227-012-2049-8.
- **Denton A, Chapman ARO, Markham J. 1990.** Size-specific concentrations of phlorotannins (anti-herbivore compounds) in three species of *Fucus. Marine Ecology Progress Series* **65**:103–104 DOI 10.3354/meps065103.

- Estes JA, Steinberg PD. 1988. Predation, herbivory, and kelp evolution. *Paleobiology* 14(1):19–36 DOI 10.1017/S0094837300011775.
- Faugeron S, Martinez EA, Correa JA, Cardenas L, Destombe C, Valero M. 2004. Reduced genetic diversity and increased population differentiation in peripheral and overharvested populations of *Gigartina skottsbergii* (Rhodophyta, Gigartinales) in southern Chile. *Journal of Phycology* 40(3):454–462 DOI 10.1111/j.1529-8817.2004.03114.x.
- Faugeron S, Valero M, Destombe C, Martínez EA, Correa JA. 2001. Hierarchical spatial structure and discriminant analysis of genetic diversity in the red alga *Mazzaella laminarioides* (Gigartinales, Rhodophyta). *Journal of Phycology* 37(5):705–716 DOI 10.1046/j.1529-8817.2001.01072.x.
- Fleury BG, Kelecom A, Pereira RC, Teixeira VL. 1994. Polyphenols, terpenes and sterols in Brazilian Dictyotales and Fucales (Phaeophyta). *Botanica Marina* 37(5):457–462 DOI 10.1515/botm.1994.37.5.457.
- Floeter SR, Soares-Gomes A. 1999. Biogeographic and species richness patterns of gastropoda on the Southwestern Atlantic. *Revista Brasileira de Biologia* **59(4)**:567–575 DOI 10.1590/S0034-71081999000400006.
- Hay ME, Steinberg PD. 1992. The chemical ecology of plant-herbivore interactions in marine versus terrestrial communities. In: Rosenthal G, Berembaum M, eds. *Herbivores: Their Interaction with Secondary Plant Metabolites*. San Diego: Academic Press, 371–413.
- Hemmi A, Honkanen T, Jormalainen V. 2004. Inducible resistance to herbivory in *Fucus* vesiculosus—duration, spreading and variation with nutrient availability. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 273:109–120 DOI 10.3354/meps273109.
- Henry BE, Van Alstyne KL. 2004. Effects of UV radiation on growth and phlorotannins in *Fucus gardneri* (Phaeophyceae) juveniles and embryos. *Journal of Phycology* **40(3)**:527–533 DOI 10.1111/j.1529-8817.2004.03103.x.
- Jennings JG, Steinberg PD. 1994. In situ exudation of phlorotannins by the sublittoral kelp *Ecklonia radiata. Marine Biology* 121(2):349–354 DOI 10.1007/BF00346744.
- Jormalainen V, Honkanen T. 2008. Macroalgal chemical defenses and their roles in structuring temperate marine communities. In: Amsler CD, ed. *Algal Chemical Ecology*. Berlin, Heidelberg: Springer-Verlag, 57–89.
- Jormalainen V, Honkanen T, Koivikko R, Eränen A. 2003. Induction of phlorotannin production in a brown alga: defense or resource dynamics? *Oikos* 103(3):640–650 DOI 10.1034/j.1600-0706.2003.12635.x.
- Jormalainen V, Ramsay T. 2009. Resistance of the brown alga *Fucus vesiculosus* to herbivory. *Oikos* 118(5):713–722 DOI 10.1111/j.1600-0706.2008.17178.x.
- Kamiya M, Nishio T, Yokoyama A, Yatsuya K, Nishigaki T, Yoshikawa S, Ohki K. 2010. Seasonal variation of phlorotannin in sargassacean species from the coast of the Sea of Japan. *Phycological Research* **58**(1):53–61 DOI 10.1111/j.1440-1835.2009.00558.x.
- Karez CS, Pereira RC. 1995. Metal contents in polyphenolic fractions extracted from the brown alga *Padina gymnospora*. *Botanica Marina* 38(1–6):151–155 DOI 10.1515/botm.1995.38.1-6.151.
- Katayama T. 1951. (302)Tannin of Seaweeds. *Journal of the Society of Chemical Industry* 54(9):603–604 DOI 10.1246/nikkashi1898.54.603.
- Koivikko R, Eränen JK, Loponen J, Jormalainen V. 2008. Variation of phlorotannins among three populations of *Fucus vesiculosus* as revealed by HPLC and colorimetric quantification. *Journal of Chemical Ecology* 34(1):57–64 DOI 10.1007/s10886-007-9410-2.

- Koivikko R, Loponen J, Honkanen T, Jormalainen V. 2005. Contents of soluble, cell-wall-bound and exuded phlorotannins in the brown alga *Fucus vesiculosus*, with implications on their ecological functions. *Journal of Chemical Ecology* 31(1):195–212 DOI 10.1007/s10886-005-0984-2.
- Koivikko R, Loponen J, Pihlaja K, Jormalainen V. 2007. High-performance liquid chromatographic analysis of phlorotannins from the brown alga *Fucus vesiculosus*. *Phytochemical Analysis* **18(4)**:326–332 DOI 10.1002/pca.986.
- **Longo GO, Ferreira CEL, Floeter SR. 2014.** Herbivory drives large-scale spatial variation in reef fish trophic interactions. *Ecology and Evolution* **4(23)**:4553–4566 DOI 10.1002/ece3.1310.
- Masuda M, Abe T, Sato S, Suzuki T, Suzuki M. 1997. Diversity of halogenated secondary metabolites in the red alga *Laurencia nipponica* (Rhodomelaceae, Ceramiales). *Journal of Phycology* **33(2)**:196–208 DOI 10.1111/j.0022-3646.1997.00196.x.
- Matlock DB, Ginsburg DW, Paul VJ. 1999. Spatial variability in secondary metabolite production by the tropical red alga *Portieria hornemannii*. *Hydrobiologia* 398/399:267-273.
- Nishihara GN, Terada R, Noro T. 2004. Photosynthesis and growth rates of *Laurencia* brongniartii J. Agardh (Rhodophyta, Ceramiales) in preparation for cultivation. Journal of Applied Phycology 16(4):303–308 DOI 10.1023/B:JAPH.0000047790.59265.fb.
- Oliveira AS, Sudatti DB, Fujii MT, Rodrigues SV, Pereira RC. 2013. Inter- and intrapopulation variation in the defensive chemistry of the red seaweed *Laurencia dendroidea* (Ceramiales, Rhodophyta). *Phycologia* **52(2)**:130–136 DOI 10.2216/12-058.1.
- Padilla-Gamiño JL, Carpenter RC. 2007. Thermal ecophysiology of *Laurencia pacifica* and *Laurencia nidifica* (Ceramiales) from tropical and warm-temperate regions. *Journal of Phycology* 43(4):686–692 DOI 10.1111/j.1529-8817.2007.00362.x.
- Paul VJ, Van Alstyne KL. 1988. Chemical defense and chemical variation in some tropical Pacific species of *Halimeda* (Chlorophyta, Halimedaceae). *Coral Reefs* 6(3–4):263–269 DOI 10.1007/BF00302022.
- Pavia H, Cervin G, Lindgren A, Aberg P. 1997. Effects of UV-B radiation and simulated herbivory on phlorotannins in the brown alga *Ascophyllum nodosum*. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 157:139–146 DOI 10.3354/meps157139.
- Pavia H, Toth GB. 2000. Influence of light and nitrogen on the phlorotannin content of the brown seaweeds Ascophyllum nodosum and Fucus vesiculosus. Hydrobiologia 440(1/3):299–305 DOI 10.1023/A:1004152001370.
- Pavia H, Toth GB, Lindgren A, Åberg P. 2003. Intraspecific variation in the phlorotannin content of the brown alga Ascophyllum nodosum. Phycologia 42(4):378–383 DOI 10.2216/i0031-8884-42-4-378.1.
- **Pereira RC, Da Gama BAP. 2008.** Macroalgal chemical defenses and their roles in structuring tropical marine communities. In: Amsler CD, ed. *Algal Chemical Ecology*. London: Springer, 25–55.
- **Pereira RC, Yoneshigue-Valentin Y. 1999.** The role of polyphenols from tropical brown alga *Sargassum furcatum* on the feeding by amphipod herbivores. *Botanica Marina* **42(5)**:441–444 DOI 10.1515/BOT.1999.051.
- Pereira RC, Yoneshigue-Valentin Y, Teixeira VL, Kelecom A. 1990. Phlorotannins in Brazilian brown algae: quantitative study and ecological implications. *Planta Medica* 56(6):557–558 DOI 10.1055/s-2006-961142.

- Plouguerné E, Cesconetto C, Cruz CP, Pereira RC, Da Gama BAP. 2012. Within-thallus variation in polyphenolic content and antifouling activity in Sargassum vulgare. Journal of Applied Phycology 24(6):1629–1635 DOI 10.1007/s10811-012-9826-0.
- Plouguerné E, Hellio C, Cesconetto C, Thabard M, Mason K, Véron B, Pereira RC, Da Gama BAP. 2010. Antifouling activity as a function of population variation in *Sargassum vulgare* from the littoral of Rio de Janeiro (Brazil). *Journal of Applied Phycology* 22(6):717–724 DOI 10.1007/s10811-010-9511-0.
- Puglisi MP, Paul VJ. 1997. Intraspecific variation in the red alga *Portieria hornemannii*: monoterpene concentrations are not influenced by nitrogen or phosphorus enrichment. *Marine Biology* 128(1):161–170 DOI 10.1007/s002270050079.
- Ragan MA, Glombitza KW. 1986. Phlorotannins, brown algal polyphenols. In: Round FE, Chapman DJ, eds. *Progress in Phycological Research*. Bristol: Biopress, 129–241.
- Railkin AI. 2004. Marine biofouling: colonization processes and defenses. Boca Raton: CRC.
- **Santelices B. 1990.** Patterns of reproduction, dispersal and recruitment in seaweeds. *Oceanography and Marine Biology Annual Review* **28**:177–276.
- **Schoenwaelder MEA. 2002.** The occurrence and cellular significance of physodes in brown algae. *Phycologia* **41(2)**:125–139.
- Schoenwaelder MEA, Clayton MN. 1999. The presence of phenolic compounds in isolated cell walls of brown algae. *Phycologia* 38(3):161–166 DOI 10.2216/i0031-8884-38-3-161.1.
- **Sosa PA, Garcia-Reina G. 1993.** Genetic variability of *Gelidium canariensis* determined by isozyme electrophoresis. *Journal of Phycology* **29(1)**:118–124 DOI 10.1111/j.1529-8817.1993.tb00289.x.
- Steinberg PD. 1985. Feeding preferences of *Tegula funebralis* and chemical defenses of marine brown algae. *Ecological Monograph* 55(3):333–349 DOI 10.2307/1942581.
- Steinberg PD. 1986. Chemical defenses and the susceptibility of tropical marine brown algae to herbivores. *Oecologia* 69(4):628–630 DOI 10.1007/BF00410374.
- Steinberg PD. 1988. Effects of quantitative and qualitative variation in phenolic compounds on feeding in three species of marine invertebrate herbivores. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 120(3):221–237 DOI 10.1016/0022-0981(88)90003-2.
- Steinberg PD. 1989. Biogeographical variation in brown algal polyphenolics and other secondary metabolites: comparison between temperate Australasia and North America. *Oecologia* 78(3):373–382 DOI 10.1007/BF00379112.
- Steinberg PD. 1992. Geographical variation in the interaction between marine herbivores and brown algal secondary metabolites. In: Paul VJ, ed. *Marine Chemical Ecology*. New York: Cornell Press, 51–92.
- Steinberg PD, Paul VJ. 1990. Fish feeding and chemical defenses of tropical brown algae in Western Australia. Marine Ecology Progress Series 58:253–259 DOI 10.3354/meps058253.
- Steinberg PD, Van Altena IA. 1992. Tolerance of marine invertebrate herbivores to brown algal phlorotannins in temperate Australasia. *Ecological Monographs* 62(2):189–222 DOI 10.2307/2937093.
- Sudatti DB, Fujii MT, Rodrigues SV, Turra A, Pereira RC. 2011. Effects of abiotic factors on growth and chemical defenses in cultivated clones of *Laurencia dendroidea* J. Agardh (Ceramiales, Rhodophyta). *Marine Biology* 158(7):1439–1446 DOI 10.1007/s00227-011-1660-4.
- Sudatti DB, Rodrigues SV, Pereira RC. 2006. Quantitative GC-ECD analysis of halogenated metabolites: determination of surface and within-thallus elatol of *Laurencia obtusa*. *Journal of Chemical Ecology* 32(4):835–843 DOI 10.1007/s10886-006-9033-z.

- Targett NM, Arnold TM. 1998. Minireview-predicting the effects of brown algal phlorotannins on marine herbivores in tropical and temperate oceans. *Journal of Phycology* 34(2):195–205 DOI 10.1046/j.1529-8817.1998.340195.x.
- Targett NM, Arnold TM. 2001. Effects of secondary metabolites on digestion in marine herbivores. In: McClintock JB, Baker BJ, eds. *Marine Chemical Ecology*. Boca Raton: CRC Press, 391–412.
- Targett NM, Boettcher AA, Targett TE, Vrolijk NH. 1995. Tropical marine herbivore assimilation of phenolic-rich plants. *Oecologia* 103(2):170–179 DOI 10.1007/BF00329077.
- Targett NM, Coen LD, Boettcher AA, Tanner CE. 1992. Biogeographic comparisons of marine algal polyphenolics: evidence against a latitudinal trend. *Oecologia* 89(4):464–470 DOI 10.1007/BF00317150.
- Tatarenkov A, Jonsson RB, Kautsky L, Johannesson K. 2007. Genetic structure in populations of Fucus vesiculosus (Phaeophyceae) over spatial scales from 10 m to 800 km<sup>1</sup>. Journal of Phycology 43(4):675–685 DOI 10.1111/j.1529-8817.2007.00369.x.
- Tsai C-C, Cheng J-S, Sheu F, Shyu Y-T, Yu AY-C, Wong S-L, Dai C-F, Lee T-M. 2005. Seasonal growth dynamics of *Laurencia papillosa* and *Gracilaria coronopifolia* from a highly eutrophic reef in southern Taiwan: temperature limitation and nutrient availability. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 315(1):49–69 DOI 10.1016/j.jembe.2004.08.025.
- Tugwell S, Branch GM. 1989. Differential polyphenolic distribution among tissues in the kelps *Ecklonia maxima*, *Laminaria pallida* and *Macrocystis angustifolia* in relation to plant-defence theory. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 129(3):219–230 DOI 10.1016/0022-0981(89)90104-4.
- Van Alstyne KL. 1988. Herbivore grazing increases polyphenolic defenses in the intertidal brown alga *Fucus distichus*. *Ecology* **69(3)**:655–663 DOI 10.2307/1941014.
- Van Alstyne KL, Paul VJ. 1990. The biogeography of polyphenolic compounds in marine macroalgae: temperate brown algal defenses deter feeding by tropical herbivorous fishes. *Oecologia* 84(2):158–163 DOI 10.1007/BF00318266.
- Van der Strate HJ, Van de Zande L, Stam WT, Haroun RJ, Olsen JL. 2003. Within-island differentiation and between-island homogeneity: non-equilibrium population structure in the seaweed *Cladophoropsis membranacea* (Chlorophyta) in the Canary Islands. *European Journal of Phycology* **38(1)**:15–23 DOI 10.1080/0967026031000096218.
- Verges A, Paul NA, Steinberg PD. 2008. Sex and life-history stage alter herbivore responses to a chemically defended red alga. *Ecology* **89**(5):1334–1343 DOI 10.1890/07-0248.1.
- Weidner K, Lages BG, Da Gama BAP, Molis M, Wahl M, Pereira RC. 2004. Effects of mesograzer and nutrient levels on the induction of defenses in several Brazilian macroalgae. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 283:113–125 DOI 10.3354/meps283113.
- Wright JT, De Nys R, Poore AGB, Steinberg PD. 2004. Chemical defense in a marine alga: heritability and the potential for selection by herbivores. *Ecology* **85**(11):2946–2959 DOI 10.1890/03-4041.
- Wright JT, Zuccarello GC, Steinberg PD. 2000. Genetic structure of the subtidal red alga *Delisea* pulchra. Marine Biology 136(3):439–448 DOI 10.1007/s002270050703.
- Zuccarello G, Sandercock B, West J. 2002. Diversity within red algal species: variation in world-wide samples of *Spyridia filamentosa* (Ceramiaceae) and *Murrayella periclados* (Rhodomelaceae) using DNA markers and breeding studies. *European Journal of Phycology* 37(3):403–417 DOI 10.1017/S0967026202003827.