

Reviewer #

Overall remarks

The study examines how different forage cereal species perform when established using perpendicular and straight row sowing methods. While not new, results indicate yield and quality differences among the species and sowing method. The English language needs to be revised.

I noted key lapses on the study.

Plant spacing is not reviewed in the introduction nor has it been discussed yet it is the pivot of the study. Extensive discussions ought to be on the different methods and less on the cereal species

Can the author discuss results averaged across the years and limit discussion on year by year

The feedstock values should be presented in g/kg and not percentages (%)

Table 1: Does the long term average (LTA) refer to 30-year averages. If so, please indicate

Figure 2: The figure needs to be redrawn to show plant design with row spacing clearly shown. For example check: <https://www.frontiersin.org/journals/soil-science/articles/10.3389/fsoil.2022.981263/full>

I suggest converting kg/da to kg/ha throughout the texts as the latter is widely used across the scientific world.

Table 2: I prefer to have the yield data presented as figures and the feedstock components in table.

Line 34: It is not clear what the lowest soil and climate requirements mean?

Line 36: Add reference after ... strong root development.

Lines 36-37: Which plant are you referring to? Please reword

Lines 46-47: Check reference style, applies to whole document

Lines 76-78: Can author clarify whether the plant spacing were similar or different between the straight row sowing method and the perpendicular row sowing method.

Lines 101-104: Indicate whether it was 2-way ANOVA and what was the p-value for significance

Lines 175-177: ... Barley is a cool season cereal with... The discussions are not supported by the results

Lines 177-178: ... “The average dry matter yield..”. This sentence is hanging

Lines 203 -205: These are results and should be moved to result section

Line 206: Author cannot claim directly that higher rainfall increased crude protein content. It has to be reworded.. yield increases due to high water supply from rain in turn probably increased crude protein etc

Line 215: “Cereals provide more satiety when fed”.. What does this mean, author to rewrite

Line 228: .. “some researchers”... provide reference at the end of sentence

Lines 248-253: Author reported no differences on RFV among the sowing treatment and therefore there is no need for the extra discussions. Delete beginning “Indeed... fourth-quality forage”.

Lines 255-257: Delete or rewrite.