# Peer

### Improvement of morphophysiological and anatomical attributes of plants under abiotic stress conditions using plant growth-promoting bacteria and safety treatments

Wasimah Buraykan Alshammari<sup>1</sup>, Kholoud Alshammery<sup>1</sup>, Salwa Lotfi<sup>1</sup>, Haya Altamimi<sup>1</sup>, Abeer Alshammari<sup>1</sup>, Nadi Awad Al-Harbi<sup>2</sup>, Dragana Jakovljević<sup>3</sup>, Mona Hajed Alharbi<sup>4</sup>, Moustapha Eid Moustapha<sup>5</sup>, Diaa Abd El-Moneim<sup>6</sup> and Khaled Abdelaal<sup>7</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Department of Biology, College of Science, University of Hail, Hail, Saudi Arabia

- <sup>2</sup> Biology Department, University College of Tayma, University of Tabuk, Tabuk, Saudi Arabia
- <sup>3</sup> Department of Biology and Ecology, Faculty of Science, University of Kragujevac, Kragu-jevac, Serbia
- <sup>4</sup> Department of Biology, College of Scince and Humanities in Al-Kharj, Prince Sattam bin Abdulaziz University, Al-Kharj, Saudi Arabia
- <sup>5</sup> Department of Chemistry, College of Science and Humanities in Al-Kharj, Prince Sattam bin Abdulaziz University, Al-Kharj, Saudi Arabia
- <sup>6</sup> Department of Plant Production (Genetic Branch), Faculty of Environmental Agricultural Sciences, Arish University, El-Arish, Egypt
- <sup>7</sup> EPCRS Excellence Center, Plant Pathology and Biotechnology Lab, Faculty of Agriculture, Kafrelsheikh University, Kafrelsheikh, Egypt

#### ABSTRACT

Drought and salinity are the major abiotic stress factors negatively affecting the morphophysiological, biochemical, and anatomical characteristics of numerous plant species worldwide. The detrimental effects of these environmental factors can be seen in leaf and stem anatomical structures including the decrease in thickness of cell walls, palisade and spongy tissue, phloem and xylem tissue. Also, the disintegration of grana staking, and an increase in the size of mitochondria were observed under salinity and drought conditions. Drought and salt stresses can significantly decrease plant height, number of leaves and branches, leaf area, fresh and dry weight, or plant relative water content (RWC%) and concentration of photosynthetic pigments. On the other hand, stress-induced lipid peroxidation and malondialdehyde (MDA) production, electrolyte leakage (EL%), and production of reactive oxygen species (ROS) can increase under salinity and drought conditions. Antioxidant defense systems such as catalase, peroxidase, glutathione reductase, ascorbic acid, and gammaaminobutyric acid are essential components under drought and salt stresses to protect the plant organelles from oxidative damage caused by ROS. The application of safe and eco-friendly treatments is a very important strategy to overcome the adverse effects of drought and salinity on the growth characteristics and yield of plants. It is shown that treatments with plant growth-promoting bacteria (PGPB) can improve morphoanatomical characteristics under salinity and drought stress. It is also shown that yeast extract, mannitol, proline, melatonin, silicon, chitosan,  $\alpha$ -Tocopherols (vitamin E), and biochar alleviate the negative effects of drought and salinity stresses

Submitted 12 February 2024 Accepted 1 April 2024 Published 30 April 2024

Corresponding authors Diaa Abd El-Moneim, dabdelmoniem@aru.edu.eg Khaled Abdelaal, khaled.elhaies@gmail.com

Academic editor Imren Kutlu

Additional Information and Declarations can be found on page 14

DOI 10.7717/peerj.17286

Copyright 2024 Alshammari et al.

Distributed under Creative Commons CC-BY 4.0

OPEN ACCESS

through the ROS scavenging resulting in the improvement of plant attributes and yield of the stressed plants. This review discusses the role of safety and eco-friendly treatments in alleviating the harmful effects of salinity and drought associated with the improvement of the anatomical, morphophysiological, and biochemical features in plants.

Subjects Agricultural Science, Genetics, Genomics, Molecular Biology, Plant Science Keywords PGPB, Salinity, Drought, Economic plants, ROS, Antioxidant enzymes

### INTRODUCTION

Plants face many abiotic stresses including drought (Khaffagy et al., 2022; El Sabagh et al., 2019; Abdelaal et al., 2021a), heat (Soliman et al., 2018; Farooq et al., 2017), and salinity (El-Banna & Abdelaal, 2018; Alnusairi et al., 2021; Helaly et al., 2017) that limit yield and productivity. The adverse effects of drought can be observed in morphological characteristics like leaf number and plant height in different plant species including barley (Abdelaal et al., 2020a), faba bean (Abdelaal, 2015a), pea (Arafa et al., 2021), and sugar beet plants (AlKahtani et al., 2021a). The negative effects on physiological features, such as concentrations of chlorophyll and carotenoids were observed in barley (Hafez et al., 2020a; Hafez et al., 2020b) and maize (Abdelaal et al., 2017). Production of reactive oxygen species (ROS) was increased significantly due to drought conditions among which hydrogen peroxide and superoxide are the main types of reactive oxygen species recorded in drought-stressed plants (Abdelaal, Mazrou & Hafez, 2020; Abdelaal et al., 2022a). The decrease in chlorophyll concentrations and relative water content was noticeable under water deficit conditions in faba bean plants (Abdelaal, 2015a) and heat conditions in tomato plants (Elkelish et al., 2020). Additionally, the decreases in the content of chlorophyll and fatty acids, as well as the photosystem II efficiency were recorded as a response mechanism to stress (Soliman et al., 2018). Farooq et al. (2017) reported that the activity of antioxidant enzymes and the photosynthesis process of chickpea plants were negatively affected under heat-stress conditions.

In addition to drought, salinity is one of the most harmful abiotic stress factors that negatively affect morphological and physiological characteristics in various economically important plants including rice plants (*Hafez et al., 2020a*; *Hafez et al., 2020b*), faba bean (*El-Flaah et al., 2021*; *Abdelaal et al., 2021b*), pea plants (*Abdelaal, Mazrou & Hafez, 2022*), and sweet pepper plants (*ALKahtani et al., 2020*). The oxidative damage can be seen in salt-stressed plants, and this is associated with the production of malondialdehyde (MDA) and ROS, particularly superoxide, and hydrogen peroxide (*Al-Shammari, Altamimi & Abdelaal, 2023*). Many studies were conducted to find suitable and safe compounds and methods to improve plant growth and yield under various stress conditions. The application of plant growth-promoting bacteria (PGPB) is among the most significant methods to overcome oxidative stress and improve plant growth (*Abdelaal, 2015b*; *Yadav et al., 2017; Kour et al., 2020*). *Azospirillum, Paenibacillus, Pseudomonas, Bacillus, Azotobacter,* and *Rhizobium* are the most common genera used to improve plant growth under both natural and

stressful conditions. The significant role of PGPB could be attributed to the production of compounds such as siderophores, phytohormones, and antibiotics (*Çakmakçi et al., 2006*). Inoculation of *Pseudomonas fluorescens* and *Azospirillum brasilense* caused an increase in the growth characteristics of *Urochloa* spp. (*Hungria et al., 2021*). Additionally, the application of safety compounds such as silicon, chitosan, and melatonin improved several plants' growth characteristics. *Abdelaal et al. (2021c)* reported that applying chitosan led to the improvement of morphological and physiological attributes of garlic plants under drought-stress conditions. Also, *Al-Shammari, Altamimi & Abdelaal (2023)* found an increase in seed yield and improvement in physiological features of pea plants with the application of nano silica and melatonin under salinity stress conditions. Antioxidant metabolism and the physiological traits of the salt-stressed lettuce plants were improved with the application of silicon and *Bacillus thuringiensis (AlKahtani et al., 2021a*). The present work aims to summarize the pivotal role of various PGPB and eco-friendly treatments as a promising strategy to alleviate drought and salinity's negative impacts and the yield and production of economically important plants under stressful conditions.

#### Intended audience

The abiotic stress factors are significant for the researchers and broader audience because of the harmful effects of these factors on agricultural production and sustainable development. Our review is essential for researchers in plant breeding for abiotic stress, plant physiology, and genetics.

#### Survey methodology

We have checked about 480 articles and book chapters in this field to achieve our aim and introduce the recent information and results to the researchers and audience. We used search engines like Web of Science and PubMed. The date range searched was between 1999 and 2023. We focused on the manuscripts and book chapters that summarize the pivotal role of various PGPB and eco-friendly treatments as a promising strategy to alleviate the negative impacts of drought and salinity and increase plant yield and production under stressful conditions.

### EFFECT OF DROUGHT STRESS ON MORPHOPHYSIOLOGI-CAL AND BIOCHEMICAL CHARACTERISTICS OF PLANTS

**Effect of drought stress on morphological characteristics of plants** The growth characteristics of plants can be significantly affected by drought stress (*Abdelaal et al.*, 2022*b*). This is a serious threat to agricultural production (*Abdelaal et al.*, 2021*d*) since can affect all stages of plant growth and development, including germination, seedling growth, and yield (*Elkoca et al.*, 2007; *Kaya et al.*, 2006). As mentioned, the reduction in leaf number, leaf area, and plant height was recorded in many plants under drought stress, including faba bean plants (*Abdelaal*, 2015*a*), barley (*Abdelaal et al.*, 2018; *Abdelaal et al.*, 2020*b*) and wheat (*Kutlu et al.*, 2021). Similar effects of drought were recorded in sugar beet (*Abdelaal*, 2015*b*) and wheat (*Abdelaal et al.*, 2021*d*). Additionally, the decrease in fresh and dry weight is a common negative effect under drought stress conditions (*Abdelaal et al.*,

Treatments	Improved morphological characters under drought stress conditions	Plant species	References
Proline	Increase leaves number	Sugar beet	AlKahtani et al. (2021a)
Silicon	Improve root yield	Sugar beet	AlKahtani et al. (2021a)
Proline	Increase water availability	Faba bean	Al-Shammari, Altamimi & Abdelaal (2023)
Yeast extract	Increase yield	Garlic	Abdelaal et al. (2021c)
Mannitol	Improve growth characters	Wheat	<i>Abebe et al. (2003)</i>
$K_2SiO_3$	Improve shoots number, shoot length, roots number and survival percentage	Banana	Aziz et al. (2023)
Silicon	Improve fresh weight, dry weight, leaf area, and root length	Coriander	Mahmoud et al. (2023)
Biochar	Increase plant height, root dry weight and root diame- ter	Okra	Jabborova et al. (2021)
Biochar	Improve growth characters and yield	Tomato	Usman et al. (2023)
Chitosan	Increase plant height, number of seeds per spike, num- ber of spikes and grain yield	Wheat	Jahanbani et al. (2023)
Azotobacter vinelandii, + Pseudomonas putida	Increased germination indices, dry weight, stem length, and root length	Festuca ovina	Rigi, Saberi & Ebrahimi (2023)

Table 1 Application of safety compounds to improve the morphological characteristics of economic plants under drought stress conditions.

2018) observed in many plants (*AlKahtani et al., 2021a*; *Galal et al., 2023*). Previous studies showed that water deficit caused significant decreases in morphological characteristics of faba bean and maize plants (*Abdelaal, 2015a*; *Abdelaal et al., 2017*). Moreover, a significant decrease in leaf area, plant height, and number of leaves per plant in pea was observed during two seasons under drought conditions. Also, pod number and dry weight of 100 seeds decreased significantly in drought-stressed pea plants (*Arafa et al., 2021*). In recent years many studies have been implemented to overcome the negative effects of drought stress on the morphological characters in plants (Table 1).

# Effect of PGPB and safety treatments on morphological characteristics of plants under drought conditions

The harmful effects of drought stress can be alleviated with the application of safety treatments and compounds such as PGPB, yeast extract, mannitol, melatonin, silicon, trehalose, chitosan,  $\alpha$ -Tocopherols (vitamin E) or biochar (Table 1). In sugar beet plants, the application of silicon and proline improved leaf number, root fresh weight, and root yield under water deficit conditions (*Abdelaal et al., 2017*). *Abdelaal et al. (2021a*), *Abdelaal et al. (2021b*), *Abdelaal et al. (2021c*), *Abdelaal et al. (2021d*) and *Abdelaal et al. (2021e*) reported that yeast extract significantly increased garlic yield under drought conditions and increased the number of leaves, leaf area, and flowers per plant in both seasons (*Arafa et al., 2021*). Biochar treatments may play a significant role in the enhancement of morphological features under drought stress conditions since this treatment led to improved plant height and branch number of drought-stressed barley plants (*Abdelaal et al., 2022b*). In the experiments of *AlKahtani et al. (2021a*), significant

decreases in morphological characteristics under water deficit stress conditions were shown. However, the application of salicylic acid led to the improvement of morphological characteristics and the overcoming of drought stress negative effects. Furthermore, the application of yeast extract caused a significant improvement in the morphological characteristics of maize plants under water deficit conditions (*Abdelaal et al., 2017*). In experiments with wheat, exogenously application of yeast extract and ascorbic acid led to the improve the plant height and leaves number under water deficit (*Abdelaal et al., 2021d*).

### Effect of drought stress on physiological and biochemical characteristic of plants

Antioxidant enzymes are a very important sign of drought stress conditions. In this context, *Abdelaal et al. (2021c)* reported that drought stress affects antioxidant enzyme activity, photosynthetic parameters, and relative water content in stressed garlic plants. Additionally, electrolyte leakage, and concentration of  $H_2O_2$ , and  $O_2$ - were significantly higher in garlic plants under drought conditions (*Abdelaal et al., 2021c*). Furthermore, concentrations of chlorophyll a and chlorophyll b, and relative water content of pea plants significantly decreased under drought stress conditions (*Arafa et al., 2021*). On the other hand,  $O_2$ - and  $H_2O_2$  levels significantly increased in pea plants under drought stress. The maize plants exposed to water deficit stress showed that water deficit led to significant decreases in chlorophyll content in the stressed plants compared to control, whereas electrolyte leakage and MDA content significantly increased. Furthermore, a significant decrease in antioxidant compounds and protein was recorded in maize plants under water-deficit conditions (*Abdelaal et al., 2017*), while drought-stressed barley plants showed significant decreases in photosynthesis, relative water content, and water uptake (*Hafez et al., 2020; Hafez et al., 2020b*).

# Effect of PGPB and safety compounds on physiological and biochemical characteristics of plants under drought conditions

Several studies were conducted to improve plants' growth and physiological features under water deficit stress conditions (Table 2). Yeast extract significantly improved antioxidant enzyme activity and relative water content and decreased ROS in garlic plants under drought conditions. Additionally, garlic's physiological and biochemical characteristics were improved with chitosan treatment under drought conditions, including relative water content and photosynthetic parameters (*Abdelaal et al., 2021c*). Furthermore, the number of seeds per pod, pod length, and dry weight of 100 seeds of pea plants were significantly increased with the application of carrot extract under drought stress conditions (*Arafa et al., 2021*). Also, *Bacillus thuringiensis* treatment improved the biochemical characteristics of pea plants such as chlorophyll a, chlorophyll b, relative water content, and decreased  $O_{2-}$  and  $H_2O_2$  under drought conditions. The carrot extract can be very significantly improve plant growth and development by increasing plant height, leaf area, and number of leaves in pea plants. The positive impacts of carrot extract were also recorded on the physiological features of faba bean plants under drought conditions (*Kasim, Nessem & Gaber, 2019*).

The application of biochar led to an increase in chlorophyll a and b content, relative water content, and antioxidant compound activity in barley plants under drought-stress conditions (Hafez et al., 2020a; Hafez et al., 2020b). Under water deficit conditions, PGPB can be used to enhance the morphophysiological and biochemical characteristics via phosphorus solubilization, nitrogen uptake, and the availability of essential nutrients (Kasim, Nessem & Gaber, 2019; Ghosh, Gupta & Mohapatra, 2019). Treatment with PGPB such as Serratia spp. (Heinrichs et al., 2009), Azoarcus sp., Pseudomonas spp. (Egener, Hurek & Reinhold-Hurek, 1999; Igiehon & Babalola, 2021; Sandhya et al., 2010; Zahir et al., 2009), and *Rhizobium* spp. led to better morphophysiological features and yield of several plants (Table 2). Furthermore, the application of Azospirillum gave the best results regarding the drought tolerance of maize plants (García et al., 2017). The positive role of PGPB could be attributed to the improvement of water accessibility and antioxidant components as well as the production of osmoprotectants which improve plant growth under drought conditions. Meenakshi et al. (2019) stated that Bacillus thuringiensis, Bacillus subtilis, and Bacillus megaterium treatments significantly increased chlorophyll content in stressed plants. The useful effects of PGPB under stressful conditions might be due to the formation of osmolytes and the improvement of the antioxidant system.

### EFFECT OF SALT STRESS ON MORPHOLOGICAL, PHYSIOLOGICAL AND BIOCHEMICAL CHARACTERISTICS OF PLANTS

#### Effect of salt stress on morphological characteristics

Under salinity conditions, plants display many variations and changes in all developmental stages. Salinity stress significantly decreases plant height, number of leaves, and leaf area in stressed plants such as calendula (*El-Shawa, Rashwan & Abdelaal, 2022*), sweet basil, and pea plants (*Jakovljević et al., 2017*; *Sapre, Gontia-Mishra & Tiwari, 2021*). Also, fresh weight and dry weight were significantly reduced under salinity conditions in barley (*Elsawy et al., 2022*), rice (*Mohamed et al., 2022*), basil (*Jakovljević et al., 2017*) and bean (*Kutlu & Gulmezoglu, 2023*). *Khedr et al. (2023*) reported that the salt-stressed wheat plants were negatively affected since most of the studied characteristics significantly decreased under salinity conditions. In the experiment with lettuce, both salinity concentrations (4 dS m<sup>-1</sup> and 8 dS m<sup>-1</sup>) caused a significant decrease in leaf number and head weight in the stressed plants compared to the control in two seasons. This harmful effect of salt stress may be due to decreased water uptake from the soil, and the inhibition of cell elongation and cell division. Salinity stress is also followed by toxicities of Na+ and Cl-, which reduce the uptake of essential elements like nitrogen, phosphorus, and potassium (*ALKahtani et al., 2021b*) reducing the stressed plants' morphological features.

## Effect of PGPB and safety treatments on morphological characteristics of plants under salinity conditions

Many studies were conducted to find suitable methods to overcome the negative effects of salinity stress. *Bharti et al.* (2016) reported that the application of PGPB *Dietzia natronolimnaea* caused improvement in the morphological features of wheat plants

 Table 2
 Treatments with safety compounds improving physiological and biochemical characteristics of economic plants under drought stress conditions.

Treatments	Improved physiological and biochemical characters	Plant species	References
PGPB	Act osmoregulatory	Some plants	Soliman et al. (2018)
Ascorbic acid (Vita- min C)	Protection of plant cells against toxic free radicals	Tomato	Farooq et al. (2017)
Bacillus thuringiensis	Physiological characters and seed yield	Pea	Abdelaal (2015b)
Yeast extract	Activity of antioxidant enzymes, photosyn- thetic process, and RWC	Garlic	Abdelaal et al. (2021c)
Mannitol	Super oxide and hydroxyl radical scav- enging; Protection of chloroplasts against photo-oxidative stress	Arabidopsis thaliana	Abebe et al. (2003)
Melatonin	Concentration of photosynthetic pigments (chlorophyll a and b, and carotenoids)	Soybean	Imran et al. (2023)
Bacillus cereus	The significant increase in IAA, and zeatin	Walnut	Liu et al. (2023)
Pseudomonas spp.	Root elongation and NPK concentration	Soybean	Igiehon & Babalola (2021)
Pseudomonas and Bacillus	Physiological characters and yield	Tomato	Nemeskéri et al. (2022)
Azotobacter and Pseu- domonas	Seed germination and seedlings' radical	Spinacia oler- acea	Petrillo et al. (2022)
Proline	Protection of plant cells against the in- creased ROS production; water availability	Sugar beet, Bean and Soybean	Abdelaal et al. (2021e) and Al-Shammari, Altamimi
Gamma- aminobutyric acid (GABA)	Cellular ion homeostasis Improve antioxidant enzymes	Arabidopsis Tomato	Ghosh, Gupta & Mohapatra (2019)
Paenibacillus polymyxa	Improve the physiological characteristics	Pepper	Quyet-Tien et al. (2010)
Bacillus spp and Pseu- domonas spp	Increased fruit yield	Pepper	Admassie et al. (2022)
Bacillus spp.	Improving the physio-chemical properties	Mung bean	<i>Kumar et al. (2023)</i>

under salt-stress conditions. *Bacillus thuringiensis* treatment increased leaves number, head weight, and total yield in lettuce plants under salinity stress compared to untreated plants (*AlKahtani et al., 2021a*). In the study of *El-Flaah et al. (2021*), the treatment with Rhizobium improved the growth characteristics of salt-stressed faba bean plants such as branch number, plant height, and flower number. Additionally, *Abdelaal, Mazrou & Hafez* (2020) reported that stress tolerance-inducing compounds alleviate salinity stress effects on sweet pepper plants and improve growth characteristics. The application of chitosan caused a significant improvement in morphological characteristics of sweet pepper plants including plant height, leaf number, and fresh shoot weight under salt stress (*Abdelaal et al., 2021c*). *Al-Shammari, Altamimi & Abdelaal (2023)* found an improvement in the seed yield of pea plants under salinity conditions with melatonin treatment, the growth characteristics also were improved under these conditions. One of the crucial treatments in alleviating the negative effects of salinity stress is biochar, which may overcome the harmful effects and improve the growth characteristics of faba bean plants (*El Nahhas et al., 2021*).

# Effect of salt stress on physiological and biochemical characteristics of plants

Salinity stress significantly affects the physiological and biochemical characteristics of plants, resulting in an imbalance of ions and a decrease in nutrient uptake, especially nitrogen, phosphorus, and potassium (Kumar et al., 2017; Putra, Santosa & Salsinha, 2023). The harmful effects on physiological and biochemical features may be due to the decrease in the synthesis of growth-promoting hormones. IAA is a hormone that stimulates cell division and elongation (Putra, Santosa & Salsinha, 2023). High salinity levels can decrease amino acid production (like tryptophan) which is involved in the IAA synthesis, resulting in decreased IAA concentration. Many physiological and biochemical changes were observed under salinity conditions, such as the synthesis of compatible solutes, antioxidant components, and stress proteins, as well as the excessive production of ROS, which negatively affects cellular structures, inhibits carbon fixation, decreases the photosynthetic rate, and causes hormonal balance disorder (Abdelaal, Mazrou & Hafez, 2020). Moreover, electrolyte leakage, MDA content, and superoxide and hydrogen peroxide production increase, while chlorophyll content and relative water content decrease. The synthesis of antioxidant compounds, including both enzymatic and non-enzymatic antioxidants, is one of the mechanisms to deal with salinity and it is based on the protection of cells against oxidative damage. Glutathione reductase, peroxidase, catalase, superoxide dismutase, and ascorbate peroxidase are the main enzymatic antioxidants (Usman et al., 2023; Jahanbani et al., 2023), while non-enzymatic antioxidants including ascorbic acid, proline, carotenoids and  $\alpha$ -Tocopherols (vitamin E) (*Rigi, Saberi & Ebrahimi, 2023; Hafez et al., 2020a; Hafez* et al., 2020b). El Nahhas et al. (2021) reported that salinity stress significantly decreased relative water content and chlorophyll concentration, while lipid peroxidation, electrolyte leakage, and ROS significantly increased in salt-stressed faba bean plants. Additionally, salt concentration was positively correlated with the content of secondary metabolites such as phenolics (including flavonoids), and proline (Beheshti, Khorasaninejad & Hemmati, 2023). The decrease in the content of photosynthetic pigments under salinity conditions could be due to the chlorophyll photooxidation and chloroplasts oxidative damage under salinity conditions (Beheshti, Khorasaninejad & Hemmati, 2023; Singh et al., 2022).

# Mitigation of salt stress effects on the physiological and biochemical characteristics of plants

It can be concluded that the adverse effects of salinity can be detected in all stages of plant growth and development, including both vegetative and reproductive stages in numerous plants (*El-Flaah et al., 2021; Aziz et al., 2023*). Application of PGPB was used to improve plant growth and increase productivity under salinity stress (Table 3). It is shown that plant growth-promoting rhizobacteria can improve physiological and biochemical characteristics such as water absorption, nutrient uptake, and photosynthesis, and promote plant growth and development. PGPB can produce essential compounds such as siderophores and ACC-deaminase which increase the availability of some nutrients in the soil. For example, the *Enterobacter* treatment led to increased ACC deaminase activity and alleviated salinity stress by reducing ethylene concentration (*Singh et al., 2022; Agha et al., 2023*). Under

Treatments	Improved physiological and biochemical charac- ters under salinity stress	Plant species	References
Enterobacter cloacae	Production of ACC deaminase	Wheat	Singh et al. (2022)
Bradyrhizobium japonicum + Enterobacter Delta PSK	Reduction of MDA, electrolyte leakage and hydro- gen peroxide	Soybean	Agha et al. (2023)
Piriformospora indica	Alleviation the oxidative damages	Trigonella	<i>Bisht et al. (2022)</i>
Enterobacter cloacae PM23	Regulation of antioxidant defense, and solutes accu- mulation	Maize	Ali et al. (2022)
Enterobacter cloacae and Bacillus drentensis	water uptake and nutrient accessibility	Mung bean	Mahmood et al. (2016)
Halomonas sp.	Siderophores production	Rice	Mukherjee, Mitra & Roy (2019)
Pesudomonas	Exopolysaccharides secretion	Rice	Sen & Chandrasekhar (2014)
Pseudomonas sp.	ACC-deaminase production	Wheat	Choudhary et al. (2022)
<i>Achromobacter</i> sp. and <i>Bacillus</i> sp.	ACC deaminase and siderophore production	Rice	Zahir et al. (2009)
Klebsiella sp.	Production of IAA, antioxidant enzymes and proline	Avena sativa	Sapre, Gontia-Mishra & Ti- wari (2018)
Pseudomonas azoto- formans FAP5	Both morphological and physiological attributes	Wheat	Ansari, Jabeen & Ahmad (2021)
Gluconacetobacter di- azotrophicus	chlorophyll content	Maize	Tufail et al. (2021)
Azospirillum sp.	phosphate solubilization	Chickpea	Patel et al. (2021)
Pseudomonas pseu- doalcaligenes	antioxidant enzymes activity	Soybean	Yasmin et al. (2020)
Serotonin	Decrease MDA contents and electrolyte leakage	Tomato	Akcay & Okudan (2023)
Melatonin	Increase the activities of SOD, POD, and CAT	Alfalfa	<i>Guo et al. (2023)</i>
Yeast extract + pro- line	Improved chlorophyll contents, decrease the levels of super oxide and electrolyte leakage	Solidago virgaurea	Arnao & Hernández-Ruiz (2017)

 Table 3
 Mitigation of salinity stress effects on the physiological and biochemical characters of economic plants.

salt stress conditions, MDA production, electrolyte leakage, and concentration of  $H_2O_2$ significantly decreased with the application of *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* + Enterobacter in the stressed soybean plants, while chlorophyll concentrations increased (*Bisht et al.*, 2022). AlKahtani et al. (2021a) and Bisht et al. (2022) reported that the application of PGPB markedly improved photosynthetic rate, stomatal conductance, and chlorophyll and carotenoid content in lettuce and *Trigonella* under salinity stress. Moreover, Ali et al. (2022) found that inoculation with *Enterobacter cloacae* improved relative water content, flavonoid, and protein content in maize under salt stress (*Mahmood et al.*, 2016). Also, *Mukherjee, Mitra* & Roy (2019) reported that the application of *Halomonas* sp. promotes the growth characteristics of rice plants and increases siderophore production under salinity stress. Likewise, *Klebsiella variicola* produced many compounds under salinity conditions such as siderophore, 1 aminocyclopropane-1-carboxylate deaminase, IAA, exopolysaccharides, and antioxidant enzymes (*Sen* & *Chandrasekhar*, 2014).



Figure 1 Effect of plant growth promoting bacteria on plant growth under drought and salinity stress conditions.

Full-size DOI: 10.7717/peerj.17286/fig-1

The positive role of PGPR may be due to improved uptake of nitrogen, phosphorus, and potassium (*Zahir et al., 2009*; *Choudhary et al., 2022*). PGPR may trigger the antioxidant defense system to scavenge ROS which are produced as indicators of salt stress in many plants (*Sapre, Gontia-Mishra & Tiwari, 2018*; *Ansari, Jabeen & Ahmad, 2021*). Previous studies showed that the application of *Pseudomonas* sp. and *Serratia* sp. led to improved physiological characteristics in the salt-stressed wheat plants (Table 3) via enhanced ACC-deaminase production in plants (*Tufail et al., 2021*; *Patel et al., 2021*). Also, the secretion of phytohormones and nitrogen fixation is one of the various mechanisms to decrease the negative effect of salinity stress. Generally, PGPB can play an important role in improving the plant tolerance to drought and salinity stress conditions (Fig. 1).

Furthermore, the application of melatonin caused significant increases in chlorophyll concentrations and relative water content in the stressed pea plants. However, a significant

decrease in the MDA production, EL%, and  $H_2O_2$  and  $O_{2-}$  concentration was recorded in the stressed plants compared with the stressed pea plants without treatments (*Kour et al.*, 2020). Serotonin is a vital bioregulator that is formed during the biosynthesis pathway of melatonin and has light-absorbing properties. Serotonin and melatonin are indolamines, they have a pivotal role for life in living organisms (*Azmitia*, 2011). Serotonin application led to decreased MDA content and EL% level of tomato plants, while relative water content was increased under salinity and drought stress conditions (*Akcay & Okudan*, 2023).

Exogenously applied melatonin mitigates the negative effect of salt stress by improving the IAA content, photosynthesis rate, and photosynthesis efficiency and reducing the accumulation of  $H_2O_2$  in stressed wheat seedlings (*Ke et al., 2018*). *Guo et al. (2023*) reported that melatonin applied as foliar spray increased root length, leaf area, proline content, and soluble protein as well as the activity of antioxidant enzymes such as catalase and peroxidase in the salt-stressed alfalfa plants, while the levels of MDA were decreased. Melatonin can also mitigate the adverse effects of salinity and drought (Wang, Reiter & Chan, 2017). Furthermore, melatonin stimulates the essential enzymes, such as CAT, APX, SOD, POD, and GR, as well as some important metabolites such as flavonoids, glutathione, ascorbate, and anthocyanins which activate the antioxidant system and protect plants from oxidative damage under various stresses. Melatonin can also play a significant role in controlling  $H_2O_2$  levels (Anwar et al., 2023). The positive effect of melatonin may be due to its role in maintaining root development and photosynthetic rate under salinity conditions (Arnao & Hernández-Ruiz, 2017). Application of yeast extract and proline led to increased concentration of elements such as N, P, K, and Ca in calendula plants under salinity stress, whereas concentration of Na, proline,  $O_{2-}$  and  $H_2O_2$ , and electrolyte leakage were decreased in the stressed plants (El-Shawa, Rashwan & Abdelaal, 2022).

The application of yeast extract and/or gibberellic acid (GA<sub>3</sub>) gave the highest increase in plant growth characteristics such as plant height and fresh and dry weight of shoots, as well as photosynthetic efficiency, macronutrient content, total soluble sugars, and total phenolics in Solidago plants under alkaline soil conditions (Youssef et al., 2022). Additionally, the application of biochar and compost (alone or together) led to a significant improvement in plant growth compared to the control. Furthermore, the combined application of compost and biochar significantly reduced the sodium in the shoots and roots of tomato plants (Ud Din et al., 2023). It was also observed that the application of arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi (Rhizophagus intraradices) led to an increase in nutrient uptake, accumulation of compatible osmolytes, and decreased electrolyte leakage in Pisum sativum under salinity stress conditions (Parihar et al., 2020). Shahzad et al. (2017) found that the ability of rice plants to tolerate salinity stress was significantly increased by inoculation with arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi, which alter the endogenous phytohormone and essential amino acids such as glutamic acid, phenylalanine, cysteine, and proline. Additionally, arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi can improve the availability of nutritional elements via biological processes (Ma, Vosátka & Freitas, 2019) under various environmental factors. Navarro-Torre et al. (2023) reported that the application of halotolerant/halophilic bacteria can be one of the important strategies in improving plant tolerance to salinity stress in grapevines in the context of climate change. Furthermore, PGPB can improve plant tolerance to

several abiotic stresses, especially salinity, by regulating the enzymatic and nonenzymatic antioxidants to prevent the accumulation of ROS, which results in improved plant growth (*Abdou et al.*, 2023).

### EFFECT OF SALINITY AND DROUGHT STRESSES ON ANATOMICAL CHARACTERISTICS OF PLANTS

Plants display many changes in anatomical structures under salinity and drought conditions such as a decrease in the thickness of lamina, midvein, palisade and spongy leaf tissues (Fig. 2). Additionally, salinity and drought can cause detrimental effects on the anatomical structure of plant stems. Abdo et al. (2012) reported that salinity stress decreased the thickness of the soybean leaves' lamina, spongy, and palisade tissues. El-Banna & Abdelaal (2018) found that high NaCl levels induced ultrastructural changes in the mesophyll tissue of strawberry leaflets such as the disintegration of grana staking, swelling of thylakoids (Fig. 3), increased number of starch grains and plastoglobuli, as well as increased size of mitochondria. Also, salinity led to the shrinkage of plasma membranes, increased vesicle formation, and increased cell wall thickness (El-Banna & Abdelaal, 2018). However, the application of yeast extract and garlic extract led to an improvement of the anatomical characteristics of soybean plants under stress conditions (Abdo et al., 2012). The positive effect of yeast extract and garlic extract on the anatomical characteristics of soybean plants could be related to the improvement in plant growth. In the experiment of faba bean, Taie et al. (2013) reported that salinity stress led to a decrease in the thickness of the epidermis, cortex, phloem tissue, xylem tissue, as well as parenchyma tissue. Also, vessel diameter and internode diameter were decreased due to reduced stem wall thickness and hollow pith diameter reduction. Under salinity conditions, the midvein and lamina thickness of the leaflet was decreased due to the decrease in thickness of both palisade and spongy tissues (Taie et al., 2013).

It is shown that salinity at 6,000 ppm reduced the midvein's thickness, vascular bundle length and width, xylem rows, and vessel diameter in cowpea leaflets. Also, the stem diameter, cortex thickness, and thickness of phloem and xylem tissues decreased in the stressed cowpea plants compared with the control (El-Taher et al., 2022). Taha et al. (2021) found that the application of yeast extract led to an improvement in the anatomical features of the lupine stems such as stem diameter, cortex thickness, xylem vessel diameter, and number of pith layers in the salt-stressed lupine plants. The damaging effects of drought can be seen in drought-stressed eggplant through the changes in lamina thickness, length and width of the vascular bundle, and the midvein thickness. However, the application of 100 ppm ZnO NP reduced the damaging effect of drought on the stressed eggplant (Semida et al., 2021). Likewise, a significant reduction in anatomical characteristics of leaves such as lamina thickness, palisade and spongy tissue thickness, vascular bundle width, and a number of xylem vessels were recorded in the drought-stressed fenugreek plants (Abou-Sreea et al., 2022). Under drought stress conditions, negative effects were recorded on the ultrastructure of sugarcane leaves such as deformation of chloroplasts, plasmolysis of mesophyll tissue, alteration of lamellae in the chloroplast, also, chloroplasts getting round,



**Figure 2** Cross sections micrographs of strawberry leaflet under salinity conditions. A (control), B (68 mM NaCl) (*El-Banna & Abdelaal, 2018*). U.E., upper epidermis; P., palisade tissue; Sp., spongy tissue; X., xylem; Ph., phloem; L.E., lower epidermis. (X100).

Full-size DOI: 10.7717/peerj.17286/fig-2



Figure 3 Effect of salinity stress on strawberry leaflet showing alterations in the ultrastructure of leaflet organelles. A (control), B (68 mM NaCl) (*El-Banna & Abdelaal, 2018*). Ch, chloroplast; CW, cell wall. Scale bar = (A) 5  $\mu$ m and (B) 2  $\mu$ m.

Full-size DOI: 10.7717/peerj.17286/fig-3

swollen, and produced osmiophilic particles (*Zhang et al., 2015*). The negative effects of drought on anatomical features could be attributed to the reduction of water supply and nutrient uptake from the soil, which, negatively affect the anatomical structure of plants.

#### **CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE PERSPECTIVES**

The issue of abiotic stress is very significant in the agricultural sectors, where plants must deal with salinity and drought conditions which cause a sharp decrease in crop production. It can be seen that treating plants with PGPB and safety treatments has multiple mechanisms for improving growth and yield production. The adverse effects of drought and salinity can be mitigated by applying PGPB, arbuscular mycorrhizal

fungi, yeast extract, melatonin, biochar, chitosan, and proline. These safety treatments can improve morphoanatomical attributes such as the diameter of the xylem vessel, pith layer, cortex thickness, and overall stem diameter. They also regulate ion homeostasis and osmolyte accumulation, enzymatic and non-enzymatic antioxidant activities, and play a pivotal role in phytohormone biosynthesis. Many studies showed that the application of safety treatments significantly improved the physiological and biochemical attributes in economically important plants under drought and salinity stress conditions, such as chlorophyll concentrations, carotenoids content, relative water content, osmoprotectants accumulation, organic compounds production, as well as scavenge of the ROS. It can be concluded that safety and eco-friendly treatments may have a significant role in developing economically important plants with improved tolerance to environmental stresses. Still, further studies are required to investigate the molecular mechanisms employed in order to thoroughly understand and further apply species-specific biofertilizers and increase the tolerance to salinity and drought.

### **ADDITIONAL INFORMATION AND DECLARATIONS**

#### Funding

This work was supported by the deanship at the University of Ha'il, Saudi Arabia, through project number RG-23 100. The funders had no role in study design, data collection and analysis, decision to publish, or preparation of the manuscript.

### **Grant Disclosures**

The following grant information was disclosed by the authors: University of Ha'il, Saudi Arabia: RG-23 100.

### **Competing Interests**

Diaa Abd El Moneim is an Academic Editor for PeerJ.

### **Author Contributions**

- Wasimah Buraykan Alshammari conceived and designed the experiments, performed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the article, and approved the final draft.
- Kholoud Alshammery conceived and designed the experiments, performed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the article, and approved the final draft.
- Salwa Lotfi conceived and designed the experiments, performed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the article, and approved the final draft.
- Haya Altamimi conceived and designed the experiments, performed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the article, and approved the final draft.

- Abeer Alshammari conceived and designed the experiments, performed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the article, and approved the final draft.
- Nadi Awad Al-Harbi conceived and designed the experiments, performed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the article, and approved the final draft.
- Dragana Jakovljević conceived and designed the experiments, performed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the article, and approved the final draft.
- Mona Hajed Alharbi conceived and designed the experiments, performed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the article, and approved the final draft.
- Moustapha Eid Moustapha conceived and designed the experiments, performed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the article, and approved the final draft.
- Diaa Abd El-Moneim conceived and designed the experiments, performed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the article, and approved the final draft.
- Khaled Abdelaal conceived and designed the experiments, performed the experiments, analyzed the data, prepared figures and/or tables, authored or reviewed drafts of the article, and approved the final draft.

### **Data Availability**

The following information was supplied regarding data availability: This is a literature review.

### **Supplemental Information**

Supplemental information for this article can be found online at http://dx.doi.org/10.7717/peerj.17286#supplemental-information.

### REFERENCES

- **Abdelaal Kh. 2015a.** Effect of salicylic acid and abscisic acid on morpho-physiological and anatomical characters of faba bean plants (*Vicia faba* L.) under drought stress. *Journal of Plant Production* **6(11)**:1771–1788 DOI 10.21608/jpp.2015.52096.
- **Abdelaal Kh. 2015b.** Pivotal role of bio and mineral fertilizer combinations on morphological anatomical and yield characters of sugar beet plant (*Beta vulgaris* L.). *Middle East Journal of Agriculture Research* **4**(**4**):717–734.
- Abdelaal Kh, Alamrey S, Attia K, Elrobh M, Elnahhas N, Abou El-Yazied A, Ibrahim M. 2022b. The pivotal role of biochar in enhancement soil properties, morphophysiological and yield characters of barley plants under drought stress. *Notulae Botanicae Horti Agrobotanici Cluj-Napoca* **50**(2):12710 DOI 10.15835/nbha50212710.

- Abdelaal K, Alkahtani M, Attia K, Hafez Y, Király L, Künstler A. 2021a. The role of plant growth-promoting bacteria in alleviating the adverse effects of drought on plants. *Biology* **10(6)**:520 DOI 10.3390/biology10060520.
- Abdelaal K, Alsubeie MS, Hafez Y, Emeran A, Moghanm F, Okasha S, Omara R, Basahi MA, Darwish DBE, Ibrahim MFM, Abou El-Yazied A, Rashwan E, Elkelish A, Mady M, Ibraheem F. 2022a. Physiological and biochemical changes in vegetable and field crops under drought, salinity and weeds stresses: control strategies and management. *Agriculture* 12:2084 DOI 10.3390/agriculture12122084.
- Abdelaal KAA, Attia KA, Alamery SF, El-Afry MM, Ghazy AI, Tantawy DS, Al-Doss AA, El-Shawy E-SE, Abu-Elsaoud AM, Hafez YM. 2020a. Exogenous application of proline and salicylic acid can mitigate the injurious impacts of drought stress on barley plants associated with physiological and histological characters. *Sustainability* 12:1736 DOI 10.3390/su12051736.
- Abdelaal Kh A, Attia KA, Niedbała G, Wojciechowski T, Hafez Y, Alamery S, Alateeq TK, Arafa SA. 2021c. Mitigation of drought damages by exogenous chitosan and yeast extract extract with modulating the photosynthetic pigments, antioxidant defense system and improving the productivity of garlic plants. *Horticulturae* 7(11):510 DOI 10.3390/horticulturae7110510.
- **Abdelaal Kh AA, Elafry M, Abdel-Latif I, Elshamy R, Hassan M, Hafez Y. 2021d.** Pivotal role of yeast extract and ascorbic acid in improvement the morpho-physiological characters of two wheat cultivars under water deficit stress in calcareous soil. *Fresenius Environmental Bulletin* **30**(3):2554–2565.
- Abdelaal Kh, El-Afry M, Metwaly M, Zidan M, Rashwan E. 2021b. Salt tolerance activation in faba bean plants using proline and salicylic acid associated with physiobiochemical and yield characters improvement. *Fresenius Environmental Bulletin* **30(4)**:3175–3186.
- Abdelaal Kh AA, EL-Maghraby LM, Elansary H, Hafez YM, Ibrahim EI, El-Banna M, El-Esawi M, Elkelish A. 2020b. Treatment of sweet pepper with stress toleranceinducing compounds alleviates salinity stress oxidative damage by mediating the physio-biochemical activities and antioxidant systems. *Agronomy* **10**:26.
- **Abdelaal Kh, El-Okkiah S, Metwaly M, El-Afry L. 2021e.** Impact of ascorbic acid and proline application on the physiological machinery in soybean plants under salinity stress. *Fresenius Environmental Bulletin* **30(11A)**:12486–12497.
- Abdelaal Kh, Hafez Y, El-Afry MM, Tantawy DS, Alshaal T. 2018. Effect of some osmoregulators on photosynthesis lipid peroxidation antioxidative capacity and productivity of barley (*Hordeum vulgare* L.) under water deficit stress. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* 25:30199–30211 DOI 10.1007/s11356-018-3023-x.
- Abdelaal Kh, Hafez Y, El Sabagh A, Saneoka H. 2017. Ameliorative effects of Abscisic acid and yeast extract on morpho-physiological and yield characteristics of maize plant (*Zea mays* L.) under water deficit conditions. *Fresenius Environmental Bulletin* 26(12):7372–7383.
- **Abdelaal Kh AA, Mazrou YSA, Hafez YM. 2020.** Silicon foliar application mitigates salt stress in sweet pepper plants by enhancing water status, photosynthesis, antioxidant enzyme activity and fruit yield. *Plants* **9**:733 DOI 10.3390/plants9060733.

- **Abdelaal Kh, Mazrou Y, Hafez Y. 2022.** Effect of silicon and carrot extract on morphophysiological characters of pea (*Pisum sativum* L.) under salinity stress conditions. *Fresenius Environmental Bulletin* **31(1)**:608–615.
- Abdo FA, Nassar DMA, Gomaa EF, Nassar MA. 2012. Minimizing the harmful effects of cadmium on vegetative growth, leaf anatomy, yield and physiological characteristics of soybean plant [*Glycine max* (L.) Merrill] by foliar spray with active yeast extract or with garlic cloves extract. *Research Journal of Agriculture and Biological Sciences* **8**(1):24–35.
- Abdou AH, Alkhateeb O, Mansour HH, Ghazzawy HS, Albadrani MS, Al-harbi NA, Al-Shammari WB, Abdelaal Kh. 2023. Application of plant growth-promoting bacteria as an eco-friendly strategy for mitigating the harmful effects of abiotic stress on plants. *Phyton* 92(12):1–10 DOI 10.32604/phyton.2023.044780.
- Abebe T, Guenzi AC, Martin B, Cushman JC. 2003. Tolerance of mannitolaccumulating transgenic wheat to water stress and salinity. *Plant Physiology* 131:1–8 DOI 10.1104/pp.900061.
- Abou-Sreea AIB, Kamal M, El Sowfy DM, Rady MM, Mohamed GF, Al-Dhumri SA, AL-Harbi MS, Abdou NM. 2022. Small-sized nanophosphorus has a positive impact on the performance of fenugreek plants under soil-water deficit stress: a case study under field conditions. *Biology* 11(1):115 DOI 10.3390/biology11010115.
- Admassie M, Woldehawariat Y, Alemu T, Gonzalez E, Jimenez JF. 2022. The role of plant growth-promoting bacteria in alleviating drought stress on pepper plants. *Agricultural Water Management* 272:107831 DOI 10.1016/j.agwat.2022.107831.
- Agha MS, Haroun SA, Abbas MA, Sofy M, Mowafy AM. 2023. Growth and metabolic response of glycine max to the plant growth-promoting enterobacter delta PSK and *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* under salinity stress. *Journal of Plant Growth Regulation* 42:5816–5830 DOI 10.1007/s00344-023-10967-4.
- Akcay UC, Okudan N. 2023. Exogenous serotonin improves drought and salt tolerance in tomato seedlings. *Plant Growth Regulation* 101:1–11 DOI 10.1007/s10725-023-01002-3.
- Ali B, Wang X, Saleem MH, Hafeez A, Afridi MS. 2022. PGPR-mediated salt tolerance in maize by modulating plant physiology, antioxidant defense, compatible solutes accumulation and bio-surfactant producing genes. *Plants* 11(3):345 DOI 10.3390/plants11030345.
- ALKahtani MDF, Attia KA, Hafez YM, Khan N, Eid AM, Ali MAM, Abdelaal KAA. 2020. Chlorophyll fluorescence parameters and antioxidant defense system can display salt tolerance of salt acclimated sweet pepper plants treated with chitosan and plant growth promoting rhizobacteria. *Agronomy* **10(8)**:1180 DOI 10.3390/agronomy10081180.
- ALKahtani M, Hafez Y, Attia K, Al-Ateeq T, Ali MAM, Hasanuzzaman M, Abdelaal K. 2021b. *Bacillus thuringiensis* and silicon modulate antioxidant metabolism and improve the physiological traits to confer salt tolerance in lettuce. *Plants* 10:1025 DOI 10.3390/plants10051025.
- AlKahtani MDF, Hafez YM, Attia K, Rashwan E, Husnain LA, AlGwaiz HIM, Abdelaal KAA. 2021a. Evaluation of silicon and proline application on the

oxidative machinery in drought-stressed sugar beet. *Antioxidants* **10**:398 DOI 10.3390/antiox10030398.

- Alnusairi GSH, Mazrou YSA, Qari SH, Elkelish AA, Soliman MH, Eweis M, Abdelaal K, El-Samad GA, Ibrahim MFM, ElNahhas N. 2021. Exogenous nitric oxide reinforces photosynthetic efficiency, osmolyte, mineral uptake, antioxidant, expression of stress-responsive genes and ameliorates the effects of salinity stress in wheat. *Plants* 10(8):1693 DOI 10.3390/plants10081693.
- Al-Shammari WB, Altamimi HR, Abdelaal Kh. 2023. Improvement in physiobiochemical and yield characteristics of pea plants with nano silica and melatonin under salinity stress conditions. *Horticulturae* 9(6):711 DOI 10.3390/horticulturae9060711.
- **Ansari F, Jabeen M, Ahmad I. 2021.** Pseudomonas azotoformans FAP5, a novel biofilm forming PGPR strain, alleviates drought stress in wheat plant. *International Journal of Environmental Science and Technology* **18**:1–16 DOI 10.1007/s13762-020-03120-1.
- Anwar T, Qureshi H, Fatimah H, Siddiqi EH, Anwaar S, Moussa IM, Adil MF. 2023.
   Elucidating effect of ZnO-Nanoparticles and melatonin on physiological adjustments and growth of *Solanum melongena* under salinity stress. *Scientia Horticulturae* 322:112455 DOI 10.1016/j.scienta.2023.112455.
- Arafa SA, Attia KA, Niedbała G, Piekutowska M, Alamery S, Abdelaal K, Alateeq TK, Ali AMM, Elkelish A, Attallah SY. 2021. Seed priming boost adaptation in pea plants under drought stress. *Plants* 10(10):2201 DOI 10.3390/plants10102201.
- Arnao MB, Hernández-Ruiz J. 2017. Melatonin and its relationship to plant hormones. *Annals of Botany* **121**:195–207 DOI 10.1093/aob/mcx114.
- Aziz HA, Sharaf M, Omar M, Abou El-Yazied A, AlJwaizea NI, Ismail S, Omar M, Alharbi K, Elkelish A, Tawfik M. 2023. Improvement of selected morphological, physiological, and biochemical parameters of banana (*Musa acuminata* L.) using potassium silicate under drought stress condition grown *in vitro*. *Phyton-International Journal of Experimental Botany* **92**(**4**):1019–1036.
- Azmitia EC. 2011. Modern views on an ancient chemical: serotonin effects on cell proliferation, maturation and apoptosis. *Brain Research Bulletin* 56(5):413–424 DOI 10.1016/s0361-9230(01)00614-1.
- **Beheshti F, Khorasaninejad S, Hemmati K. 2023.** Effect of salinity stress on morphological, physiological, and biochemical traits of male and female plants of cannabis (*Cannabis sativa* L.). *Iranian Journal of Rangelands and Forests Plant Breeding and Genetic Research* **30(2)**:242–262.
- **Bharti N, Pandey SS, Barnawal D, Patel VK, Kalra A. 2016.** Plant growth promoting rhizobacteria *Dietzia natronolimnaea* modulates the expression of stress responsive genes providing protection of wheat from salinity stress. *Scientific Reports* **6**:34768 DOI 10.1038/srep34768.
- Bisht S, Singh S, Singh M, Sharma JG. 2022. Augmentative role of *Piriformospora indica* fungus and plant growth promoting bacteria in mitigating salinity stress in *Trigonella* foenumgraecum. *Journal of Applied Biology and Biotechnology* **10(1)**:85–94 DOI 10.7324/JABB.2021.100111.

- Çakmakçi R, Dönmez F, Aydın A, Şahin F. 2006. Growth promotion of plants by plant growth promoting rhizobacteria under greenhouse and two different field soil conditions. *Soil Biology and Biochemistry* 38(6):1482–1487 DOI 10.1016/j.soilbio.2005.09.019.
- Choudhary M, Chandra P, Dixit B, Nehra V, Choudhary U, Choudhary S. 2022. Plant growth-promoting microbes: role and prospective in amelioration of salt stress. *Communications in Soil Science and Plant Analysis* 53(13):1692–1711 DOI 10.1080/00103624.2022.2063316.
- Egener T, Hurek T, Reinhold-Hurek B. 1999. Endophytic expression of nif genes of *Azoarcus* sp. strain BH72 in rice roots. *Molecular Plant-Microbe Interactions* 12:813–819 DOI 10.1094/MPMI.1999.12.9.813.
- **El-Banna M, Abdelaal Kh. 2018.** Response of strawberry plants grown in the hydroponic system to pretreatment with H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> before exposure to salinity stress. *Journal of Plant Production* **9**(12):989–1001 DOI 10.21608/jpp.2018.36617.
- **El-Flaah RF, El-Said RAR, Nassar MA, Hassan M, Abdelaal Kh. 2021.** Effect of rhizobium, nano silica and ascorbic acid on morpho-physiological characters and gene expression of POX and PPO in faba bean (*Vicia faba* L.) under salinity stress conditions. *Fresenius Environmental Bulletin* **30(6)**:5751–5764.
- El Nahhas N, AlKahtani M, Abdelaal Kh AA, Al Husnain L, AlGwaiz H, Hafez YM, Attia K, El-Esawi M, Ibrahim M, Elkelish A. 2021. Biochar and jasmonic acid application attenuates antioxidative systems and improves growth, physiology, nutrient uptake and productivity of faba bean (*Vicia faba* L.) irrigated with saline water. *Plant Physiology and Biochemistry* 166:807–817166 DOI 10.1016/j.plaphy.2021.06.033.
- El Sabagh A, Hossain A, Barutcular C, Islam MS, Awan SI. 2019. Wheat (*Triticum aes-tivum* L.) production under drought and heat stress-adverse effects mechanisms and mitigation: a review. *Applied Ecology and Environmental Research* 17(4):8307–8332.
- **El-Shawa GMR, Rashwan EM, Abdelaal Kh. 2022.** Mitigating salt stress effects by exogenous application of proline and yeast extract extract on morphophysiological, biochemical and anatomical characters of calendula plants. *Scientific Journal of Flowers and Ornamental Plants* **7**:461–482.
- El-Taher AM, Abd El-Raouf HS, Osman NA, Azoz SN, Omar MA, Elkelish A, Abd El-Hady MAM. 2022. Effect of salt stress and foliar application of salicylic acid on morphological, biochemical, anatomical, and productivity characteristics of cowpea (*Vigna unguiculata* L.) plants. *Plants* 11:115 DOI 10.3390/plants11010115.
- Elkelish A, Qari SH, Mazrou YSA, Abdelaal KAA, Hafez YM, Abu-Elsaoud AM, Batiha GE-S, El-Esawi MA, El Nahhas N. 2020. Exogenous ascorbic acid induced chilling tolerance in tomato plants through modulating metabolism, osmolytes, antioxidants, and transcriptional regulation of catalase and heat shock proteins. *Plants* **9**(**4**):431 DOI 10.3390/plants9040431.
- **Elkoca E, Haliloglu K, Esikten A, Ercisli S. 2007.** Hydro and osmopriming improve chickpea germination. *Acta Agriculturae Scandinavica Section B* **57**:193–200.

- Elsawy HIA, Alharbi K, Mohamed AMM, Ueda A, AlKahtani M, AlHusnain L, Attia KA, Abdelaal K, Shahein AMEA. 2022. Calcium lignosulfonate can mitigate the impact of salt stress on growth, physiological, and yield characteristics of two barley cultivars (*Hordeum vulgare* L.). *Agriculture* 12(9):1459 DOI 10.3390/agriculture12091459.
- Farooq M, Gogoi N, Barthakur S, Baroowa B, Bharadwaj N, Alghamdi SS, Siddique KHM. 2017. Drought Stress in Grain Legumes during Reproduction and Grain Filling. *Journal of Agronomy and Crop Science* 203:81–102.
- Galal AA, Basahi MA, Mohamed LS, Nassar SM, Kh Abdelaal, Abdel-Hafez AG. 2023. Genetic analysis of wheat tolerance to drought under different climatic zones. *Fresenius Environmental Bulletin* 32(2):821–830.
- García JE, Maroniche G, Creus C, Suárez-Rodríguez R, Ramirez Trujillo JA. 2017. *In vitro* PGPR properties and osmotic tolerance of different *Azospirillum* native strains and their effects on growth of maize under drought stress. *Microbiological Research* 202:21–29 DOI 10.1016/j.micres.2017.04.007.
- **Ghosh D, Gupta A, Mohapatra SA. 2019.** Comparative analysis of exopolysaccharide and phytohormone secretions by four drought-tolerant rhizobacterial strains and their impact on osmotic-stress mitigation in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *World Journal of Microbiology and Biotechnology* **35(6)**:90 DOI 10.1007/s11274-019-2659-0.
- **Guo X, Shi Y, Zhu G, Zhou G. 2023.** Melatonin mitigated salinity stress on alfalfa by improving antioxidant defense and osmoregulation. *Agronomy* **13**(**7**):1727 DOI 10.3390/agronomy13071727.
- Hafez Y, Attia K, Alamery S, Ghazy A, Al-Doss A, Ibrahim E, Rashwan E, El-Maghraby L, Awad A, Abdelaal K. 2020a. Beneficial effects of biochar and chitosan on antioxidative capacity, osmolytes accumulation, and anatomical characters of water-stressed barley plants. *Agronomy* 10:630 DOI 10.3390/agronomy10050630.
- Hafez Y, Elkohby W, Mazrou YA, Ghazy M, Elgamal A, Abdelaal Kh. 2020b. Alleviating the detrimental impacts of salt stress on morpho-hpysiological and yield characters of rice plants (*Oryza sativa* L.) using actosol, Nano-Zn and Nano-Si. *Fresenius Environmental Bulletin* 29(8):6882–6897.
- Heinrichs R, Meirelles GC, De Melo Santos LF, Da Silva Lira MV, De Marcos Lapaz
   A. 2009. Azospirillum inoculation of 'Marandu' palisade grass seeds: effects on forage production and nutritional status. Semina Ciencias Agrarias 41:465–478
   DOI 10.5433/1679-0359.2020v41n2p465.
- Helaly MN, Mohammed Z, El-Shaeery NI, Abdelaal Kh, Nofal IE. 2017. Cucumber grafting onto pumpkin can represent an interesting tool to minimize salinity stress. *Physiological and anatomical studies. Middle East Journal of Agriculture Research* 6(4):953–975.
- Hungria M, Rondina ABL, Nunes ALP, Araujo RS, Nogueira MA. 2021. Seed and leaf-spray inoculation of PGPR in brachiarias (*Urochloa* spp.) as an economic and environmental opportunity to improve plant growth forage yield and nutrient status. *Plant Soil* **46**(3):171–186 DOI 10.1007/s11104-021-04908-x.

- **Igiehon ON, Babalola O. 2021.** Rhizobium and mycorrhizal fungal species improved soybean yield under drought stress conditions. *Current Microbiology* **78**:1615–1627 DOI 10.1007/s00284-021-02432-w.
- Imran M, Mpovo CL, Aaqil Khan M, Shaffique S, Ninson D, Bilal S, Khan M, Kwon EH, Kang SM, Yun BW, Lee IJ. 2023. Synergistic effect of melatonin and *Lysinibacillus fusiformis* L. (PLT16) to mitigate drought stress *via* regulation of hormonal, antioxidants system, and physio-molecular responses in soybean plants. *International Journal of Molecular Sciences* 24(10):8489 DOI 10.3390/ijms24108489.
- Jabborova D, Annapurna K, Al-Sadi AM, Alharbi SA, Datta R, Zuan AT. 2021. Biochar and Arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi mediated enhanced drought tolerance in Okra (*Abelmoschus esculentus*) plant growth, root morphological traits and physiological properties. *Saudi Journal of Biological Sciences* 28(10):5490–5499 DOI 10.1016/j.sjbs.2021.08.016.
- Jahanbani A, Asghari Zakaria R, Ashrafi V, Ghasemi Kalkhoran M, Shahriary R. 2023. Effect of foliar application of chitosan and humic acid on yield and yield components of bread wheat under end-season drought stress. *Environmental Stresses in Crop Sciences* 16(4):905–918.
- Jakovljević DZ, Topuzović MD, Stanković MS, Bojović BM. 2017. Changes in antioxidant enzyme activity in response to salinity-induced oxidative stress during early growth of sweet basil. *Horticulture, Environment, and Biotechnology* **58**:240–246 DOI 10.1007/s13580-017-0173-6.
- Kasim WA, Nessem AA, Gaber A. 2019. Effect of seed priming with aqueous extracts of carrot roots, garlic cloves or ascorbic acid on the yield of *Vicia faba* grown under drought stress. *Pakistan Journal of Botany* **51**:1979–1985.
- Kaya MD, Okçu G, Atak M, Çikili Y, Kolsarici O. 2006. Seed treatments to overcome salt and drought stress during germination in sunflower (*Helianthus annuus* L.). *European Journal of Agronomy* 24(4):291–295 DOI 10.1016/j.eja.2005.08.001.
- Ke Q, Ye J, Wang B, Ren J, Yin L, Deng X, Wang S. 2018. Melatonin mitigates salt stress in wheat seedlings by modulating *polyamine* metabolism. *Frontiers in Plant Science* 9:914 DOI 10.3389/fpls.2018.00914.
- Khaffagy AE, Mazrou YSA, Morsy AR, El-Mansoury MAM, El-Tokhy AI, Hafez Y, Abdelaal K, Khedr RA. 2022. Impact of irrigation levels and weed control treatments on annual weeds, physiological traits and productivity of soybean under clay soil conditions. *Agronomy* 12:1037 DOI 10.3390/agronomy12051037.
- **Khedr R, Aboukhadrah S, El-Hag D, Elmohamady E, Abdelaal Kh. 2023.** Ameliorative effects of nano silica and some growth stimulants on water relations, biochemical and productivity of wheat under saline soil conditions. *Fresenius Environmental Bulletin* **32**(1):375–384.
- Kour D, Rana KL, Yadav AN, Yadav N, Kumar M. 2020. Microbial biofertilizers: bioresources and ecofriendly technologies for agricultural and environmental sustainability. *Biocatalysis and Agricultural Biotechnology* 23(1):101487 DOI 10.1016/j.bcab.2019.101487.
- Kumar K, Anil A, Geetha P, Kumar T, Pandey B. 2023. Effect of plant growth regulators and plant growth promoting rhizobacteria on physio-chemical properties of

mung bean under drought stress. *Biological Forum—An International Journal* **15(4)**:753–761.

- Kumar D, Hassan MAl, Naranjo MA, Agrawal V, Boscaiu M, Vicente O. 2017. Effects of salinity and drought on growth, ionic relations, compatible solutes and activation of antioxidant in oleander (*Nerium oleander* L.). *PLOS ONE* 12(9):1–22 DOI 10.1371/journal.pone.0185017.
- **Kutlu I, Gulmezoglu N. 2023.** Suitable humic acid application methods to maintain physiological and enzymatic properties of bean plants under salt stress. *Gesunde Pflanzen* **75**:1075–1086 DOI 10.1007/s10343-022-00766-4.
- Kutlu I, Turhan E, Yorgancilar Ö, Yorgancilar A. 2021. Differences of physiological parameters and sucrose metabolism in bread wheat genotypes exposed to drought stress. *The Journal of Animal & Plant Sciences* **31**(4):998–1006.
- Liu F, Ma H, Liu B, Du Z, Ma B. 2023. Effects of plant growth-promoting rhizobacteria on the physioecological characteristics and growth of walnut seedlings under drought stress. *Agronomy* 13:290 DOI 10.3390/agronomy13020290.
- Ma Y, Vosátka M, Freitas H. 2019. Beneficial microbes alleviate climatic stresses in plants. *Frontiers in Plant Science* 10:595 DOI 10.3389/fpls.2019.00595.
- Mahmood S, Daur I, Al-Solaimani SG, Ahmad S, Madkour MH, Yasir M, Hirt H, Ali S, Ali Z. 2016. Plant growth promoting rhizobacteria and silicon synergistically enhance salinity tolerance of mung bean. *Frontiers in Plant Science* 7:876 DOI 10.3389/fpls.2016.00876.
- Mahmoud AW, Rashad HM, Esmail SE, Alsamadany H, Abdeldaym EA. 2023. Application of silicon, zinc, and zeolite nanoparticles—a tool to enhance drought stress tolerance in *Coriander* plants for better growth performance and productivity. *Plants* 12(15):2838 DOI 10.3390/plants12152838.
- Meenakshi K, Govindasamy V, Ajit V, Choudhary DK. 2019. Mitigation of drought stress in wheat crop by drought tolerant endophytic bacterial isolates. *Vegetos* 32:486–493 DOI 10.1007/s42535-019-00060-1.
- Mohamed A, Mazrou Y, Zayed B, Badawy SA, Nadier S, Hafez H, Abdelaal Kh. 2022. Effect of soil salinity wizards on ion selectivity, growth and productivity of rice. *Fresenius Environmental Bulletin* **31**(5):5129–5138.
- Mukherjee P, Mitra A, Roy M. 2019. Halomonas rhizobacteria of *Avicennia marina* of Indian sundarbans promote rice growth under saline and heavy metal stresses through exopolysaccharide production. *Frontiers in Microbiology* **10**:1207 DOI 10.3389/fmicb.2019.01207.
- Navarro-Torre S, Ferrario S, Caperta AD, Victorino G, Bailly M, Sousa V, Viegas W, Nogales A. 2023. Halotolerant endophytes promote grapevine regrowth after salt-induced defoliation. *Journal of Plant Interactions* 18(1):2215235 DOI 10.1080/17429145.2023.2215235.
- Nemeskéri E, Horváth KZ, Andryei B, Ilahy R, Takács S. 2022. Impact of plant growth-promoting rhizobacteria inoculation on the physiological response and productivity traits of field-grown tomatoes in Hungary. *Horticulturae* **8**(7):641 DOI 10.3390/horticulturae8070641.

- Parihar M, Rakshit A, Rana K, Tiwari G, Jatav SS. 2020. The effect of arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi inoculation in mitigating salt stress of pea (*Pisum Sativum* L.). *Communications in Soil Science and Plant Analysis* 51(11):1545–1559 DOI 10.1080/00103624.2020.1784917.
- Patel D, Jha CK, Tank N, Saraf M. 2021. Growth enhancement of chickpea in saline soils using plant growth promoting rhizobacteria. *Journal of Plant Growth Regulation* 31(1):53–62.
- Petrillo C, Vitale E, Ambrosino P, Arena C, Isticato R. 2022. Plant growth-promoting bacterial consortia as a strategy to alleviate drought stress in *Spinacia oleracea*. *Microorganisms* 10:1798 DOI 10.3390/microorganisms10091798.
- **Putra SP, Santosa S, Salsinha YCF. 2023.** Waterlogging and salinity stress affecting growth and morphological character changes of *Limnocharis flava*. *Biodiversitas Journal of Biological Diversity* **24**(1):333–340.
- Quyet-Tien P, Yu-Mi P, Keyung-Jo S, Choong-Min R, Seung-Hwan P, Jong-Guk K, Sa-Youl G. 2010. Assessment of root-associated *Paenibacillus polymyxa* groups on growth promotion and induced systemic resistance in pepper. *Journal of Microbiology and Biotechnology* 20:1605–1613.
- **Rigi F, Saberi M, Ebrahimi M. 2023.** Improved drought tolerance in *Festuca ovina* L. using plant growth promoting bacteria. *Journal of Arid Land* **15(6)**:740–755 DOI 10.1007/s40333-023-0015-6.
- Sandhya V, Ali SZ, Grover M, Reddy G, Venkateswarlu B. 2010. Effect of plant growth promoting *Pseudomonas* spp on compatible solutes antioxidant status and plant growth of maize under drought stress. *Plant Growth Regulators* 62(1):21–30 DOI 10.1007/s10725-010-9479-4.
- Sapre S, Gontia-Mishra I, Tiwari S. 2018. *Klebsiella* sp. confers enhanced tolerance to salinity and plant growth promotion in oat seedlings (*Avena sativa*). *Microbiological Research* 206:25–32 DOI 10.1016/j.micres.2017.09.009.
- Sapre S, Gontia-Mishra I, Tiwari S. 2021. Plant growth promoting rhizobacteria ameliorates salinity stress in pea (*Pisum sativum*). *Journal of Plant Growth Regulation* 41:647–656 DOI 10.1007/s00344-021-10329-y.
- Semida WM, Abdelkhalik A, Mohamed GF, Abd El-Mageed TA, Abd El-Mageed SA, Rady MM, Ali EF. 2021. Foliar application of zinc oxide nanoparticles promotes drought stress tolerance in eggplant (*Solanum melongena* L.). *Plants* 10:421 DOI 10.3390/plants10020421.
- Sen S, Chandrasekhar CN. 2014. Effect of PGPR on growth promotion of rice (*Oryza sativa* L.) under salt stress. *Asian Journal of Plant Science and Research* 4:62–67.
- Shahzad R, Khan AL, Bilal S, Waqas M, Kang SM, Lee IJ. 2017. Inoculation of abscisic acid-producing endophytic bacteria enhances salinity stress tolerance in Oryza sativa. Environmental and Experimental Botany 136:68–77 DOI 10.1016/j.envexpbot.2017.01.010.
- Singh RP, Pandey DM, Jha PN, Ma Y. 2022. ACC deaminase producing rhizobacterium Enterobacter cloacae ZNP-4 enhance abiotic stress tolerance in wheat plant. *PLOS ONE* 17(5):e0267127 DOI 10.1371/journal.pone.0267127.

- Soliman MH, Alayafi AAM, El Kelish AA, Abu-Elsaoud AM. 2018. Acetylsalicylic acid enhance tolerance of *Phaseolus vulgaris* L. to chilling stress, improving photosynthesis, antioxidants and expression of cold stress responsive genes. *Botanical Studies* 59(1):6 DOI 10.1186/s40529-018-0222-1.
- Taha R, Seleiman MF, Alhammad BA, Alkahtani J, Alwahibi MS, Mahdi AHA. 2021. Activated yeast extract extract enhances growth, anatomical structure, and productivity of *Lupinus termis* L. plants under actual salinity conditions. *Agronomy* 11:74 DOI 10.3390/agronomy11010074.
- Taie HA, Abdelhamid MT, Dawood MG, Nassar RMA. 2013. Pre-sowing seed treatment with proline improves some physiological, biochemical and anatomical attributes of faba bean plants under sea water stress. *Journal of Applied Sciences Research* 9(4):2853–2867.
- Tufail MA, Touceda-Gonzá M, Pertot I, Ehlers RU. 2021. *Gluconacetobacter diazotrophicus* Pal5 enhances plant robustness status under the combination of moderate drought and low nitrogen stress in *Zea mays* L. *Microorganisms* 9(4):870 DOI 10.3390/microorganisms9040870.
- Ud Din MM, Khan MI, Azam M, Ali MH, Qadri R, Naveed M, Nasir A. 2023. Effect of biochar and compost addition on mitigating salinity stress and improving fruit quality of tomato. *Agronomy* 13(9):2197 DOI 10.3390/agronomy13092197.
- Usman M, Ahmad N, Raza W, Zhao Z, Abubakar M, Rehman SU, Ikram S, Tariq H.
  2023. Impact of biochar on the yield and nutritional quality of tomatoes (*Solanum lycopersicum*) under drought stress. *Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture* 103(7):3479–3488 DOI 10.1002/jsfa.12517.
- Wang Y, Reiter RJ, Chan Z. 2017. Phytomelatonin: a universal abiotic stress regulator. *Journal of Experimental Botany* 69:963–974 DOI 10.1093/jxb/erx473.
- Yadav AN, Verma P, Kour D, Rana KL, Kumar V. 2017. Plant microbiomes and its beneficial multifunctional plant growth promoting attributes. *International Journal of Environmental Sciences & Natural Resources* 3:1–8.
- Yasmin H, Naeem S, Bakhtawar M, Jabeen Z, Nosheen A, Naz R, Keyani R, Mumtaz S, Hassan MN. 2020. Halo-tolerant rhizobacteria *Pseudomonas* pseudoalcaligenes and *Bacillus* subtilis mediate systemic tolerance in hydroponically grown soybean (*Glycine max* L.) against salinity stress. *PLOS ONE* 15:e0231348 DOI 10.1371/journal.pone.0231348.
- Youssef SM, Abdella EM, Al-Elwany OA, Alshallash KS, Alharbi K, Ibrahim MT, Tawfik MM, Abu-Elsaoud AM, Elkelish A. 2022. Integrative application of foliar yeast extract and gibberellic acid improves morpho-physiological responses and nutrient uptake of *Solidago virgaurea* plant in alkaline soil. *Life* **2(9)**:1405 DOI 10.3390/life12091405.
- Zahir ZA, Ghani U, Naveed M, Nadeem SM, Asghar HN. 2009. Comparative effectiveness of *Pseudomonas* and *Serratia* sp. containing ACC-deaminase for improving growth and yield of wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.) under salt-stressed conditions. *Archives of Microbiology* 191:415–424 DOI 10.1007/s00203-009-0466-y.

Zhang F, Zhang K, Du C, Li J, Xing Y, Yang L, Li Y. 2015. Effect of drought stress on anatomical structure and chloroplast ultrastructure in leaves of sugarcane. *Sugar Tech* 17(1):41–48 DOI 10.1007/s12355-014-0337-y.