

Journal: PeerJ

COMMENTS OF REVIEWER: Milena Gocić

Paper title: Characteristics and development of spoon gullies in the Dry valleys of Southwest China

Your introduction needs more detail. I suggest that you improve the description by adding references that talk about the same topic from other parts of the world (for example: Ionita et al., 2021; Le Roux, Sumner 2011; Martins et al., 2022; Rahmati et al., 2022).

The English language is satisfactory and understandable for an international audience.

The methodology has already been used in other manuscripts and is clearly explained.

The tables and figures are clear and appropriate. The correlations are quite high. Based on the results and correlations obtained, the authors have good conclusions in the manuscript. The objectives of the study were answered.

Strengthening of the manuscript: Field research and remote sensing measurements were used in the manuscript, which certainly contributes to a better understanding of the problem of the occurrence and development of spoon gullies.

The only weakness of the manuscript is that you have not compared your conclusions and discussions with other parts of the world. Is there anywhere else in the world, at least to a lesser extent, the possibility of the occurrence of this kind of the gullies (other than the Loess Plateau), how did they form and develop there?

The literature is new, up-to-date and well cited.

In line 62, a space should be inserted between the word observed and the literature citation.

Line 331, delete the superscript number above the word Loess Plateau.