

April 9, 2017

Dr. Kenneth De Baets
Academic Editor
PeerJ

Dear Kenneth,

Thank you very much for your very helpful comments and suggestions from the last round of review of the revised version of our paper. We have made all of the changes you suggested (as I shall detail more fully below), and I hope that the paper is now ready for the publication. Also, in case it would be helpful, I have included the version of our manuscript showing all of the changes tracked. If I can provide any additional information on the changes we have made please do not hesitate to contact me. Thank you very much for your time and consideration.

Sincerely,



Bruce S. Lieberman
Professor, Department of Ecology & Evolutionary Biology
Senior Curator, Biodiversity Institute
785-864-2741
blieber@ku.edu

How we have addressed the Academic Editor comments:

We have changed the title of the paper to “Disc-shaped fossils resembling porpitiids or eldonids from the early Cambrian (Series 2: Stage 4) of western U.S.A.” as you requested. We have made the “Geology and paleoenvironment” an individual subtitle as you requested. We have also changed the wording to “and/or”, repeated that “*Bristolia*” is a trilobite, added the word “clear”, and added the mention of brachiopods and salt pseudomorphs and referenced the Otto (2000) paper. Moreover, we have placed the term “cf.” in front of *Discophyllum* whenever we reference our material, such that it is now treated as cf. *Discophyllum* sp. Finally, we have added the link in the references section so readers can easily get access to MacGabhann’s thesis.