

1 **How long should the fully hillside-closed forest protection be implemented on**
2 **the Loess Plateau, Shaanxi, China?**

3 Lin Hou¹, Sijia Hou²

4 1 College of Forestry, Northwest A&F University, Yangling, Shaanxi 712100, China

5 2 College of Transportation, Southeast University, Nanjing, Jiangsu, 211189, China

Comment [A1]: It seems that the fully hillside-closed forest protection program is the same as Sloping Land Conservation Program? See Xi et al. 2014. Challenges to sustainable development in China: a review of six large-scale forest restoration and land conservation programs. *Journal of Sustainable Forestry*, 33:1-19. If they are the same, then change your title to “How long should sloping land conservation program be implemented on the Loess Plateau, Shaanxi, China?” Also, if this change is made, then go through the paper and change all “fully hillside-closed forest protection” to “sloping land conservation program.”

17

18 **Corresponding author**

19 Lin Hou

20 3 Taicheng Road, Yangling, Shaanxi, 712100, China

21 E-mail: houlin1969@163.com

22 **Abstract**

23 **Background.** Restoration of degraded forest ecosystem is crucial for regional sustainable
24 development. To protect the country's fragile and fragmented environment, the Chinese
25 government has initiated an ecological engineering, the Natural Forest Protection Program in
26 seventeen provinces in China since 1998. Fully hillside-closed forest protection (vegetation
27 restoration naturally without any artificial disturbance) was one of vital measures of the Natural
28 Forest Protection Program applied national wide. Whether plant diversity, biomass and age
29 structure of dominant tree species and soil nutrients in protected stands may become better with
30 increase of protected period are still open problems.

31 **Methods.** We investigated community diversity, biomass of dominant tree species, age structures,
32 and analyzed soil chemical properties of a *Pinus tabulaeformis* population at protected sites
33 representing different protected ages at Huanglongshan Forest Bureau on the Loess Plateau, Shaanxi,
34 China.

35 **Results.** Plant species richness of *Pinus tabulaeformis* community was significantly affected

36 ($p<0.05$) by forest protection and the effect attenuated with protection age. Shannon evenness
37 index of plant species generally increased with protection age. Stands protected for 45 years had
38 the highest tree biomass and considerable natural regeneration capacity. Contents of organic
39 carbon, available phosphorus and available potassium in top soil increased in protected stands less
40 than 45 years, however decreased significantly thereafter. Long-term forest protection also
41 decreased content of mineral nitrogen in top soil.

42 **Discussion.** We found that richness of shrubs and herbs was significantly affected by forest
43 protection, and evenness indices of tree, shrub and herb increased inconsistently with protected
44 ages. Forest protection created more complex age structures and tree densities with increasing age
45 of protection. Content of soil mineral nitrogen at 0-20 cm soil depth showed a decreasing trend in
46 stands of up to 30 years. Soil available phosphorus and potassium contents were higher in stands
47 with greater proportions of big and middle trees. Long-term protection (> 45 years) of *Pinus*
48 *tabulaeformis* stand in southeast Loess Plateau, China, may be associated with decreasing plant
49 species richness, proportion of medium to large trees, dominant biomass of *Pinus tabulaeformis*
50 and soil nutrients.

51
52 **Keywords:** Fully Hillside-closed Forest Protection, Optimal Protection Age, *Pinus tabulaeformis*,
53 the Loess Plateau, Restoration

54

Comment [A2]: The word middle designates position and not size unlike big or small. Instead use mid-sized or medium trees. You can say “.....proportions of big and mid-sized trees.” Try to effect this correction throughout the paper. See lines 47, 196, 197

55

56

57

58

59

60

61

62

63

64 **INTRODUCTION**

65 Ecological restoration is being recognized as an international priority(Aronson & Alexander
66 2013; Wortley et al. 2013) and it plays a crucial role in rebuilding ecological equilibrium and
67 reversing ecosystem degradation (Ma et al. 2013). As a part of ecological engineering (Mitsch
68 2012), the practice is being widely incorporated into natural resource strategies from the local to
69 global level (Wortley et al. 2013).

70 To protect the country's fragile and fragmented environment, the Chinese government has
71 initiated an ecological engineering, the Natural Forest Protection Program (NFPP) since 1998 (Xu

et al. 2006). Logging and harvesting of partial or full timber was prohibited in protected areas from 1998 to 2008(Xu et al. 2006). Fully hillside-closed forest protection (vegetation restoration naturally without any artificial disturbance) was applied ~~in national-wide~~ nation-wide. Ecosystems have the capacity to self-organize and the self-design or self-organizational properties of natural systems is an essential component to ecological engineering(Bergen et al. 2001). ~~It is obviously~~ Obviously, fully hillside-closed forest protection is in accord with the ecological engineering principle self-design.

The previous studies regarding NFPP have mainly focused upon the introduction of the related policy issues(Grumbine & Xu 2011; Li 2004; Wang et al. 2015) , the spatial-temporal succession of regional vegetation (Huang et al. 2014) and ecological restoration programs and payments (Yin & Zhao 2012).

However, a range of questions remain, particularly in relation to stand function and associated environmental parameters following stand protection. We hypothesize that fully hillside-closed forest protection may promote plant diversity, biomass and age structure of dominant tree species and soil nutrients with increase of protected period.

The objectives of this study are to address a few of these key knowledge gaps, including : (i) do the stands exhibit significant differences in plant assemblage; (ii) does soil fertility change with stand age structure;(iii) can a functional relationship be defined regarding length of stand protection and stand quality, i.e., are stands protected for longer timeframes “better” than other stands; and (iv) based on findings of i-iii above, can a preliminary estimate regarding the optimal

92 time span for *Pinus tabulaeformis* stands be recommended to the Natural Forest Protection
93 Program?

94 MATERIALS AND METHODS

95 Site description

96 The study was conducted in Huanglong County (35°28'49"–36°02'01"N, 109°38'49"–
97 110°12'47"E) on the southeast Loess Plateau ,Shaanxi, China. Stands in this area (a part of NFPP
98 area) play key ecological roles in soil erosion abated and sand storm mitigated(Chen et al. 2014).

Comment [A3]: play key ecological roles in abatement of soil erosion and mitigation of sand storm (Chen et al. 2014).

99 The vegetation type is a northern deciduous broad-leaved forest sub-region. *Pinus tabulaeformis* is
100 dominant tree species in the currently existing stands. The associated tree species are *Quercus*
101 *liaotungensis*, *Syringa oblate*, *Populus davidiana*, *Prunus davidiana*, *Betula platyphylla* and
102 *Toxicodendron vernicifluum*. Shrubs and herb species in understory are abundant. The altitude
103 ranges from 1100 to 1300 m. It is dominated by a warm temperate and semi-humid continental
104 climate. The annual average precipitation is 612 mm and the mean atmospheric temperature is
105 8.6 °C. Cinnamon soil is the main soil type in the forest region.

106 Due to poor communication and a small [human](#) population in the past years, stands on some
107 special sites have not been disturbed since 1950, especially since 1998.

108 According to data from Huanglongshan Forest Bureau, Yanan, Shaanxi, China, stands with
109 protected age sequence were found in four forest farms (Table 1).

110 Field methods

111 The field investigation and sampling was conducted between June 5 to July 15, 2003. Each
 112 plot of trees_s, shrubs_s and herbs_s was 20 m×20 m, 2m×2 m and 1 m×1 m respectively. Five sub-plots
 113 of shrubs_s, herbs_s and ~~regeneration-regenerating~~ seedlings were arrayed diagonally in each tree plot
 114 respectively. The indices, species, number, Height (H), diameter at breast height (DBH) and
 115 canopy density of trees, and species, height, cover ratio, number of shrubs_s, herbs_s and ~~regeneration-~~
 116 ~~regenerating~~ seedlings were measured. All community data were collected from 27 tree plots
 117 spreading among the age cohorts and 270 sub-plots (Table 1).

Comment [A4]: You can use 'advance regeneration' or 'regenerating seedlings' to refer to seedlings growing on forest floor.

118 Three soil samples were obtained randomly by a special drill in each tree plot. Surface soils
 119 (0-20cm depth) at all sites were assessed for soil properties including organic carbon, mineral N,
 120 available phosphorous and potassium.

121 **Community diversity**

122 The importance of species richness and evenness in influencing diversity-associated
 123 productivity has been demonstrated in a meta-analysis of 54 studies (Zhang et al. 2012). In this
 124 study, we chose indices of richness and evenness to reflect characteristics of community. Species
 125 richness index (S) was derived from field survey data. To characterize the diversity of the stand
 126 community, the Shannon-Wiener index (H') and evenness index (J') were calculated as the
 127 following:

128 Shannon-Wiener index $H' = -\sum P_i \ln P_i$

129 Shannon evenness index $J' = \frac{H'}{\ln S}$

130 where P_i is the relative frequency of the i -th species, and S is total number of species in plots
131 and subplots (Magurran 2004).

132 **Biomass of dominant tree species**

133 Average DBH (cm) and height (m) of *Pinus tabulaeformis* in each plot were calculated and
134 living biomass (Mgha^{-1}) of whole trees (*Pinus tabulaeformis*) were estimated (Chen & Peng 1996;
135 Pan et al. 2004).

136 $Y = 15.525 + 0.6269v$

137 $\ln v = 0.99138 \ln(D^2 H) - 10.30211$

138 where Y is the living biomass of trees (Mgha^{-1}) v is the stand growing stock ($\text{m}^3 \text{ha}^{-1}$), D (cm) is
139 diameter at breast height and H (m) is height.

140 Combining the density of dominant tree species (Table 1) with equations, biomass of *Pinus*
141 *tabulaeformis* in protected stands was determined.

142 **Age structures**

143 DBH of tree species correlate significantly to their ages under the same environmental
144 condition (Parker & Peet 1984). Lacking of analytic wood data, we adopted DBH structures of
145 *Pinus tabulaeformis* population instead of its age structures. Combining DBH ~~to~~ and H , age
146 structures of *Pinus tabulaeformis* population were classified as following: I seedling, $H \leq 0.30 \text{ m}$;
147 II young tree, $0.30 \text{ m} < H \leq 2.00 \text{ m}$, $\text{DBH} \leq 6.00 \text{ cm}$; III small tree, $H > 2.0 \text{ m}$, $6.0 \text{ cm} < \text{DBH} \leq 12.0 \text{ cm}$;

Comment [A5]: Are the equations from Chen and Peng 1996; and Pan et al. 2004? If yes, Lines 133 – 135 should read - Average DBH (cm) and height (m) of *Pinus tabulaeformis* in each plot were calculated and living biomass (Mgha^{-1}) of whole trees (*Pinus tabulaeformis*) were estimated according to Chen and Peng 1996; and Pan et al. 2004.

148 **IV**middle tree, 12.0cm<DBH≤20.0cm; **V** big tree, DBH>20.0cm. The ratio of seedlings, young trees,
149 small trees, middle trees and big trees in stand with same protecting age was used to illustrate age
150 structures. Probable age of individual was determined by their whorled branches.

151 **Chemical analyses**

152 Analyses were made on air-dry soil material that passed through a 2 mm sieve. Soil organic
153 carbon content (SOC) was determined by dry combustion with a TOC/TON analyzer
154 (TOC-VTH-2000A, Shimadzu Corporation, Japan). Soil mineral nitrogen (ammonium nitrogen,
155 NH_4^+ -N and nitric nitrogen, NO_3^- -N) content was determined by the colorimetric method with
156 automatic flow injection (AA3, BRAN+LUEBBE, Germany). Available phosphorus content was
157 extracted in 0.5M NaHCO_3 and determined by Mo-Sb colorimetry. Available potassium content
158 was determined by method of flame photometry (Bao 2000).

159 **Data processing and analysis**

160 SPSS 17.0 and Origin8.0 (OriginLab Corporation) software were used for statistical analysis
161 and plotting. A graphic check of the postulates was performed based on the residual distribution.
162 One-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) following ~~by~~ Fisher's least significant difference (LSD)
163 test ($p<0.05$) was used to compare the protection age effects on diversity of plant community and
164 soil nutrients respectively.

165 **RESULTS**

166 **Diversity of plants in protected stands**

167 Richness index of tree, shrub and herb was highest in the stand protected for 30 years (Table
 168 2). A significant difference in the tree species richness index was observed in the 30 year protected
 169 stand compared to stands protected for 16 years ($n=5, p<0.05$) and 45 years ($n=8, p<0.05$), but not
 170 in other stands with different protected ages (Figure 1). The richness index of within stand shrubs
 171 differed significantly between stands protected for 30 years compared to stands protected for 16
 172 years ($n=25, p<0.05$), 45 years ($n=40, p<0.05$), 60 years ($n=20, p<0.05$) and 75 years ($n=20,$
 173 $p<0.05$) (Figure 1). Significant differences in the within-stand shrub richness index were also
 174 found in stands protected (i) 16 years and 60, 75 years, (ii) 45 years and 60 years, 75 years (Figure
 175 1). The within stand herb richness index in the stands protected for 30 years differentiated
 176 significantly ~~to~~ from stands protected 16 years ($n=25, p<0.05$), 45 years ($n=40, p<0.05$), 60 years
 177 ($n=20, p<0.05$) and 75 years ($n=20, p<0.05$) (Figure 1). Richness of within stand herb at stands
 178 protected for 16 years also varied significantly ~~to~~ from stands protected for 60 years and 75 years
 179 (Figure 1).

Comment [A6]: Make sure that all $n=?$ are as shown on the table.

180 Shannon-Wiener evenness index of tree, shrub and herb was ~~the~~ highest in stands protected
 181 for 30 years, 45 years and 75 years respectively (Figure 2). The index of herb generally increased
 182 with protected ages except in stands protected for 16 years to 30 years (Figure 2). However, the
 183 index of tree and shrub fluctuated with stand protected years and did not follow a trending
 184 relationship (Figure 2). Tree and shrub Shannon-Wiener index increased with stand protection age,
 185 with the exception of tree index 30-45 year stand protection and shrub index 45-60 year stand
 186 protection (Figure 2).

187 **Biomass of *Pinus tabulaeformis* in protected stands**

188 Biomass of *Pinus tabulaeformis* increased in stands until 45 years of forest protection;
189 however, for sites older than this protection age, stand biomass decreased (Figure 3). Peak biomass
190 was $70.60 \pm 8.00 \text{ t} \cdot \text{ha}^{-1}$ in the stand protected for 45 years, while biomass in the stand protected for
191 75 years ($19.90 \pm 9.20 \text{ t} \cdot \text{ha}^{-1}$) was lower than the stand protected for 16 years ($23.70 \pm 17.10 \text{ t} \cdot \text{ha}^{-1}$)
192 (Figure 3).

193 **Age structure of *Pinus tabulaeformis* population in protected stands**

194 Although age classes of *Pinus tabulaeformis* occurred in protected stands, they varied greatly
195 (Figure 4). Only young (II) and small trees (III) were found in the stand protected for 16 years,
196 small (III) and middle trees (IV) dominated the stand protected for 30 years (Figure 4). For the
197 stand protected for 45 years, big (V) and middle trees (IV) were main components, but seedlings
198 (I) and young trees were considerable also (Figure 4). In contrast, for stands protected for 60 and
199 75 years, seedlings (I) were the dominant component, followed by young (II) and small trees
200 (III), with big trees (V) lowest in distribution (Figure 4).

201 **Soil nutrients**

202 Significant differences of soil organic carbon content at 0-20 cm soil depth were observed
203 between the stands, with higher soil organic carbon content observed in stands protected for longer
204 than 30 years (Figure 5 A). Content of mineral nitrogen at 0-20 cm soil depth demonstrated
205 significant differences in stands before and after [the](#) protected 30 years (Figure 5 B). No significant

differences were found between [stands](#) protected for 16 years and 30 years, and among stands after ~~protected for~~ 30 years (Figure 5 B). Content of available phosphorus at 0-20 cm soil depth increased as protection of stand age increased, with significant differences observed mostly at youngest and oldest stand ages (Figure 5 C). No significant difference in available phosphorus was observed in stands between ~~45– 30~~ and ~~30– 45~~ years ~~of protection-age~~, and between 45 and 60 years ~~of protection age~~ (Figure 5 C). Content of available potassium at 0-20 cm soil depth decreased in stands younger than 45 years ~~forest protection~~ and thereafter increased (Figure 5 D). Significant differences were demonstrated among stands with different protection ages, except at ~~ages~~ 45 ~~years~~ and 60 ~~years~~ (Figure 5 D).

Discussion

Response of plant diversity to forest protection

Species richness is one measure of biodiversity and is very important for ecosystem functioning, stability and integrity (Coroi et al. 2004). We found that richness of shrubs and herbs was significantly affected by forest protection, although richness (Figure 1) and evenness (Figure 2) indices of tree, shrub and herb increased ~~inconsistently–~~ [in an unpredictable manner](#) with protected age. The richness of plant species increased in stands protected for 16 years to 30 years, decreased in stands protected for 30 years to 45 years and remained fairly stable in stands protected for longer than 45 years (Table 2). Due to adequate sunlight and growing spaces, some pioneer tree species (*Populus davidiana*, *Betula platyphylla*) and drought resistant shrubs (*Rubus corchorifolius*, *Rosa hugonis*, etc.) and herbs (*Artemisia gmelinii*, *Saussurea petrovii*, etc.) were

226 more prevalent in the younger forest protection sites, increasing plant species richness of these
227 stands (Table 2). With the growth of trees, canopy density increased and some drought resistant
228 plant species disappeared. ~~The naturally regenerating seedlings~~ Advance regeneration in stands
229 protected for 45 years and older ~~occupied~~ made up a large proportion of the species observed,
230 impeding invasive plant species and stabilizing plant diversity of the community assemblage.
231 Inherent spatial variability within the landscape may provide a possible explanation for this pattern
232 observed, since *Pinus tabulaeformis* stands are distributed across variable site conditions within
233 the region. Soil moisture is considered to be the key limiting factor on the Loess Plateau for
234 differences in plant species growth and regeneration (Chen et al. 2014) and it is possible that the
235 differences in soil ~~properties~~ property as observed in this study ~~reflect~~ affected ~~variation in~~
236 plant-available moisture.

237 Forest protection in Huanglongshan forest region, Yanan, Shaanxi, China was initiated in
238 1950. Stand structure within the protection area under the natural restoration condition differed.
239 Stands with diversified age ~~diversity~~ structure generally were ~~more richer in~~ species ~~rich~~ than
240 stands with less diversified age structure (Thompson 2012). Findings in this study partly support
241 this notion. Stands protected for great than 16 years had more species with diverse age structures
242 and plant species richness (Figure 1). Age class structure in stands protected for 30 years were
243 generally simpler than stands protected for longer periods (Figure 4). However, stands older than
244 30 years ~~forest~~ of protection had lower richness index of tress and understory species (Figure 2).

245 Our results suggest that sustainable forest protection can potentially contribute to plant

246 diversity conservation by increasing species richness generally (Table 2) and promoting even
247 distribution of trees and herbs ~~more even~~ (Figure 2).

248 **Response of age structure to forest protection**

249 Forest protection created more complex age structures (Figure 3) and tree densities with
250 increasing age of protection (Table1). Seedlings, ~~middle~~ medium and big trees were absent in
251 younger stands (Figure 4) which indicated tree biomass was low (Figure 3) and lacked natural
252 regeneration capacity. Although plants species were most abundant in stands protected for 30 years
253 (Figure 1), this protection age contained the lowest proportion of big trees (**V**) among age classes
254 (Figure 4) limiting tree biomass. Both seedlings (Figure 4) and density of trees (Figure 1) in older (>
255 60 years) protected stands ~~protection~~ were higher than in younger stands, suggesting ~~that~~ a better
256 natural regeneration capacity. However, more seedlings and small trees without adequate big trees
257 (Figure 4) in ~~the~~ some older stands ~~also unveiled their~~ were evidence of insufficient productivity_
258 of such stands (Figure 3).

Comment [A7]: ?

259 Our results support the widely accepted view that the rate of stand biomass accumulation
260 peaks in the early stage of development, usually at the time of canopy closure, and declines
261 thereafter (Acker et al. 2002; McMahon & Schlesinger 2010; Sarah Lesley Taylor 2005; Xu et al.
262 2012). The stands s protected for 45 years had not only the highest canopy density (Table 1), but
263 also the highest proportion of big trees and tree biomass ~~and~~ as well as considerable seedling
264 density (Figure 4), suggesting adequate regeneration capacity at this age.

265 **Response of soil nutrients to forest protection**

266 Vegetation plays a key role in maintaining the soils in which they grow (Mishra et al. 2003),
267 by directly influencing soil nutrients accumulation and consequently soil development by via
268 above ground inputs (Blazejewski et al. 2009; Drouin et al. 2011; Giese et al. 2000) . Litter fall and
269 its decomposition is an important mechanism governing soil chemical properties (Mishra et al.
270 2003), especially the upper soil layer (Ma et al. 2007).

271 In the present study, *Pinus tabulaeformis* tree growth (Figure 3) and understory plant species
272 richness increased quickly for stands protected less than 30 years (Figure 1), however litterfall
273 input to soil was lower due to the absence of big trees in these stands (Figure 4). Tree and canopy
274 density (Table 1) decreased in stands protected for more than 30 years , with highest values
275 observed in stands protected for 45 years (Figure 3). Increased litter fall input, decomposition rate
276 and higher soil organic carbon contents were also observed at older forest sites (Figure 5A).

277 Content of soil mineral nitrogen at 0-20 cm soil depth showed an a decreasing trend in stands
278 of up to 30 years of protection although no significant differences were found among stands
279 (Figure 5B). This trend supports previous studies which have observed that young or developing
280 stands accumulate forest floor nitrogen, tending towards relatively stable conditions in undisturbed
281 mature forests (Johnson & Turner 2014; Miller 1981; Turner 1981).

282 The primary source of phosphorus and potassium in terrestrial ecosystems are derives-derived
283 from mineral materials in weathering parent rock (Filippelli 2008; Sheng 2005; Smeck 1985;

Comment [A8]: if no statistical significant differences were found in this study, then the results do not support the finding of previously published information. This is a major contribution and it is important to report it as such. It is necessary to say that soil nitrogen at 0-20 cm in this study did not support previously published information about soil nitrogen in the upper 0-20 cm. This is significant so scientists are aware and so pay special attention to this at their research sites.

Tiessen et al. 1984). A proportion of ~~there-leased~~ the released phosphorus and potassium, available in exchangeable and soluble (available) fractions, can be assimilated by plants and soil microorganisms directly (Schachtman et al. 1998; Sheng 2005). Soil phosphorus availability is also enhanced through phosphorus solubilizing and mineralizing microbial biomass (Richardson & Simpson 2011). Many soil microorganisms excrete organic acids to directly dissolve rock potassium to bring the potassium into solution (Bennett 1998; Friedrich et al. 1991; Groudev 2010; Ullman et al. 1996).

In the present study, soil available phosphorus (Figure 5C) and potassium (Figure 5D) contents were higher in stands with greater proportions of big and ~~middle-~~ medium trees. We suggest that the stands with greater biomass accumulated more litter and humic mineral in the top soil, which provided a substantial energy source and favorable conditions for microbial activity (Fontaine et al. 2003). In younger stands, more nutrients may be taken up by the vegetation during intense tree growth phase than can be replaced within the soil from mineral weathering and litter decomposition (Brais et al. 1995) which may explain why soil available potassium decreased in stands of up to 45 years of protection in ~~the-present~~ this study (Figure 5D).

The optimal age for the fully hillside-closed forest protection

No restoration project is undertaken in a social vacuum (Knight et al. 2010). The goods and services provided by forests are an important source of income for local people in the rural part of China (Ma et al. 2013). Even when the intentions of ecological restoration are good and the restoration strategy suitable for the environmental conditions (Ma et al. 2013), restoration action

304 will not be sustainable if it does not take into account the profit potential of local people

305 Our results showed that long-term protection (> 45 years) of *Pinus tabulaeformis* stands in
306 southeast Loess Plateau, China, may be associated with decreasing plant species richness (Table 2),
307 proportion of medium to large trees (Figure 4) , dominant tree biomass (Figure 3) and soil nutrients
308 (Figure 5). We suggest that it is possible, based on the findings above, to couple forest
309 management policy without exacerbating the poverty of local people, through the promotion of
310 measured forest indices as evidence-based support for forest protection and use. For this region,
311 we suggest the optimum forest protection age of 45 years would encourage maximum plant
312 diversity and productivity, while supporting the socio-economic conditions of the local population
313 for sustainable land use.

314 **Conclusions**

315 The present study has reported differences of plant diversity, changes in forest age structure
316 and soil nutrients of *Pinus tabulaeformis* stands ~~restoring~~ restoration in chronosequence on the
317 southeast Loess Plateau, China. The richness of plant species significantly differed with age of
318 forest protection, attenuating towards more even distribution with increasing age of forest
319 protection. Sustainable forest protection not only hindered ~~from~~ increased organic carbon content,
320 available phosphorus and potassium in top soil, but it also abated tree biomass. Our findings have
321 practical implications. By using measured forest indices as evidence-based support for balancing
322 forest management policy, ecological restoration and local economy development including
323 sustainable timber harvesting, we conclude that the preliminary optimal age for forest protection in

324 this area should be not more than 45 years.

325 **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

326 I thank Mr. Ren-he Wang, Ms. Fen-ling Zhang and other staff in Huanglongshan Forest
327 Bureau, Yanan, Shaanxi, China for their valuable assistance. I also thank Dr. Diane Allen for her
328 comments.

Comment [A9]: this should be 'we' since two authors wrote the paper. However, if one of the authors wants to thank some individual unknown to the other author, then the sentence should read "One of us,.....(name of the author) wants to thank"

329 **ADDITIONAL INFORMATION AND DECLARATIONS**

330 **Funding**

331 This study was funded by the National Forest Management Basic Project (No. 1692016-07).

332 **Competing Interests**

333 The author declares there are no competing interests.

334 **Author Contribution**

335 Lin Hou conceived and designed the experiments, performed the experiments, and wrote the
336 paper. Sijia Hou analyzed the data, prepared figures and tables, and reviewed drafts of the paper.

337 **Data Availability**

338 The following information was supplied regarding data availability. The summary data on
339 which these analyses are based are available in Table 1 and Table 2.

340

341 **REFERENCES**

- 342 Acker SA, Halpern CB, Harmon ME, and Dyrness CT. 2002. Trends in bole biomass accumulation,
343 net primary production and tree mortality in *Pseudotsuga menziesii* forests of contrasting
344 age. *Tree Physiology* 22:213-217.
- 345 Aronson J, and Alexander S. 2013. Ecosystem Restoration is Now a Global Priority: Time to Roll
346 up our Sleeves. *Restoration Ecology* 21:293–296.
- 347 Bao SD. 2000. *Soil and Agricultural Chemistry Analysis*. Beijing: China Agriculture Press.
- 348 Bennett PC. 1998. Microbial Destruction of Feldspars. *Mineralogical Magazine* 62A:149-150.
- 349 Bergen SD, Bolton SM, and L. Fridley J. 2001. Design principles for ecological engineering.
350 *Ecological Engineering* 18:201-210.
- 351 Blazejewski GA, Stolt MH, Gold AJ, Gurwick N, and Groffman PM. 2009. Spatial distribution of
352 carbon in the subsurface of riparian zones. *Soil Science Society of America Journal*
353 73:1733-1740.
- 354 Brais S, Camiré C, and Paré D. 1995. Impacts of whole-tree harvesting and winter windrowing on
355 soil pH and. *Canadian Journal of Forest Research* 25:997-1007.
- 356 Chen C, and Peng H. 1996. Standing Crops and Productivity of the Major Forest-types at the
357 Huoditang Forest Region of the Qinling Mountains. *Journal of Northwest Forestry College*
358 11:92-102.

359 Chen Y, Cao Y, Chen Y, and Cao Y. 2014. Response of tree regeneration and understory plant
360 species diversity to stand density in mature *Pinus tabulaeformis* plantations in the hilly area
361 of the Loess Plateau, China. *Ecological Engineering* 73:238–245.

362 Coroi M, Skeffington MS, Giller P, Smith C, Gormally M, and O'Donovan G. 2004. Vegetation
363 diversity and stand structure in streamside forests in the south of Ireland. *Forest Ecology &*
364 *Management* 202:39-57.

365 Drouin A, Saint-Laurent D, Lavoie L, and Ouellet C. 2011. High-Precision Elevation Model to
366 Evaluate the Spatial Distribution of Soil Organic Carbon in Active Floodplains. *Wetlands*
367 31:1151-1164.

368 Filippelli GM. 2008. The Global Phosphorus Cycle: Past, Present, and Future. *Elements* 4:89-95.

369 Fontaine S, Mariotti A, and Abbadie L. 2003. The priming effect of organic matter: a question of
370 microbial competition? *Soil Biology & Biochemistry* 35:837-843.

371 Friedrich S, Platonova NP, Karavaiko GI, Stichel E, and Glombitza F. 1991. Chemical and
372 microbiological solubilization of silicates. *Acta Biotechnologica* 11:187-196.

373 Giese LA, Aust WM, Trettin CC, and Kolka RK. 2000. Spatial and temporal patterns of carbon
374 storage and species richness in three South Carolina coastal plain riparian forests.
375 *Ecological Engineering* 15:S157–S170.

376 Groudev SN. 2010. Use of heterotrophic microorganisms in mineral biotechnology. *Engineering in*
377 *Life Sciences* 7:299-306.

- 378 Grumbine RE, and Xu J. 2011. Creating a ‘Conservation with Chinese Characteristics’. *Biological*
379 *Conservation* 144:1347–1355.
- 380 Huang XH, Yuan H, Yu FK, Li XY, Liang QB, Yao P, and Shao HB. 2014. Spatial–temporal
381 succession of the vegetation in Xishuangbanna, China during 1976–2010: A case study
382 based on RS technology and implications for eco-restoration. *Ecological Engineering*
383 70:255–262.
- 384 Johnson DW, and Turner J. 2014. Nitrogen budgets of forest ecosystems: A review. *Forest Ecology*
385 *& Management* 318:370-379.
- 386 Knight AT, Cowling RM, Mark D, and Campbell BM. 2010. Mapping human and social
387 dimensions of conservation opportunity for the scheduling of conservation action on
388 private land. *Conservation Biology* 24:1348-1358.
- 389 Li W. 2004. Degradation and restoration of forest ecosystems in China. *Forest Ecology &*
390 *Management* 201:33-41.
- 391 Ma H, Lv Y, and Li H. 2013. Complexity of ecological restoration in China. *Ecological*
392 *Engineering* 52:75-78.
- 393 Ma X, Heal KV, Liu A, and Jarvis PG. 2007. Nutrient cycling and distribution in different-aged
394 plantations of Chinese fir in southern China. *Forest Ecology & Management* 243:61-74.
- 395 Magurran AE. 2004. *Measuring Biological Diversity*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

396 McMahon SM, and Schlesinger WH. 2010. Evidence for a recent increase in forest growth.
 397 *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*
 398 107:3611-3615.

399 Miller HG. 1981. Forest fertilization: some guiding concepts. *Forestry* 54:157-167.

400 Mishra A, Sharma SD, and Khan GH. 2003. Improvement in physical and chemical properties of
 401 sodic soil by 3, 6 and 9 years old plantation of Eucalyptus tereticornis : Biorejuvenation of
 402 sodic soil. *Forest Ecology & Management* 184:115-124.

403 Mitsch WJ. 2012. What is ecological engineering? *Ecological Engineering* 45:5-12.

404 Pan Y, Luo T, Birdsey R, Hom J, and Melillo J. 2004. 'New Estimates of Carbon Storage and
 405 Sequestration in China'S Forests: Effects of Age-Class and Method On Inventory-Based
 406 Carbon Estimation'. *Climatic Change* 67:211-236.

407 Parker AJ, and Peet RK. 1984. Size and Age Structure of Conifers Forests. *Ecology* 65:1685-1689.

408 Richardson AE, and Simpson RJ. 2011. Soil Microorganisms Mediating Phosphorus Availability
 409 Update on Microbial Phosphorus. *Plant Physiology* 156:989-996.

410 Sarah Lesley Taylor DAM. 2005. Rate and causes of decline of mature and overmature balsam fir
 411 and spruce stands in New Brunswick, Canada. *Canadian Journal of Forest Research*
 412 35:2479-2490.

413 Schachtman DP, Reid RJ, and Ayling SM. 1998. Phosphorus Uptake by Plants: From Soil to Cell.

414 *Plant Physiology* 116:447-453.

415 Sheng XF. 2005. Growth promotion and increased potassium uptake of cotton and rape by a
 416 potassium releasing strain of *Bacillus edaphicus*. *Soil Biology & Biochemistry*
 417 37:1918-1922.

418 Smeck NE. 1985. Phosphorus dynamics in soils and landscapes ☆ *Geoderma* 36:185-199.

419 Thompson I. 2012. Biodiversity, ecosystem thresholds, resilience and forest degradation. *Unasylva*
 420 62:25-30.

421 Tiessen H, Stewart JWB, and Cole CV. 1984. Pathways of Phosphorus Transformations in Soils of
 422 Differing Pedogenesis. *Soil Science Society of America Journal* 48:853-858.

423 Turner J. 1981. Nutrient cycling in an age sequence of western Washington Douglas-fir stands.
 424 *Annals of Botany* 48:159-169.

425 Ullman WJ, Kirchman DL, Welch SA, and Vandevivere P. 1996. Laboratory evidence for
 426 microbially mediated silicate mineral dissolution in nature ☆ *Chemical Geology*
 427 132:11-17.

428 Wang Y, Sun M, Wang R, and Lou F. 2015. Promoting regional sustainability by eco-province
 429 construction in China: A critical assessment. *Ecological Indicators* 51:127-138.

430 Wortley L, Hero J-M, and Howes M. 2013. Evaluating Ecological Restoration Success: A Review
 431 of the Literature. *Restoration Ecology* 21:537-543.

432 Xu CY, Turnbull MH, Tissue DT, Lewis JD, Carson R, Schuster WSF, Whitehead D, Walcroft AS,
433 Li J, and Griffin KL. 2012. Age-related decline of stand biomass accumulation is primarily
434 due to mortality and not to reduction in NPP associated with individual tree physiology,
435 tree growth or stand structure in a Quercus -dominated forest. *Journal of Ecology*
436 100:428-440.

437 Xu J, Yin R, Li Z, and Liu C. 2006. China's ecological rehabilitation: Unprecedented efforts,
438 dramatic impacts, and requisite policies. *Ecological Economics* 57:595-607.

439 Yin R, and Zhao M. 2012. Ecological restoration programs and payments for ecosystem services as
440 integrated biophysical and socioeconomic processes—China's experience as an example.
441 *Ecological Economics* 73:56-65.

442 Zhang Y, Chen HYH, and Reich PB. 2012. Forest productivity increases with evenness, species
443 richness and trait variation: a global meta- analysis. *Journal of Ecology* 100:742–749.

444