# Environmental risks and agronomic benefits of industrial sewage sludge-derived biochar

3 4 5

1

2

Vladimír Frišták<sup>1</sup>, Lucia Polťáková<sup>1</sup>, Gerhard Soja<sup>2</sup>, Hana Kaňková<sup>3</sup>, Katarína Ondreíčková<sup>4</sup>, Elena Kupcová<sup>5</sup>, Martin Pipíška<sup>1</sup>

6 7 8

9

- <sup>1</sup> Department of Chemistry. Trnava university in Trnava, Trnava, Slovakia
- <sup>2</sup> Institute for Chemical and Energy Engineering, University of Natural Resources and Life
- 10 Sciences, Vienna, Austria
- 11 <sup>3</sup> FunGlass, Centre for Functional and Functionalized Glass, Alexander Dubček University of
- 12 Trenčín, Trenčín, Slovakia
- 13 <sup>4</sup> Research Institute of Plant Production, National Agricultural and Food Centre, Piešťany,
- 14 Slovakia
- <sup>5</sup> Department of Chemistry, Faculty of Natural Sciences, Matej Bel University, Banská Bystrica,
- 16 Slovakia

17

- 18 Corresponding Author:
- 19 Vladimír Frišták<sup>1</sup>
- 20 Priemyselná 4, Trnava, 91701, Slovakia
- 21 Email address: vladimir.fristak@truni.sk

22 23

24

25

26

27

28

29 30

31

32

33 34

35

36 37

38

39

## **Abstract**

The main objective of the present work was to assess the ecotoxicological safety of the use of thermochemically treated sewage sludge from the WWTP of a distillery plant as a soil additive in agricultural soils on the basis of its physicochemical characteristics and the bioaccumulation of selected elements in the plant tissues of maize (Zea mays). We have carried out physicochemical characterization (pH, EC, Corg, Cinorg, CEC, N, H, ash content, PAHs) of sewage sludge feedstock (SS) and sludge-derived biochar (BC) at a temperature of 400 °C. The effect of 1% (w/w) amendment of SS and BC on soil physicochemical properties (pH, EC, Cinorg), germination of ryegrass, soil rhizobacteria and microorganisms, as well as on the accumulation and translocation of selected elements in maize (Zea mays) was studied. The results show that pyrolysis treatment of distillery WWTP sludge at 400 °C increases pH, C<sub>org</sub>, N, ash content and decreases EC, CEC, H and PAHs content. RFA analysis of SS and BC showed that pyrolysis treatment multiplies Cr, Ni, Pb, Zn, Fe in the obtained BC, but based on an ecotoxicological test with earthworms Eisenia fetida, we conclude that pyrolysis treatment reduced the amount of available forms of heavy metals in BC compared to SS. We demonstrated by a pot experiment with a maize that a 1% addition of BC increased soil pH, decreased EC and Cinorg and had no significant effect on heavy metal accumulation in plant tissues. According to the results of the three-level germination test, it also

Commented [VR1]: Scientific name = italics

**Commented [VR2]:** By how much? And was statistical analysis performed?

does not affect the germination of cress seeds (*Lepidium sativum*). There was a significant effect of 1% BC addition on soil microbial community, and we observed a decrease in total microbial biomass and an increase in fungal species variability in the soil. Based on these results, we conclude that BC represents a promising material that can serve as a soil additive and source of nutritionally important elements after optimization of the pyrolysis process.

**Commented [VR3]:** Is this effect negative or positive towards soil quality?

#### Introduction

Globally, increasing industrial activity and human population growth bring with them a range of negative impacts on the environment. One of these is the production of bulk sludge as a by-product of municipal and industrial water treatment in wastewater treatment plants (WWTPs). The handling, recovery and disposal of these wastes represents a challenge that must be addressed from a sustainability perspective. Conventional treatment practices for sewage sludge are incineration and landfilling respectively. Agronomical applications of sludge are very rare in terms of current EU legislation. On the other hand, sludge is a relatively valuable material, rich in an organic matter and nutritionally important elements (C, N, P, Zn etc.). Therefore, the possibility of alternative treatment is constantly being sought, while maintaining the above-mentioned benefits and eliminating the risks of untreated sludge application to the soil. These include the danger of microbial contamination and the penetration of inorganic (heavy metals) and organic contaminants (polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons - PAHs, polychlorinated dibenzo-p-dioxins and dibenzofurans - PCDD/Fs, polychlorinated biphenyls – PCBs and microplastics) into the soil ecosystem.

Pyrolysis treatment of sludge produced by industrial and municipal WWTPs represents a relatively innovative and promising method for the efficient use of waste material to obtain a valuable product rich in organic carbon. Several scientific studies (Frišták et al., 2022; Xiao et al. 2022; Zhou et al., 2023; Wan et al. 2024) point to the effectiveness of pyrolysis treatment of sludge in terms of its hygienization (elimination of pathogenic microorganisms) and reduction of the risk of accessibility of contaminants to living organisms. According to Chen et al. (2015), pyrolysis sludge treatment represents a sustainable solution for the treatment of sewage sludge from different input sources, as it solves the issues of energy recovery, nutrient recycling, immobilization of heavy metals, as well as overall environmental protection. Gao et al. (2017) reported in their work that sludge pyrolysis converts approximately 50% of the sludge mass into biochar, which can then be used as a solid fuel, adsorbent of heavy metals and organic pollutants, catalyst, or as a soil additive. However, as we know very well, soil applications and the overall handling of sludge and sludge-based pyrolysis products are limited by several factors (pyrolysis temperature, sludge pretreatment, residence time etc.). Pyrolysis is a complex multi-step process in which organic matter is thermally decomposed by increasing temperature (Rumaihi, 2022). Different perspectives on the phases of sludge pyrolysis suggest that these differences may be due to the diverse experimental conditions and heterogeneous properties of the clarified sludge. Manara and Zabaniotou (2012) reported in their work that low temperatures are inefficient for decomposition of organic matter, and higher temperatures, although providing sufficient energy for secondary pyrolysis, reduce the biochar yield from sludge. During the pyrolysis process, most of the heavy

Commented [VR4]: brings

metals are not eliminated from the sludge but transformed into a different chemical form (Praspaliauskas et al., 2018). Metals occurring in the form of mineral salts and hydroxides are usually transformed into oxides or sulfides with higher thermal stability. The consequence of this transformation is a decrease in the mobility of metals in the resulting sludge biochar (Lu et al. 2016). According to Li et al. (2018), the main reasons for the immobilization of heavy metals in biochar are related to the formation of new stable crystalline forms of C, which absorb heavy metals through their reaction with elements in minerals, substitution of mineral elements, and occupation of vacancies in minerals. Biochar, in a figurative sense, can fix heavy metals within its structure, leading to their lower leachability and release into the environment.

On the one hand, sludge-based biochar has the potential to serve as an organic fertiliser, which is an important source of essential elements and microelements for plants. Also, the material characteristics of biochar such as pH and porosity contribute to the retention of some nutritionally important elements and soil moisture. Among other things, sludges contain different concentrations and forms of heavy metals, which are multiplied in the structure of the resulting biochar during pyrolysis treatment.

Since the above knowledge, in the present work we decided to characterize the pyrolysis product based on the sewage sludge from the industrial wastewater treatment plant of a distillery in terms of bioavailability of the selected microelements and potentially toxic elements. The aim of the work was the imaginary closure of the cycle: useful plant - harvesting - industrial processing - sludge production - sludge processing - fertilizer production for the cultivation of the useful plant.

## **Materials & Methods**

#### Sewage sludge origin and biochar production

A sample of the distillery's WWTP sludge was obtained after centrifugation of the return sludge from the collection tank of Enviral, a.s. (Leopoldov, Slovakia), a company involved in bioethanol production. The sludge obtained was oven-dried at 50 °C to constant weight. Part of the dried sludge was thermochemically treated by a slow pyrolysis process at 400 °C in a continuous pyrolysis reactor PYREKA (Pyreg, Germany) under strictly anoxic conditions. Slow pyrolysis was carried out at a heating rate of 30 °C/min and after reaching the maximum temperature the feed material was kept in the reactor for 20 min. The use of gaseous N<sub>2</sub> with a flow rate of 2 L/min of the reactor exchange volume ensured that a strictly anoxic atmosphere was achieved. The sewage sludge-derived biochar (BC) and dried sewage sludge (SS) were sieved to a fraction of 0.25-2 mm using standard sieves.

## Physico-chemical characterization of sewage sludge-derived biochar

The SS and BC samples were exposed to basic physicochemical characterization. All determinations were carried out in triplicates. For pH determination the KCl method was used. The BC and SS samples were mixed with 1 mol/L KCl at volume ratio 1/10 (v/v). The pH was

Commented [VR5]: Statistical analysis performed?

measured using a pH/EC/TDS multimeter HI5521 (Hanna Instruments, EU). The determination of electrical conductivity (EC) was carried out by mixing SS and BC samples with deionized water at ratio 1/10 (v/v) and measured using a pH/EC/TDS multimeter HI5521 (Hanna Instruments, EU). To quantify the carbonate content in the BC and SS samples, the Jankov calcimeter was used. The analysis of cation exchange capacity (CEC) was carried out using the method modified by Frišták et al. (2013) in three repetitions. The Ba<sup>2+</sup> as a loading cation and Mg<sup>2+</sup> as an exchanging cation were used. A modified toluene extraction procedure according to Hilber et al. (2017) was used to determine the total concentration of 18 extractable structures of PAHs. The obtained extracts were concentrated using a Hei-Vap vacuum evaporator (Heidolph, Germany). For the quantification of 18 structures of PAHs compounds namely naphthalene, acenaphthylene, acenaphthalene, fluorene, phenanthrene, anthracene, fluoranthene, pyrene, benzo(a)anthracene, chrysene, benzo(b)fluoranthene. benzo(a)pyrene. dibenzo(a,h)anthracene. benzo(g.h.i)pervlene. ideno(1,2,3)pyrene, 1-methylnaphtalene and 2-methylnaphthalene, high-performance liquid chromatography HPLC (1260 Infinitym AGILENT Technologies) was employed. Total concentrations of C, H and N in BC and SS samples were quantified by CHNS-O elemental analyzer (CHNS-O EA 1108, Carlo Erba Instruments, Italy). For the determination of total concentrations of As, Cd, Cr, Cu, Ni, Pb, Zn, Fe, Hg the method of X-ray fluorescence spectrometry (RFA) was used by Spectro Xepos-XRF meter (Spectro AnalyticL Instruments GmbH, Germany).

#### Short-term ecotoxicological tests

120

121

122

123

124

125

126 127

128

129

130

131

132 133

134

135

136

137

138

139

140 141

142

143

144

145

146 147

148

149

150

151

152

153

154

155 156

157

158

159

The short-term germination test (7 days) with cress seeds (Lepidium sativum) was performed according to the scheme described in our previous work (Frišták et al., 2022). Nine containers were prepared for the test, three serving as a control, three containing 1% (w/w) amendment of BC and three containing 1% (w/w) amendment of SS. Washed and chemical pure sand served as a medium. The containers were divided into three levels and the effects of contaminants (gaseous, water-soluble, and bound to BC and SS) on the germination of cress seeds were studied. At the first level, the effect of volatile compounds released from BC and SS materials on germination was investigated. At the second level, the effect of gaseous contaminants, water-soluble contaminants, and direct contact of seeds with BC and SS materials was studied. At the third level, the effect of volatile compounds and water-soluble compounds from BC and SS materials on seed germination was investigated. To assess the suitability and toxicological safety of the analyzed BC and SS samples as soil additives, a long-term ecotoxicological test (120 days) using selected individuals of the California earthworm (Eisenia fetida) obtained from a vermicomposting station with certified origin was performed. Containers with conventional commercially available garden substrate (Natura, Agro CS, Slovakia) were amended with 1% (w/w) addition of SS and 1% (w/w) addition of BC. Containers with non-amended substrate represented control. In each container 10 adult earthworm specimens were added. The soil moisture was monitored by moisture sensors EcoWitt WH51 (EcoWitt, China) and adjusted between 50 and 60% during experimental period. Once a month the counting abundance of earthworms, measurement of size and application

**Commented [VR6]:** How was this investigated? To provide a little more details on the study design

**Commented [VR7]:** What is the starting number of earthworms for each experimental arm?

of a feeding ration consisting of coffee grounds, carrots and leaf lettuce (3:2:1 ratio) were done. Feed rations were always applied in equal amounts to each experimental container and manually incorporated to a maximum of 2 cm depth of substrate. After 120 days the specimens were left emptied and executed by ethanol method. Tissues were digested by microwave assisted digestion system Multiwave GO PLUS (Antoon Paar, Germany) with HNO<sub>3</sub> and characterize by spectral analysis for the determination of selected heavy metals by atomic absorption spectrometry with electrothermal atomization (ET - AAS) and with flame atomization (F - AAS) using an Agilent 240FS AA spectrometer (Agilent, USA).

#### Pot experiment with Zea mays L.

160

161

162

163

164

165 166

167

168 169

170

171

172

173

174

175

176

177

178

179

180 181

182

183

184

185

186

187

188

189 190

191

192 193

194

195

196

197

198

To assess how the BC and SS samples as soil additives affect plant growth and metal accumulation in the plant, a long-term outdoor pot experiment with maize (Zea mays L.) was carried out. The arable soil used as a substrate in the experimental pots was collected at the site of the village of Zákamenné in North of Slovakia (49°24'44.3 "N 19°17'14.6 "E) in April 2023 where experiment was set up. After collection, the substrate was air-dried, homogenized, stripped of plant and animal residues and sieved to a fraction > 2 mm using standard sieves. Subsequently, 9 containers were applied, 3 serving as control (K1-3), 3 containing substrate with 1% (w/w) addition of BC (BC1-3) and 3 containing substrate with 1% (w/w) addition of SS (SS1-3). Preparation of the containers consisted of creating a drainage layer consisting of mesh and gravel, weighing the substrate and 1% additions, which were thoroughly mixed into the substrate. Corn seeds were soaked in rainwater for 3 days before being placed in the containers, to identify damaged seeds and to accelerate germination. Subsequently, into each pot were placed 6 seeds, which were allowed to germinate, and after germination, just one plant individuals in each pot were left. On the day of planting, the substrates were moistened with rainwater to ensure sufficient moisture for germination. The randomized experimental set-up of pots has been used. External environmental conditions such as daily temperature, humidity and volume of rainfall were monitored throughout the experiment. The experiment was finished after twenty-two weeks by harvesting the plant objects as well as taking representative soil substrate samples for subsequent chemical and microbiological analysis.

#### Physico-chemical and microbiological analysis of plant and soil samples

Obtained maize plant material was separated into root system, stems, leaves, flowers and fruits, which were washed with deionized water, oven-dried and homogenized. The plant materials were digested by Multiwave Go Plus microwave digestion system (Anton Paar, Germany) with HNO<sub>3</sub> and analyzed for the determination of As, Cd, Cr, Cu, Ni, Mn, Pb, Zn, Fe, Hg, P concentrations by inductively coupled plasma optical emission spectrometry (ICP-OES) method as well as inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry (ICP-MS). The ICP-OES analysis was performed using an ICP-OES 5100SVDV spectrometer (Agilent, USA) in axial view. The ICP-MS analysis was performed using an ICP MS 7900 spectrometer (Agilent, USA) in both gas-free and He-mode.

Commented [VR8]: the experiment

Commented [VR9]: one individual plant

Commented [VR10]: was

Physicochemical characterization of soil samples after the experiment and substrate was carried out to determine pH, EC and carbonate content. The methodology is described above. Microbial analysis of soil samples after corn harvesting was performed using ARISA (Automated ribosomal intergenic spacer analysis), in which total metagenomic DNA (mgDNA) is isolated from control soil substrate as well as soil substrates with 1% addition of SS and BC after the end of the maize sowing experiment. For analysis, DNA was eluted in 50 µL of sterile water and then the concentration and purity of the DNA samples were measured spectrophotometrically using a NanoDrop One instrument (Thermo Scientific). Later, the samples were diluted to a uniform concentration of 25 ng/µl and stored at -20 °C. ITSF and ITSReub primers (Cardinale et al. 2004) were used for PCR amplification of the bacterial 16S-23S rRNA variable ITS (intergenic transcribed spacer) region, and the reverse primer was fluorescently labeled at the 5'-end with 6-FAM. The length-variable DNA region of fungal ITS1 - 5.8S rRNA - ITS2 was amplified using the 2234C and 3126T primer pairs (Sequerra et al. 1997), and in this case the forward primer was fluorescently labeled at the 5'-end using 6-FAM. PCR amplification was performed in a GeneAmp PCR System 9700 (Applied Biosystems) under the following conditions: initial denaturation for 3 min at 94 °C; followed by 35 cycles of denaturation for 45 s at 94 °C, annealing of the primers for 1 min at 60 °C, and polymerization for 2 min at 72 °C; and final polymerization for 10 min at 72 °C. The PCR products were subsequently precipitated with ethanol and dissolved in 10 µL of sterile water. To 1 µL of purified PCR product was added 9 µL of formamide containing LIZ1200 size standard (Applied Biosystems), the mixture was denatured for 3 min at 95 °C and separated by capillary electrophoresis in an ABI 3100 Prism Avant instrument (Applied Biosystems). Data obtained from fragment analysis with a fluorescence value greater than 30 were analyzed using Peak Scanner 2 (Applied Biosystems) software, and PCR product sizes ranging from 200 to 1000 bp were used for statistical evaluation.

## Results

199

200

201

202

203 204

205

206

207

208

209

210

211 212

213

214

215

216

217

218

219 220

221

222

223 224

225

226

227

228

229 230

231

232

233

234

235

236

237

238

Based on the determination of the potential pH of the BC and SS samples (Table 1), it can be concluded that the pyrolysis treatment of the distillery sludge at 400 °C increases the pH of the material. The electrical conductivity (EC) is a parameter that characterizes the representation of the total amount of water-soluble salts in the studied materials. In our case, the pyrolysis treatment of the distillery's sewage sludge at 400 °C resulted in a significant reduction of the EC value by more than 50 % (Table 1), indicating that the representation of water-soluble salts in the BC was reduced. In the SS sample as input material, the ash content was 23.59 % and after pyrolysis treatment at 400 °C, the ash content in the biochar obtained increased to 50.99 %. In the analysis of our samples, we found that pyrolysis treatment of sewage sludge at 400 °C resulted in approximately twofold decrease in CEC in BC (55.656 cmol/kg) compared to SS (118.66 cmol/kg) (Table 1). Pyrolysis treatment of the centrifuged sewage sludge enriched the obtained BC solid material in total C, with a significant increase in the C<sub>org</sub> form (36, 83% for BC and 28.86% for SS) and a decrease in the C<sub>inorg</sub> form (1.73% for BC and 2.65% for SS). The pyrolysis treatment of the sludge reduced the % of bound H in the obtained biochar (Table 1), and the H/C ratio also

Formatted: Strikethrough

decreased significantly (from 0.234 for SS to 0.051 for BC). After pyrolysis treatment, the C/N ratio also increased in BC compared to SS. RFA analysis of both samples determined the highest concentration of Fe (135000 mg/kg for BC and 107000 mg/kg for SS) and Zn (1656 mg/kg for BC and 593 mg/kg for SS). Other identified heavy metals and potentially toxic elements were represented in the samples in the following order in terms of decreasing concentration Cu > Ni > Cr > Pb > Hg > Cd > As. The RFA analysis values obtained for the total concentration of metals and metalloids present in BC and SS (Table 1) indicate that pyrolysis treatment at 400 °C results in approximately a twofold increase in Cr, Pb, Cu and a threefold increase in Ni and Zn in BC. For BC and SS samples, the concentrations of As and Cd were below the detection limit of the analytical method (0.1 mg/kg). The amount of Hg in the BC sample was reduced by pyrolysis treatment to below the detection limit (0.2 mg/kg).

The total concentration of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) present was reduced by pyrolysis treatment of the industrial sewage sludge to 3.38 mg/kg in the final BC material from 4.03 mg/kg in SS (Table 2). In general, the concentration of the individual PAHs of the structures was reduced by pyrolysis treatment at 400 °C, with naphthalene being the most abundant in both materials (1.82 mg/kg for SS and 1.68 mg/kg for BC). In the toluene extracts of the analysed materials, other 4-ring and 3-ring PAHs structures were also identified above the detection limit of the assay, as well as the structure of a single 5-ring PAH, namely benz(b)fluoranthene. Benzo(b)fluoranthene was also the only PAH structure detected whose total extractable concentration was increased by pyrolysis treatment in the BC compared to the input precursor SS.

Graphical representations of the results of the three-stage ecotoxicological germination test are shown in Fig. 1. In all 3 levels, i.e., when considering I. the influence of volatile contaminants, II. the influence of volatile contaminants, water-soluble contaminants and direct contact with BC and SS, and III. the influence of volatile and water-soluble contaminants, we did not observe a statistically significant difference between the additions ( $\alpha$ =0.05). Comparing the level II control group and with the group with 1% addition of BC, we found that seed germination did not increase statistically significantly with the addition of biochar. Even, substrate enrichment with 1% addition of BC inhibited germination most at level II, when seeds are in direct contact with biochar while being exposed to volatile and water-soluble contaminants from BC. However, even in this case, no statistically significant difference was confirmed at the  $\alpha$  = 0.05 level of statistical significance. In the case of 1% addition of untreated SS, seed germination is most inhibited at level III, where seeds are exposed to volatile and water-soluble contaminants.

We also assessed the ecotoxicity of BC and SS in terms of their impact on soil biota by conducting a 4-month incubation test with soil giant nematodes, specifically California earthworms (*Eisenia fetida*). During the exposure period, 120 days, we monitored earthworms every 30 days, and mortality of individuals in all groups began to be observed after three months. The mortality of earthworm individuals after 90 days of exposure was 30% in the control sample (without BC and SS addition), 60% in the sample with 1% SS addition, and 20% in the sample with 1% BC addition. We did not observe cocoon formation in either sample for the duration of the experiment. After the end of the experiment, an exposure period of 120 days, there were 7

Commented [VR11]: The difference in total PAHs could be due to specific PAHs as the data shows that only certain PAHs were reduced. This may skew the total concentration of PAHs

Commented [VR12]: What is the starting number of earthworms for each experimental arm (baseline value to measure reduction)?

original individuals in the control sample, 2 individuals in the substrate with 1% SS addition and 4 individuals in the substrate with 1% BC addition. Earthworm mortality decreases in the order SS > BC > CONTROL, while the average weight of surviving individuals increases in the reverse order. The total concentration of selected heavy metals (Fe, Zn, Cu, Pb and Cd) in the earthworm digests obtained from control, 1% SS and 1% BC additions were determined using both F-AAS and ET-AAS, and all the values obtained did not exceed 1 mg/kg. The Fe value in individuals from the 1% SS exposure was almost threefold higher compared to individuals from the 1% BC exposure, and almost sixfold higher compared to the control group. Similarly, the amount of Cu and Cd was lower in individuals from the 1% BC exposure compared to individuals from the 1% SS exposure. There was also no statistically significant difference between the amount of Zn in individuals from the 1% BC exposure compared to individuals from the 1% SS exposure. In general, total heavy metal levels decreased in the control and 1% BC groups in the order Zn > Fe > Cu > Pb > Cd and in the 1% SS group in the order En > Cu > Pb > Cd.

279

280

281

282

283 284

285

286

287

288

289

290

291

292

293

294

295

296

297

298

299

300

301

302 303

304

305

306

307

308

309

310

311 312

313

314 315

316

317

318

Throughout the outdoor experiment, we recorded the height of the plants in the pots every 7 days, based on which we established a trend of plant growth. From the data obtained, we conclude that the growth of the above-ground part of the maize was slower in all pots for the first 30 days. After one month, the growth rate of the plants increased, and we observed the greatest increase 60-80 days after planting. After about 80 days from planting, we observed a decreasing trend in plant growth. From the data obtained, it is evident that the plant height was highest in the substrate enriched with 1% addition of SS followed by plants with 1% addition of BC and the lowest plants were in the control group. The average values of the dimensions (height and length, respectively) and weight after harvesting and drying of the underground and aboveground parts of the plants are given in Fig. 2. From the graph (Fig. 2 - A), it can be seen that the weight of the above and below ground parts of the control group plants is almost the same, while the height of the above ground part is three times higher. In the case of the plants enriched with 1% SS addition, as it can be seen from the graph that the difference in the weight of the biomass of the below ground part is statistically significant compared to the weight of the biomass of the below ground part of the plants grown in the substrate with 1% BC addition. In the case of comparison of above-ground part biomass weight between plants grown in 1% SS substrate and 1% BC substrate, statistical significance was not confirmed ( $\alpha$ =0.05). We did not observe statistically significant differences between the biomass of the underground part and the aboveground part of SS and control. The highest plant biomass yield was obtained from plants from the group with 1% SS addition. Comparison of the height and length of above-ground plant individuals grown in the control (no addition), 1% SS and 1% BC addition environments (Fig. 2 - B) showed a statistically significant difference between plants grown in the SS and BC environments, respectively (Fig. 2 - B). However, both treatments did not show statistically significant difference with control environment. The lengths of the underground parts (root systems) were without statistically significant difference among all groups analyzed.

Based on the experimental data obtained, we found that the soil substrate used has a pH in the acidic region (6.4), and after cultivation of maize, the pH increased in all soils, in the order of

**Commented [VR13]:** Which day of growth does the data correspond to?

CONTROL < SS < BC. The most significant increase in soil pH occurred in the case of 1% addition of BC to the soil (7.21). In both groups (BC, SS), we observed an increase in pH and a decrease in  $C_{anorg}$ , with the largest increase and decrease occurring simultaneously in the case of soil with 1% BC addition. In the case of the group with 1% addition of SS, we observed an increase in the amount of  $C_{anorg}$  in the soil after the end of the experiment, which may be due to the higher amount of  $C_{anorg}$  in SS compared to BC. In terms of soil EC, we found that after cultivation of maize, EC decreased in the order CONTROL > SS > BC.

 Total microbial biomass activity was assessed as the amount of DNA isolated per 1 g of soil substrate. The DNA isolated represents DNA from both living and dead microorganisms. Using the applied LSD statistical test, there was a statistically significant difference between the total microbial biomass in the BC amended soil and the control (LSD,  $\alpha$ =0.05), with the BC amended soil showing the statistically lowest microbial biomass (Fig. 3). The representation of microbial biomass in the soil substrates decreased in the order CONTROL > SS > BC. Venn diagrams were used to evaluate the common and dissimilar bacterial (BARISA) and fungal (F-ARISA) species among the samples (Fig. 4). Soil with 1% BC addition contained the lowest number of bacterial species but on the other hand the highest number of fungal species. The number of bacterial species decreased in the order CONTROL > SS > BC, with 44 fewer bacterial species in the soil with 1% BC compared to the soil with 1% SS addition and up to 50 fewer species in the soil with 1% BC addition compared to the control. For fungi, this variation in species numbers was not as pronounced and the soil enriched with 1% BC had 6 more fungal species than the other samples. Of all the bacterial and fungal species detected, 8 bacterial species and 15 fungal species were identified in all three samples.

From our results (Fig. 5A), it is evident that maize is a Zn hyperaccumulator as we identified increased translocation of Zn to above ground parts in all samples. Zn accumulation by maize roots was statistically significantly reduced after 1% addition of SS and BC compared to the control. For SS plants, although there was a statistically significant decrease in the amount of Zn in the stem of maize compared to the control, based on % translocation, we found that the largest amount of Zn accumulated in the aboveground part was in SS plants. The translocation of Fe uptake in the maize specimens obtained and Fe accumulation in the different plant parts is shown in Fig. 5B, and it can be observed that the difference between the groups analyzed is not statistically significant in any plant part. In all cases, individuals accumulated more Fe in the roots than in the above-ground part, with the % Fe abundance in the different parts decreasing in the order R (root) > L (leaf) > F (flower)  $\ge$  S (stem) > C (cob-fruit). The translocation of As uptake in the maize specimens obtained and the accumulation of As in the different plant parts is shown in Fig. 5C, and it can be observed that the difference between the analyzed groups is not statistically significant in any plant part. For all groups analysed, the amount of As in stems, flowers and fruits was lower than the LOD of the analytical method of determination used (0.4 mg/kg). Individuals from the control and SS groups accumulated more As in the roots than in the aboveground part, and in the case of BC individuals we observed an increase in translocation to the aboveground part, resulting in the same percentages of As in roots and leaves. For Cd, similar to As, we did not

expect a statistically significant effect of 1% addition on Cd accumulation and translocation in maize, since both the soil substrate and the additions contained less than 1 mg/kg Cd according to the RFA analysis. The translocation of ingested Cd in the obtained maize individuals together with the accumulation of Cd in the different plant parts is shown in Fig. 5D, and it can be observed that the differences between the amount of Cd in the root, stem and leaves are not statistically significant between the analysed groups. Compared to the other plant parts, the highest amount of Cd was accumulated in roots within all groups. A statistically significant reduction in Cd content was observed only in the BC maize flower compared to the control. Also, for BC cobs we observe a reduction in Cd content in fruits and also a reduction in % translocation of Cd to fruits. The translocation of the Cr uptake in the maize specimens obtained and the accumulation in the different plant parts is shown in Fig. 5E, and it can be observed that the difference between the analyzed groups is not statistically significant in any plant part. From the results obtained, it can be assumed that in the soil substrate itself, Cr was mainly represented in the form of Cr(VI), since in the case of the control, 61% of the Cr taken up was transported to the aboveground part. After application of 1% SS and 1% BC, the amount of accumulated Cr in the roots increased statistically insignificantly. For all samples, the highest amount of Cu accumulated was in the roots, with no statistically significant difference between the groups. However, in SS plants we observed that up to 68% of Cu was accumulated in the whole aerial part (Fig. 5F). From the results obtained, it is evident that 1% addition of SS and BC did not have statistically significant effect on the amount of Cu accumulated by plant parts compared to control, but in case of 1% addition of BC, there was a change in Cu translocation in maize plant parts compared to control and SS. We observe a statistically significant increase in the amount of Ni in the stem in BC plants compared to SS and a statistically significant decrease in the amount of Ni in the flowers in SS compared to control. Thus, Ni accumulates in SS and BCS plants mainly in the non-edible parts of the plants, which protects the fruits and seeds from contamination. In the case of BC maize, we observe an overall increase in the amount of Ni uptake into the aboveground part of the maize (Fig. 5G). For our samples, we identified (Fig. 5H) that it was the roots and leaves that accumulated the most Pb, while in the case of roots we did not find a statistically significant difference between the analyzed groups and, on the contrary, in the case of leaves we identified a statistically significant decrease in the amount of Pb in SS plants compared to the control. In the case of corn plant stems, we cannot assess whether there was a statistically significant difference in accumulation, as the amount of Pb in SS plants was below the detection limit of the assay analytical method used (0.1 mg/kg). The translocation of uptake of P in the maize specimens obtained and the accumulation in the different plant parts is shown in Fig. 5I, and we found that there were no statistically significant changes in the roots, leaves, flowers and fruits due to the effect of 1% addition of BC or SS compared to the control. However, in the case of SS plants, there was a statistically significant decrease in the amount of P accumulated in the stem, which is probably the result of increased translocation of P from the stems of SS plants to the fruits, in order to maintain an optimal level of P in the leaves, consumed for photosynthesis. The translocation of uptaken Mn in the obtained maize individuals and the accumulation in the different plant parts is shown in Fig. 5J, and it can be observed that

359

360

361

362

363 364

365

366

367 368

369

370

371

372

373

374

375

376

377

378

379

380

381

382 383

384

385

386

387

388

389

390

391 392

393

394

395

396

397

the 1% addition of BC and neither SS statistically significantly affects the amount of Mn in the stems and roots. However, 1% addition of BC statistically significantly reduced the amount of Mn in leaves compared to the control and also along with 1% addition of SS statistically significantly reduced the amount of Mn in flowers compared to the control.

#### Discussion

399

400

401

402

403 404

405

406

407

408

409

410

411

412

413

414

415

416

417

418

419 420

421

422

423

424

425

426

427

428

429

430

431

432

433

434

435

436

437

438

The obtained pH value of the untreated sludge (7.33) is comparable to the average pH value of sludge from industrial wastewater treatment plants analysed in the work of Kazi et al. (2005). Only a very small increase in the pH value was observed when the sewage sludge was thermochemically treated at a relatively low temperature of 400 °C, which was comparable to the pH increase in the work of Hossain et al. (2011) for pyrolysis treatment of sewage sludge at an analogous temperature. The increase in pH during the pyrolysis treatment of sludge, according to Souza et al. (2021) is due to a decrease in the concentration of functional groups present (e.g., carboxyl and hydroxyl), which are acidic in nature, while the alkalinity of the resulting biochar increases with increasing pyrolysis temperature. Obtained EC values of SS and BC were similar to values found by Souza et al. (2021), according to whom the EC value itself is closely related to the ash content of the analysed material. During the pyrolysis of sludge, the ash content increases, while the solubility of salts and metals in water decreases, and thus the EC value of the material decreases. The authors attribute the decrease in solubility of salts and metal compounds at pyrolysis temperatures above 200 °C to the fixation of K<sup>+</sup>, Ca<sup>2+</sup>, Mg<sup>2+</sup> and PO<sub>4</sub><sup>3-</sup> ions in the mineral fractions, while the mineral content in the analysed material is directly related to the ash content. Sewage sludge contains, according to Wentzel et al. (2002) generally around 25 % ash. In the SS sample, the ash content was 23.59 % and after pyrolysis treatment at 400 °C the ash content of the obtained biochar increased to 50.99 %. The CEC value of biochar depends mainly on the nature of the biomass feedstock and the pyrolysis temperature. Similar results to those obtained in our study for SS and BC samples were also obtained by Figueiredo et al. (2021) according to which the decrease in the CEC of sewage sludge-based biochar prepared at temperatures above 200 °C is due to the elimination of oxygen functional groups on the surface of the produced biochar. The results obtained for C, H, N contents in SS and BC materials correspond with the results of the work of Fachini et al. (2022), who justify the increase of total C in sewage sludge-based biochar by the formation of more stable organic compounds in the resulting solid pyrolysis product due to the reorganization of aliphatic hydrocarbon compounds into aromatic compounds. The H/C ratio is used to indirectly indicate the degree of aromaticity of the resulting biochar, and according to Yuan et al. (2013) the lower the value of this ratio the higher the number of aromatic structures in the obtained material. An increase of N in biochar obtained at pyrolysis temperatures up to 400°C was also found by Figueiredo et al. (2017). The authors justify this fact by the presence of more thermally stable N compounds in the sludge, which do not decompose up to 400°C. The C/N ratio of BC also increased after pyrolysis treatment compared to SS, which corresponds with the results of Figueiro et al. (2017), according to which the increase of C/N in sewage sludge-derived biochar is due to the increase of  $C_{\text{org}}$  in the biochar and the transformation of N into gaseous form. The C/N ratio is used as an indicator of the ability of organic matter to release nitrogen when biochar is used as a soil additive (Jin et al., 2016).

 The total concentrations of extractable PAHs found under the given experimental conditions in both analysed materials meet the limit (6 mg/kg) set for soil additives under the EU Fertiliser Regulation (Regulation 2019/1009 of the European Parliament and of the Council). Our results correspond with the results of Buss et al. (2022), who found naphthalene to be the dominant PAHs structure ( $72 \pm 21$  %) in biochar produced from sewage sludge and lignocellulosic biomass. HPLC analysis of toluene extracts of BC and SS aimed at quantification of methylated hydrocarbons revealed an equally significant representation of 1-methylnaphthalene and 2-methylnaphthalene structures. The methylated hydrocarbons have higher volatility than other PAHs structures, which makes them more dangerous for the environment. The presence of PAHs in BC poses a potential ecotoxicological risk when this material is applied as a soil additive. However, the concentrations of PAHs structures determined by us represent the total, extractable concentrations present in BC and SS under given conditions, and thus are not readily releasable and bioavailable concentrations of PAHs.

According to Chandra and Kumar (2016), the elevated concentration of heavy metals in sludge from distillery WWTPs is due to the corrosive effect of sugarcane juice components as well as the potential addition of metal-containing additives during fermentation and distillation processes. The increase of heavy metals in biochar occurs due to higher boiling temperatures of heavy metals, resulting in a higher mass loss of organic compounds than the mass loss of heavy metals during pyrolysis. Increases in Cd, Cr, Cu, Ni, Pb and Zn after pyrolysis of sewage sludge were also observed by Li et al. (2021). Based on the findings, we conclude that the content of heavy metals and potentially toxic elements in BC is directly related to their content and form in the input precursor, sewage sludge. The obtained values of heavy metals in BC were compared with the limits determined by EBC standards for biochar of EBC classification class - Agro. Based on these limits, the BC sample meets the permissible concentration for As, Cd, Pb. The Cu and Ni contents are three times higher, while the Zn content is almost four times higher than the EBC (2022) limits. According to the findings of He et al. (2010), pyrolysis temperatures above 350 °C leads to higher concentrations of Cd, Pb, Zn, and Cu in sewage sludge-based biochar, but at the same time there is a stabilization in the carbon structure, which reduces their bioavailability to plants. The values obtained for the total concentrations of heavy metals and potentially toxic elements present in the input precursor SS were compared with Annex II of Directive 86/278/EEC, which provides limit values for the concentration of heavy metals in sludges used as soil additives. We found that the heavy metal content of SS complies with the values set out in the Directive, on the basis of which we conclude that untreated SS can be used as a soil additive in terms of heavy metal content. From the point of view of meeting the BC limits, it is inevitable to consider the pre-treatment of the input sludge or the preparation of a mixed precursor based on sludge and other material, which would reduce the overall concentration of elements in the final product.

By RFA analysis, we equally quantified the abundance of heavy metals and potentially toxic elements in the soil substrate used in the outdoor pot experiment under realistic conditions with a

corn. We found that in the soil substrate the elements are represented in the following order in terms of decreasing concentration Fe > Cu > Cr > Zn > Ni > Pb > As > Hg > Cd, with all the values of heavy metals and potentially toxic elements present meeting the limit values for heavy metal concentrations in soil with a pH in the range of 6-7 according to Annex I of Directive 86/278/EEC.

Germination tests confirmed that neither BC nor SS had a negative effect on cress seed germination compared to the control at any of the 3 levels. According to Bouqbis et al. (2016) biochar increases the water holding capacity of the soil thereby positively affecting seed germination. The same results of the three-level ecotoxilogical cotoxicological test were obtained by Buss and Mašek (2014), who investigated the effect of 1%, 2% and 5% biochar addition on seed germination of cress (*Lepidium sativum*) seeds.

The accumulation of heavy metals in earthworm tissues occurs through two mechanisms, namely chemical sorption of soluble forms of metals through the epidermis and digestion (Malińska et al., 2017). The higher weight of individuals in the 1% SS supplemented sample may be due to the higher number of bioavailable forms of heavy metals and nutritionally important elements in SS compared to BC, which accumulate in earthworm tissues, increasing their weight. The increase in earthworm weight in the exposure with 1% addition of SS corresponds with the work of Kniuipyté et al. (2020) who found that low addition of sewage sludge to soil increases earthworm weight as sludge is a source of nutritionally important substances that promote their growth. In general, total heavy metal levels decreased in the control and 1% BC groups in the order Zn > Fe > Cu > Pb > Cd and in the 1% SS group in the order Fe > Zn > Cu > Pb > Cd. On the basis of the experimental data obtained, we can conclude that the pyrolysis treatment of the sewage sludge from the distillery's WWTP, at a temperature of 400 °C, resulted in a multiplication of Fe, Cu, Pb and probably also Cd in the resulting pyrolysis product, but on the other hand, the bioavailable forms of these metals for living organisms were reduced.

The declining trend in plant growth, which is a trend that is, according to Rout et al. (2015) is due to leaf senescence and decrease in leaf area, resulting in reduced assimilation of light energy required for photosynthesis, was observed in our study. From the data obtained, it is evident that the plant height was highest in the substrate enriched with 1% addition of SS followed by plants with 1% addition of BC and the lowest plants were in the control group. According to Ason et al. (2015), root weight is positively correlated with the above ground height of the plants as the root system absorbs water and nutritionally important substances for the stem and leaves, which in turn produce nutrients to maintain the root system. This statement can be confirmed especially in the case of plants enriched with 1% SS addition, as it is clear from the graph (Fig.2A) that the difference in the weight of the biomass of the under-ground part is statistically significant compared to the weight of the biomass of the above-ground part of the plants grown in the substrate with 1% BC addition. The reduction in root system weight due to 1% BC can be attributed to the reduction in root system weight according to Prendergast-Miller et al. (2013) due to fewer and especially thinner root hairs through which the plant absorbs nutrients. The highest plant biomass yield was obtained from the plants of the group with 1% SS addition, which is the highest yield according to Khanmohammadi et al. (2016) due to faster release of bioavailable N from untreated

Formatted: Strikethrough

sewage sludge as opposed to biochar from sewage sludge. The most significant increase in soil pH occurred with 1% BC addition to the soil (7.21), which corresponds with the results of the work of Junior et al. (2023), since biochar generally tends to reduce soil acidity. According to Wang et al. (2020), growing maize reduces the amount of Cinorg in the soil, and the reduction in Cinorg is directly related to the increase in soil pH, as the released Ca<sup>2+</sup> reacts with OH to form alkaline hydroxide. This statement corresponds with the results obtained for the soil from the control group and from the group with 1 % BC addition. In both groups, we observed an increase in pH and a decrease in C<sub>inorg</sub>, with the greatest increase and decrease occurring in the case of soil with 1 % BC addition. In the case of the group with 1% addition of SS, we observed an increase in the amount of C<sub>inorg</sub> in the soil after the end of the experiment, which may be due to the higher amount of C<sub>inorg</sub> in SS compared to BC. The claim by Wu et al. (2010) also corresponds with our findings regarding plant biomass yield, as we observed the highest above-ground plant biomass yield for plants from the 1% SS addition group (Fig. 2A). In terms of soil EC, we found that EC decreases after cultivation of maize, which according to Zhang et al. (2015) due to the growth of microorganisms in the soil. The EC decreased in the order of CONTROL > SS > BC. Based on the results obtained, we hypothesized that the more the EC was reduced the greater the amount of microorganisms would be found in the soil. We verified our assumption by microbiological analysis of soil samples after the experiment.

519

520 521

522

523 524

525

526

527

528

529

530

531 532

533

534

535

536

537

538

539 540

541

542 543

544

545

546

547

548

549

550

551 552

553

554 555

556

557

558

Changes in microbial diversity of soil amended with SS and BC can be discussed in several ways. According to Wang et al. (2020), a reduction in total microbial biomass due to biochar addition can occur if the biochar contains significant amounts of toxic PAH structures and VOCs. As was discussed above, after pyrolysis treatment of sludge, the resulting biochar was enriched in the PAH structure benzo(b)fluoranthene, which according to Yang et al. (2022) has a toxic effect on soil bacteria. A decrease in microbial biomass due to the addition of biochar to sandy soil was also observed by Brtnicky et al. (2019). According to authors, the decrease in microbial biomass may be due to adsorption of nutrients from the soil onto the biochar surface, resulting in reduced nutrient availability to microorganisms. The representation of microbial biomass in soil substrates decreased in the order CONTROL > SS > BC, and the obtained result does not confirm our established assumption regarding the decrease of soil EC due to the increase of microorganisms in the soil. The result obtained corresponds with Yao et al. (2017), who describe that the increase in fungal species variation in biochar-enriched soil can occur due to the improvement in aeration and water-holding capacity of the soil, and these changes favourably affect the habitat of soil fungi and the development of fungal filaments, hyphae. According to Zheng et al. (2016), the increase in fungal species variation by the addition of biochar may also occur due to a decrease in soil bacteria, specifically streptomycetes, which produce antifungal compounds. Higher amounts of fungi in the soil, especially mycorrhizal fungi, can reduce the root-shoot translocation factor of heavy metals in the plant, due to the immobilization of metals by hyphae formed by the fungus in the soil and on the root surface (Gómez-Gallego et al., 2022). Based on this, we hypothesize that in plants from soil enriched with 1% BC addition, a smaller amount of heavy metals will be accumulated in the aboveground part and a larger amount will be accumulated in the root. According to Jamal et al.

(2002), higher number of mycorrhizal fungi in the soil causes a reduction in root weight and branching in cereals, as the fungal hyphae increase the absorption area of nutrients from the soil instead of the root. This statement corresponds with our results, as we found a statistically significant decrease in root weight in BC soil plants, which may be due to an increase in fungal species variability, specifically the occurrence of mycorrhizal fungi in the soil substrate enriched with 1% BC addition. The results of the Venn diagrams (Fig. 4) also indicate that there are no statistically significant changes in the species variation of bacteria and fungi in the soil with 1% SS addition compared to the control, which is in agreement with the results of Hawrot - Paw et al. (2022). However, Hawrot - Paw et al. (2022) found that although there is no increase in the species variability of bacteria and fungi in the soil during maize cultivation due to the impact of the sewage sludge, there is a change in the abundance of bacteria and fungi in the soil. They identified a higher abundance of Bacillus bacteria, which stimulate maize growth, in the soil with a 1% addition of sewage sludge. The probability of these bacteria in our soil samples is high, as Bacillus bacteria are typically found in the root system of maize. Based on this, we hypothesize that their abundance increased in the soil enriched with 1% SS addition and positively influenced maize growth (Fig.2B). Fungi can compete with bacterial community for nutrients sources and therefore create a stress condition and eliminate their abundance.

The translocation of heavy metals and elements in plants is generally provided by conductive plant tissues, xylem and phloem. According to Namdari et al. (2024), maize accumulates a significant fraction of heavy metals in the roots and leaves, and the translocation factor of heavy metals from leaves to corn cobs is low, thereby protecting the seeds from contamination. According to Vymazal and Brezinova (2014), higher concentrations of heavy metals in leaves than in stems are due to detoxification mechanisms of aboveground organs, which involve their complexation or removal from the metabolically active cytoplasm to inactive compartments, especially cell vacuoles and walls. According to them, heavy metals are accumulated in plants mainly in the order R (root) > L (leaf) > S (stem), whereas the amount of metals in leaves and stems is erratic and varies depending on the position on the stem, the length of vegetation and the season. According to Thakur et al. (2016), plants get rid of heavy metals at the end of the growing season just by their accumulation in the leaves, which subsequently fall off due to senescence, thus reducing the concentrations of heavy metals in the plant body.

#### **Conclusions**

Physicochemical characterization of the obtained biochar showed that BC has properties typical for sewage sludge biochar, namely pH  $7.71 \pm 0.02$ ; EC  $1.055 \pm 0.01$  mS/cm; CEC  $55.66 \pm 2.67$  cmol/kg;  $C_{org}$   $36.83 \pm 0.06\%$ ;  $C_{inorg}$   $1.73 \pm 0.06\%$ ; N 6.53%; H 1.89%; ash content 50.99%; and in terms of PAHs content of the structures, it meets the limiting concentrations (<6 mg/kg) prescribed by the EU fertilizer regulation, making it safe for land application. From the obtained results of RFA analysis of heavy metal content in BC and SS, we found that pyrolysis treatment results in multiplication of heavy metals in the obtained biochar compared to untreated sewage sludge, while the concentrations of Cu, Ni and Zn in BC exceed the permissible limits set by the EBC for biochar

of classification class EBC - Agro. The determined heavy metals were represented in BC in the order Fe > Zn > Cu > Ni > Cr > Pb > Hg > Cd = As. In ecotoxicological tests with a cress seeds and earthworms, we demonstrated that there are no statistically significant changes in seed germination in a biochar-based sludge environment, but there is an increased accumulation of Zn and Cu in the tissues of soil giant nematodes, which may pose a risk in terms of transfer of elements to other levels of the food chains of higher organisms. However, we confirmed by an outdoor pot experiment using corn that although there was multiplication of heavy elements in the obtained BC, a 1% addition of BC statistically significantly increased only the concentration of Ni in the plant stem compared to SS, but there was no statistically significant increase of Ni in the corn husk compared to the control. In addition, a 1% addition of BC decreases Cd concentration in flowers and Mn concentration in leaves and flowers compared to the control. In the case of heavy metal accumulation in plant weeds, despite the increased heavy metal content of BC, we rather observed a decrease in the amount of selected heavy metals and nutritionally important elements accumulated in maize weeds, which although was not statistically significant but we assume that we would observe more statistically significant differences at the increased application rate. The application rate was chosen to assess the safety of using the obtained biochar as a soil additive in arable land, and not to assess the ability of the obtained biochar to immobilize heavy metals in contaminated soil. The analyzed heavy metals were accumulated in plants mostly in roots and leaves, which is a consequence of the defence mechanisms of plants against contamination of generative parts by heavy metals. Addition of BC, among others, statistically significantly reduced the total amount of microbial biomass in the soil, while increasing fungal species variability, resulting in increased P availability to plants due to the presence of a higher amount of fungal hyphae compared to SS. Based on all the results obtained, we conclude that the biochar obtained from the sewage sludge of the distillery's WWTP represents a promising material that, after optimization of the pyrolysis process and pretreatment of the input precursor in order to meet the criteria imposed for ecotoxicological safety, can serve as a soil additive and a source of nutritionally important elements.

### **Acknowledgements**

Authors are thankful to employees of Enviral a.s. Leopolpov for sludge feedstock providing.

## References

599

600 601

602

603

604

605

606

607

608 609

610

611 612

613

614 615

616

617

618

619 620

621

622 623

624 625

626 627

628

629 630 631

632

- **Ason B, Ababio FO, Boateng E, Yangyouru M. 2015.** Comparative Growth Response of Maize on Amended Sediment from the Odaw River and Cultivated Soil. *World journal of Agricultural Research* **3**:143-147. DOI 10.12691/wjar-3-4-5.
- Bouqbis L, Daoud S, Koyro HW, Kammann CI, Ainlhout LFZ, Harrouni MC. 2016. Biochar
  from argan shells: production and characterization. *International Journal of Recycling of Organic* Waste in Agriculture 5:361–365 DOI 10.1007/s40093-016-0146-2.

- 638 Brtnicky M, Dokulilova T, Holatko J, Pecina V, Kintl A, Latal O, Vyhnanek T, Prichystalova
- 639 J, Datta R. 2019. Long-Term Effects of Biochar-Based Organic Amendments on Soil Microbial
- 640 Parameters. *Agronomy* **9:**747 DOI 10.3390/agronomy9110747.
- Buss W, Mašek O. 2014. Mobile organic compounds in biochar A potential source of
- 642 contamination Phytotoxic effects on cress seed (Lepidium sativum) germination. Journal of
- 643 Environmental Management 137:111-119 DOI 10.1016/j.jenvman.2014.01.045.
- 644 Buss W, Hilber I, Graham MC, Mašek O. 2022. Composition of PAHs in Biochar and
- $\textbf{645} \qquad \textbf{Implications for Biochar Production.} \textit{ Sustainable Chemistry \& Engineering } \textbf{10:} 6755-6765 \ DOI$
- 646 10.1021/acssuschemeng.2c00952.
- 647 Chandra R, Kumar V. 2016. Phytoextraction of heavy metals by potential native plants and their
- 648 microscopic observation of root growing on stabilised distillery sludge as a prospective tool for in
- 649 situ phytoremediation of industrial waste. Environmental Science and Pollution Research
- 650 **24**:2605–2619 DOI 10.1007/s11356-016-8022-1.
- 651 Chen F, Hu Y, Dou X, Chen D, Dai X. 2015. Chemical forms of heavy metals in pyrolytic char
- of heavy metalimplanted sewage sludge and their impacts on leaching behaviors. *Journal of*
- 653 Analytical and Applied Pyrolysis 116:152–160 DOI 10.1016/j.jaap.2015.09.015.
- **Directive 86/278/EEC** Council of the European Union. COUNCIL DIRECTIVE of 12 June 1986
- on the protection of the environment, and in particular of the soil, when sewage sludge is used in
- 656 agriculture, Offical Journal of the European Communities § (1986). Retrieved from
- 657 http://data.europa.eu/eli/dir/1986/278/oj.
- 658 EBC (2022) 'European Biochar Certificate Guidelines for a Sustainable Production of Biochar.
- 659 Carbon Standards International (CSI), Frick, Switzerland. Online available :http://european-
- 660 biochar.org. Version 10.2. (8. Dec 2022).
- **Fachini J, Figueiredo CC. 2022.** Pyrolysis of Swage Sludge: Physical, Chemical, Morphological
- and Mineralogical Transformations. Brazilian Archives of Biology and Technology 65:e22210592
- 663 DOI 10.1590/1678-4324-2022210592
- 664 Figueiredo C, Lopes H, Coser T, Vale A, Busato J, Aguiar N. 2017. Influence of pyrolysis
- temperature on chemical and physical properties of biochar from sewage sludge. Archives of
- 666 Agronomy and Soil Science 64:881–889 DOI 10.1080/03650340.2017.1407870.
- 667 Figueiredo CC, Reis ASPJ, Araujo AS, Blum LEB, Shah K, Paz-Ferreiro J. 2021. Assessing
- 668 the potential of sewage sludge-derived biochar as a novel phosphorus fertilizer: Influence of
- 669 extractant solutions and pyrolysis temperatures. Waste Management. 124:144-153 DOI
- 670 10.1016/j.wasman.2021.01.044.
- 671 Frišták V, Pipíška M, Horník M, Augustín J, Lesný J. 2013. Sludge of wastewater treatment
- plants as  $Co^{2+}$  ions sorbent. Chemical Papers 67:265–273 DOI 10.2478/s11696-012-0244-1.
- 673 Frišták V, Bošanská D, Pipíška M, Ďuriška L, Bell SM, Soja G. 2022. Physicochemical
- 674 Characterization of Cherry Pits-Derived Biochar. *Materials* **15**:408 DOI 10.3390/ma15020408.
- 675 Gao N, Quan C, Liu B, Li Z, Wu C, Li A. 2017. Continuous Pyrolysis of Sewage Sludge in a
- 676 Screw-Feeding Reactor: Products Characterization and Ecological Risk Assessment of Heavy
- 677 Metals. *Energy & Fuels* 31:5063–5072 DOI 10.1021/acs.energyfuels.6b031.
- 678 Gómez-Gallego T, Valderas A, Tuinen D, Ferrol, N. 2022. Impact of arbuscular mycorrhiza on
- 679 maize P1B-ATPases gene expression and ionome in copper-contaminated soils. Ecotoxicology and
- 680 Environmental Safety 234:113390 DOI 10.1016/j.ecoenv.2022.113390.
- 681 Hawrot -Paw M, Mikiciuk M, Koniuszy A, Meller E. 2022. Influence of Organomineral
- 682 Fertiliser from Sewage Sludge on Soil Microbiome and Physiological Parameters of Maize (Zea
- 683 mays L.). Agronomy 12:1114 DOI 10.3390/agronomy12051114.

- 684 He YD, Zhai YB, Li CT, Yang F, Chen L, Fan XP. 2010. The fate of Cu, Zn, Pb and Cd during
- the pyrolysis of sewage sludge at different temperatures. *Environmental Technology*. 31:567–574.
- 686 DOI 10.1080/09593330903514466.
- 687 Hilber I, Mayer P, Gouliarmou V, Hale SE, Cornelissen G, Schmidt HP, Bucheli TD. 2017.
- Bioavailability and bioaccessibility of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons from (post-pyrolytically
- 689 treated) biochars. Chemosphere 174:700-707 DOI 10.1016/j.chemosphere.2017.02.014.
- 690 Hossain MK, Strezov V, Chan KY, Ziolkowski A, Nelson PF. 2011. Influence of pyrolysis
- 691 temperature on production and nutrient properties of wastewater sludge biochar. Journal of
- 692 Environmental Management 92:223–228 DOI 10.1016/j.jenvman.2010.09.008.
- 693 Irfan M, Mudassir M, Khan MJ, Dawar KM, Muhammad D, Mian IA, Ali W, Fahad S, Saud S,
- Hayat Z, Nawaz T, Khan SA, Alam S, Ali B, Banout J, Ahmed S, Mubeen S, Danish S, Datta
  R, Elgorban AM, Dewil R. 2021. Heavy metals immobilization and improvement in maize (*Zea*
- 696 mays L.) growth amended with biochar and compost. Scintific Reports 11:18416. DOI
- 697 10.1038/s41598-021-97525-8.
- 698 Jamal A, Ayub N, Usman M, Khan AG. 2002. Arbuscular Mycorrhizal Fungi Enhance Zinc
- and Nickel Uptake from Contaminated Soil by Soybean and Lentil. International Journal of
- 700 *Phytoremediation.* **4**:205–221 DOI 10.1080/15226510208500083.
- Jin J, Li Y, Zhang J, Wu S, Cao Y, Liang P, Zhang J, Wong MH, Wang M, Shan S, Christie
- 702 P. 2016. Influence of pyrolysis temperature on properties and environmental safety of heavy
- metals in biochars derived from municipal sewage sludge. *Journal of Hazardous Materials* **320**:417–426 DOI 10.1016/j.jhazmat.2016.08.050.
- Junior A, Guo M. 2023. Efficacy of sewage sludge derived biochar on enhancing soil health and
- 706 crop productivity in strongly acidic soil. Frontiers in Soil Science 3:1066547
- 707 10.3389/fsoil.2023.1066547.
- 708 Kazi T, Jamali MK, Kazi GH, Arain MB Afridi HI, Siddiqui A. 2005. Evaluating the Mobility
- 709 of Toxic Metals in Untreated Industrial Wastewater Sludge Using a BCR Sequential Extraction
- 710 Procedure and a Leaching Test. Analytical and Bioanalytical Chemistry. 383:297-304 DOI
- 711 10.1007/s00216-005-0004-y.
- 712 Khanmohammadi Z, Afyuni M, Mosaddeghi MR. 2016. Effect of sewage sludge and its biochar
- 713 on chemical properties of two calcareous soils and maize shoot yield. Archives of Agronomy and
- 714 Soil Science 63:198–212. doi:10.1080/03650340.2016.1210787.
- 715 Kniuipyté I, Praspaliauskas M, Žaltauskaité J, Dikšaityté A. 2020. Bioremediation Efficiency
- 716 of Heavy Metal Contaminated Soil Using Earthworm Eisenia Fetida. 11th International
- 717 Conference "Environmental Engineering" DOI 10.3846/enviro.2020.593.
- 718 Li J, Yu G, Xie S, Pan L, Li C, You F, Wang Y. 2018. Immobilization of heavy metals in
- 719 ceramsite produced from sewage sludge biochar. Science of The Total Environment 628:131-140
- 720 DOI 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.02.036.
- 721 Li B, Ding S, Fan H, Ren Y. 2021. Experimental Investigation into the Effect of Pyrolysis on
- 722 Chemical Forms of Heavy Metals in Sewage Sludge Biochar (SSB), with Brief Ecological Risk
- 723 Assessment. *Materials* **14**:447 DOI 10.3390/ma14020447.
- 724 Lu T, Yuan H, Wang Y, Huang H, Chen Y. 2016. Characteristic of heavy metals in biochar
- derived from sewage sludge. Journal of Material Cycles and Waste Management 18:725–733
- 726 DOI 10.1007/s10163-015-0366-y.
- 727 Malińska K, Galańska M, Caceres R, Rorat A. 2017. Biochar amendment for integrated
- 728 composting and vermicomposting of sewage sludge The effect of biochar on the activity of
- 729 Eisenia fetida and the obtained vermicompost. Bioresource Technology 225:206-214 DOI
- 730 10.1016/j.biortech.2016.11.049.

- 731 Manara P, Zabaniotou A. 2012. Towards sewage sludge based biofuels via thermochemical
- 732 conversion A review. Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews 16:2566-2582 DOI
  733 10.1016/j.rser.2012.01.074.
- 734 Namdari M, Soleimani M, Mirghaffari N, Kharrazi SM. 2024. Effect of biological sewage
- 735 sludge and its derived biochar on accumulation of potentially toxic elements by corn (Zea mays
- 736 L.). Scientific Reports 14:5985 DOI 10.1038/s41598-024-56652-8.
- 738 Praspaliauskas M, Pedišius N, Striugas N. 2018. Elemental Migration and Transformation from
- 739 Sewage Sludge to Residual Products during the Pyrolysis Process. *Energy & Fuels* **32**:5199–5208
- 740 DOI 10.1021/acs.energyfuels.8b00196.

- 741 Prendergast-Miller MT, Duvall M, Sohi SP. 2013. Biochar-root interactions are mediated by
- biochar nutrient content and impacts on soil nutrient availability. European Journal of Soil
  Science. 65:173–185 DOI 10.1111/ejss.12079.
- Regulation (EU) 2019/1009 of the European Parliament and of the Council of 5 June 2019 laying
- 745 down rules on the making available on the market of EU fertilising products and amending
- Regulations (EC) No 1069/2009 and (EC) No 1107/2009 and repealing Regulation (EC) No
- 747 2003/2003; Commission Delegated Regulation of 2021-07-07 amending Annexes II, III and IV to
- 748 regulation (EU) No 2019/1009 for the purpose of adding pyrolysis and gasification materials as a
- 749 component material category in EU fertilizing products. <a href="https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-">https://eur-lex.europa.eu/legal-</a>
- 750 content/EN/TXT/PDF/?uri=CELEX:32021R2088
- 751 **Rout GR, Sahoo S. 2015.** Role of iron in plant growth and metabolism. *Reviews in Agricultural*
- 752 *Science* **3**:1–24. DOI 10.7831/ras.3.1.
- 753 Rumaihi AA, Shahbaz M, Mckay G, Mackey H, Al-Ansari T. 2022. A review of pyrolysis
- technologies and feedstock: A blending approach for plastic and biomass towards optimum biochar yield. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews.* **167**:112715 DOI 10.1016/j.rser.2022.112715.
- 756 Souza CS, Bomfim MR, Almeida MC, Alves LS, Santana WN, Amorim ICS, Santos JAG.
- 757 2021. Induced changes of pyrolysis temperature on the physicochemical traits of sewage sludge
- 758 and on the potential ecological risks. *Scientific Reports* **11**:974 DOI 10.1038/s41598-020-79658-759 4.
- 760 Thakur S, Singh L, Wahid ZA, Siddiqui MF, Atnaw SM, Din MFM. 2016. Plant-driven
- 761 removal of heavy metals from soil: uptake, translocation, tolerance mechanism, challenges, and
- future perspectives. Environmental Monitoring and Assessment 188:206 DOI 10.1007/s10661-
- **763** 016-5211-9.
- 764 Vymazal J, Březinová T. 2014. Heavy metals in plants in constructed and natural wetlands:
- 765 concentration, accumulation and seasonality. Water Science and Technology 71:268–276. DOI
- 766 10.2166/wst.2014.507.
- 767 Wan J, Feng X, Li B, Wang M, Tang X, Chen J, Rong J, Ma S, Jiang Y, Zhang Z. 2024.
- 768 Effects of carbonization temperature and time on the characteristics of carbonized sludge. Water
- 769 Science & Technology. **89**:2342-2366. DOI 10.1016/j.apsoil.2020.103570.
- 770 Wang D, Felice ML, Scow KM. 2020. Impacts and interactions of biochar and biosolids on
- agricultural soil microbial communities during dry and wet-dry cycles. Applied Soil Ecology
- 772 **152**:103570 DOI 10.1016/j.apsoil.2020.103570.
- 773 Wentzel MC, Ubisi MF, Lakay MT, Ekama GA. 2002. Incorporation of inorganic material in
- 774 anoxic/aerobicactivated sludge system mixed liquor. Water Research 36:5074-5082 DOI
- 775 10.1016/S0043-1354(02)00053-2.

- 776 Wu C, Zhang H, He P, Shao L. 2010. Thermal stabilization of chromium slag by sewage sludge:
- 777 Effects of sludge quantity and temperature. Journal of Environmental Sciences. 22:1110-1115
- 778 DOI 10.1016/s1001-0742(09)60225-4.
- 779 Xiao Y, Raheem A, Ding L, Chen WH, Chen X, Wang F, Lin SL. 2022. Pretreatment,
- 780 modification and applications of sewage sludge-derived biochar for resource recovery- A review.
- 781 Chemosphere. **287**:131969 DOI 10.1016/j.chemosphere.2021.131969.
- 782 Yang ZN, Liu ZS, Wang KH, Liang ZL, Abdugheni R, Huang Y, Wang RH, Ma HL, Wang
- 783 XK, Yang ML, Zhang BG, Li DF, Jiang CY, Corvini PFX, Liu SJ. 2022. Soil microbiomes
- divergently respond to heavy metals and polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons in contaminated industrial sites. *Environmental Science and Ecotechnology* **10**:100169 DOI
- industrial sites. Environmental Science and Ecotech10.1016/j.ese.2022.100169.
- 787 Yao Q, Liu J, Yu Z, Li Y, Jin J, Liu X, Wang G. 2017. Three years of biochar amendment alters
- 788 soil physiochemical properties and fungal community composition in a black soil of northeast
  789 China. Soil Biology and Biochemistry. 110:56–67. DOI 10.1016/j.soilbio.2017.03.005.
- 790 Yuan H, Lu T, Zhao D, Huang H, Noriyuki K, Chen Y. 2013. Influence of temperature on
- 791 product distribution and biochar properties by municipal sludge pyrolysis. *Journal of Material*
- 792 *Cycles and Waste Management* **15**:357-361 DOI 10.1007/s10163-013-0126-9.
- 793 Zhang J, Lü F, Zhang H, Shao L, Chen D, He P. 2015. Multiscale visualization of the structural
  794 and characteristic changes of sewage sludge biochar oriented towards potential agronomic and
- 795 environmental implication. *Scintific Reports* 5:9406 DOI https://doi.org/10.1038/srep09406.
- 796 Zheng J, Chen J, Pan G, Liu X, Zhang X, Li L, Bian R, Cheng K, Zheng J. 2016. Biochar 797 decreased microbial metabolic quotient and shifted community composition four years after a
- single incorporation in a slightly acid rice paddy from southwest China. *Science of The Total Environment* **571**:206–217 DOI 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.07.1.
- 800 **Zhou K, Yang, Y, Liu B, Tian G, Jiang Z, Bian B. 2023.** Waste to worth: A new approach to
- 801 treat wastewater sludge. Separation and Purification Technology 305:122412 DOI
- 802 10.1016/j.seppur.2022.122412.