

# Risk factors associated with prolonged viral clearance in patients with a refractory course of COVID-19—a retrospective study

Weitao Zhuang<sup>Equal first author, 1, 2</sup>, Shujie Huang<sup>Equal first author, 1, 2</sup>, Dongya Wang<sup>3, 4</sup>, Lulu Zha<sup>3, 4</sup>, Wei Xu<sup>5</sup>, Guibin Qiao<sup>Corresp. 1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Department of Thoracic Surgery, Guangdong Provincial People's Hospital, Guangzhou, Guangdong, China

<sup>2</sup> Shantou University Medical College, Shantou, Guangdong, China

<sup>3</sup> General Hospital of Southern Theater Command, Chinese People's Liberation Army, Guangzhou, Guangdong, China

<sup>4</sup> Huoshenshan Hospital, Wuhan, China

<sup>5</sup> School of Public Health and Management, Chongqing Medical University, Chongqing, China

Corresponding Author: Guibin Qiao

Email address: qiaoguibin@gdph.org.cn

**Background:** This study aimed to characterize a cohort of patients with a refractory course of COVID-19, and to investigate factors associated with the duration of viral clearance (DoVC).

**Materials & Methods:** A total of 65 patients with refractory COVID-19 were retrospectively enrolled from Huoshenshan Hospital. Univariate analysis and multivariate analysis were performed to examine the potential association between clinicopathologic characteristics and the DoVC.

**Results:** The median DoVC in the overall study cohort was 48 days (ranged from 21 to 104 days). Multivariate analysis indicated that fever at illness onset [Hazard ratio (HR) = 4.897, 95%CI, 1.809–13.260,  $p = 0.002$ ], serum level of aspartate aminotransferase  $> 21.8$  IU/L (HR = 3.010, 95% CI, 1.195–7.578,  $p = 0.019$ ), and titer of SARS-CoV-2 IgG  $> 142.09$  (HR = 3.061, 95% CI, 1.263–7.415,  $p = 0.013$ ) were the three independent risk factors associated with delayed viral clearance.

**Conclusion:** The current study suggested that clinical characteristics such as fever at illness onset, mildly impaired liver function, and a high serum level of SARS-CoV-2 IgG were associated with delayed viral clearance. Patients with these characteristics might need a more positive treatment strategy to accelerate their recovery from the refractory COVID-19 diseases.

# **Risk factors associated with prolonged viral clearance in patients with a refractory course of COVID-19: a retrospective study**

Weitao Zhuang<sup>1,2</sup>, M.D., Shujie Huang<sup>1,2</sup>, M.D., Dongya Wang<sup>3,4</sup>, B.S.N., Lulu Zha<sup>3,4</sup>, B.S.N., Wei Xu, Ph.D.<sup>5</sup>, Guibin Qiao<sup>1</sup>, M.D., Ph.D.

## **Affiliations:**

1. Guangdong Provincial People's Hospital, Guangdong Academy of Medical Sciences, Guangzhou 510080, China;
2. Shantou University Medical College, Shantou 515041, China;
3. Huoshenshan Hospital, Wuhan 430113, China;
4. General Hospital of Southern Theater Command, Chinese People's Liberation Army, Guangzhou, 510010, China
5. School of Public Health and Management, Chongqing Medical University, Chongqing 400016, China

\* Weitao Zhuang and Shujie Huang contributed equally to this work

## **Corresponding to:**

Guibin Qiao, M.D., Ph.D.

Department of Thoracic Surgery

Guangdong Provincial People's Hospital, Guangdong Academy of Medical Sciences

106 Zhongshan Second Road, Guangzhou 510080, China.

Email: [guibinqiao@126.com](mailto:guibinqiao@126.com)

## Abstract

**Background:** This study aimed to characterize a cohort of patients with a refractory course of COVID-19, and to investigate factors associated with the duration of viral clearance (DoVC).

**Materials & Methods:** A total of 65 patients with refractory COVID-19 were retrospectively enrolled from Huoshenshan Hospital. Univariate analysis and multivariate analysis were performed to examine the potential association between clinicopathologic characteristics and the DoVC.

**Results:** The median DoVC in the overall study cohort was 48 days (ranged from 21 to 104 days). Multivariate analysis indicated that fever at illness onset [Hazard ratio (HR) = 4.897, 95%CI, 1.809–13.260,  $p = 0.002$ ], serum level of aspartate aminotransferase  $> 21.8$  IU/L (HR = 3.010, 95% CI, 1.195–7.578,  $p = 0.019$ ), and titer of SARS-CoV-2 IgG  $> 142.09$  (HR = 3.061, 95% CI, 1.263–7.415,  $p = 0.013$ ) were the three independent risk factors associated with delayed viral clearance.

**Conclusion:** The current study suggested that clinical characteristics such as fever at illness onset, mildly impaired liver function, and a high serum level of SARS-CoV-2 IgG were associated with delayed viral clearance. Patients with these characteristics might need a more positive treatment strategy to accelerate their recovery from the refractory COVID-19 diseases.

**Keywords:** COVID-19; Risk factors; Reinfection; Refractory; Viral Clearance

## Introduction

As the severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) sweeps across the globe, there is rising concern that the patients who recovered from COVID-19 may be at risk of reinfection. It was reported that a small percentage of patients were tested positive again after recovery from a previous episode of COVID-19 infection.<sup>1,2</sup> However, the mechanism of reinfection/reactivation has not been clarified, which created an

uncertainty of the criteria to define clinical and virological recovery.<sup>3</sup> Miscellaneous hypotheses are coming out to address this scientific question, such as false positive results from the leftover genetic materials,<sup>4,5</sup> persistence of virus within body, cross-contamination from another virus, incorrect sampling methods,<sup>6</sup> thermal inactivation of samples,<sup>7</sup> impaired immune response,<sup>5</sup> even storage of viruses in exosomes and extracellular vesicles.<sup>8</sup> Given the false negative rates were as high as 30%–60% for SARS-CoV-2 PCR testings in upper respiratory tract or sputum specimens,<sup>9,10</sup> it is not easy to distinguish between reinfection and prolonged viral clearance.<sup>11,12</sup> Underlying mechanisms and corresponding patient characteristics of reinfection or prolonged viral clearance may be quite different, which requires personalized treatment strategy. As the medical institutions are overwhelmed by the cumulating patients, what kind of care should be provided to reinfected patients, and how to deal with the patients with a refractory course of diseases, remain to be answered by both physicians and researchers.

The median duration of viral shedding was reported to be about 20 days in many studies.<sup>13-17</sup> However, prolonged viral clearance is not a rare phenomenon, with the longest duration being 83 days.<sup>18-20</sup> In this regard, a longer period of post-discharged quarantine and medical observation has been suggested.<sup>1,18,20</sup> Identifying the patients who are at risk of reinfection or delayed viral clearance might be the first important step to tackle the abovementioned challenge. This may help with optimizing the treatment and preventing the transmission of diseases. Recently, studies are emerging to identify the risk factors associated with longer viral clearance.<sup>14,15,17,21</sup> However, risk factors of prolonged duration of viral clearance (DoVC) in patients with a refractory course of COVID-19 are less clear and deserve further investigation. Mo, et al. defined a hospital stay of > 10 days without alleviation of symptoms or radiological improvement to be the refractory COVID-19 diseases, which was the first study to investigate the clinical characteristics associated with refractory COVID-19

pneumonia.<sup>22</sup> By their definition, nearly a half of the patients in this study had a refractory course of COVID-19, which suggested a necessity of further stratification.<sup>22</sup>

In our study, we characterized a cohort of patients who were deemed having a refractory course of COVID-19 disease, with the purpose to identify the clinicopathologic risk factors associated with the delayed viral clearance.

## Patients and Methods

### Participants

A total of 65 inpatients with refractory COVID-19 from Huoshenshan Hospital between February 8, 2020 to March 31, 2020 were enrolled in this retrospective study. All patients had a calculated DoVC longer than 20 days and had a previous history of COVID-19-related hospitalization before admitted to Huoshenshan Hospital. Patients with a calculated DoVC  $\leq 20$  days were excluded from this study. The severity of disease was evaluated based on the sixth version of Chinese clinical guideline for COVID-19.<sup>23</sup> Mild cases referred to mild clinical symptoms with no sign of pneumonia on imaging. General cases were defined as positive clinical symptoms along with pneumonia on thoracic imaging. Patients who met any of the following criteria were classified as severe cases: respiratory rate  $\geq 30$  per minute; pulse oxygen saturation  $\leq 93\%$  at resting status; arterial partial pressure of oxygen (PaO<sub>2</sub>)/oxygen concentration (FiO<sub>2</sub>)  $\leq 300$  mmHg; patients with  $> 50\%$  progression of lesion volume within 24 to 48 hours on chest imaging. Patients who presented with any of the following conditions were defined as critical cases: Respiratory failure that requires mechanical ventilation; shock; organ failure that requires ICU care. Patients could be discharged after they met the following criteria<sup>13</sup>: absence of fever for at least 3 days, remission of clinical symptoms or chest imaging, and two consecutive negative results for SARS-

CoV-2 RNA in respiratory tract samples obtained at least 24 hours apart. This study was approved by the institutional review boards of Huoshenshan Hospital (No. IEC-AF-SL-02), Guangdong Provincial People's Hospital (No.GDRE20200141H) and General Hospital of Southern Theater Command (No.202039), and was carried out in accordance with the Declaration of Helsinki. Electronic forms of informed consents to use their demographic and clinical information were collected from all participants in advance.

## Data collection

A standardized sheet for data collection was used to retrieve the demographic, clinical, laboratory and treatment information from electronic medical records. Given the relatively high rate of false negative nucleic acid testing by nasal/pharyngeal swabs in the previous studies,<sup>9,10</sup> we raised the standard to define viral clearance, which was in accordance with the abovementioned standard criteria of discharge from hospital.<sup>13</sup> Therefore, the DoVC was calculated from the date of illness onset (as stated in the history of present illness) to the date of discharge from Huoshenshan hospital. For those who received their negative results of nucleic acid testing but were delayed for discharge due to complications of other organ systems, the DoVC was calculated from the date of illness onset to the date of the second negative nucleic acid testing. Patients with a DoVC > 20 days were defined to have a refractory course of COVID-19 and satisfied the inclusion criteria of this study. All data were double-checked by two researchers (W. Z. and S. H.) independently for accuracy.

## Laboratory tests

Respiratory samples were tested for SARS-CoV-2 RNA by the real-time reverse transcriptase polymerase chain-reaction (RT-PCR) test (BioGerm, Shanghai, China), following WHO guideline for qRT-PCR.<sup>24,25</sup> SARS-

CoV-2 IgM and IgG antibodies in blood samples were measured using chemiluminescent immunoassay (Shenzhen Yahuilong Biotechnology Co., Ltd) as per manufacturer's protocol. The titers higher than 10 of either IgM or IgG were considered positive infection for SARS-CoV-2.

# **Treatment**

All patients were provided with necessary supportive care during the first and second hospitalizations, including but not limited to oxygen, antipyretic, antitussive, expectorant, antidiabetic, and antihypertensive agents. For etiological treatment, antivirals, antibiotics, traditional Chinese herbal tea or Chinese patent medicine were used either separately or in combination.

# **Statistical analysis**

Data of baseline characteristics such as demographic information, reasons of admission, symptoms and signs, comorbidities and treatment details were presented as frequency (percentage), while data of laboratory results were presented as median (interquartile range, IQR). The medians of continuous variables were used as cut-off values to separate the patients into two groups for the sake of comparison, except for C-reactive protein and procalcitonin, where the upper limits of normal range were used. Univariate analysis was performed by using log-rank test to evaluate the association of patient characteristics with DoVC. All variables with p values  $\leq 0.1$  were included in multivariate analysis. Subsequently, log minus log function was used to identify the covariates which did not satisfy the proportional hazard assumption, and

these covariates were excluded for the subsequent multivariate analysis. Multivariate analysis was conducted using Cox regression model to identify independent risk factors of prolonged viral clearance. Cases with missing data were excluded from the Cox regression model. A sensitivity analysis was performed to assess the robustness of the results (see Supplementary table S1, S2). Finally, Kaplan-Meier method was used to visualize the impact of these risk factors on the DoVC. All data were performed using IBM SPSS statistics for Windows, Version 25.0 (Armonk, NY: IBM Corp., USA). Figures were generated using the using R software version 3.6.3 (R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria).

## Results

### Baseline characteristics

The mean age of patients with a refractory course of COVID-19 was 52.5 years old, and 40 out of 65 patients were male. According to the sixth version of Chinese clinical guideline for COVID-19,<sup>23</sup> 51 out of 68 (78.5%) patients were classified as general cases, while the others were severe cases. The number of patients who were readmitted to hospitals because of recurrence of symptoms, possible reinfection with positive nucleic acid testing again or referral with persistent symptoms was 3 (4.6%), 11 (16.9%) and 51 (78.5%), respectively. Fever (78.5%), cough (70.8%), shortness of breath (43.1%) and fatigue (33.8%) were the four most prevalent sign and symptoms at illness onset among these patients. Hypertension (26.2%) was the most common comorbidity, followed by type II diabetes mellitus (18.5%) (Table 1).

### Clinicopathologic information



Complete blood count and blood biochemistries such as inflammatory seromarkers, renal, cardiac and hepatic function tests were measured upon admission to Huoshenshan Hospital (Table 2). Of the 65 individuals, 59 patients had white blood cell counts in the normal range; 8 patients had increased platelet counts; 30 patients had increased C-reactive protein (CRP). Eleven out of 39 patients had increased procalcitonin (PCT). Almost all patients were normal regarding cardiac, renal and hepatic function tests. Thirty-five patients were tested for the serum antibodies to SARS-CoV-2, of which all patients were positive for SARS-CoV-2 IgG, while only 88.6% of patients were positive for SARS-CoV-2 IgM. In this study cohort, 26 out of 65 patients (40.0%) were treated with antiviral agents, including ribavirin, arbidol, oseltamivir and entecavir. Thirty-seven out of 65 patients (56.9%) were treated with antibiotics, which were mainly cephalosporin and floxacillin. Notably, 95.4% of patients received traditional Chinese herbal tea or Chinese patent medicine, such as Lianhua Qingwen Capsule. Corticosteroid was mainly provided to the severe or critical cases. Twenty-six out of 65 patients had poor sleep quality and required prescription of hypnotics. The median DoVC in the overall study cohort was 48 days (ranged from 21 to 104 days). More than a half of the patients (53.8%) had a DoVC in the range of 31 to 60 days, and the DoVC was longer than 2 months in 30.8% of patients.

### **Risk factors associated with longer viral clearance**

In univariate analyses, several clinicopathologic characteristics were found to be associated with the DoVC, including fever ( $p = 0.03$ ), shortness of breath ( $p = 0.03$ ), and fatigue ( $p = 0.03$ ) at onset, as well as serum levels of CRP ( $p = 0.01$ ) and SARS-CoV-2 IgG ( $p = 0.01$ ) (Table 1, Table 2). Thirty-five patients with complete data were included in the Cox model with a -2 Log Likelihood being 147.9 (overall Chi-square value = 27.909,  $p < 0.001$ ), indicating an acceptable goodness-of-fit of the current model. Sensitivity analyses suggested no

statistically significant difference in baseline and clinical characteristics between overall study cohort and patients included in Cox model (see Supplementary table S1, S2). Multivariate analysis suggested that fever at illness onset [Hazard ratio (HR) = 4.897, 95%CI, 1.809–13.260,  $p = 0.002$ ], serum level of AST > 21.8 IU/L (HR = 3.010, 95% CI, 1.195–7.578,  $p = 0.019$ ), and titer of SARS-CoV-2 IgG > 142.09 (HR = 3.061, 95% CI, 1.263–7.415,  $p = 0.013$ ) were the three independent risk factors associated with longer viral clearance in the refractory COVID-19 patients (Table 3). The proportional curves of positive viral test specified by three independent factors were depicted using Kaplan-Meier method (Figure 1). The estimated median DoVC was significantly longer in patients with fever at admission (54 days vs. 44 days,  $p = 0.028$ ), with a titer of SARS-CoV-2 IgG higher than 142 AU/ml (68 days vs. 56 days,  $p = 0.013$ ). Patients with mildly impaired liver function (with AST > 21.8 IU/L) were deemed to have only a statistically boundary significant longer DoVC (56 days vs. 44 days,  $p = 0.089$ ).

## Discussion

The DoVC is central for decision-making of nosocomial isolation precaution and post-discharge quarantine. Due to the high infectivity of virus and the overloaded medical system, a refractory clinical course of COVID-19 could be rather annoying for both patients and medical workers. However, there is still a lack of clinical guideline to deal with this particular group of patients. The current study documented the demographical, epidemiological, laboratory, and many other clinical data in a cohort of patients with a refractory course of COVID-19 disease, with the purpose to identify the risk factors of prolonged hospitalization or viral clearance in these patients. In this retrospective study, 11 out of 65 (16.9%) were considered as possible reinfection (Table

1), given that they were negative for viral RNA in the former two consecutive nucleic acid tests. However, there was no concrete evidence to support this assumption as the false negative rate of nucleic acid testing was too high. Therefore, they were collectively recognized as patients with a refractory clinical course of COVID-19, along with those with recrudescence or persistent symptoms. It should be noted that this definition did not necessarily signify a severe or critical disease.

Before the cross-study comparison, it is worth noting that the definition of duration of viral shedding or viral clearance has not been unified in the previous studies.<sup>14,17,21</sup> In consideration of the high false negative rate of nucleic acid testing, we adopted a more conservative criteria to define the date of discharge as the endpoint of viral clearance. As two patients were still in hospitalization due to the complications from other organ systems despite their negative viral RNA results, their DoVC was calculated from the date of illness onset to the date of the second negative nucleic acid testing. The median DoVC was 48 days in our study, which was similar to the finding of one previous study (median = 53.5 days, IQR 47.75-60.5 days).<sup>18</sup> The duration of viral shedding was about 20 days in many other studies, which was much shorter because the patients with multiple COVID-19-related admissions were usually not enrolled.<sup>13-17</sup> It should be noted that nasal or pharyngeal swabs were mostly used for nucleic testing in these studies, but persistent SARS-CoV-2 RNA has been found elsewhere (e.g. anal swab or stool sample) after negative conversion of nasopharyngeal RT-PCR test.<sup>9,26</sup>

In the current study, the DoVC had a very wide range (Table 2), which indicated that the further stratification among this population might be helpful for personalized management. We have identified the presence of fever at illness onset, AST > 21.8 IU/L and titer of SARS-CoV-2 IgG > 142.09 to be the three independent risk factors for longer viral clearance in the refractory COVID-19 patients (Table 3, Figure 1). Several other studies have also revealed the presence of fever was significantly associated with prolonged

DoVC.<sup>27,28</sup> These patients were hypothesized to be more severely affected by the SARS-CoV-2 infection in the lungs and thus the prolonged DoVC.<sup>27</sup> Fever at illness onset may indicate a cytokine storm or a higher viral load at the time of symptom onset,<sup>29</sup> as the viral load was found to be associated with more severe COVID-19 and a longer virus-shedding period.<sup>30</sup> Mildly abnormal liver function test was frequently reported in COVID-19 patients, especially the elevated plasma AST.<sup>26,30,31</sup> Although a serum level of AST > 21.8 IU/L in our study not necessarily signified clinical relevance, it was significantly associated with a delayed viral clearance in multivariable analysis (HR = 3.010, 95% CI, 1.195–7.578, p=0.019). Drug-induced liver injury should be taken into consideration,<sup>31</sup> because a longer hospital stay usually required more medication, which were potentially hepatotoxic. Other possible underlying mechanisms included direct viral hepatitis or immune-mediated inflammatory response.<sup>27</sup> The presence of angiotensin-converting enzyme 2 (ACE2) receptor on cholangiocytes and hepatocytes suggested a plausible mechanism of SARS-CoV-2 related hepatotoxicity.<sup>33</sup> Interestingly, a high level of SARS-CoV-2 IgM was also found to be related to the prolonged viral shedding in a previous study,<sup>18</sup> which was instead echoed by the level of IgG in our study. The larger magnitude of SARS-CoV-2 IgG, along with presence of fever at illness onset, might imply a higher viral load or stronger immune response to the virus. Nevertheless, the underlying mechanism requires further investigation.

Although less importantly, attention should also be paid to the symptoms such as shortness of breath, fatigue and the serum level of CRP (Table 1, Table 2). However, we did not observe the impact of age, comorbidities, severity of disease and treatment on the DoVC. Previous studies revealed multiple risk factors associated with prolonged viral shedding, including age,<sup>14,21</sup> sex,<sup>17</sup> fever<sup>15,34</sup> or chest tightness<sup>21</sup> at admission, comorbidities such as hypertension and diabetes mellitus,<sup>27</sup> the duration from symptom onset to admission,<sup>15,17</sup> albumin level,<sup>16</sup> antiviral treatment,<sup>14,16</sup> invasive mechanical ventilation,<sup>17</sup> and length of hospital stay.<sup>15</sup> What is noteworthy is

that many studies directly divided the patients into two groups using a cutoff value in the DoVC and perform multivariate analysis by logistic regression, instead of using Kaplan-Meier method and Cox regression model.<sup>14,15,17</sup> This might have led to a loss of detailed temporal information, and thus the inaccuracy of results.

Although this study is bolstered by its design and methodological strength, it is also limited by its retrospective nature and small sample size. Not all tests were performed and monitored in all patients during hospitalization, especially the serology testing for SARS-CoV-2. Therefore, patients with incomplete data were excluded from multivariable regression analysis, which limited its statistical power despite a sensitivity analysis had proved the representativeness of the included samples. The patients with multiple hospitalizations might potentially subject to recall bias in retrieving the treatment history. Additionally, we only enrolled patients with a refractory COVID-19 disease, therefore, the results and conclusion should be customized to this specific group of patients, which limits the generalizability of this study. Finally, the ability to associate clinicopathologic characteristics with DoVC might be limited by using a convenient instead of statistically determined sample size.

In conclusion, clinical characteristics such as fever at illness onset, mildly impaired liver function, and a high serum level of SARS-CoV-2 IgG were associated with delayed viral clearance in patients with a refractory course of COVID-19. Patients with these characteristics might need a more positive treatment strategy to accelerate their recovery from the refractory COVID-19.

## Acknowledgements

We thank all the patients who provided consents to participate in this retrospective study.

## Funding

This study was funded by the 2020 Guangdong Provincial Special Project for Popularization of Science and Technology Innovation (grant number: 2020A1414070007).

# References

1. Mei Q, Li J, Du R, Yuan X, Li M, Li J. Assessment of patients who tested positive for COVID-19 after recovery. *Lancet Infect Dis*. 2020. doi: 10.1016/S1473-3099(20)30433-3
2. Smith J. South Korea reports more recovered coronavirus patients testing positive again. Available from: <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-health-coronavirus-southkorea/south-korea-reports-more-recovered-coronavirus-patients-testing-positive-again-idUSKCN21V0JQ>.
3. Alvarez-Moreno CA, Rodriguez-Morales AJ. Testing Dilemmas: Post negative, positive SARS-CoV-2 RT-PCR - is it a reinfection? *Travel Med Infect Dis* 2020; 35: 101743. doi: 10.1016/j.tmaid.2020.101743
4. Chaturvedi R, Naidu R, Sheth S, Chakravarthy K. Efficacy of Serology Testing in Predicting Reinfection in Patients with SARS-CoV-2. *Disaster Med Public Health Prep* 2020: 1-7. doi: 10.1017/dmp.2020.216
5. Batisse D, Benech N, Botelho-Nevers E, Bouiller K, Collarino R, Conrad A. Clinical recurrences of COVID-19 symptoms after recovery: viral relapse, reinfection or inflammatory rebound? *J Infect* 2020. doi: 10.1016/j.jinf.2020.06.073.
6. Law SK, Leung Awn, Xu C. Is reinfection possible after recovery from COVID-19? *Hong Kong Med J* 2020; 26(3): 264-5. doi: 10.12809/hkmj208601
7. Pan Y, Long L, Zhang D, Yuan T, Cui S, Yang P, Wang Q, Ren S. Potential False-Negative Nucleic Acid Testing Results for Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus 2 from Thermal Inactivation of Samples with Low Viral Loads. *Clin Chem*. 2020;66(6):794-801. doi: 10.1093/clinchem/hvaa091
8. Elrashdy F, Aljaddawi AA, Redwan EM, Uversky VN. On the potential role of exosomes in the COVID-

- 19 reinfection/reactivation opportunity. *J Biomol Struct Dyn* 2020: 1-12. doi: 10.1080/07391102.2020.1790426
9. Wang W, Xu Y, Gao R, Lu R, Han K, Wu G, Tan W. Detection of SARS-CoV-2 in Different Types of Clinical Specimens. *JAMA* 2020, 12;323(18):1843-1844. doi: 10.1001/jama.2020.3786.
10. Li Y, Yao L, Li J, Chen L, Song Y, Cai Z, Yang C. Stability issues of RT-PCR testing of SARS-CoV-2 for hospitalized patients clinically diagnosed with COVID-19. *J Med Virol*. 2020;92(7):903-8. doi: 10.1002/jmv.25786
11. Man Z, Jing Z, Huibo S, Bin L, Fanjun Z. Viral shedding prolongation in a kidney transplant patient with COVID-19 pneumonia. *Am J Transplant* 2020. doi: 10.1111/ajt.15996
12. Xiao AT, Tong YX, Zhang S. False negative of RT-PCR and prolonged nucleic acid conversion in COVID-19: Rather than recurrence. *J Med Virol* 2020. doi: 10.1002/jmv.25855
13. Zhou F, Yu T, Du R, Fan G, Liu Y, Liu Z, Xiang J, Wang Y, Song B, Gu X, Guan L, Wei Y, Li H, Wu X, Xu J, Tu S, Zhang Y, Chen H, Cao B. Clinical course and risk factors for mortality of adult inpatients with COVID-19 in Wuhan, China: a retrospective cohort study. *Lancet*. 2020;395(10229):1054-62. doi: 10.1016/S0140-6736(20)30566-3
14. Yan D, Liu XY, Zhu YN, Huang L, Dan BT, Zhang GJ, Gao YH. Factors associated with prolonged viral shedding and impact of lopinavir/ritonavir treatment in hospitalised non-critically ill patients with SARS-CoV-2 infection. *Eur Respir J*. 2020;56(1). doi: 10.1183/13993003.00799-2020
15. Qi L, Yang Y, Jiang D, Tu C, Wan L, Chen X, Li Z. Factors associated with the duration of viral shedding in adults with COVID-19 outside of Wuhan, China: a retrospective cohort study. *Int J Infect Dis*. 2020;96:531-7. doi: 10.1016/j.ijid.2020.05.045
16. Fu Y, Han P, Zhu R, Bai T, Yi J, Zhao X, Tao M, Quan R, Chen C, Zhang Y, He Q, Jing M, Xiong X, Tian D, Yan W. Risk factors for viral RNA shedding in COVID-19 patients. *Eur Respir J*. 2020;56(1). doi:

295 10.1183/13993003.01190-2020

296 17. Xu K, Chen Y, Yuan J, Yi P, Ding C, Wu W, Li Y, Ni Q, Zou R, Li X, Xu M, Zhang Y, Zhao H, Zhang X,  
297 Yu L, Su J, Lang G, Liu J, Wu X, Guo Y, Tao J, Shi D, Yu L, Cao Q, Ruan B, Liu L, Wang Z, Xu Y, Liu Y,  
298 Sheng J, Li L. Factors associated with prolonged viral RNA shedding in patients with COVID-19. *Clin Infect*  
299 *Dis.* 2020. doi: 10.1093/cid/ciaa351

300 18. Li N, Wang X, Lv T. Prolonged SARS-CoV-2 RNA shedding: Not a rare phenomenon. *J Med Virol* 2020.  
301 doi: 10.1002/jmv.25952

302 19. Yang JR, Deng DT, Wu N, Yang B, Li HJ, Pan XB. Persistent viral RNA positivity during the recovery  
303 period of a patient with SARS-CoV-2 infection. *J Med Virol* 2020. doi: 10.1002/jmv.25940

304 20. Liu WD, Chang SY, Wang JT, Tsai MJ, Hung CC, Hsu CL, Chang SC. Prolonged virus shedding even  
305 after seroconversion in a patient with COVID-19. *J Infect.* 2020. doi: 10.1016/j.jinf.2020.03.063

306 21. Hu X, Xing Y, Jia J, Ni W, Liang J, Zhao D, Song X, Gao R, Jiang F. Factors associated with negative conversion  
307 of viral RNA in patients hospitalized with COVID-19. *Sci Total Environ.* 2020;728:138812. doi:  
308 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.138812

309 22. Mo P, Xing Y, Xiao Y, Deng L, Zhao Q, Wang H, Xiong Y, Cheng Z, Gao S, Liang K, Luo M, Chen T, Song S,  
310 Ma Z, Chen X, Zheng R, Cao Q, Wang F, Zhang Y. Clinical characteristics of refractory COVID-19 pneumonia in  
311 Wuhan, China. *Clin Infect Dis.* 2020 Mar 16:ciaa270. doi: 10.1093/cid/ciaa270.

312 23. National Health Commission of China. Chinese management guideline for COVID-19 (version 6.0).  
313 Published February 19, 2020.

314 [https://www.chinadaily.com.cn/pdf/2020/1.Clinical.Protocols.for.the.Diagnosis.and.Treatment.of.COVID-](https://www.chinadaily.com.cn/pdf/2020/1.Clinical.Protocols.for.the.Diagnosis.and.Treatment.of.COVID-19.V7.pdf)  
315 [19.V7.pdf](https://www.chinadaily.com.cn/pdf/2020/1.Clinical.Protocols.for.the.Diagnosis.and.Treatment.of.COVID-19.V7.pdf) (accessed Feb 20, 2020; in Chinese).



- 316 24. Corman VM, Landt O, Kaiser M, Molenkamp R, Meijer A, Chu DK, Bleicker T, Brunink S, Schneider J,  
317 Schmidt ML, Mulders DG, Haagmans BL, van der Veer B, van den Brink S, Wijsman L, Goderski G, Romette  
318 JL, Ellis J, Zambon M, Peiris M, Goossens H, Reusken C, Koopmans MP, Drosten C. Detection of 2019 novel  
319 coronavirus (2019-nCoV) by real-time RT-PCR. *Euro Surveill.* 2020;25(3). doi: 10.2807/1560-  
320 7917.ES.2020.25.3.2000045
- 321 25. Organization WH. Laboratory testing for 2019 novel coronavirus (2019-nCoV) in suspected human cases.  
322 Interim guidance. Jan 17, 2020. . [https://www.who.int/publications-detail/laboratory-testing-for-2019-novel-](https://www.who.int/publications-detail/laboratory-testing-for-2019-novel-coronavirus-in-suspected-human-cases-20200117)  
323 [coronavirus-in-suspected-human-cases-20200117](https://www.who.int/publications-detail/laboratory-testing-for-2019-novel-coronavirus-in-suspected-human-cases-20200117) (accessed Feb 20, 2020)
- 324 26. Kipkorir V, Cheruiyot I, Ngure B, Misiani M, Munguti J. Prolonged SARS-Cov-2 RNA Detection in  
325 Anal/Rectal Swabs and Stool Specimens in COVID-19 Patients After Negative Conversion in Nasopharyngeal  
326 RT-PCR Test. *J Med Virol* 2020. doi: 10.1002/jmv.26007
- 327 27. Zhou Y, Ding F, Bao W, Xue Y, Han L, Zhang X, Zhang P, Ji Y, Yin D, Bao A, Luo S, Xu Z, Liu J, Zhang M.  
328 Clinical features in coronavirus disease 2019 (COVID-19) patients with early clearance and prolonged shedding of  
329 severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 (SARS-CoV-2) RNA. *Ann Transl Med.* 2021;9(8):665. doi:  
330 10.21037/atm-21-445.
- 331 28. Bennasrallah C, Zemni I, Dhouib W, Sriha H, Mezhoud N, Bouslama S, Taboubi W, Beji MO, Kacem M,  
332 Abroug H, Fredj MB, Loussaief C, Belguith AS. Factors associated with a prolonged negative conversion of viral  
333 RNA in patients with COVID-19. *Int J Infect Dis.* 2021;105:463-9. doi: 10.1016/j.ijid.2021.02.089.
- 334 29. Chau AS, Weber AG, Maria NI, Narain S, Liu A, Hajizadeh N, Malhotra P, Bloom O, Marder G, Kaplan B. The  
335 Longitudinal Immune Response to Coronavirus Disease 2019: Chasing the Cytokine Storm. *Arthritis Rheumatol.*  
336 2021;73(1):23-35. doi: 10.1002/art.41526.

30. Liu Y, Yan LM, Wan L, Xiang TX, Le A, Liu JM, Peiris M, Poon LLM, Zhang W. Viral dynamics in mild and severe cases of COVID-19. *Lancet Infect Dis.* 2020;20(6):656-7. doi: 10.1016/S1473-3099(20)30232-2.
31. Bertolini A, van de Peppel IP, Bodewes F, Moshage H, Fantin A, Farinati F, Fiorotto R, Jonker JW, Strazzabosco M, Verkade HJ, Peserico G. Abnormal liver function tests in COVID-19 patients: relevance and potential pathogenesis. *Hepatology.* 2020. doi: 10.1002/hep.31480
32. Zarifian A, Bidary MZ, Arekhi S, Rafiee M, Gholamalizadeh H, Amirani A, Ghaderi MS, Khadem-Rezaian M, Amini M, Ganji A. Gastrointestinal and hepatic abnormalities in patients with confirmed COVID-19: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *J Med Virol.* 2020. doi: 10.1002/jmv.26314
33. Chai X, Hu L, Zhang Y, Han W, Lu Z, Ke A, Zhou J, Shi G, Fang N, Fan J, Cai J, Fan J, Lan F. Specific ACE2 expression in cholangiocytes may cause liver damage after 2019-nCoV infection. *bioRxiv* 2020.02.03.931766. doi: 10.1101/2020.02.03.931766.
34. Lu Y, Li Y, Deng W, Liu M, He Y, Huang L, Lv M, Li J, Du H. Symptomatic Infection is Associated with Prolonged Duration of Viral Shedding in Mild Coronavirus Disease 2019: A Retrospective Study of 110 Children in Wuhan. *Pediatr Infect Dis J.* 2020;39(7):e95-e9. doi: 10.1097/INF.0000000000002729

## Figure Legend

**Figure 1. Proportional curves of positive viral testing.** Comparison of duration of viral clearance between patients (A) with or without fever at onset; (B) with lower ( $\leq 142.09$ ) or higher ( $> 142.09$ ) levels of SARS-CoV-2 IgG; (C) with lower ( $\leq 21.8$  IU/L) or higher ( $> 21.8$  IU/L) levels of aspartate aminotransferase (AST). Log-rank test was used for comparison.

**Table 1** (on next page)

Table 1 Baseline characteristics of patients with a refractory clinical course of COVID-19

1 **Table 1** Baseline characteristics of patients with a refractory clinical course of COVID-19

Baseline Characteristics	Study cohort = 65 Frequency (%) / Mean $\pm$ SD	p value*
<b>Age (years)</b>	52.5 $\pm$ 14.1	0.85
$\leq 60$	43 (66.2)	
$> 60$	22 (33.8)	
<b>Male</b>	40 (61.5)	0.76
<b>Reasons of admission</b>		0.89
Recurrence of symptoms	3 (4.6)	
Possible reinfection with positive nucleic acid testing again	11 (16.9)	
Referral with persistent symptoms	51 (78.5)	
<b>Symptoms and signs at illness onset</b>		
Fever	51 (78.5)	<b>0.03</b>
Shortness of breath	28 (43.1)	<b>0.03</b>
Dyspnea	5 (7.7)	0.17
Chest tightness	11 (16.9)	0.77
Myalgia	13 (20.0)	0.97
Dry cough	16 (24.6)	0.70
Productive cough	30 (46.2)	0.82
Fatigue	22 (33.8)	<b>0.03</b>
Diarrhea	4 (6.2)	0.99
Headache	3 (4.6)	0.99
<b>Comorbidities</b>		
Hypertension	17 (26.2)	0.35
Type II diabetes mellitus	12 (18.5)	0.91
Coronary artery disease	4 (6.2)	0.24
COPD	3 (4.6)	0.94
Hepatitis B	3 (4.6)	0.50
Malignancy	2 (3.1)	0.67
<b>Smoker</b>	5 (7.7)	0.80
<b>Alcohol user</b>	2 (3.1)	0.99
<b>Severity of COVID-19 pneumonia</b>		0.40

Mild	0
General	51 (78.5)
Severe	14 (21.5)
Critical	0

2 \*Univariate analysis to determine the association of baseline characteristics with duration of viral clearance by  
 3 using log-rank test. COPD, chronic obstructive pulmonary diseases. Variables with p value in bold were included  
 4 in multivariable analysis.

# **Table 2**(on next page)

Table 2 Clinicopathologic characteristics of patients with a refractory clinical course of COVID-19

1 **Table 2** Clinicopathologic characteristics of patients with a refractory clinical course of COVID-19

Clinicopathologic characteristics	Study cohort = 65 Frequency (%) / Median (Q1, Q3)	Normal range	p value*
<b>Laboratory results</b>			
WBC # ( $\times 10^9/L$ )	6.00 (5.05, 7.10)	3.5–9.5	0.90
RBC # ( $\times 10^{12}/L$ )	4.10 (3.80, 4.45)	4.3–5.8	0.76
Platelet # ( $\times 10^9/L$ )	230.00 (184.5, 291.50)	125–350	<b>0.07</b>
NLR	2.35 (1.77, 3.45)		<b>0.08</b>
C-reactive protein (mg/L)	2.90 (1.59, 9.66)	0–4	<b>0.01</b>
Normal	35 (53.8)		
Increased	30 (46.2)		
Procalcitonin (ng/ml) (n=38)	0.05 (0.03, 0.06)	0–0.05	0.12
Normal	27 (71.1)		
Increased	11 (28.9)		
Albumin (g/L)	38.15 (35.35, 40.65)	40–55	0.54
ALT (IU/L)	30.15 (16.60, 49.85)	9–50	0.23
AST (IU/L)	21.80 (17.25, 29.20)	9–60	<b>0.09</b>
HBDH (IU/L) (n=48)	152.90 (128.20, 193.43)	24–190	0.33
LDH (IU/L) (n=48)	181.15 (156.83, 239.95)	120–250	0.44
CK (IU/L) (n=48)	48.05 (34.35, 70.43)	24–190	0.74
CK-MB (IU/L) (n=48)	7.75 (6.40, 11.50)	0–24	0.96
SARS-CoV-2 IgM (n=35) (AU/ml)	39.01 (17.74, 90.51)	< 10	0.26
SARS-CoV-2 IgG (n=35) (AU/ml)	142.09 (116.40, 179.86)	< 10	<b>0.01</b>
<b>Treatment details</b>			
Antivirals	26 (40.0)	—	0.12
Antibiotics	37 (56.9)	—	0.24
Traditional Chinese medicine	62 (95.4)	—	0.11
Corticosteroid	12 (18.5)	—	0.27
Hypnotics	26 (40.0)	—	0.66
<b>Duration of viral clearance</b>	49 (35, 65)	—	—
20-30 days	10 (15.4)		
31-60 days	35 (53.8)		

> 60 days

20 (30.8)

---

\* Univariate analysis to determine the association of clinicopathologic characteristics with duration of viral clearance by using log-rank test. Patients were categorized into two groups based on the median value of laboratory results except for C-reactive protein and procalcitonin. NLR, neutrophil-lymphocyte ratio; ALT, Alanine aminotransferase; AST, Aspartate aminotransferase; HBDH,  $\alpha$ -Hydroxybutyrate dehydrogenase; LDH, lactate dehydrogenase; CK, creatine kinase; CK-MB, creatine kinase isoenzyme. Variables with p value in bold were included in multivariable analysis.



# **Table 3**(on next page)

Table 3 Multivariate analysis using Cox regression model (n=36)

**Table 3** Multivariate analysis using Cox regression model (n=35)

Variables (Reference)	Hazard Ratio	95% Confidence Interval		p value
		Lower	Upper	
Fever (No)				
Yes	4.897	1.809	13.260	<b>0.002</b>
Shortness of breath (No)				
Yes	1.239	0.436	3.521	0.687
Fatigue (No)				
Yes	1.515	0.569	4.034	0.406
Platelet # ( $\leq 230 \times 10^9/L$ )				
$> 230 \times 10^9/L$	0.479	0.205	1.123	0.091
NLR ( $\leq 2.35$ )				
$> 2.35$	2.831	0.984	8.145	0.054
CRP ( $\leq 4$ mg/L)				
$> 4$ mg/L	0.311	0.087	1.115	0.073
AST ( $\leq 21.8$ IU/L)				
$> 21.8$ IU/L	3.010	1.195	7.578	<b>0.019</b>
SARS-CoV-2 IgG ( $\leq 142.09$ )				
$> 142.09$	3.061	1.263	7.415	<b>0.013</b>

NLR, neutrophil-lymphocyte ratio; CRP, C-reactive protein; AST, aspartate aminotransferase; SARS-CoV-2 IgG, Severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus 2 immunoglobulin G.

Figure 1

Figure 1 Proportional curves of positive viral testing.

