

1 **Influencing factors and health risk assessment of microcystins in the**  
2 **Yongjiang river (China) by ~~the~~ Monte Carlo simulation ~~method~~**

3 Chan-Chan Xiao<sup>1</sup>, Mao-Jian Chen<sup>2</sup>, Fan-Biao Mei<sup>1</sup>, Xiang Fang<sup>1</sup>, Tian-Ren Huang<sup>1</sup>, Ji-lin  
4 Li<sup>1</sup>, Wei Deng<sup>1,\*</sup>, Yuan-Dong Li<sup>1,\*</sup>

5 <sup>1</sup>Department of Experimental Research, Affiliated Tumor Hospital of Guangxi Medical  
6 University, Nanning, Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region, China

7 <sup>2</sup>Department of Breast Surgery, Affiliated Tumor Hospital of Guangxi Medical University,  
8 Nanning, Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region, China

9 Corresponding Author: Wei Deng\*, Yuan-Dong Li\*

10 \*Department of Experimental Research, Affiliated Tumor Hospital of Guangxi Medical  
11 University, Nanning, Guangxi Zhuang Autonomous Region, China

12 Email address: Wei Deng, dengwei@gxmu.edu.cn

13 Yuan-Dong Li, lyd641209@163.com;

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

## 21 ABSTRACT

22 The Yongjiang river is a large, shallow, hyper-trophic, freshwater river in Guangxi, China. To  
23 investigate the ~~exposure to~~presence of microcystin-RR, microcystin-LR, and microcystin-YR  
24 (~~MC-RR, MC-LR<sub>2</sub> and MC-YR~~) ~~of in the~~ Yongjiang river and describe their correlation with  
25 environmental factors, as well as, assess ~~the~~ health risk using Monte Carlo simulation ~~method~~ ,  
26 90 water samples ~~with environmental data~~ were collected ~~from at~~ three sample points from  
27 March–December 2017 ~~in river Yongjiang~~. ~~The r~~Results showed that during the monitoring  
28 period, ~~the~~ total concentrations of MC-RR (TMC-RR), MC-YR (TMC-YR)<sub>2</sub> and MC-LR  
29 (TMC-LR) ~~were~~ varied from 0.0224 to 0.3783 µg/L, 0.0329 to 0.1433 µg/L<sub>2</sub> and 0.0341 to  
30 0.2663 µg/L, respectively. ~~The t~~Total phosphorus (TP) content ~~may appeared to~~ be related to  
31 TMC-LR and the total content of microcystins (TMCs)~~-~~, while pH and total nitrogen/total  
32 phosphorus (TN/TP) ratio ~~may appeared to~~ be related to TMC-RR and TMC-YR, respectively.  
33 ~~By u~~Using the professional health risk assessment software @Risk7.5, the risks of dietary  
34 intake of microcystins (MCs)<sub>2</sub> ~~include including of~~ the carcinogenic risk and non-carcinogenic  
35 risk<sub>2</sub> were evaluated. It was found that the carcinogenic risk of MC-RR from drinking water  
36 ~~source~~ was higher than ~~those of~~ MC-LR and MC-YR, and the ~~pollution presence~~ of MCs would  
37 lead to high potential health risks, especially in children. The carcinogenic risk of MC-RR to  
38 children was ~~higher than~~  $\geq 1 \times 10^{-4}$ , the maximum allowance levels recommended by the US  
39 Environmental Protection Agency (USEPA); ~~As to for~~ adults, it was ~~higher than~~  $\geq 5 \times 10^{-5}$ , the  
40 maximum allowance levels recommended by the International Commission on Radiological  
41 Protection (ICRP). The non-carcinogenic hazard index of MC-RR, MC-YR<sub>2</sub> and MC-LR  
42 increased successively, ~~indicated~~ indicating that MC-LR was more hazardous to human health

43 than MC-YR and MC- RR, but its ~~was found that the~~ hazard index ~~is was < less than 1;~~  
44 ~~Those~~ This suggested suggests that MCs pose less risk to health. ~~Therefore~~ However, it is  
45 necessary to strengthen the protection and monitoring of drinking water sources for effective  
46 control of water pollution and safeguarding of human health.

## 47 1. INTRODUCTION

48 Eutrophication of freshwater bodies can result in algal blooms, especially those caused by  
49 cyanobacteria. Cyanobacteria can secrete algal toxin, most of which are potentially harmful to  
50 plants, animals and humans (Holland & Kinnear, 2013; Cao et al., 2017). The majority of the  
51 approximately 90 known microcystins(MCs) have been isolated from species and strains of  
52 *Microcystis* (Pham &Utsumi, 2018). Of these, the most widely distributed are microcystin-LR  
53 (MC-LR), microcystin-RR (MC-RR), and microcystin-YR (MC-YR) (Zegura, 2016). These  
54 toxins are synthesized in the cells and released after cell rupture, resulting in the appearance of  
55 microcystins in the water source.

56 Cyanobacteria blooms appear in eutrophicated waters worldwide, and MCs can be  
57 bioaccumulated by aquatic animals and can reach humans, severely endangering human health  
58 and leading to illness or death. In 1975, the drinking water source in the small town of  
59 Pennsylvania was contaminated with *Microcystis*, which resulted in acute gastroenteritis in  
60 more than half of the local population (Keleti et al., 1979; Keleti & Sykora, 1982; Lippy & Erb,  
61 1976 ). In 1996, a hemodialysis center in Brazil was contaminated with MCs , causing 116 of  
62 130 patients to have abnormal symptoms such as blurred vision, nausea, and >50 individuals  
63 succumbed to mortality (Pouria et al., 1998). Studies on drinking water showed that in Haimen

64 and Fu Sui, the mortality rate of hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC) in drinking ditch pond water  
65 with MCs was about 100/100 000, which was significantly higher than that of shallow wells or  
66 deep wells (20/100 000) (Ueno et al., 1996). In 2010, the International Agency for Research on  
67 Cancer (IARC) listed MCs as a “possible human carcinogen” (Group 2B) based on its potential  
68 carcinogenicity (IARC, 2010).

69 Although MCs have been confirmed to cause acute and chronic damage to the human body,  
70 reports on MC-LR, MC-RR, and MC-YR and their risk assessment in Yongjiang river of China  
71 are yet lacking. The environmental conditions of water source are crucial in concentration  
72 levels of toxins. However, the factors affecting the concentration levels of MCs (nutrient levels  
73 and climatic conditions) in Yongjiang have not yet been elucidated. Therefore, the present study  
74 investigated the concentration and distribution of MCs in Yongjiang river as influenced by  
75 seasonal changes in water quality and the related parameters.

76 Owing to the requirement of prolonged duration and inoperability of toxicological health  
77 risk assessments, the present study could not be conducted in a population. Thus, the Monte  
78 Carlo simulation mathematical and logical model was used. In recent years, this model has  
79 been used to understand the behavior of water systems that would aid in decision-making based  
80 on the advantage to model any appropriate assumptions of the problem or the system (Clausen  
81 et al., 2017). Moreover, the Monte Carlo simulation of uncertainties was applied in the risk  
82 assessment model by collecting limited samples to predict the overall situation. In this regard,  
83 the risk uncertainty was expressed intuitively, which was in agreement with the nature of the  
84 uncertainty and predictability of the risk; The risk managers and policymakers can provide a  
85 favorable intuitive and scientific basis (Paladino, Moranda & Seyedsalehi, 2017; Sasi,

86 [Yozukmaz & Yabanli, 2017](#)). The US Environmental Protection Agency (USEPA) has set  
87 Monte Carlo simulation as a basic method in the risk analysis policy ([Moolenaar, 1996](#)).  
88 Currently, American Palisade developed @Risk Monte Carlo software that is loaded into Excel  
89 simulation technology for risk. The professional software is mainly based on the analysis of  
90 stochastic simulation method of Monte Carlo that provides various potential results using a  
91 variety of probabilistic simulations, the probability of occurrence of events that constitute a  
92 risk, forecast the risk of uncertainty quantitatively, and summarize the characterization results.  
93 [Li et al. \(2017\)](#) used the Monte Carlo model to assess the quantitative risk of aluminum in  
94 Youtiao, which did not exceed the provisional tolerable weekly intake (PTWI) set by the Joint  
95 Expert Committee on Food Additives (JECFA) for the public. [Jia et al. \(2018\)](#) used the Monte  
96 Carlo simulation to evaluate the trace elements in four freshwater fish from a mine-impacted  
97 river, and found that consumption did not exert any appreciable adverse impact on human  
98 health due to the exposure to trace elements in fish muscle.

99 The present study investigated the current status of drinking water sources in the Yongjiang  
100 river in China regarding the contamination of MCs. By using the professional health risk  
101 assessment software @Risk7.5, the risks of dietary intake of microcystins (MCs) include of the  
102 carcinogenic risk and non-carcinogenic risk were evaluated. These findings provide a basis to  
103 undergo an effective control of water pollution and quality in order to protect the human health  
104 of the area.

## 105 **2. MATERIALS AND METHODS**

### 106 **2.1. Sampling location**

107 Yongjiang river is a major water resource with an average annual flow of 1292 m<sup>3</sup>/s in the  
108 Nanning City area (Figure 1) . It is the main urban water source in Nanning city, China, and  
109 the tributary channel is also a vital transportation route. The surface area of the river is 2676  
110 ha with a maximum depth of 23 m and is used for entertainment purposes as well as a source  
111 of water for domestic use, agriculture, fishery, and industry.

## 112 **2.2. Sampling**

113 Water samples were collected from the Yongning river in Nanning City from March to  
114 December in 2017. For this, the river section was set into three sampling points: Qingxiu  
115 District, Jiangnan District, and Yongning District (Figure 1). The water samples were collected  
116 at a depth of 0.5 m and 3 times/month from each sampling point, a total of 90 samples were  
117 collected in 10 months, and were taken during the most active daylight period (11:00–14:00).  
118 Sample collection, containers, stabilization, and transportation to the laboratory were in  
119 accordance with the methods described in [Wunderlin et al. \(2001\)](#). Water samples were passed  
120 through the 500 mesh stainless steel screensto remove large particles of impurities and were  
121 stored at 4°C and protected from light, and process samples within 24 hours. A volume of 2000  
122 mL water sample was collected, and 500 mL water sample is passed through the 0.45 µm filter  
123 (Jinteng, China) under reduced pressure filtration. The filter containing the algae was subjected  
124 to an extraction process in order to recover the intracellular MCs, followed by two extractions  
125 with 5 mL ultra-pure water after five times freezing-thawing at -80°C/37°C. After filtering  
126 through the 0.45 µm filter for removing the algal cells, the filtrate and the extract from the filter  
127 were passed through solid phase extraction (SPE) (500 mg/6 mL) (SUPELCO, USA). The SPE  
128 was rinsed with 20 mL of 20% methanol and 10 mL deionized distilled water. The toxin was

129 eluted from the stationary phase with 80% methanol (containing 0.05% TFA), and each sample  
130 was dried in a water bath under control temperature (60 °C).

### 131 **2.3. Water quality analysis**

132 Water parameters  $\chi^1$ =Water Temperature,  $\chi^2$ =pH,  $\chi^6$ =Dissolved Oxygen (DO) were measured  
133 in situ and  $\chi^3$ =Total phosphorus (TP),  $\chi^4$ = $\text{PO}_4^{3-}$ -P,  $\chi^5$ =Total Nitrogen (TN) were measured in  
134 the laboratory. Each experiment was performed in triplicate, and the average values are  
135 reported. All water samples were analyzed using standard methods (GB, 2002). Instruments  
136 used were YSI Model 58 thermometer, Knick Portamess 911 for pH measurement. DO using  
137 iodometric method. TN and TP were analyzed using Kjeldahl method and persulfate digestion.  
138  $\text{PO}_4^{3-}$ -P was determined according to stannous chloride method.

### 139 **2.4. Determination of MCs**

140 The air-dried samples were suspended into 1 mL deionized distilled water for high performance  
141 liquid chromatography (HPLC) (Shimadzu LC-20A, Japan) analysis. The solubilized toxin  
142 samples were analyzed using HPLC with UV detector at 238 nm and symmetrical C18 column  
143 (3.9×150 mm) (Waters, USA). The mobile phase constituted of 33% acetonitrile and 67%  
144 deionized distilled water in 0.1% phosphate buffer (pH=3.0). The flow rate was set at 1 mL/min.  
145 The injection volume is 20  $\mu\text{L}$  and the column temperature is 45°C. MC-LR and MC-RR  
146 (Solarbio, approximate purity, 95%) and MC-YR (Alexis, approximate purity 98%) were used  
147 as standards. Furthermore, the concentrations of MCs were determined by calibrating such area  
148 under the peak with the corresponding standard curves. MC-LR, MC-RR, and MC-YR showed  
149 good linearity in the range of 0.025~2  $\mu\text{g/L}$  (  $r^2$ =0.9987, 0.9992, 0.9997 ). Under the condition

150 that the signal to noise ratio (S/N) is 3, the detection limits of MC-RR and MC-LR were 0.0125  
151  $\mu\text{g/L}$ , and the detection limit of MC-YR was 0.014  $\mu\text{g/L}$ . The recoveries ranged from 91% to  
152 110%, the relative standard deviation (RSD) was 3.0%~5.6%. A series of toxin peaks was  
153 identified using retention time and comparison with spikes and known standard in the blank  
154 samples. Furthermore, the concentrations of microcystins were determined by calibrating such  
155 area under the peak with corresponding standard curves. The order of the peaks and time of  
156 each standard substance were as follows: MC-RR (7.599 min), MC-YR (14.225 min), and MC-  
157 LR (17.601 min). The test sample was analyzed in 18 min (Figure 2).

## 158 **2.5. Method of risk assessment**

### 159 **2.5.1. Construction of exposure assessment model**

160 The three main route of exposure to pollutants were consumption, inhalation, and skin  
161 absorption; the proportion of each was different due to the variations in the pollutants. The  
162 present study assessed the risk exposure caused by drinking water. The daily exposure to MC-  
163 RR, MC-YR, and MC-LR by direct drinking water was assessed using the Monte Carlo  
164 simulation by @Risk7.5 software operating platform; the Bootstrap sampling method was used  
165 for the quantification of uncertainty. Each Bootstrap sample was simulated with 10,000 Monte  
166 Carlo simulations to obtain different percentile values (P5–P95) for determining its uncertainty.  
167 The probabilistic assessment method was used to construct the exposure evaluation model  
168 ([Zobitz et al., 2011](#)).

169 The mechanism underlying the different exposures and various routes with different  
170 exposure dose formula were employed for the exposure assessment model of the health risk of

171 chemical pollutants from the US environmental protection agency. Chronic daily intake (CDI)  
172 evaluated the safety of MCs in drinking water and the health risks of diverse routes in different  
173 populations. The CDI ( $\mu\text{g}/\text{kg}/\text{day}$ ) formula is as follows.

174 Daily exposure of drinking water (Duy et al., 2000; Funari & Testai, 2008):

$$\text{CDI} = \frac{C_w \times \text{IR} \times \text{EF} \times \text{ED}}{\text{BW} \times \text{AT}}$$

175 Here,  $C_w$  is the concentration of pollutants in the water,  $\mu\text{g}/\text{L}$ ; IR is the volume of drinking  
176 water (L/day); EF is the frequency of exposure, drinking water for daily necessities (365  
177 days/years) ; ED is exposure duration (years); BW is the average body weight, kg; AT is the  
178 average time, equal to ED multiplied by 365 days/years. According to the WHO, the standard  
179 weight of adults is 70 kg, and the daily drinking volume is 2 L/day; While the weight of  
180 children is 16 kg and the daily drinking volume is 1 L/day (WHO, 2017).

### 181 2.5.2. Construction of risk description model

182 The characteristics of the pollutants in a water environment are generally divided into genetic,  
183 toxic substances (for instance, chemical carcinogens) and somatic toxic substances (for  
184 instance, non-carcinogens) as recommended by the USEPA water environmental health risk  
185 assessment model. Calculating the carcinogenic and non-carcinogenic risks of MCs in source  
186 waters from exposure pathways.

#### 187 (1) Health hazard risk model of chemical carcinogens

188 The formula of health hazard risk caused by chemical carcinogens recommended by USEPA  
189 (Duy et al., 2000):

$$R_i^c = \frac{1 - \exp(-D_i q_i)}{70}$$

190

191 In the formula,  $R_i^c$  is the average personal carcinogenic annual risk of chemical carcinogen  
 192  $i$  through drinking water,  $(\text{years})^{-1}$ ; 70 indicates the average life expectancy of Chinese  
 193 population, years;  $D_i$  is the daily average exposure to chemical carcinogen  $i$  through drinking  
 194 water, i.e., CDI,  $\mu\text{g}/\text{kg}/\text{day}$ ;  $q_i$  is the carcinogenic strength coefficient of the chemical  
 195 carcinogen  $i$  through the drinking water, and currently, there is no recognized carcinogenic  
 196 intensity coefficient of MCs. Based on the formula of carcinogenic strength coefficient of  
 197 carcinogens (Hitzfeld, Hoger & Dietrich, 2000), this study deduced the formula as follows:

198

$$\text{CPI} = \frac{(\text{OR}-1) \times \text{LR}}{D}$$

199 Where, carcinogenic potency index (CPI) is the coefficient of carcinogenic strength  
 200 estimated from the population data:  $q_i$ ,  $\text{kg}/\text{day}/\mu\text{g}/\text{L}$ . Odds ratio (OR) refers to the ratio of the  
 201 number of exposed and non-exposed people in the case group divided by the ratio of the number  
 202 of exposed and non-exposed in the control group. According to the population of 80,000  
 203 inhabitants, the study showed that the person who drank the river water presented a liver cancer  
 204 OR of 1.246 (Falconer & Buckley, 1989; Yeh et al., 1989; Yu, Chen & Li, 1995). Lifetime risk  
 205 (LR) indicated the risk of cancer among individual in the whole local population, and the  
 206 parameter was not dimensionless; According to the risk of cancer during the individual's  
 207 lifespan exposed to MC-LR in the population of China:  $6.2 \times 10^{-3}$  (Yeh et al., 1989; Fan et

208 [al.,2009](#)). D indicated the calculation of the average daily life exposure dose,  $\mu\text{g}/\text{kg}/\text{day}$ .  
209 According to the results of the study by Wolf et al., the lifetime carcinogenic strength of MC-  
210 RR was set to  $1/10^{\text{th}}$  of that of MC-LR, while the strength of carcinogenicity of MC-YR and  
211 MC -LR was equivalent ([Wolf & Frank, 2002](#)).

212 (2) Non-carcinogenic health risk assessment model

213 The health risk assessment model recommended by USEPA was used to evaluate the  
214 non-carcinogenic health risk of MCs in the Yongjiang river source water. The non-carcinogenic  
215 risk was described using a hazard index (HI) by the following formula:

$$\text{HI} = \frac{\text{CDI}}{\text{RfD}}$$

218 Here, reference dose (*RfD*) is the reference dose for MCs: the internationally accepted  
219 tolerable daily intake (*TDI*) instead of MC-LR *RfD* was  $0.04 \mu\text{g}/\text{kg}/\text{d}$ . According to the  
220 equivalent toxicity relationship among MC-RR, MC-YR and MC-LR, the *RfD* values of MC-  
221 RR and MC-YR were  $0.4$  and  $0.04 \mu\text{g}/\text{kg}/\text{d}$ , respectively ([Wolf & Frank, 2002](#); [Lee et al., 2017](#)).

222 The HI to 1 is usually calculated for the benchmark:  $\text{HI}>1$  indicates harm to the human body;  
223 The value higher than the reference dose for exposure may be dangerous;  $\text{HI}\leq 1$  indicates that  
224 the extent of damage is smaller and the exposure level is lower than the reference dose, which  
225 is unlikely to be detrimental ([Younes, 1999](#)).

## 226 2.6. Statistical analysis

227 IBM SPSS Statistics 22.0 software was used to perform all descriptive statistical analysis

228 including minimum value, maximum value, mean value, standard deviation, Pearson's  
229 correlation analysis and stepwise multiple linear regression. Moreover, the risk assessment of  
230 MC-RR, MC-YR, and MC-LR exposure in water source was carried out using @Risk7.5  
231 probabilistic evaluation software based on the Monte Carlo simulation technique.

## 232 **3. RESULTS**

### 233 **3.1. Concentration level, distribution characteristics, and environmental impact factors** 234 **of MCs in source water**

#### 235 **3.1.1. Concentration distribution characteristics of MCs in source water**

236 The concentration of MC-LR, MC-RR, and MC-YR in water samples were detected. The total  
237 concentrations of MCs (TMCs) in water is the sum of the concentrations of extracellular MCs  
238 (EMCs) and intracellular MCs (IMCs) dissolved in the water, and the results summarized in  
239 Table 1.

#### 240 **3.1.2. Seasonal distribution characteristics of MCs in water samples**

241 The seasonal distribution of MCs in Yongjiang river source is shown in Figure 3, which  
242 demonstrated that the concentration of TMC-YR (refers to the sum of intracellular and  
243 extracellular and the same below) was significantly lower than the other two MCs. The  
244 concentrations of TMC-RR and TMC-YR at the same time reached maximum levels in October.

#### 245 **3.1.3. Pearson's correlation analysis of environmental factors and MCs' concentration**

246 Pearson's correlation analysis of environmental factors and MCs' concentration was analyzed  
247 and the results shown in Table 2. According to the correlation analysis, the concentration of

248 TMC-RR was positively correlated with water temperature and TN ( $p < 0.01$ ), with a significant  
249 negative correlation with pH ( $p < 0.01$ ). The concentration of TMC-YR was negative correlated  
250 with TN:TP ratio ( $p < 0.05$ ). The concentration of TMC-LR was positively correlated with water  
251 temperature, TP, and  $\text{PO}_4^{3-}\text{-P}$  ( $p < 0.01$ ), with a significant negative correlation with DO and  
252 TN:TP ratio ( $p < 0.01$ ). The concentration of TMCs was positively correlated with water  
253 temperature and TP ( $p < 0.01$ ), with a significant negative correlation with pH, DO, and TN:TP  
254 ratio ( $p < 0.01$ ).

#### 255 **3.1.4. Stepwise multiple linear regression analysis of MCs' concentration and** 256 **environmental factors**

257 A stepwise multiple linear regression analysis of MCs' concentration and environmental factors  
258 is shown in Table 3. The results indicated that TP ( $\chi^3$ ) is the dominant factor affecting the  
259 contents of TMC-LR and TMCs. pH ( $\chi^2$ ) and TN:TP ratio ( $\chi^7$ ) are the primary factors affecting  
260 the content of TMC-RR and TMC-YR, respectively. These findings were in agreement with  
261 the results of the correlation analysis.

### 262 **3.2. Assessment of MCs' exposure in source waters**

#### 263 **3.2.1. Distribution fitting of the concentration of MCs in source water**

264 The present study used @Risk7.5 software to fit the processed samples. The sample data of the  
265 concentration of MCs in source water was characterized as continuous data. The fitting results  
266 were Gamma, Invgauss, Lognorm, Expon, and Loglogistic, followed by the optimal fitting  
267 distribution model. Three main methods were used to test the goodness of fit: Chi-Sq (Chi-  
268 squared) test, K-S (Kolmogorov–Smirnov) test, and A-D (Anderson–Darling) test ([Lipton et](#)

269 [al., 1995](#); [Cummins et al., 2009](#)). Taken together, the sample fitting results (Table 4) were used  
270 to determine the fitting distribution types of the optimal probability of the pollution data: MC-  
271 RR had Gamma and Invgauss distribution, MC-YR had Lognorm, Expon, and Loglogistic  
272 distribution, and MC-LR had Gamma and Expon distribution. Furthermore, the results of the  
273 distribution parameters after fitting and comparison with the sample data parameters are  
274 summarized in Table 5. The probability distribution of the mass concentration of microcystins  
275 MC-RR, MC-YR and MC-LR in source water is shown in Figures 4, 5, and 6. The fitting results  
276 can be visually observed from the coincidence of the blue rectangular shape and the area under  
277 the red curve.

### 278 **3.2.2. Daily exposure calculation**

279 The @Risk7.5 software was utilized for the random extraction of the MCs concentration  
280 profiles from the water to calculate the daily exposure of direct drinking water by different  
281 populations to MC-RR, MC-YR, and MC-LR. Each simulation cycle was performed for 10,000  
282 cycles, and the simulation results are shown in Table 6. In adults and children, a significant  
283 difference was observed in daily exposure. P50, P85, P90, and P95 (Table 6) represented the  
284 high exposure sites of each population. The MCs exposed to drinking water showed that the  
285 children's daily intake was 2-fold higher than that of the adults, suggesting that children are  
286 more susceptible to the pollution of MCs than adults.

## 287 **3.3. Risk characterization of MCs in source water**

### 288 **3.3.1. Carcinogenic risk of MCs in source water**

289 Based on the exposure parameters and carcinogenic risk formula, @Risk7.5 risk analysis

290 software was used to extract the numerical the value of MCs concentration in water randomly  
291 and calculate the carcinogenic risk of MC-RR, MC-YR, and MC-LR intake by different groups  
292 of individuals through direct drinking water. Each simulation cycle of 10,000 displayed the  
293 statistical simulation results summarized in Table 7. The carcinogenic annual risk of MC-YR  
294 was less than that of MC-LR and MC-RR, and MC-RR was the primary hazard in the source  
295 water. The maximum acceptable level and the negligible level of carcinogenic risk for the  
296 population recommended by some institutions is listed in Table 8. The annual risk of  
297 carcinogenesis of MCs in a water source is  $10^{-6}$ – $10^{-4}$ . The carcinogenic risk of MC-YR and  
298 MC-LR in adults and children is lower than the maximum acceptable risk level designated by  
299 USEPA ( $1 \times 10^{-4}$ ) and ICRP ( $5 \times 10^{-5}$ ), and the risk of carcinogenic in children is higher than that  
300 in adults. The health risks caused by MC-RR from drinking water source for children was  
301 significantly higher than the maximum allowance levels recommended by USEPA ( $1 \times 10^{-4}$ ).  
302 Also, the health risks caused by the MC-RR from drinking water source for adults were  
303 significantly higher than the maximum allowance levels recommended by ICRP ( $5 \times 10^{-5}$ ).  
304 These statistical details indicated that MC-RR in water bodies exhibited a significant  
305 carcinogenic risk to the health of adults and children.

### 306 **3.3.2. Non-carcinogenic risk of MCs in source water**

307 The exposure parameters and non-carcinogenic hazards index formula was used to calculate  
308 the value of different populations through direct drinking water intake of MC-RR, MC-YR,  
309 and MC-LR (Table 9), which demonstrated that the average non-carcinogenic hazards index of  
310 MCs in different populations through drinking water intake and the non-carcinogenic hazards  
311 index of P90 and P95 at high levels of exposure was  $<1$ . This suggested that MCs, which are

312 ingested through drinking water, pose less risk to health. The non-carcinogenic hazard index  
313 of MC-RR, MC-YR and MC-LR increased successively, indicated that MC-LR was more  
314 hazardous to human health than MC-YR and MC- RR. Although the MC-RR, MC-YR, and  
315 MC-LR display a non-carcinogenic index in children than adults, and thus, MCs are detrimental  
316 to children.

#### 317 **4. DISCUSSION**

318 The World Health Organization (WHO) established a guide value of 1 µg/L for MC-LR  
319 concentration in drinking water ([WHO, 2017](#)). A comprehensive Australian report suggest the  
320 concentration of total MCs in drinking water should not exceed 1.3 µg/L expressed as MC-LR  
321 toxicity equivalents. Furtherly, a cell density of approximately 6,500 cells/mL (biovolume of  
322 0.6 mm<sup>3</sup>/L) would be equivalent to the guideline of 1.3 µg/L MC-LR toxicity equivalents if the  
323 toxin were fully released into the water ([NHMRC & NRMCC, 2011](#)). In a 1996 Canadian  
324 publication, the recommended maximum acceptable level (MAL) in drinking water is 0.5 µg/L  
325 of MC-LR, or in the absence of potency equivalency values for other microcystins, 1 µg/L of  
326 total MCs ([Watanabe et al., 1996](#)).

327 The monitoring of the water quality in Yongjiang river demonstrated that although no major  
328 algal bloom occurred, MC-RR, MC-YR, and MC-LR were present in the water column during  
329 the monitoring period. The TMCs concentrations varied from 0.0313 to 0.4585 µg/L during the  
330 monitoring period. An earlier study of microcystins in Guangxi showed that the average  
331 concentration of microcystins in source water and treated water supplies were 0.277 µg/L and  
332 0.221 µg/L ([Lv et al., 2005](#)). Another survey showed that the concentration of microcystins in

333 the source water of high-incidence areas of liver cancer in Guangxi was  $(15.64 \pm 2.08)$  ng/L,  
334 and the concentration in treated water supplies was  $(14.42 \pm 2.28)$  ng/L (Li et al., 2016). These  
335 results suggest that microcystins are detected in parts of Guangxi, but no one study considered  
336 the influence factors and health risk assessment of microcystins. Data collected indicated when  
337 using TMCs content as an indicator that a peak level in October followed by a sharp drop in  
338 concentration (Figure 3). The significant decrease in TMCs content may be due to lower  
339 temperature from November to December and a slow growth of *Microcystis*. These phenomena  
340 were similar to those described from previously in Tai, Yang-cheng, and Xuanwu lakes in  
341 China (Xu et al., 2010; Li, Gu & He, 2014). TMC-RR concentration reached maximum levels  
342 in October, and then decreased to an average concentration level in November. As compared  
343 to the concentration of the above two toxins, TMC-YR concentration was lowest of the three  
344 toxins studied; these results were identical with findings by other researchers, which suggested  
345 that the MCs are primarily dominated by TMC-RR and TMC-LR (Yang et al., 2006; Bi et al.,  
346 2017). It was clearly shown that TMC-LR gradually increased in concentration from September  
347 to November. Such variation may be due to the influence of differences in nutrients and  
348 climates which are in favor of TMC-RR, TMC-LR and to a lesser extent TMC-YR.

349 Previous studies demonstrated that the algal toxins are produced by algae and  
350 consequently the concentration of toxins in water depends mainly on algal abundance (or  
351 biomass) such as chlorophyll-a concentration or algal cell counts, in turn, which is regulated  
352 by environmental factors. The relationship of physical and chemical water parameters to  
353 concentration levels of toxins are shown in Table 2. In this study, it was evident that temperature  
354 was positive and significantly correlated with concentration levels of TMCs, TMC-LR, TMC-

355 RR and weakly associated with concentration levels of TMC-YR. The highest TMCs and  
356 TMC-RR, TMC-LR concentration was observed in October and November with surface water  
357 temperature were around 25.6°C and 26.2°C, respectively. When water temperature increased,  
358 further higher concentration of TMCs and TMC-RR, TMC-LR concentration were detected.  
359 These findings are in agreement with previous reports which showed TMCs and TMC-RR,  
360 TMC-LR concentration were temperature dependent, and TMC-RR which are generally  
361 detected at lower temperatures as compared to TMC-LR which favor at higher temperatures  
362 (Wang et al., 2010; Mantzouki et al., 2018). Intriguingly, water pH was also shown to be related  
363 to the concentration levels of toxins in Nanning Yongjiang river. The maximum toxin  
364 concentration was detected at a pH below or above the medium level. As a result, TMC-RR  
365 and TMCs were negatively correlated with pH (Table 2), which was similar to the results from  
366 other studies. Notably, the phytoplankton is known to affect pH and then further affect the  
367 concentration levels of toxins. Therefore, the pH value cannot be used as an appropriate  
368 parameter to determine the concentration levels of toxins. A majority of the blue-green algae  
369 can grow adequately in the water at pH 6.5–7.9 (Wang et al., 2002). The pH of Yongjiang river  
370 was within this range. Dissolved oxygen (DO) concentration ranged from 2.0 to 12.5 mg/L  
371 during the study period. The reported environmental standard for river water is 5 mg/L (GB,  
372 2002). DO of Yongjiang river was partially lower than the reported standard during the  
373 monitoring period; these results show that the water is contaminated by organic matter, the  
374 oxygen consumption is severe, dissolved oxygen can not be replenished in time, and the  
375 anaerobic bacteria in the water will multiply quickly (Wang et al., 2002). DO showed a negative  
376 correlation of TMC-LR with TMCs in Yongjiang river. However, some researchers indicated

377 that increases in oxygen saturation were correlated with algal biomass (Bi et al., 2017).  
378 Unfortunately, the algal abundance (or biomass) such as chlorophyll-a concentration or algal  
379 cell counts were not measured, thus, DO has no direct effect on concentration levels of toxins.  
380 Correlation analysis results indicated that increasing the TP concentration could increase the  
381 concentration levels of toxins, especially that of TMC-LR. The current observations were in  
382 agreement with those from a study conducted in the large eutrophic Lake Erie in the USA  
383 (Harke et al., 2016) that demonstrated positive correlations between TP and the abundance of  
384 toxic Microcystis and MCs. Consistent with the trend, Vézic et al. (2002) also found that higher  
385 P concentrations were beneficial to the growth of toxic Microcystis. Although TP was a  
386 dominant explanatory variable, the effect of TN on the concentration levels of toxins could not  
387 be ignored. The concentration of TMC-YR was negatively correlated with the TN/TP ratio.  
388 Previous studies also demonstrated that decreasing the TN/TP ratio concentration could  
389 promote the growth and toxin concentration of Microcystis (Yu et al., 2014; Lei et al., 2015).  
390 According to stepwise multiple linear regression (Table 3), TP was found to be the dominant  
391 factor affecting the contents of TMC-LR and TMCs, and pH and TN/TP ratio as the main  
392 factors affecting the content of TMC-RR and TMC-YR. These findings were in agreement with  
393 the results of correlation analysis.

394 The Monte Carlo simulation model determined the risk levels and putative human exposure  
395 scenarios associated with the blooms in Yongjiang river used for drinking. The whole process  
396 of security risk assessment was always accompanied by the uncertainty. The entire process of  
397 risk assessment was conducted two in steps: exposure assessment and hazard characterization.  
398 Although the extrapolation of the experimental results does not lead to certainty, it could be

399 carried out from experimental animals to the general population and from the general  
400 population to specific populations (sensitive populations). The variations in human individuals  
401 involved parameters such as genetics, age, sex, environment (nutritional status) and other  
402 factors. On the other hand, missing data or limitations led to uncertainties, including NOVEL,  
403 time differences, and lack of exposure data. Recent studies have gradually established superior  
404 methods, such as benchmark dose (BMD) and chemical-specific adjustment factor (CSAF), to  
405 address and reduce the uncertainty in the risk assessment ([Ibelings et al., 2015](#)). The USEPA  
406 and Health Canada have gradually started utilizing the BMD and CSAF methods to develop  
407 the health guidance values ([Zeller, Duran-Pacheco & Guerard, 2017](#)).

408 Several countries that regulate cyanotoxins in drinking water use a parametric value based  
409 on the WHO Guidelines for 1 µg/L MC-LR ([WHO, 2017](#)). With respect to the drinking source  
410 waters, most countries use guidance values based on cyanobacterial biomass (cell density,  
411 chlorophyll-a, biovolume) indirectly reflecting the potential hazardous MCs concentrations  
412 ([Valerio et al., 2009](#); [Menezes, Churro & Dias, 2017](#)). Our results indicated that the risk of  
413 carcinogenicity of MC-RR to children health under high exposure was greater than the  
414 maximum acceptable risk level recommended by USEPA ( $1 \times 10^{-4}$ ); the annual risk of  
415 carcinogenic exposure in adults with MC-RR was greater than the maximum acceptable risk  
416 level recommended by the ICRP ( $5 \times 10^{-5}$ ). The TMC-RR concentrations varied from 0.0224 to  
417 0.3783 µg/L during the monitoring period. Therefore, the guideline value of TMC-RR in the  
418 Yongjiang river should be less than 0.3783 µg/L, so as not to pose a health risk to humans.  
419 Furthermore, we must take into account that the use of Yongjiang river is increasing, not only  
420 for the production of drinking water, but also for ludic activities, such as water sports, fishing,

421 sailing and swimming. Thus, the relevant departments must attach great importance to the  
422 potential risks associated with Yongjiang river in order to protect the health of their users.

## 423 **5. CONCLUSION**

424 This study analyzed the influencing factors and the health risk assessment of MCs by Monte  
425 Carlo simulation method in Yongjiang river, China. The results showed that TP content may be  
426 related to TMC-LR and TMCs concentration, while pH and TN/TP ratio may be related to  
427 TMC-RR and TMC-YR concentration, respectively. The health risk assessment results showed  
428 that the risk of MC-RR for human health hazards is higher than that of MC-LR and MC-YR,  
429 and children are more vulnerable to MCs contamination than the adults. The risk of  
430 carcinogenicity of MC-RR to children health under high exposure was greater than the  
431 maximum acceptable risk level recommended by USEPA. The annual risk of carcinogenic  
432 exposure in adults with MC-RR was greater than the maximum acceptable risk level  
433 recommended by the ICRP. The non-carcinogenic hazard index for MCs was <1. Therefore,  
434 MCs in the water bodies should be monitored in regards to the carcinogenic risk to human  
435 health.

## 436 **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

437 At this point, we appreciate the Affiliated Tumor Hospital of Guangxi Medical University for  
438 their total support to research. We also thank immensely the reviewers for their constructive  
439 comments which has led to the final draft of this article.

440

## 441 **REFERENCES**

442 Bi X, Dai W, Zhang S, Dong S, Zhang D. 2017. Effects of toxic *Microcystis* genotypes on  
443 natural colony formation and mechanism involved. *Water Sci Technol* 76(4): 885-894.

444 Cao Q, Steinman AD, Yao L, Xie L. 2017. Toxicological and biochemical responses of the  
445 earthworm *Eisenia fetida* to cyanobacteria toxins. *Sci Rep* 7(1): 15954.

446 Clausen JL, Georgian T, Gardner KH, Douglas TA. 2017. Applying Incremental Sampling  
447 Methodology to Soils Containing Heterogeneously Distributed Metallic Residues to Improve  
448 Risk Analysis. *Bull Environ Contam Toxicol*.

449 Cummins E, Butler F, Gormley R, Brunton N. 2009. A Monte Carlo risk assessment model for  
450 acrylamide formation in French fries. *Risk Anal* 29(10): 1410-1426.

451 Duy TN, Lam PK, Shaw GR, Connell DW. Toxicology and risk assessment of freshwater  
452 cyanobacterial (blue-green algal) toxins in water. *Rev Environ Contam Toxicol* 163: 113-185.

453 Falconer, I. R. and T. H. Buckley. 1989. Tumour promotion by *Microcystis* sp., a blue-green  
454 alga occurring in water supplies. *Med J Aust* 150(6): 351.

455 Fan Ch, E.J.Love, Zhai PY, Wang J, Na HK .2009. Risk assessment of liver cancer caused by  
456 organic poisons in S river water. *Mutant Society for Carcinogenicity* 2009:7(in Chinese).

457 Funari, E. and E. Testai. 2008. Human health risk assessment related to cyanotoxins exposure.  
458 *Crit Rev Toxicol* 38(2): 97-125.

459 Guo Biao(GB) 3838-2002. Environmental quality standards for surface water(in Chinese) .

460 Harke MJ, Davis TW, Watson SB, Gobler CJ.2016. Nutrient-Controlled Niche Differentiation  
461 of Western Lake Erie Cyanobacterial Populations Revealed via Metatranscriptomic Surveys.  
462 *Environ Sci Technol* 50(2): 604-615.

463 Hitzfeld BC, Hoger SJ, Dietrich DR. 2000. Cyanobacterial toxins: removal during drinking  
464 water treatment, and human risk assessment. *Environ Health Perspect* 108 Suppl 1: 113-122.

465 Holland, A.; Kinnear, S. 2013. Interpreting the possible ecological role(s) of cyanotoxins:  
466 Compounds for competitive advantage and/or physiological aid? *Mar. Drugs*, 11(7), 2239–  
467 2258.

468 International Agency for Research on Cancer(IARC). 2010. monographs on the evaluation of  
469 carcinogenic risks to humans. Ingested nitrate and nitrite, and cyanobacterial peptide toxins.  
470 *IARC Monogr Eval Carcinog Risks Hum* 94: v-vii, 1-412.

471 Ibelings BW, Backer LC, Kardinaal WE, Chorus I. 2015. Current approaches to cyanotoxin  
472 risk assessment and risk management around the globe. *Harmful Algae* 49: 63-74.

473 Jia Y, Wang L, Cao J, Li S, Yang Z. 2018. Trace elements in four freshwater fish from a mine-  
474 impacted river: spatial distribution, species-specific accumulation, and risk assessment.  
475 *Environ Sci Pollut Res Int*.

476 Keleti, G., Sykora, J.L., Libby, E.C. and Shapiro, M.A. 1979. Composition and biological  
477 properties of lipopolysaccharides isolated from *Schizothrix calcicola* (Ag.) Gomont  
478 (cyanobacteria). *Appl. Environ. Microbiol.*,38, 471-477.

479 Keleti, G. and J. L. Sykora. 1982. Production and properties of cyanobacterial endotoxins. *Appl*  
480 *Environ Microbiol* 43(1): 104-109.

481 Lee S, Jiang X, Manubolu M, Riedl K, Ludsin SA, Martin JF, Lee J. 2017. Fresh produce and  
482 their soils accumulate cyanotoxins from irrigation water: Implications for public health and  
483 food security. *Food Res Int* 102: 234-245.

484 Lei L, Li C, Peng L, Han BP. 2015. Competition between toxic and non-toxic *Microcystis*  
485 *aeruginosa* and its ecological implication. *Ecotoxicology* 24(7-8): 1411-1418.

486 Li, D., A. Z. Gu and M. He. 2014. Quantification and genetic diversity of total and microcystin-  
487 producing *Microcystis* during blooming season in Tai and Yang-cheng lakes, China. *J Appl*  
488 *Microbiol* 116(6): 1482-1494.

489 Li G, Zhao X, Wu S, Hua H, Wang Q, Zhang Z. 2017. Dietary exposure to aluminium in the  
490 popular Chinese fried bread youtiao. *Food Addit Contam Part A Chem Anal Control Expo Risk*  
491 *Assess* 34(6): 972-979.

492 Li KZ, Deng W, Li YX, Li JL, Zhang CY, Ren JJ, Wu HH .2016. Microcystin content of  
493 different water sources in a region of Guangxi showing high incidence of liver cancer  
494 .*Chin J of Oncol Prev and Treat*. 2016,8(06):387-390(in Chinese).

495 Lippy, E.C. and Erb, J. 1976 Gastrointestinal illness at Sewickley, PA. *J. Am. Water Works*  
496 *Assoc.*, 68, 606-610.

497 Lipton J, Shaw WD, Holmes J, Patterson A. 1995. Short communication: selecting input  
498 distributions for use in Monte Carlo simulations. *Regul Toxicol Pharmacol* 21(1): 192-198.

499 LV BJ, Pan J, Wu SSH, Wei CHY, Li CHM, WU HY. 2005. Investigation on the content of  
500 microcystin in drinking source water and factory water in Guangxi. *Chin J Nat Med*  
501 2005(04):313-314(in Chinese).

502 Mantzouki E. 2018. Temperature Effects Explain Continental Scale Distribution of  
503 Cyanobacterial Toxins. *Toxins (Basel)* 13;10(4).

504 Menezes, C., C. Churro and E. Dias. 2017. Risk Levels of Toxic Cyanobacteria in Portuguese  
505 Recreational Freshwaters. *Toxins (Basel)* 9(10).

506 Moolenaar RJ. 1996. A perspective on carcinogen risk assessment. *Toxicology Forum*,  
507 Washington DC, February 19, 1996. *Regul Toxicol Pharmacol* 23(3): 241-243.

508 NHMRC, NRMCC. 2011. Australian Drinking Water Guidelines Paper 6 National Water  
509 Quality Management Strategy. National Health and Medical Research Council, National  
510 Resource Management Ministerial Council, Commonwealth of Australia, Canberra.

511 Paladino, O., A. Moranda and M. Seyedsalehi. 2017. A Method for Identifying Pollution  
512 Sources of Heavy Metals and PAH for a Risk-Based Management of a Mediterranean Harbour.  
513 *Scientifica (Cairo)* 2017: 4690715.

514 Pham TL, Utsumi M. 2018. An overview of the accumulation of microcystins in aquatic  
515 ecosystems. *J Environ Manage* 213:520-529.

516 Pouria S, de Andrade A, Barbosa J, Cavalcanti RL, Barreto VT, Ward CJ, Preiser W, Poon GK,  
517 Neild GH, Codd GA. 1998. Fatal microcystin intoxication in haemodialysis unit in Caruaru,  
518 Brazil. *Lancet* 352(9121): 21-26.

519 Jia Y, Wang L, Cao J, Li S, Yang Z. 2017. Monte Carlo simulations of skin exposure to  
520 electromagnetic field from 10 GHz to 1 THz. *Phys Med Biol* 62(17): 6993-7010.

521 Sasi, H., A. Yozukmaz and M. Yabanli. 2017. Heavy metal contamination in the muscle of  
522 Aegean chub (*Squalius Fellowesii*) and potential risk assessment. *Environ Sci Pollut Res Int*.

523 Ueno Y, Nagata S, Tsutsumi T, Hasegawa A, Watanabe MF, Park HD, Chen GC, Chen G, Yu  
524 SZ. 1996. Detection of microcystins, a blue-green algal hepatotoxin, in drinking water sampled  
525 in Haimen and Fusui, endemic areas of primary liver cancer in China, by highly sensitive  
526 immunoassay. *Carcinogenesis* 17(6): 1317-1321.

527 Valerio E, Chambel L, Paulino S, Faria N, Pereira P, Tenreiro R. 2009. Molecular identification,  
528 typing and traceability of cyanobacteria from freshwater reservoirs. *Microbiology* 155(Pt 2):  
529 642-656.

530 Vezie C, Rapala J, Vaitomaa J, Seitsonen J, Sivonen K. 2002. Effect of nitrogen and phosphorus  
531 on growth of toxic and nontoxic *Microcystis* strains and on intracellular microcystin  
532 concentrations. *Microb Ecol* 43(4): 443-454.

533 Wang Q, Niu Y, Xie P, Chen J, Ma Z, Tao M, Qi M, Wu L, Guo L. 2010. Factors affecting  
534 temporal and spatial variations of microcystins in Gonghu Bay of Lake Taihu, with potential  
535 risk of microcystin contamination to human health. *ScientificWorldJournal* 10: 1795-1809.

536 Wang X, Parkpian P, Fujimoto N, Ruchirawat KM, DeLaune RD, Jugsujinda A. 2002.  
537 Environmental conditions associating microcystins production to *Microcystis aeruginosa* in a  
538 reservoir of Thailand. *J Environ Sci Health A Tox Hazard Subst Environ Eng* 37(7):1181-207.

539 Watanabe, M.F., Harada, K.I., Carmichael, W.W., Fujiki. 1996. Production of Microcystins. In  
540 Toxic Microcystis; CRC Press: Boca Raton, Fla. 1996; 35-36.

541 World Health Organization(WHO). 2017. Guidelines for drinking-water quality: fourth edition  
542 incorporating the first addendum. Geneva. Licence: CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO

543 Wolf, H. U. and C. Frank. 2002. Toxicity assessment of cyanobacterial toxin mixtures. *Environ*  
544 *Toxicol* 17(4): 395-399.

545 Wunderlin DA, Diaz MP, Ame´ MV, Pesce SF, Hued AC, Bistoni MA. 2001. Pattern  
546 recognition techniques for the evaluation of spatial and temporal variations in water quality. A  
547 case study: Suqu´ia River Basin (Co´rdoba -Argentina). *Water Res* 35:2881–2894.

548 Xu Y, Wang G, Yang W, Li R. 2010. Dynamics of the water bloom-forming *Microcystis* and  
549 its relationship with physicochemical factors in Lake Xuanwu (China). *Environ Sci Pollut Res*  
550 *Int* 17(9): 1581-1590.

551 Yang H, Xie P, Xu J, Zheng L, Deng D, Zhou Q, Wu S. 2006. Seasonal variation of microcystin  
552 concentration in Lake Chaohu, a shallow subtropical lake in the People's Republic of China.  
553 *Bull Environ Contam Toxicol* 77(3): 367-374.

554 Yeh FS, Yu MC, Mo CC, Luo S, Tong MJ, Henderson BE. 1989. Hepatitis B virus, aflatoxins,  
555 and hepatocellular carcinoma in southern Guangxi, China. *Cancer Res* 49(9): 2506-2509.

556 Younes, M. 1999. Specific issues in health risk assessment of endocrine disrupting chemicals  
557 and international activities. *Chemosphere* 39(8): 1253-1257.

558 Yu L, Kong F, Zhang M, Yang Z, Shi X, Du M. 2014. The dynamics of microcystis genotypes  
559 and microcystin production and associations with environmental factors during blooms in Lake  
560 Chaohu, China. *Toxins (Basel)* 6(12): 3238-3257.

561 Yu SZ, Chen W, Li J .1995. The prospective research of risk factors of primary liver cancer in  
562 Nanhui County, Shanghai. *Zhonghua Liu Xing Bing Xue Za Zhi* 16(1):22-4(in Chinese).

563 Zegura, B. 2016. An Overview of the Mechanisms of Microcystin-LR Genotoxicity and  
564 Potential Carcinogenicity. *Mini Rev Med Chem* 16(13): 1042-1062.

565 Zeller, A., G. Duran-Pacheco and M. Guerard. 2017. An appraisal of critical effect sizes for the  
566 benchmark dose approach to assess dose-response relationships in genetic toxicology. *Arch*  
567 *Toxicol* 91(12): 3799-3807.

568 Zobitz JM, Desai AR, Moore DJ, Chadwick MA. 2011. A primer for data assimilation with  
569 ecological models using Markov Chain Monte Carlo (MCMC). *Oecologia* 167(3): 599-611.