

Correlated evolution of sternal keel length and ilium length in birds

Tao Zhao<sup>Corresp., 1</sup>, Di Liu<sup>2, 3, 4</sup>, Zhiheng Li<sup>Corresp., 3</sup>

<sup>1</sup> School of Earth Sciences and Engineering, Nanjing University, Nanjing, China

<sup>2</sup> University of Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing, China

<sup>3</sup> Key Laboratory of Vertebrate Evolution and Human Origins of Chinese Academy of Sciences,

Institute of Vertebrate Paleontology and Paleoanthropology, Chinese Academy of Sciences,

Beijing, China

<sup>4</sup> Beijing Museum of Natural History, Beijing, China

Corresponding Author: Tao Zhao

Email address: zhaotao@smail.nju.edu.cn

Corresponding Author: Zhiheng Li

Email address: lizhiheng@ivpp.ac.cn

**Abstract**

23

24 The interplay between the pectoral module (the pectoral girdle and limbs) and the pelvic module  
25 (the pelvic girdle and limbs) plays a key role in shaping avian evolution, but prior empirical  
26 studies on trait covariation between the two modules are limited. Here we empirically test  
27 whether (size-corrected) sternal keel length and ilium length are correlated during avian  
28 evolution using phylogenetic comparative methods. Our analyses on extant birds and Mesozoic  
29 birds both recover a significantly positive correlation. The results also provide new evidence  
30 regarding the integration between the pelvic and pectoral modules. The correlated evolution of  
31 sternal keel length and ilium length may serve as a mechanism to cope with the effect on  
32 performance caused by the tradeoff in muscle mass between pectoral and pelvic modules, via  
33 changing moment arms of muscles that function in flight and in terrestrial locomotion.

#### 34 Introduction

35

36 Although the pectoral module (the pectoral girdle and limbs) and the pelvic module (the pelvic  
37 girdle and limbs) of birds are specialized for different functions, they are likely to be linked  
38 during evolution (Allen et al. 2013; Gatesy & Dial 1996; Heers & Dial 2015). This linkage  
39 could be a result of developmental and functional constraints (Allen et al. 2013; Young et al.  
40 2005) as the pectoral and pelvic limbs share a broad range of development pathways, though  
41 they acquire distinct identity in adult in tetrapods (Young et al. 2005). Restricted by overall  
42 resources availability, pectoral and pelvic modules are negatively correlated in skeletal mass  
43 and muscle mass (Heers & Dial 2015). Changes of the forelimb size could change the position  
44 of center of mass, further affecting the hindlimb posture and functions (Allen et al. 2013;

Deleted: .

Deleted: T

**Comment [TD1]:** Perhaps change wording slight, maybe to something like “In addition to simple resource partitioning, changes to one of the module such as an elongation of the forelimb has implications for shifts in the position of the center of mass which can further alter hindlimb position and function (references)”

47 Dececchi & Larsson 2013; Hutchinson & Allen 2009). But functional specialization could  
 48 also weaken the integration between pectoral and pelvic limbs, as suggested by morphometric  
 49 analyses of avian and mammalian limbs (Bell et al. 2011; Schmidt & Fischer 2009; Young et  
 50 al. 2005). ~~This conflict between drivers of limb evolution,~~ necessitates empirical studies to  
 51 understand whether and how traits of pectoral and pelvic modules co-vary ~~during evolution.~~

52

53 ~~Along the theropod to avian lineage leading to the origin of crown birds, a series of~~  
 54 morphological changes ~~in the pectoral and pelvic girdles have previously been identified. These~~  
 55 ~~include~~ In the pectoral girdle, the changes include the enlargement of the sternum and keel  
 56 (O'Connor et al. 2015; Zheng et al. 2014; Zheng et al. 2012), the elongation of the coracoid  
 57 (Zheng et al. 2014), the origin of an acrocoracoid process and the triosseal canal (Baier et al.  
 58 2007; Longrich 2009), the reorientation of the glenoid fossa from laterally directed to  
 59 dorsolaterally directed (Jenkins 1993), and the transformation of the furcula from boomerang-  
 60 shaped to U-shaped (Nesbitt et al. 2009; Zhou & Zhang 2002). ~~While~~ In the pelvic girdle ~~we~~  
 61 ~~find~~ the elongation of the ilium and the loss of the pubic symphysis ~~have been identified~~  
 62 (Hutchinson 2001). ~~Of these changes two major derived features that characterize derived birds~~  
 63 are the larger sternal keel and the longer ilium (Hutchinson 2001; O'Connor et al. 2015). This  
 64 pattern ~~of similar first appearances of these two key features~~ could result from the correlated  
 65 evolution between the sternal keel and the ilium, since pectoral and pelvic modules are  
 66 suggested to be integrated in evolution (Allen et al. 2013; Heers & Dial 2015). Here we compile  
 67 morphometric data on extant birds and Mesozoic birds to empirically test this hypothesis based  
 68 on sternal keel length and ilium length..

Deleted: ,

Deleted: which

Formatted: Strikethrough

Comment [TD2]: Perhaps give a very general review such as Brusatte et al. 2015, Makovicky and Zanno 2011

Deleted: of

Deleted: , leading to the origin of crown birds,

Deleted: ,

Formatted: Strikethrough

Deleted: T

Deleted: obtained by

Deleted: crown

77

## 78 **Material and Methods**

79

### 80 ***Data collection on extant birds***

81

82 We sampled 224 skeleton specimens with body mass data of 137 volant bird species from 45  
83 families of 19 orders. All the specimens are housed in the collection of Beijing Museum of  
84 Natural History (Supporting Information Table S1). Sternal keel length and ilium length were  
85 taken with a digital caliper ( $\pm 0.01$  mm) (Fig. 1). When multiple specimens were measured for  
86 a species, the mean values of those specimens were used. These variables were log10-  
87 transformed before subsequent analyses.

88

### 89 **Phylogenetic comparative methods**

90

91 All analyses were carried out in R 3.3.3 (R Core Team).

92

### 93 ***Phylogeny and size-correction***

94

95 We used 1000 time-calibrated phylogenetic trees for the 137 species included in our study from  
96 birdtree.org (Jetz et al. 2012). Phylogenetic size-correction of log10-transformed ilium length  
97 and keel length was conducted using the function `phyl.resid` in the “phytools” (Revell 2012).

98

99     ***Evolutionary rate matrix***

100

101     Under the assumption of Brownian motion model, the variance of a trait at a given time  
102     interval is equal to the length of the time interval times the Brownian motion rate parameter,  
103      $\sigma^2$ . The multivariate Brownian motion is governed by the evolutionary rate matrix, which  
104     contains the evolutionary variances or rates ( $\sigma^2$ ) for individual characters on its diagonals and  
105     the evolutionary covariances on its off-diagonals (Revell & Collar 2009; Revell & Harmon  
106     2008). The Pearson correlation coefficient (r) can be calculated based on these values. This  
107     analysis was implemented using the function `evol.vcv` in the “phytools” (Revell 2012). The  
108     Pearson correlation coefficients from iterations across the 1000 trees were averaged, weighted  
109     by their Akaike weights based on AICc (Burnham & Anderson 2002). As the Pearson  
110     correlation coefficient does not follow a normal distribution, Fisher transformation was used  
111     during the process.

112

113     ***Mesozoic birds***

114

115     To determine whether keel length and ilium length are correlated during early evolution of birds,  
116     we sampled 10 Mesozoic avian species housed in the collection of Institute of Vertebrate  
117     Paleontology and Paleoanthropology, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing, China. Sternal  
118     keel length, ilium length and femur length were measured (Supporting Information Table S1).  
119     They were log10-transformed before subsequent analyses. Calibration dates for these taxa were  
120     adapted from Wang & Lloyd (2016a; 2016b). A phylogenetic tree including these 10 species

was constructed manually based on a recent phylogenetic analysis (Wang & Zhou 2017). The fossil bird tree was time-calibrated using the function timePaleoPhy with the “equal” method in the “paleotree” (Bapst 2012), with tip dates drawn randomly from a uniform distribution between the maximum and minimum dates, producing 1000 trees. The estimate of the evolutionary rate matrix was iterated across these 1000 trees to account for the uncertainty in time-calibration. The estimated correlation coefficients from 1000 iterations were averaged, weighted by Akaike weights.

## Results

In extant birds, the correlation between sternal keel length and ilium length is 0.77 (95% Confidence interval: 0.69 to 0.84). Similarly, the correlation is 0.90 in Mesozoic birds (95% Confidence interval: 0.61 to 0.98). Both are positive and statistically significant, as their 95% confidence intervals do not include 0.

In the morphospace defined by sternal keel length and ilium length (Fig. 2), several outliers are identifiable in these extant birds. *Phalacrocorax carbo* deviates from other taxa by entering the upper-left space, indicating that it has relatively long ilia but a relatively short keel. By contrast, *Brachyramphus marmoratus* enters the lower right space, by having a relatively long keel but relatively short ilia. *Gavia stellata* also deviates from others, but it largely follows the pattern of a positive correlation between sternal keel length and ilium length.

In the phylomorphospace defined by sternal keel length and ilium length of Mesozoic birds (Fig. 3), the enantiornithines are located in the lower left part, while the ornithuromorphs in the upper right part, indicating that the ornithuromorphs have a longer keel and longer ilia than enantiornithines. An exception is *Piscivorenantiornis inusitatus*, which has relatively longer ilia than most ornithuromorphs except *Iteravis huchzermeyeri*. *Piscivoravis lii* differs from other ornithuromorphs in having a comparatively shorter keel and shorter ilia.

## Discussion

Our results support the hypothesis that ilium length and sternal keel length are correlated during avian evolution and further provide quantitative support of the integration between pelvic and pectoral modules (Allen et al. 2013; Gatesy & Dial 1996; Heers & Dial 2015). Among basal birds, an ossified sternal keel is absent in *Archaeopteryx*, *Jeholornis* and *Sapeornis*, and only a faint keel is present in *Confuciusornis* (Chiappe et al. 1999; O'Connor et al. 2015; Zheng et al. 2014). The keel is small and restricted to the caudal part of the sternum in Early Cretaceous enantiornithines (O'Connor et al. 2011; Wang & Zhou 2017; Zheng et al. 2012), while comparatively larger in ornithuromorphs (e.g., Zhou & Zhang 2001; Zhou & Zhang 2006). ~~Despite these differences~~ the recovered positive correlation between the sternal keel length and ilium length based on data of enantiornithines and ornithuromorphs suggests that this pattern appears very early during avian evolution.

Deleted: T

166

167 Heers & Dial (2015) showed that the pectoral and pelvic modules are negatively correlated in  
168 muscle mass and skeletal mass and suggested the tradeoff in investment is associated with a  
169 tradeoff in performance. In other words, the less-invested module has to cope with a larger  
170 burden. The correlated evolution of sternal keel length and ilium length may serve as a  
171 mechanism to offset, to some extent, the effect on performance caused by the tradeoff in muscle  
172 mass via changing moment arms of pectoral muscles and hindlimb muscles, because the torque  
173 produced by a muscle is determined by its mass and moment arm and the effect caused by a  
174 decrease in the muscle mass can be offset by an increase in the muscle moment arm. This  
175 requires that the mass and moment arm of a muscle can be modified independently to some  
176 extent. The sternal keel provides a surface for the attachment of muscles essential for flight, i.e.,  
177 m. supracoracoideus and m. pectoralis; therefore, their moment arms can be directly affected  
178 by changes of sternal keel length. Though sternal keel length is correlated with the mass of  
179 these muscles ( $R^2 = 0.47$ ; Wright et al. 2016), parts of their variances cannot be statistically  
180 explained by each other. These facts imply that during evolution of flight, birds have the  
181 potential to modify masses and moment arms of pectoral muscles independently. Similarly,  
182 evolution of hindlimb functions may be achieved through changing the masses or moment arms  
183 of hindlimb muscles, though their relationship has not been empirically estimated. These  
184 inferences need to be tested in future studies.

185

186 In the sampled extant birds, two birds, i.e., *Brachyramphus marmoratus* and *Phalacrocorax*  
187 *carbo*, exhibit large deviation from other taxa in the morphospace defined by sternal keel length

**Comment [TD3]:** Even during their lifetime. See Lindstrom et al. 2000 and Dietz et al. 2007.

**Deleted:** huge

189 and ilium length (Fig. 2). As a wing-propelled diver, the elongated keel *Brachyramphus*  
190 *marmoratus* accommodates the enlarged m. supracoracoideus and the elongated m. pectoralis  
191 to flap the wing in the water (Kovacs & Meyers 2000; Spear & Ainley 1997). To adapt to this  
192 situation, the pelvic girdle of *B. marmoratus* shifts to an upright posture rather than acquires an  
193 elongated ilium as in other birds (Fig. 2) (Storer 1945). The relatively long ilium in  
194 *Phalacrocorax carbo* is an adaptation of foot-propelled diving (HiniĆ-Frlog & Motani 2010).  
195 Its comparatively shorter sternal keel than that of other foot-propelled divers, for example,  
196 *Gavia stellata*, is associated with its weak flight ability; it can only slope soar in strong winds  
197 (Norberg 1990). *Phalacrocorax carbo* is an example of the evolution towards flightlessness  
198 with the pelvic module enhanced and the pectoral module reduced (Wright et al. 2016), which  
199 is seen in some flightless bird species such as the Galápagos cormorant (*Phalacrocorax harrisi*)  
200 (Livezey 1992) and ratites (Cracraft 1974).

201

202 Among our sampled Mesozoic birds, *Piscivorenantionis inusitatus*, a fish-eating  
203 enantiornithine (Wang & Zhou 2017; Wang et al. 2016), differs from other enantiornithines  
204 (*Longipteryx chaoyangensis*, *Bohaiornis guoi* and *Longirostravis hani*) in that it has relatively  
205 longer ilia (Fig. 3). The functional significance of this feature in *Piscivorenantionis* is unclear,  
206 but in extant birds it is associated with an aquatic lifestyle (HiniĆ-Frlog & Motani 2010;  
207 Stoessel et al. 2013). This provide a side evidence of its ecology besides the pellet found  
208 associated with the holotype skeleton (Wang et al. 2016).

209

210 In summary, pectoral and pelvic modules are linked in a more complicated way than just

**Comment [TD4]:** Perhaps give the numbers of this to show how much larger it is than other comparable size birds

**Deleted:** .

**Deleted:** Extreme cases are those flightless birds with the sternal keel greatly reduced or completely lost,

**Comment [TD5]:** Such as diving birds or foot propelled swimmers? Could you be more specific?

negatively correlated in overall investment. Besides modifying moment arms of muscles, birds may change behaviors to cope with the effect caused by tradeoff in investment. More integrative studies in the future can provide more insight into the relationship between pectoral and pelvic modules.

**Comment [TD6]:**

I do want to suggest the authors read the new article by Stoddard et al. (2017) entitled "Avian egg shape: Form, function, and evolution" that just appeared in the June 23rd edition of Science. It mentions how selection for flight may have influence egg shape, which undoubtedly has an effect on pelvic shape, thus showing another potential mechanism to link these two systems together. I don't think this article is critical for the authors argument, but it could be used as supporting evidence.

**Acknowledgements**

We thank Mr Zhaohui Zeng for access to specimens housed in Beijing Museum of Natural History and Mr Qiong Wang for taking the photo. Comments from Jonathan Mitchell and T. Alexander Dececchi improved the manuscript.

**References**

- Allen V, Bates KT, Li Z, and Hutchinson JR. 2013. Linking the evolution of body shape and locomotor biomechanics in bird-line archosaurs. *Nature* 497:104-107. 10.1038/nature12059  
<http://www.nature.com/nature/journal/v497/n7447/abs/nature12059.html#supplementary-information>
- Baier DB, Gatesy SM, and Jenkins FA. 2007. A critical ligamentous mechanism in the evolution of avian flight. *Nature* 445:307-310.
- Bapst DW. 2012. paleotree: an R package for paleontological and phylogenetic analyses of evolution. *Methods in Ecology and Evolution* 3:803-807. 10.1111/j.2041-210X.2012.00223.x
- Bell E, Andres B, and Goswami A. 2011. Integration and dissociation of limb elements in flying vertebrates: a comparison of pterosaurs, birds and bats. *J Evol Biol* 24:2586-2599. 10.1111/j.1420-9101.2011.02381.x
- Burnham KP, and Anderson DR. 2002. *Model selection and multimodel inference: a practical*

- Chiappe LM, Ji S, and Ji Q. 1999. Anatomy and systematics of the Confuciusornithidae (Theropoda: Aves) from the late mesozoic of northeastern China. *Bulletin of the American Museum of Natural History* Number 242.
- Cracraft J. 1974. Phylogeny and evolution of the ratite birds. *Ibis* 116:494-521. 10.1111/j.1474-919X.1974.tb07648.x
- Dececchi TA, and Larsson HCE. 2013. Body and limb size dissociation at the origin of birds: uncoupling allometric constraints across a macroevolutionary transition. *Evolution* 67:2741-2752. 10.1111/evo.12150
- Gatesy SM, and Dial KP. 1996. Locomotor Modules and the Evolution of Avian Flight. *Evolution* 50:331-340. 10.2307/2410804
- Heers AM, and Dial KP. 2015. Wings versus legs in the avian bauplan: development and evolution of alternative locomotor strategies. *Evolution* 69:305-320. 10.1111/evo.12576
- HiniĆ-Frlog S, and Motani R. 2010. Relationship between osteology and aquatic locomotion in birds: determining modes of locomotion in extinct Ornithurae. *J Evol Biol* 23:372-385. 10.1111/j.1420-9101.2009.01909.x
- Hutchinson JR. 2001. The evolution of pelvic osteology and soft tissues on the line to extant birds (Neornithes). *Zoological Journal of the Linnean Society* 131:123-168. 10.1111/j.1096-3642.2001.tb01313.x
- Hutchinson JR, and Allen V. 2009. The evolutionary continuum of limb function from early theropods to birds. *Naturwissenschaften* 96:423-448. 10.1007/s00114-008-0488-3
- Jenkins FA. 1993. The evolution of the avian shoulder joint. *American Journal of Science* 293:253-267. 10.2475/ajs.293.A.253
- Jetz W, Thomas GH, Joy JB, Hartmann K, and Mooers AO. 2012. The global diversity of birds in space and time. *Nature* 491:444-448. <http://www.nature.com/nature/journal/v491/n7424/abs/nature11631.html#supplementary-information>
- Kovacs CE, and Meyers RA. 2000. Anatomy and histochemistry of flight muscles in a wing-propelled diving bird, the Atlantic puffin, *Fratercula arctica*. *J Morphol* 244:109-125.
- Livezey BC. 1992. Flightlessness in the Galápagos cormorant (*Compsohalieus* [Nannopterum] *harrisi*): heterochrony, giantism and specialization. *Zoological Journal of the Linnean Society* 105:155-224.
- Longrich N. 2009. An ornithurine-dominated avifauna from the Belly River Group (Campanian, Upper Cretaceous) of Alberta, Canada. *Cretaceous Research* 30:161-177. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.cretres.2008.06.007>
- Nesbitt SJ, Turner AH, Spaulding M, Conrad JL, and Norell MA. 2009. The theropod furcula. *J Morphol* 270:856-879. 10.1002/jmor.10724
- Norberg U. 1990. *Vertebrate Flight: Mechanics, Physiology, Morphology, Ecology and Evolution.*: Springer Berlin Heidelberg.
- O'Connor JK, Chiappe LM, Gao C, and Zhao B. 2011. Anatomy of the Early Cretaceous enantiornithine bird *Rapaxavis pani*. *Acta Palaeontologica Polonica* 56:463-475. 10.4202/app.2010.0047
- O'Connor JK, Zheng XT, Sullivan C, Chuong CM, Wang XL, Li A, Wang Y, Zhang XM, and

- Zhou ZH. 2015. Evolution and functional significance of derived sternal ossification patterns in ornithothoracine birds. *J Evol Biol* 28:1550-1567. 10.1111/jeb.12675
- R Core Team. 2017. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. URL <https://www.R-project.org/>.
- Revell LJ. 2012. phytools: an R package for phylogenetic comparative biology (and other things). *Methods in Ecology and Evolution* 3:217-223. 10.1111/j.2041-210X.2011.00169.x
- Revell LJ, and Collar DC. 2009. Phylogenetic analysis of the evolutionary correlation using likelihood. *Evolution* 63:1090-1100. 10.1111/j.1558-5646.2009.00616.x
- Revell LJ, and Harmon LJ. 2008. Testing quantitative genetic hypotheses about the evolutionary rate matrix for continuous characters. *Evolutionary Ecology Research* 10:311-331.
- Schmidt M, and Fischer MS. 2009. Morphological integration in mammalian limb proportions: dissociation between function and development. *Evolution* 63:749-766. 10.1111/j.1558-5646.2008.00583.x
- Spear LB, and Ainley DG. 1997. Flight behaviour of seabirds in relation to wind direction and wing morphology. *Ibis* 139:221-233.
- Stoessel A, Kilbourne BM, and Fischer MS. 2013. Morphological integration versus ecological plasticity in the avian pelvic limb skeleton. *J Morphol* 274:483-495. 10.1002/jmor.20109
- Storer RW. 1945. Structural Modifications in the Hind Limb in the Alcidae. *Ibis* 87:433-456. 10.1111/j.1474-919X.1945.tb01375.x
- Wang M, and Lloyd GT. 2016a. Data from: Rates of morphological evolution are heterogeneous in Early Cretaceous birds. Dryad Data Repository.
- Wang M, and Lloyd GT. 2016b. Rates of morphological evolution are heterogeneous in Early Cretaceous birds. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 283.
- Wang M, and Zhou Z. 2017. A morphological study of the first known piscivorous enantiornithine bird from the Early Cretaceous of China. *Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology*:e1278702.
- Wang M, Zhou Z, and Sullivan C. 2016. A Fish-Eating Enantiornithine Bird from the Early Cretaceous of China Provides Evidence of Modern Avian Digestive Features. *Current Biology* 26:1170-1176. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cub.2016.02.055>
- Wright NA, Steadman DW, and Witt CC. 2016. Predictable evolution toward flightlessness in volant island birds. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 113:4765-4770. 10.1073/pnas.1522931113
- Young NM, Hallgrímsson B, and Janis C. 2005. Serial homology and the evolution of mammalian limb covariation structure. *Evolution* 59:2691-2704.
- Zheng X, O'Connor J, Wang X, Wang M, Zhang X, and Zhou Z. 2014. On the absence of sternal elements in Anchiornis (Paraves) and Sapeornis (Aves) and the complex early evolution of the avian sternum. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 111:13900-13905. 10.1073/pnas.1411070111
- Zheng X, Wang X, O'Connor J, and Zhou Z. 2012. Insight into the early evolution of the avian sternum from juvenile enantiornithines. *Nat Commun* 3:1116.
- Zhou Z, and Zhang F. 2001. Two new ornithurine birds from the Early Cretaceous of western

331 Liaoning, China. *Chinese Science Bulletin* 46:1258-1264. 10.1007/BF03184320  
332 Zhou Z, and Zhang F. 2002. A long-tailed, seed-eating bird from the Early Cretaceous of China.  
333 *Nature* 418:405-409. 10.1038/nature00923  
334 Zhou Z, and Zhang F. 2006. A beaked basal ornithurine bird (Aves, Ornithurae) from the Lower  
335 Cretaceous of China. *Zoologica Scripta* 35:363-373. 10.1111/j.1463-  
336 6409.2006.00234.x

337

338