Vertical and horizontal distribution of *Desmophyllum dianthus* in Comau Fjord, Chile: A cold water coral thriving at low pH

Cold water corals provide an important habitat for a rich fauna along the continental margins and slopes. Although these azooxanthellate corals are considered particularly sensitive to ocean acidification, their responses to natural variations in pH and aragonite saturation are largely unknown due to the difficulty of studying their ecology in deep waters. Previous SCUBA investigations have shown an exceptionally shallow population of the cold water coral *Desmophyllum dianthus* in near-surface waters of Comau Fjord, a stratified 480 m deep basin in northern Chilean Patagonia with suboxic deep waters. Here, we use a remotely operated vehicle to quantitatively investigate the distribution of *D. dianthus* and its physico-chemical drivers in so far uncharted naturally acidified waters. Remarkably, *D. dianthus* was ubiquitous throughout the fjord, but particularly abundant between 20 and 280 m depth in a pH range of 8.4 to 7.4. The persistence of individuals in aragonite-undersaturated waters suggests that present-day *D. dianthus* in Comau Fjord may show pre-acclimation or -adaptation to conditions of ocean acidification predicted to reach over 70% of the known deep-sea coral locations by the end of the century.

1 **First Page**

2 **Authors and affiliations**

3 Laura Fillinger and Claudio Richter

4 Alfred-Wegener-Institut, Helmholtz-Zentrum für Polar- und Meeresforschung

5 Bremerhaven, Germany.

6 **Corresponding author**

7 Laura Fillinger

8 Alfred-Wegener-Institut, Helmholtz-Zentrum für Polar- und Meeresforschung

9 Am Alten Hafen 26, D-27568 Bremerhaven, Germany.

10 phone: +49 471 4831 2242

11 email: laura.fillinger@gmail.com

Introduction

Similar to their tropical counterparts and in spite of their lack of photosynthetic endosymbionts, azooxanthellate scleractinian cold water corals (CWC) provide the structural 3-dimensional basis and habitat for a rich deep-reef associated fauna (Cairns & Stanley 1982; Mortensen & Buhl-Mortensen 2005; Roberts et al. 2009). With an almost circumglobal distribution (Freiwald et al. 2004; Roberts et al. 2009) these cnidarians occur mostly between 200 and 1000 m depth (Cairns 2007) making investigations in their natural environment logistically challenging (Maier et al. 2009).

One of the main reef-building species, *Lophelia pertusa* (Linnaeus, 1758), has been shown to be particularly sensitive to short-term temperature changes (Dodds et al. 2007), and the paucity of CWC in aragonite-limited waters (Guinotte et al. 2006) has raised great concerns regarding their fate in the context of climate change and ocean acidification (McCulloch et al. 2012; Roberts et al. 2009).

Ocean acidification, a consequence of the uptake of anthropogenic carbon dioxide (CO₂) by the ocean, results in pH reduction and alteration of the seawater carbonate chemistry (see e.g. Doney et al. 2009; Feely et al. 2004). As the quantity of CO₂ absorbed by the ocean increases, the saturation state of the aragonite carbonate mineral used by scleractinian corals to build their skeleton decreases, leading ultimately to its dissolution (see e.g. Caldeira & Wickett 2003; Orr et al. 2005). Besides, as carbonate solubility increases with decreasing temperature and increasing pressure, saturation states are lower in deep and cold habitats than in shallow and warm waters (Feely et al. 2004). Models predict a progressive shoaling of the aragonite saturation horizons (ASH - the limit between undersaturation and supersaturation) (Orr et al. 2005). Hence, deep-

34 dwelling cold water corals are expected to be the first exposed to aragonite undersaturation
35 (Doney et al. 2009).

36 To date, few experiments have been conducted on the response of CWC to ocean acidification
37 (Guinotte et al. 2006; Roberts et al. 2006). *Lophelia pertusa* exhibited reduced calcification rates
38 under increased CO₂ concentrations in short term experiments (Form & Riebesell 2012; Maier et
39 al. 2009) but revealed capacity for acclimation in longer term manipulations (Form & Riebesell
40 2012). In both cases, calcification rates remained positive even under aragonite undersaturation.
41 Calcification rates in *Madrepora oculata* (Linnaeus, 1958), another reef-building species,
42 remained stable under reduced pH but increased under pre-industrial, higher pH levels suggesting
43 that CWC are already suffering from ocean acidification (Maier et al. 2012).

44 A complementary strategy to manipulation experiments in aquaria to determine the sensitivity of
45 corals to changes in seawater chemistry is to investigate their distribution along natural pH
46 gradients. For zooxanthellate shallow water corals, spatial differences in coral distribution were
47 found around volcanic CO₂ seeps in Italy (Hall Spencer et al. 2008; Riebesell 2008) and Papua
48 New Guinea (Fabricius et al. 2011). To our knowledge, only three corresponding studies
49 focussing on the qualitative analysis of the presence/absence of some species were published for
50 living CWC. In the Gulf of Mexico, *Lophelia pertusa* seemed restricted to aragonite saturated
51 waters but given the lack of correlation between this species' presence and the aragonite
52 saturation level, Lunden et al. (2013) suggested that depth or other factors were more likely to
53 control the coral's distribution. On an Australian seamount, two species of colonial scleractinian
54 *Solenosmilia variabilis* (Duncan, 1873) and *Enallopsammia rostrata* (Pourtales, 1878) persisted
55 near the ASH and a third solitary species *Desmophyllum dianthus* (Esper, 1794) was detected
56 well below this depth in aragonite undersaturated waters (Thresher et al. 2011). Pronounced pH
57 and aragonite saturation gradients have recently been described for Comau Fjord, Chilean

Patagonia (Jantzen et al. 2013a). There, *Desmophyllum dianthus* is known to occur in dense aggregations in high-pH near-surface waters, together with two other cup corals: *Caryophyllia huinayensis* (Cairns, Häussermann and Försterra, 2005) and *Tethocyathus endesa* (Cairns, Häussermann and Försterra, 2005) (Cairns et al. 2005; Försterra & Häussermann 2003). The deployment of a small Remotely Operated Vehicle (ROV) halfway down the fjord (263 m) showed the presence of *D. dianthus* below the ASH down to at least 255 m depth (Häussermann & Försterra 2007; Jantzen et al. 2013a).

Desmophyllum dianthus (senior synonym of *Desmophyllum cristagalli* (Cairns 1995)) is a solitary azooxanthellate scleractinian often associated with *Lophelia pertusa* and *Madrepora oculata* (Heindel et al. 2010; Reveillaud et al. 2008). It can form pseudo-colonies with younger individuals growing on the skeleton of older ones and constitutes the framework-building CWC species in coral banks off New Zealand and Chile (Cairns & Stanley 1982; Squires 1965). The linear growth rate of deep-sea specimens has been estimated around 0.5-2 mm yr⁻¹ (Adkins et al. 2004) but might be as fast as 2.2-10 mm yr⁻¹ for Chilean corals (Jantzen et al. 2013b; McCulloch et al. 2005). This cosmopolitan species has been reported over a wide depth range from 35-2460 m (Cairns 1995). In the fjords of northern Chilean Patagonia, even shallower occurrences of dense *D. dianthus* banks have been reported (20 m depth), with scattered individuals occasionally occurring as shallow as 8 m (Försterra & Häussermann 2003). SCUBA studies reported *D. dianthus* abundances up to 1500 individuals.m⁻² on rocky walls and overhangs with inclination >80° (Försterra & Häussermann 2003), but a notable absence of corals on milder slopes, perhaps due to smothering by terrigenous sediments (Försterra et al. 2005; Försterra & Häussermann 2003). The factor limiting the upper distribution of this coral is thought to be the sharp halocline, separating the marine waters from the brackish surface layer (Cairns et al. 2005; Försterra &

Häussermann 2003). The existence and nature of a lower limit in Comau Fjord has not yet been investigated (Häussermann & Försterra 2007).

Individual *D. dianthus* have been collected in the deep-sea from waters exhibiting various pH ranging from 7.57-8.10 (Anagnostou et al. 2012; McCulloch et al. 2012). In Comau Fjord, a recent report (Jantzen et al. 2013a) described the presence of *D. dianthus* along a vertical pH gradient of 7.4-8.3 between the surface and mid-depth (230 m). Although the qualitative data suggest that this CWC is less susceptible to low pH than previously assumed (Jantzen et al. 2013a), concurrent data on *D. dianthus* abundance, pH and other environmental parameters that might be involved in the control of this CWC are still lacking.

To close this gap, we deployed a novel ROV in Comau Fjord to quantitatively characterize the occurrence of *D. dianthus* (abundance and size) and simultaneously measure several physico-chemical descriptors of its natural environment.

Our main objectives were to describe the (i) occurrence, (ii) vertical, (iii) horizontal and (iv) size distribution of *D. dianthus* in Comau Fjord; to measure (v) the corresponding environmental parameters along the ROV survey; and (vi) analyse the resulting distribution patterns to assess the role of pH versus other environmental factors in governing *D. dianthus* distribution.

Materials & Methods

Site

Comau Fjord in Northern Chilean Patagonia is a 41 km long, 4.5 km wide and about 480 m deep basin with its mouth shoaling to around 300 m depth (Fig. 1). Little is known about its hydrodynamics but the principal driving processes are probably tidal exchange and mixing in this macrotidal environment with up to 7 m tidal amplitudes (Försterra 2009), and a thermohaline

circulation sustained by high precipitation (>5000 mm/year) (Bustamante 2009). Due to its north-south orientation, the fjord is protected from the main westerly winds, so that wind-driven advection and mixing play only minor roles (Bustamante 2009). Freshwater entering the fjord from the rivers at its head and its eastern side (Bustamante 2009; Soto 2009) strongly influences the surface layer down to 10 m (Sánchez et al. 2011). Below the shallow brackish water layer with profound seasonal changes in temperature, the lower fully marine environment is less influenced by seasonality (Sánchez et al. 2011). Surrounded by steep basaltic walls covered with a temperate primary rainforest (Mayr et al. 2011), the fjord is subjected to frequent landslides and avalanches, causing a high input of terrestrial sediment to the aquatic system, which then accumulates at the bottom of the basin (Försterra 2009).

ROV surveys

In February 2012 we deployed our ROV (Ocean Modules: V8 Sii) at seven sites along Comau Fjord (Figure 1, Table 1) in order to map the horizontal and vertical distribution of *Desmophyllum dianthus*. The vehicle was equipped with two High Definition video cameras (Kongsberg: oe14-502), one oriented horizontally for video mapping of the benthos and the other tilted 30° downward for navigation. The video streams were captured to Compact Flash cards (.mxf, mpeg2) by a nanoFlash recorder (Convergent Design). An echo-sounder (Tritech: Micron) was mounted onto the horizontal camera, measuring its distance to the substrate. The ROV also carried a factory-calibrated Conductivity Temperature Depth profiler (CTD) (SeaBird Electronics: SBE19 plus) including pH (SBE18), oxygen (SBE43) and chlorophyll fluorescence (Wetlabs: Eco FLRT) sensors for continuous records of the physico-chemical environment during the dives. While the other sensors did not require re-calibrations, the pH sensor was kept calibrated prior to deployment with TRIS (TRIS buffer, batch 5, Nr. 58, pH 8.09 at 25°C ; Oceanic Carbon Dioxide Quality Control, AG Dickson, Scripps Institution of Oceanography) (Nemzer &

Dickson 2005) and two additional buffers (WTW PL4 and PL7, DIN/NIST, pH 4.006/4.01 and pH 6.865/6.87) taking care of the corresponding temperature corrections.

The survey strategy adopted there was to carry out two vertical transects per site (straight downward and upward), adapting the vehicle's pitch so that the horizontal camera axis was kept perpendicular to the substrate.

Physico-chemical environment

Plots of the CTD data were performed with Ocean Data View (Schlitzer, R., Ocean Data View, <http://odv.awi.de>, 2013). In the along-fjord profiles (Fig. 2), the colour scales were adapted to highlight the structure of the marine water column, at the expense of the structure of the low-salinity surface layer above the halocline which is not relevant for the corals. The full data range was used in the colour scale of the depth profiles (Fig. 3).

Video analyses

Frames (.png) were extracted every 10 seconds from the video recorded by the horizontal camera with the software COVER (developed by the IFREMER in the frame of the EU project CoralFISH). All frames were scaled, computing their length and width from the echo-sounder measurements and the camera properties (horizontal and vertical angles of view). A coordinate system was then conceived to graphically display the position of each frame in the fjord with the CTD depth along the y-axis. The x-coordinate was attributed arbitrarily, respecting the sequence of the seven sites along the fjord and placing both transects (down and up) at each site next to each other but not overlapping. The name, scale and coordinates of all frames were combined in COVER. Then a Scilab routine (Scilab Enterprises, www.scilab.org) was run to create an individual text file called a worldfile (.pgw) for each frame describing its scale and coordinates (method similar to the one used by Jerosch et al. (2011)).

Each frame accompanied by a worldfile could then be opened and projected in a metric coordinate system in ArcGIS (ESRI). Excluding overlapping frames, we determined the surface represented by the analysed frames for each station (surface analysed), the surface of non-sediment covered rock within the analysed area (available substrate) (Fig. 6) and the amount of rock colonized by *Desmophyllum dianthus* (coral patch size). A patch was defined as a coral aggregation within a single frame. If those aggregations were extending over several ($N \geq 3$) frames, they were described as a coral bank. Each coral was referenced and counted to determine the abundance of *D. dianthus* within each patch (coral abundance). When a coral was adequately positioned in the field of view, in a plane perpendicular to the camera axis, and entirely visible, its length and mid-length width were also measured. The morphology of the coral was then described using these values (coral shape = length / width).

Statistical analyses

All further calculations and statistical analyses were realized in R (www.r-project.org). Each parameter was summed (surface analysed, available substrate) or averaged (CTD data, coral patch size, coral abundance, coral shape) for each site within 10 m depth intervals. The fraction of available substrate effectively colonized by the corals was calculated in each depth interval (% used = $100 * \text{patch size} / \text{available substrate}$). The data on substrate and coral distribution were imported in ArcGIS for graphical representation (Fig. 4 and Fig. 5). To investigate eventual relationships between the coral distribution parameters (coral abundance and substrate usage) and the environmental parameters (temperature, salinity, pH, oxygen and available substrate) in Comau Fjord multiple linear regression analyses were performed. All primary data are available at <http://doi.pangaea.de/10.1594/PANGAEA.811911>.

Results

Fjord environment

The low salinity surface layer was limited to the upper 7 m at all sites (Fig. 2 and Fig. 3). Below this depth, the salinity slowly increased with depth in a range of 31.2-33.0. Surface water temperatures reached up to 17°C (Table 2) but below the thermocline (20-50 m depth), the temperatures remained between 10.2-12.0°C, showing a slight increase with depth. Oxygen and pH co-varied, with maximum values (O_2 : 280 $\mu\text{mol.l}^{-1}$, pH: 8.42) in the upper 12-20 m, sharp decreases between 22 and 50 m, slight increases between 50 and 200 m and a drop to minimum values (O_2 : 91 $\mu\text{mol.l}^{-1}$, pH: 7.71) below 300 m (Fig. 3). A weaker horizontal gradient was evident, where sites located at the mouth of the fjord (*Lilliguapi* and *Cross Lilli*) displayed higher temperature and pH values than sites in the inner fjord (Fig. 2 and Fig. 3). High chlorophyll concentrations were limited to the upper 20 m with a peak at 13 m at the site *Near Telele*.

Substrate

The total surface analysed (Fig. 4A) from the extracted video frames varied between stations and across depths as the deepest depth could not be sampled at all sites due to the fjord bathymetry and the time available to work at each site. The mean surface analysed for each depth also varied as the ROV could not always be kept at a constant distance to the seafloor and some video sequences had to be discarded for technical reasons. In spite of these limitations, the area of non-sediment covered rock suitable for coral settlement (available substrate, Fig. 4B) was not related to the surface analysed (linear regression, $r^2 < 0.05$) so that our sampling can be considered representative of each site and depth.

The available hard substrate (Fig. 4B) was unevenly distributed across the fjord and between depths but non-sediment covered rock suitable for corals was found at all sites and depths considered.

Coral distribution

Desmophyllum dianthus was present at all sites investigated, covering the entire depth range (16 - 395 m) between the halocline and the fjord bottom. Coral abundances (Fig. 5A) and patch sizes (Fig. 5B) were variable but *D. dianthus* was found on most of the available hard substrate (Fig. 4C). In spite of the ubiquity of the corals, a vertical pattern emerged, with higher densities of corals in the upper compared to the lower part of the fjord, delimited by the 270-280 m depth lines (two-sample Wilcoxon tests, $p < 0.001$). Due to the small sample size below 270-280 m depth (N=2 stations), we performed a permutation test (Efron & Tibshirani 1993) with 10,000 repetitions which confirmed with a 95% probability that this change in coral abundance is not by chance. The water parameters at 280 m depth are summarized in Table 3.

Coral shape (Fig. 5B) did not show any clear pattern in relation to the environmental gradients. Long, thin corals ($L/W > 5$) were mostly found in dense coral banks but were also present in less dense areas while short, thick corals ($L/W < 3$) were present in both poorly and densely populated aggregations. A large patch of mostly elongate corals was found near the river at the head of the fjord (*Rio Bodudahue*) (Fig. 6), suggesting that parameters other than the ones measured by our ROV may account for the observed shape differences.

Regression analyses

The relationships between the coral distribution (coral abundance and substrate use) and the environmental characteristics (temperature, salinity, pH, oxygen and available substrate) were extremely weak (r^2 well below 5%) for most parameters (Table 4). When the low-salinity surface

layer was excluded from the analyses, then salinity had a weak influence on the coral abundance (r^2 about 17%) and the pH, oxygen concentration and substrate availability only slightly explained the percentage of substrate used by the corals ($10\% < r^2 < 17\%$). Thus, neither pH nor any other parameter measured appears to affect the distribution of *D. dianthus* in Comau Fjord.

Discussion

Fjord environment

From the physico-chemical structure of Comau Fjord (Fig. 2 and Fig. 3) we could identify three water masses. (1) A layer with low salinity, high summer temperatures, pH, oxygen concentration and primary production at the surface (González et al. 2010; Sánchez et al. 2011) results from the large freshwater input into the fjord (Dávila et al. 2002). The freshwater outflow is compensated by the inflow of (2) Subantarctic oceanic water (Palma & Silva 2004; Valle-Levinson et al. 2007) constituting an intermediate layer. Below 300 m we found (3) a water mass with a longer residence time in the fjord (Farmer & Freeland 1983) showing higher salinity and temperature and lower pH and oxygen due to decomposition processes in the lower water column and fjord bottom (Prado-Fiedler 2009; Silva 2008). The 300 m isobath is also the one separating the deep Comau Fjord from the shallower parts of the adjacent Golfo de Ancud (Fig. 1), suggesting a less frequent exchange of these deeper water masses. At the innermost sites, near the head of the fjord, another structure could be detected between the surface and intermediate layers with lower pH and oxygen. This fourth layer could be the consequence of some of the bottom water being washed up by the inflow of oceanic water (Silva 2008) or the result of a high decomposition after a large phytoplankton bloom.

Controls on coral distribution

Our detailed study confirms anecdotal evidence from the previous shallow ROV survey (Häussermann & Försterra 2007) that *Desmophyllum dianthus* may be ubiquitous in Comau Fjord. We found this cold water coral at virtually all depths below the low salinity surface layer and down to the bottom of the fjord at 395 m (Fig. 6). *D. dianthus* was also present everywhere between the mouth and the head of the fjord. Most remarkable was the occurrence of a vast coral bank in the direct vicinity of the river at the head of the fjord (*Rio Bodudahue*), in striking contrast to the alleged sensitivity of this coral to terrigenous sediments (Försterra & Häussermann 2003).

None of the environmental parameters recorded by our ROV could be identified as a major controller of the scleractinian distribution and, similarly to deep-sea specimens of the same species (Thresher et al. 2011), the shape of *D. dianthus* individuals in Comau Fjord appeared independent of the depth. Our results suggest that density, pH, oxygen concentration and the quantity of hard substrate available for settlement are less important for *D. dianthus* than for other CWC species (e.g. Davies et al. 2008; Dullo et al. 2008; Fink et al. 2012). Nevertheless, fossil records of *D. dianthus* in the North Atlantic (Robinson et al. 2007; Thiagarajan et al. 2013), Tasmanian Seamounts (Thiagarajan et al. 2013), and Drake Passage (Burke et al. 2010; Margolin et al. 2013) display changes in the distribution of this scleractinian, most likely due to variations in the surface productivity, the subsurface oxygen concentration and the seawater carbonate chemistry caused by climate-induced modifications of the ocean circulation. The ubiquity of *D. dianthus* in Comau Fjord demonstrates that no threshold in any of the environmental parameters is crossed there that would completely prevent recruitment, growth or survival of the coral.

The pervasiveness of *D. dianthus* described above defied identification of an environmental controlling factor. Nevertheless, an important pattern emerged from our quantitative analysis: the significant reduction, in spite of available sediment-free rock, in *D. dianthus* cover and abundance below 270-280 m, corresponding to the water mass in the deep basin part of the fjord. In the absence of experimental evidence, we can only speculate that the lower oxygen concentration, combined with a lower pH, may entail higher metabolic expenditures for the corals (Dodds et al. 2007; McCulloch et al. 2012). The likely reduced water exchange may in addition limit the supply of food to *D. dianthus*, which is known to preferably consume the largest size fraction of zooplankton (Mayr et al. 2011), i.e. large copepods and euphausiids (Sánchez et al. 2011). It could also be speculated, in the virtual absence of information on *D. dianthus* reproduction, larval distribution and behaviour, that the deeper basin parts of Comau Fjord are decoupled from the circulation in the upper part of the water column thus limiting the influx of coral larvae to deep waters.

Desmophyllum, pH and ocean acidification

In Comau Fjord, we found corals within a wide range of pH values (7.71-8.42). Furthermore, Silva (Silva 2008) measured a pH of 7.6 there in 1995 and the lowest pH recorded by Jantzen et al. in 2011 (Jantzen et al. 2013a) was 7.4 in the same fjord. Given the difficulties in accurately determining pH (Riebesell et al. 2010) and the current lack of information on residence times in the different water masses, it is difficult to decide to what extent the range of values reported reveal seasonal and/or inter-annual variations in pH, or rather inaccuracies in the different measurements. These uncertainties notwithstanding, it is beyond doubt that *Desmophyllum dianthus*, is able to cope with large spatial, and likely also temporal, gradients in pH and aragonite saturation state.

In 2011, the aragonite saturation horizon was located at about 150 m depth (Jantzen et al. 2013a). The presence of *D. dianthus* below this depth appears to be in contradiction with the restriction of cold water corals to aragonite saturation states >1 (Guinotte et al. 2006). However, Thresher et al. (2011) also found *D. dianthus* in waters largely undersaturated with regard to aragonite, supporting experimental findings that scleractinian display physiological mechanisms which enable them to increase their internal pH relative to seawater pH, facilitating calcification (Venn et al. 2011). These recent reports, along with the findings of our study, suggest that cold-water corals may be able to cope with ocean acidification better than previously assumed, but likely at a high energetic cost (McCulloch et al. 2012). High primary and secondary production in marine ecosystems of northern Patagonia (González et al. 2010), reflected by the high phosphorus content in the skeleton of *D. dianthus* individuals collected in Chilean fjords (Montagna et al. 2006), could help this coral sustain the cost of calcification under low pH (Cohen & Holcomb 2009; Jantzen et al. 2013a), at least for the population located above the deep water layer. The individuals growing within the euphotic zone might be exposed to the additional cost of a parasitic relationship with endolithic photo-autotrophs (Hassenrück et al. 2013). It is possible that the corals living in the deepest parts of Comau Fjord might show pre-acclimation or -adaptation to life in future lower pH oceans. At present, it cannot be ruled out either that the deeper *D. dianthus* in the fjord might belong to a genetically divergent population (Miller et al. 2011).

Outlook

Aragonite saturation state is considered as one of the most important drivers of cold water coral distribution (Davies & Guinotte 2011). Yet direct measurements of the carbonate chemistry in the vicinity of CWC reefs are very rare (Lunden et al. 2013). Furthermore, the few long-term experimental manipulations conducted on CWC showed that at least two of the main reef-

building species: *Lophelia pertusa* and *Madrepora oculata* remain quite unaffected by pH levels projected for the end of the century (Form & Riebesell 2012; Maier et al. 2013) and the skeletal density of several CWC species seems independent of the surrounding carbonate saturation (Lunden et al. 2013; Thresher et al. 2011). There is thus a great need to acquire more information in order to be able to define the ecological niche of CWC with respect to the seawater carbonate chemistry (Findlay et al. 2013).

Prospering at the lowest limit of seawater acidity and aragonite undersaturation known for cold-water scleractinian in a relatively accessible location, the *Desmophyllum dianthus* population(s) of Comau Fjord provides a great opportunity to investigate the effect of ocean acidification on CWC.

In order to better encompass all aspects of its inter-annual, seasonal and tidal dynamic, time series of hydrographic and chemical sampling in the fjord are needed. Physiological experiments on the corals would help to determine eventual thresholds for their growth, survival and reproduction, especially when focussing on the deep-dwelling individuals, which might display specific adaptation to low pH. Genetic analyses may even reveal a distinct population, potentially more resistant to aragonite undersaturation.

Acknowledgments

Many thanks are due to Tobias Funke, our ROV engineer and pilot. We are grateful to Verena Häussermann, Gunter Försterra, Reinhard Fitzek and the Huinay Scientific field station team for their logistic support and to Mauricio Melipillán, our boat captain. We also thank Carin Jantzen and Jürgen Laudien for accompanying this project. Kerstin Jerosch provided support for the georeferencing of the frames. Nils Oswianowski wrote the SciLab routine for the creation of the worldfiles. Milian Noack and Tim Ilic helped with the video analyses. Bathymetry data in Comau

Fjord were kindly provided by CN. Patricio Carrasco, Lt. Cdr. Felipe Barrios Burnett, Enrique Silva, Carolina, Calvete and Ortiz Pilar, thank you! We also acknowledge Ruth Alheit for the English review of the manuscript.

This is publication no. 86 of Huinay Scientific Field Station.

References

- Adkins JF, Henderson GM, Wang SL, O'Shea S, and Mokadem F. 2004. Growth rates of the deep-sea scleractinia *Desmophyllum cristagalli* and *Enallopsammia rostrata*. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 227:481-490.
- Anagnostou E, Huang KF, You CF, Sikes EL, and Sherrell RM. 2012. Evaluation of boron isotope ratio as a pH proxy in the deep sea coral *Desmophyllum dianthus*: Evidence of physiological pH adjustment. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 349:251-260.
- Burke A, Robinson LF, McNichol AP, Jenkins WJ, Scanlon KM, and Gerlach DS. 2010. Reconnaissance dating: A new radiocarbon method applied to assessing the temporal distribution of Southern Ocean deep-sea corals. *Deep-Sea Research Part I* 57:1510-1520.
- Bustamante MS. 2009. The southern Chilean fjord region: oceanographic aspects. In: Häussermann V, and Försterra G, eds. *Marine Benthic Fauna of Chilean Patagonia*: Santiago, Chile: Nature In Focus, 53-60.
- Cairns SD. 1995. *The marine fauna of New Zealand: Scleractinia (Cnidaria, Anthozoa)*: New Zealand Oceanographic Institute Memoir.
- Cairns SD. 2007. Deep-water corals: An overview with special reference to diversity and distribution of deep-water Scleractinian corals. *Bulletin of Marine Science* 81:311-322.
- Cairns SD, Häussermann V, and Försterra G. 2005. A review of the Scleractinia (Cnidaria : Anthozoa) of Chile, with the description of two new species. *Zootaxa* 1018:15-46.
- Cairns SD, and Stanley GDJ. 1982. Ahermatypic coral banks: living and fossil counterparts. Proceedings of the Fourth International Coral Reef Symposium, Manila, 1981. p 611-618.
- Caldeira K, and Wickett ME. 2003. Oceanography: anthropogenic carbon and ocean pH. *Nature* 425:365.
- Cohen AL, and Holcomb M. 2009. Why Corals Care About Ocean Acidification: Uncovering the Mechanism. *Oceanography* 22:118-127.
- Davies AJ, and Guinotte JM. 2011. Global habitat suitability for framework-forming cold-water corals. *Plos One* 6:e18483.

- 366 Davies AJ, Wisshak M, Orr JC, and Roberts JM. 2008. Predicting suitable habitat
367 for the cold-water coral *Lophelia pertusa* (Scleractinia). *Deep-Sea Research*
368 *Part I* 55:1048-1062.
- 369 Dávila PM, Figueroa D, and Müller E. 2002. Freshwater input into the coastal
370 ocean and its relation with the salinity distribution off austral Chile (35-
371 55°S). *Continental Shelf Research* 22:521-534.
- 372 Dodds LA, Roberts JM, Taylor AC, and Marubini F. 2007. Metabolic tolerance of
373 the cold-water coral *Lophelia pertusa* (Scleractinia) to temperature and
374 dissolved oxygen change. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and*
375 *Ecology* 349:205-214.
- 376 Doney SC, Fabry VJ, Feely RA, and Kleypas JA. 2009. Ocean acidification: the
377 other CO₂ problem. *Annual review of marine science* 1:169-192.
- 378 Dullo WC, Flögel S, and Rüggeberg A. 2008. Cold-water coral growth in relation
379 to the hydrography of the Celtic and Nordic European continental margin.
380 *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 371:165-176.
- 381 Efron B, and Tibshirani RJ. 1993. Permutation tests. *An introduction to the*
382 *bootstrap*: New York: Chapman & Hall, 202-219.
- 383 Fabricius KE, Langdon C, Uthicke S, Humphrey C, Noonan S, De'ath G, Okazaki
384 R, Muehllehner N, Glas MS, and Lough JM. 2011. Losers and winners in
385 coral reefs acclimatized to elevated carbon dioxide concentrations. *Nature*
386 *Climate Change* 1:165-169.
- 387 Farmer DM, and Freeland HJ. 1983. The Physical Oceanography of Fjords.
388 *Progress in Oceanography* 12:147-219.
- 389 Feely RA, Sabine CL, Lee K, Berelson W, Kleypas J, Fabry VJ, and Millero FJ.
390 2004. Impact of anthropogenic CO₂ on the CaCO₃ system in the oceans.
391 *Science* 305:362-366.
- 392 Findlay HS, Artioli Y, Moreno Navas J, Hennige SJ, Wicks LC, Huvenne VA,
393 Woodward EM, and Roberts JM. 2013. Tidal downwelling and implications
394 for the carbon biogeochemistry of cold-water corals in relation to future
395 ocean acidification and warming. *Global change biology* in press.
- 396 Fink HG, Wienberg C, Hebbeln D, McGregor HV, Schmiedl G, Taviani M, and
397 Freiwald A. 2012. Oxygen control on Holocene cold-water coral
398 development in the eastern Mediterranean Sea. *Deep-Sea Research Part I*
399 62:89-96.
- 400 Form AU, and Riebesell U. 2012. Acclimation to ocean acidification during long-
401 term CO₂ exposure in the cold-water coral *Lophelia pertusa*. *Global change*
402 *biology* 18:843-853.
- 403 Försterra G. 2009. Ecological and biogeographical aspects of the Chilean fjord
404 region. In: Häussermann V, and Försterra G, eds. *Marine Benthic Fauna of*
405 *Chilean Patagonia*: Santiago, Chile: Nature In Focus, 61-76.
- 406 Försterra G, Beuck L, Häussermann V, and Freiwald A. 2005. Shallow water
407 *Desmophyllum dianthus* (Scleractinia) from Chile: characteristics of the

- biocenoses, the bioeroding community, heterotrophic interactions and (palaeo)-bathymetrical implications. In: Freiwald A, and Roberts JM, eds. *Cold-water corals and ecosystems*: Berlin: Springer-Verlag, 937-977.
- Försterra G, and Häussermann V. 2003. First report on large scleractinian (Cnidaria: Anthozoa) accumulations in cold-temperate shallow water of south Chilean fjords. *Zoologische Verhandelingen Leiden* 345:117-128.
- Freiwald A, Fosså JH, Grehan A, Koslow T, and Roberts JM. 2004. *Cold-water coral reefs. Out of sight - no longer out of mind*: Cambridge, UK: UNEP-WCMC.
- González HE, Calderón MJ, Castro L, Clement A, Cuevas LA, Daneri G, Iriarte JL, Lizárraga L, Martínez R, Menschel A et al. . 2010. Primary production and plankton dynamics in the Reloncavi Fjord and the Interior Sea of Chiloe, Northern Patagonia, Chile. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 402:13-30.
- Guinotte JM, Orr J, Cairns SD, Freiwald A, Morgan L, and George R. 2006. Will human-induced changes in seawater chemistry alter the distribution of deep-sea scleractinian corals? *Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment* 4:141-146.
- Hall Spencer JM, Rodolfo-Metalpa R, Martin S, Ransome E, Fine M, Turner SM, Rowley S, Tedesco D, and Buia MC. 2008. Volcanic carbon dioxide vents show ecosystem effects of ocean acidification. *Nature* 454:96-99.
- Hassenrück C, Jantzen C, Försterra G, Häussermann V, and Willenz P. 2013. Rates of apical septal extension of *Desmophyllum dianthus*: effect of association with endolithic photo-autotrophs. *Marine Biology* published online.
- Häussermann V, and Försterra G. 2007. Large assemblages of cold-water corals in Chile: a summary of recent findings and potential impacts. In: George RY, and Cairns SD, eds. *Conservation and adaptive management of seamount and deep-sea coral ecosystems*: Miami: Rosenstiel School of Marine and Atmospheric Science, University of Miami, 195-207.
- Heindel K, Titschack J, Dorschel B, Huvenne VAI, and Freiwald A. 2010. The sediment composition and predictive mapping of facies on the Propeller Mound-A cold-water coral mound (Porcupine Seabight, NE Atlantic). *Continental Shelf Research* 30:1814-1829.
- Jantzen C, Häussermann V, Försterra G, Laudien J, Ardelan M, Maier S, and Richter C. 2013a. Occurrence of a cold-water coral along natural pH gradients (Patagonia, Chile). *Marine Biology* 160:2597-2607.
- Jantzen C, Laudien J, Sokol S, Försterra G, Häussermann V, Kupprat F, and Richter C. 2013b. In situ short-term growth rates of a cold-water coral. *Marine and Freshwater Research* 64:631-641.
- Jerosch K, Lüdtke A, Pledge P, Paitich O, and Kostylev VE. 2011. Automatic image analysis of sediment types: Mapping from georeferenced video footage on the Labrador Shelf. Geological Survey of Canada.

- 449 Lunden JJ, Georgian SE, and Cordes EE. 2013. Aragonite saturation states at cold-
450 water coral reefs structured by *Lophelia pertusa* in the northern Gulf of
451 Mexico. *Limnol Oceanogr* 58:354-362.
- 452 Maier C, Hegeman J, Weinbauer MG, and Gattuso JP. 2009. Calcification of the
453 cold-water coral *Lophelia pertusa* under ambient and reduced pH.
454 *Biogeosciences* 6:1671-1680.
- 455 Maier C, Schubert A, Berzunza Sánchez MM, Weinbauer MG, Watremez P, and
456 Gattuso JP. 2013. End of the century pCO₂ levels do not impact calcification
457 in Mediterranean cold-water corals. *Plos One* 8:e62655.
- 458 Maier C, Watremez P, Taviani M, Weinbauer MG, and Gattuso JP. 2012.
459 Calcification rates and the effect of ocean acidification on Mediterranean
460 cold-water corals. *Proceedings Biological sciences / The Royal Society*
461 279:1716-1723.
- 462 Margolin AR, Robinson LF, Burke A, Waller RG, Scanlon KM, Roberts ML, Auro
463 ME, and van de Flierdt T. 2013. Temporal and spatial distributions of cold-
464 water corals in the Drake Passage: Insights from the last 35,000 years. *Deep-*
465 *Sea Research Part II* In press.
- 466 Mayr CC, Försterra G, Häussermann V, Wunderlich A, Grau J, Zieringer M, and
467 Altenbach AV. 2011. Stable isotope variability in a Chilean fjord food web:
468 implications for N- and C-cycles. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 428:89-
469 104.
- 470 McCulloch M, Montagna P, Försterra G, Mortimer G, Häussermann V, and
471 Mazzoli. C. 2005. Uranium-series dating and growth rates of the cool-water
472 coral *Desmophyllum dianthus* from the Chilean fjords. In: Brock R, and
473 George RY, editors. 3rd Int Symp Deep-Sea Corals. Miami, FL. p 191.
- 474 McCulloch M, Trotter J, Montagna P, Falter J, Dunbar R, Freiwald A, Försterra N,
475 López Correa M, Maier C, Rüggeberg A et al. . 2012. Resilience of cold-
476 water scleractinian corals to ocean acidification: Boron isotopic systematics
477 of pH and saturation state up-regulation. *Geochimica Et Cosmochimica Acta*
478 87:21-34.
- 479 Miller KJ, Rowden AA, Williams A, and Häussermann V. 2011. Out of their depth?
480 Isolated deep populations of the cosmopolitan coral *Desmophyllum dianthus*
481 may be highly vulnerable to environmental change. *Plos One* 6:e19004.
- 482 Montagna P, McCulloch M, Taviani M, Mazzoli C, and Vendrell B. 2006.
483 Phosphorus in Cold-Water Corals as a Proxy for Seawater Nutrient
484 Chemistry. *Science* 312:1788-1791.
- 485 Mortensen PB, and Buhl-Mortensen L. 2005. Deep-water corals and their habitats
486 in the Gully, a submarine canyon off Atlantic Canada. In: Freiwald A, and
487 Roberts JM, eds. *Cold-water corals and ecosystems*: Berlin: Springer-Verlag,
488 247-277.
- 489 Nemzer BV, and Dickson AG. 2005. The stability and reproducibility of Tris
490 buffers in synthetic seawater. *Marine Chemistry* 96:237-242.

- Orr JC, Fabry VJ, Aumont O, Bopp L, Doney SC, Feely RA, Gnanadesikan A, Gruber N, Ishida A, Joos F et al. . 2005. Anthropogenic ocean acidification over the twenty-first century and its impact on calcifying organisms. *Nature* 437:681-686.
- Palma S, and Silva N. 2004. Distribution of siphonophores, chaetognaths, euphausiids and oceanographic conditions in the fjords and channels of southern Chile. *Deep-Sea Research Part II* 51:513-535.
- Prado-Fiedler R. 2009. Winter and summer distribution of dissolved oxygen, pH and nutrients at the heads of fjords in Chilean Patagonia with possible phosphorus limitation. *Revista de Biología Marina y Oceanografía* 44:783-789.
- Reveillaud J, Freiwald A, Van Rooij D, Le Guilloux E, Altuna A, Foubert A, Vanreusel A, Olu-Le Roy K, and Henriët JP. 2008. The distribution of scleractinian corals in the Bay of Biscay, NE Atlantic. *Facies* 54:317-331.
- Riebesell U. 2008. Acid test for marine biodiversity. *Nature* 454:46-47.
- Riebesell U, Fabry VJ, Hansson L, and Gattuso JP. 2010. *Guide to best practices for ocean acidification research and data reporting*: Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union.
- Roberts JM, Wheeler A, Freiwald A, and Cairns S. 2009. *Cold-water corals: The biology and geology of deep-sea coral habitats*: Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Roberts JM, Wheeler AJ, and Freiwald A. 2006. Reefs of the deep: The biology and geology of cold water coral ecosystems. *Science* 312:543-547.
- Robinson LF, Adkins JF, Scheirer DS, Fernandez DP, Gagnon A, and Waller RG. 2007. Deep-sea scleractinian coral age and depth distributions in the northwest Atlantic for the last 225,000 years. *Bulletin of Marine Science* 81:371-391.
- Sánchez N, González HE, and Iriarte JL. 2011. Trophic interactions of pelagic crustaceans in Comau Fjord (Chile): their role in the food web structure. *Journal of Plankton Research* 33:1212-1229.
- Silva N. 2008. Dissolved oxygen, pH, and nutrients in the austral Chilean channels and fjords. In: Silva N, and Palma S, eds. *Progress in the oceanographic knowledge of Chilean interior waters, from Puerto Montt to Cape Horn*: Comité Oceanográfico Nacional-Pontificia Universidad Católica de Valparaíso, 37-43.
- Soto MV. 2009. Geography of the Chilean Fjord Region. In: Häussermann V, and Försterra G, eds. *Marine Benthic Fauna of Chilean Patagonia*: Santiago, Chile: Nature In Focus, 43-52.
- Squires DF. 1965. Deep-water coral structure on the Campbell Plateau, New Zealand. *Deep-Sea Research* 12:785-788.

- 531 Thiagarajan N, Gerlach D, Roberts ML, Burke A, McNichol A, Jenkins WJ, Subhas
532 AV, Thresher RE, and Adkins JF. 2013. Movement of deep-sea coral
533 populations on climatic timescales. *Paleoceanography* 28:227-236.
- 534 Thresher RE, Tilbrook B, Fallon S, Wilson NC, and Adkins J. 2011. Effects of
535 chronic low carbonate saturation levels on the distribution, growth and
536 skeletal chemistry of deep-sea corals and other seamount megabenthos.
537 *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 442:87-99.
- 538 Valle-Levinson A, Sarkar N, Sanay R, Soto D, and León J. 2007. Spatial structure
539 of hydrography and flow in a Chilean fjord, Estuario Reloncavi. *Estuaries*
540 *and Coasts* 30:113-126.
- 541 Venn A, Tambutté E, Holcomb M, Allemand D, and Tambutté S. 2011. Live Tissue
542 Imaging Shows Reef Corals Elevate pH under Their Calcifying Tissue
543 Relative to Seawater. *Plos One* 6:e20013.

Figure 1

Area of investigation

(A) Overview on Patagonia showing the rugged coastline broken up by fjords and channels along southern Chile. Rectangle denotes area shown in panel B. (B) Chiloé Interior Sea linking Comau Fjord (red asterisk) to the Pacific Ocean. (C) Comau Fjord (bathymetry: courtesy of SHOA) with the location of the seven ROV dive sites. Scale bar represents 5 km. (Projection for all maps: WGS 1984 UTM Zone 18S).

Figure 2

Physico-chemical sections across Comau Fjord.

Profiles obtained during the ROV downward transects (vertical black lines) from the on-board CTD and compiled in Ocean Data View for (A) salinity, (B) temperature, (C) pH and (D) oxygen concentration. The numbers within the graphs correspond to the four water masses described in the discussion: (1) low-salinity surface layer, (2) Subantarctic oceanic water, (3) deeper water mass with longer residence time, (4) subsurface minimum in pH and oxygen.

Figure 3

Vertical profiles of physico-chemical parameters in Comau Fjord.

Depth profiles at the various ROV stations compiled in Ocean Data View for (A) salinity, (B) temperature, (C) pH and (D) oxygen concentration. The red dotted lines mark the 270-280 m depth range.

Figure 4

Substrate distribution in Comau Fjord.

(A) Total surface analysed. (B) Total surface of non-sediment covered rock. (C) Proportion of non-sediment covered rock used/unused by corals. The maximum depth reached during the dives (short grey lines) might be located above the deepest data points which are positioned in the centre of their 10 m depth interval. The red dotted lines mark the 270-280 m depth range.

Figure 5

Coral distribution in Comau Fjord.

(A) Coral abundance. (B) Coral patch size. (C) Coral shape (length/width ratio). The maximum depth reached during the dives (short grey lines) might be located above the deepest data points which are positioned in the centre of their 10 m depth interval. The red dotted lines mark the 270-280 m depth range.

Figure 6

Corals in Comau Fjord

Frames extracted from the ROV videos. (A) Long and thin *Desmophyllum dianthus* forming a dense bank (*Rio Bodudahue*, 190 m depth) with some examples of pseudo-colonies. Seen from the side, some corals could be measured when they were not hidden behind other individuals. (B) Dense coral aggregation (*Lilliguapi*, 124 m depth) with almost all individuals having their tentacles extended. The angle to the substrate was ideal for determining abundances but coral sizes could not be measured. (C) Patch of the bivalve *Acesta patagonica* (Dall, 1902) (*Near Telele*, 395 m depth), often associated with *D. dianthus* below 60 m depth. The small group of scleractinian (white) on the lower right corner is the deepest record of *D. dianthus* during this study. (D) Example of non-colonized sediment-free rock (darker) and sediment-covered substrate (lighter) (*Near Telele*, 420 m depth). The white scales represent approximately 5 cm in the centre of each frame, where the echo-sounder measured the distance to the substrate.

Table 1 (on next page)

Sampling sites

Date	Site	Code	Latitude	Longitude	Max. Depth (m)	Distance to head (km)
09/02/2012	<i>Lilliguapi</i>	LL	42°09.661' S	72°36.043'W	198	40.9
09/02/2012	<i>Cross Lilli</i>	CL	42°11.295'S	72°35.211'W	115	39.5
13/02/2012	<i>Near Telele</i>	NT	42°14.935' S	72°30.880'W	422	26.9
08/02/2012	<i>Steep Wall</i>	SW	42°19.889' S	72°27.666'W	209	17.2
07/02/2012	<i>Cross Huinay</i>	CH	42°23.213' S	72°27.772'W	282	11.9
06/02/2012	<i>Punta Gruesa</i>	PG	42°24.621' S	72°25.446'W	355	8.1
11/02/2012	<i>Rio Bodudahue</i>	RB	42°27.360' S	72°24.826'W	216	2.0

Table 2_(on next page)

Physico-chemical environment: site statistics

Parameter	Site (depth range)	Range	Mean $\pm$ SD
Salinity	LL (1-198)	24.3-32.7	32.3 $\pm$ 0.9
	CL (5-115)	30.8-32.6	32.3 $\pm$ 0.4
	NT (13-422)	31.9-33.0	32.6 $\pm$ 0.2
	SW (1-209)	16.5-32.6	32.1 $\pm$ 1.8
	CH (1-282)	14.4-32.7	32.0 $\pm$ 2.5
	PG (1-355)	NA	NA
	RB (6-216)	31.0-32.6	32.4 $\pm$ 0.2
Temperature (°C)	LL (1-198)	10.6 - 15.5	11.2 $\pm$ 1.2
	CL (5-115)	10.6 - 15.7	11.4 $\pm$ 1.3
	NT (13-422)	10.3 - 13.4	10.6 $\pm$ 0.3
	SW (1-209)	10.3 - 16.3	11.0 $\pm$ 1.5
	CH (1-282)	10.2 - 16.3	10.8 $\pm$ 1.4
	PG (1-355)	10.2 - 17.0	10.6 $\pm$ 1.0
	RB (6-216)	10.2 - 15.9	10.5 $\pm$ 0.9
pH	LL (1-198)	7.86-8.33	7.92 $\pm$ 0.11
	CL (5-115)	7.88 -8.35	7.95 $\pm$ 0.14
	NT (13-422)	7.74-8.16	7.81 $\pm$ 0.04
	SW (1-209)	7.74-8.34	7.87 $\pm$ 0.14
	CH (1-282)	7.75-8.42	7.87 $\pm$ 0.15
	PG (1-355)	7.72-8.41	7.86 $\pm$ 0.11
	RB (6-216)	7.71-8.37	7.83 $\pm$ 0.10
Oxygen ($\mu\text{mol.l}^{-1}$)	LL (1-198)	146-231	158 $\pm$ 20
	CL (5-115)	144-268	160 $\pm$ 29
	NT (13-422)	91-236	140 $\pm$ 18
	SW (1-209)	127-255	161 $\pm$ 28
	CH (1-282)	131-275	160 $\pm$ 29
	PG (1-355)	117-280	148 $\pm$ 27
	RB (6-216)	112-276	149 $\pm$ 25

SD: standard deviation, NA: not available

Table 3(on next page)

Physical oceanography at 280 m depth

Sit e	Salinity	Temperature (°C)	pH	Oxygen (μmol.l ⁻¹)
NT	32.71	10.46	7.83	147.58
CH	32.71	10.46	7.83	145.98
PG	NA	10.49	7.84	140.04

NA: not available

Table 4 (on next page)

Regression analyses

Coral parameter	Environmental parameter	r^2 (whole water column)	r^2 (excluding surface layer)
Abundance	pH	0.010	0.004
	Oxygen	-0.004	-0.006
	Temperature	-0.008	0.023
	Salinity	0.030	0.168
Substrate usage	pH	-0.006	0.107
	Oxygen	0.017	0.155
	Temperature	0.005	-0.006
	Salinity	0.004	0.059
	Available substrate	0.160	0.166