# Attitudes of Medical Students in Lahore, Pakistan towards the Doctor-Patient Relationship

Waqas Ahmad, Edward Krupat, Yumna Asmaa, Noor-E- Fatima, Rayan Attique, Umar Mahmood, Ahmed Waqas

**Background.** A good doctor-patient relationship is the centre stone of modern medicine. With each passing day patients are getting more and more aware about exercising their autonomy and thus modern medicine cannot deliver all its advances to the patients if a good doctor-patient relationship is not established. We initiated this study with the aim to assess the leaning of medical students, who are the healers of tomorrow, towards either a doctor-centered or a patient-centered care and explore the effects of personal attributes on it like gender, academic year etc. **Materials & Methods.** A cross-sectional study was conducted between July-Sep 2013. CMH Lahore Medical and Dental College Ethical Review Committee approved the study questionnaire. The study population consisted of 1181 medical students in years 1-5 from two medical colleges. English version of PPOS was used to assess attitudes of medical students towards doctor-patient relationship. The relationship between PPOS scores and individual characteristics like gender, academic year etc. were examined by multiple regression. **Results.** A total of 783 students formed the final sample (response rate=92%). The total PPOS score of the entire sample was 3.40  $(\pm .49 \text{ S.D})$ . Total sharing sub-scale score was 3.18  $(\pm 0.62 \text{ S.D.})$  Total caring sub-scale score was 3.63 (± 0.56 S.D). Characteristics associated with most patient-centered attitudes were advanced academic year, having a clinical rotation, having a foreign background and studying in a private college. Gender, having doctor parents, relationship and accommodation status had no bearing on the attitudes (p>0.05). **Conclusion.** Despite ongoing debate and emphasis on a patient-centered curriculum, our study suggests that current curriculum and its teachings are not producing the results they are designed to achieve. Students should be adequately exposed to the patients from the beginning of their medical education in clinical settings which are more sympathetic to a patientcentered care.

2	
3	"Attitudes of Medical Students in Lahore, Pakistan towards the Doctor-Patient Relationship"
4	Authors: Waqas Ahmad¹*, Edward Krupat², Yumna Asma¹, Noor-E-Fatima¹, Rayan Attique¹, Umar
5	Mahmood <sup>1</sup> , Ahmed Waqas <sup>1</sup> .
6	
7	<sup>1</sup> CMH Lahore Medical College and Institute of Dentistry, Shami Road, Lahore Cantt, Pakistan.
8	<sup>2</sup> Center for Evaluation, Harvard Medical School, 384 MEC, 260 Longwood Avenue, Boston,
9	Massachusetts, United States of America.
10	
11	*Corresponding Author
12	E-mail: waqas_lalamusa@yahoo.com (WA)
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	

24 25 Abstract: **Background.** A good doctor-patient relationship is the centre stone of modern medicine. With each 26 27 passing day patients are getting more and more aware about exercising their autonomy and thus 28 modern medicine cannot deliver all its advances to the patients if a good doctor-patient relationship is not established. We initiated this study with the aim to assess the leaning of medical students, who are 29 30 the healers of tomorrow, towards either a doctor-centered or a patient-centered care and explore the 31 effects of personal attributes on it like gender, academic year etc. 32 Materials & Methods. A cross-sectional study was conducted between July-Sep 2013. CMH Lahore 33 Medical and Dental College Ethical Review Committee approved the study questionnaire. The study population consisted of 1181 medical students in years 1-5 from two medical colleges. English version 34 35 of PPOS was used to assess attitudes of medical students towards doctor-patient relationship. The 36 relationship between PPOS scores and individual characteristics like gender, academic year etc. were examined by multiple regression. 37 38 **Results.** A total of 783 students formed the final sample (response rate=92%). The total PPOS score of 39 the entire sample was 3.40 ( $\pm$ .49 S.D). Total sharing sub-scale score was 3.18 ( $\pm$  0.62 S.D. Total 40 caring sub-scale score was 3.63 ( $\pm$  0.56 S.D). Characteristics associated with most patient-centered attitudes were advanced academic year, having a clinical rotation, having a foreign background and 41 studying in a private college. Gender, having doctor parents, relationship and accommodation status 42 43 had no bearing on the attitudes (p>0.05). 44 **Conclusion.** Despite ongoing debate and emphasis on a patient-centered curriculum, our study 45 suggests that current curriculum and its teachings are not producing the results they are designed to

- achieve. Students should be adequately exposed to the patients from the beginning of their medical
- 47 education in clinical settings which are more sympathetic to a patient-centered care.

48

49

68

#### **Introduction:**

"A chain is only as strong as its weakest link". In today's healthcare system, the doctor-patient 50 relationship is the weak link which bears the weight of all the advances of health care system and its 51 delivery to the patient. The stronger the relationship, the better are the patient's compliance to the 52 53 treatment, (Safran et al., 1998) disease outcomes and satisfaction. (Simpson et al., 1991; Stewart, 1995) 54 Just like a weak link in a chain, the doctor-patient relationship is under most strain when kept vertical (doctor-centered or paternalistic) which doesn't allow the patient any control over the flow of 55 information or treatment. On the other hand when it is kept horizontal (patient-centered or egalitarian) 56 the patient is encouraged to play the role of a partner(Campbell & McGauley, 2005) and takes greater 57 responsibility for his own health.(GROL et al., 1990) It benefits doctors by decreasing the incidence of 58 59 complaints and litigation(Beckman et al., 1994) and enables them to work at an optimum level to attain 60 the four prima facie maxims (beneficence, non-maleficence, respect for autonomy and justice)(Tor, 61 2001) of modern medicine.

Patients in the modern era are becoming more and more autonomous, (Shankar & Piryani, 2009)

a possibility never considered in prior times. But modern medicine cannot advance without

incorporating this essential ethical necessity. Medical education in many parts of the world is still very

much disease-oriented (Hafferty, 1998) with hours and hours of lectures dedicated to the management

of diseases instead of patients as a whole. Studies have shown that good communication skills can be

achieved by structured training, which runs contrary to past beliefs that good communication is an

intrinsic quality of a doctor and cannot be taught. (Smith et al., 2000)

Like clay that is cast in a mould to produce beautiful sculptures, medical students are also molded in a cast, baked under intense pressures and finally come out as the healers who embody all the properties that the cast, made by medical educators, has to offer. As healers of the future it is logical to see what they think about the very foundation of modern medicine, doctor-patient relationship. A growing body of research has demonstrated that medical students around the globe show wide difference in their attitudes towards the doctor-patient relationship. Researchers have used a valid and reliable scale called the Patient Practitioner Orientation Scale (PPOS)(Haidet et al., 2002) to measure this attitude in countries like Nepal,(Shankar et al., 2006) Korea,(Choi, Kim & Park, 2004) and Greece.(Tsimtsiou et al., 2005) Medical students in Brazil have highly positive beliefs about patient centered care (PPOS score of 4.66 ± 0.44 S.D).(Ribeiro, Krupat & Amaral, 2007), followed closely by American medical students (PPOS score is 4.57 ± 0.48 S.D).(Haidet et al., 2002)

As indicated by a study in Nepal (PPOS score of  $3.71 \pm 0.48$  S.D), medical students in Asia have a tendency towards Doctor Centered care, (Haidet et al., 2002; Shankar et al., 2006) which is associated with decreased patient satisfaction (Krupat et al., 2000) in many of the countries this relationship has been studied. We are conducting this study to ascertain the attitudes of medical students of Pakistan, the 4<sup>th</sup> most densely populated country in Asia to see if they break the taboo of "doctor knows best". (Tor, 2001)

#### **Materials & Methods:**

#### 88 Study Sample:

Descriptive, cross-sectional study design and convenience (non-probability) sampling technique was employed. In Pakistan undergraduate medical education lasts 5 years. This includes 2 pre-clinical years and 3 clinical years. (Waqas et al., 2015) The dominant form of teaching in the medical colleges across the country is non-problem based learning. The attitudes of medical students of academic year 1 to 5

from two medical colleges, a Government College (Allama Iqbal Medical College) and a Private

College (CMH Lahore Medical College), were assessed towards doctor-patient relationship between

July 2013 and Sep 2013. A standardized questionnaire with English version of PPOS and a series of

demographic questions was used. Forms were distributed to 1274 students (858 in govt. and 416 in

private) out of which 1181 responded [collective response rate 92% (91% and 94.2 % respectively)].

Out of 1181, 398 forms were discarded due to incomplete demographics and more than 3 missing

responses in PPOS (final sample N=783).

#### **Instrument:**

The doctor-patient relationship was assessed by using a reliable instrument called Patient Practitioner Orientation Scale (PPOS).(Haidet et al., 2002) The PPOS contains 18-items and uses a Likert-scale format and measures the subject's leaning towards a doctor-centered or a patient-centered belief. Each item has 6 possible responses ranging from 1 (strongly agree) to 6 (strongly disagree). The scale has two subscales which measure two domains of doctor-patient relationship: *Sharing* and *Caring*. *Sharing* refers to an individual's belief that a patient should share the power, control and flow of information equally with their doctor. *Caring* refers to an individual's belief that a patient should be treated as a whole and treated with good emotional rapport rather than as a condition or disease. Both sub-scales have 9 items each. All the scores are reported as mean of the total score ranging from 1 (doctor centered) to 6 (patient centered).

#### **Statistical Analysis:**

SPSS 21 was used for analysis. Descriptive statistics and frequencies were calculated for Subscale scores on PPOS and demographic variables respectively. Multiple regression analysis (backward method) was run to predict PPOS scores, Sharing and caring subscale scores from gender, age, study year, rotation (Outpatient department, Ward and not applicable) and nationality (Pakistani/overseas).

116 The assumptions of linearity, independence of errors, homoscedasticity, unusual points and normality 117 of residuals were assessed.

#### **Ethics Statement:**

- 119 CMH Lahore Medical and Dental College Ethical Review Committee approved the study
- questionnaire. 120



#### **Results:**

118

121

122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130

131

132

133

Students from academic year 1-5 of both colleges participated in this research (N= 783). The sample distribution by gender, college, academic year etc. is shown in Table-1. The average total PPOS score of the entire sample was 3.40 ( $\pm 0.49$  S.D). Total sharing sub-scale score was 3.18 ( $\pm 0.62$  S.D). Total caring sub-scale score was 3.63 ( $\pm$  0.56 S.D). Multiple regression analysis yielded significant models for mean PPOS scores, sharing and caring scores (Table 3). Mean PPOS scores were positively associated with students from private sector medical college and foreign background. Students rotating in wards or OPDs scored higher on PPOS scale. Similar trends were observed in *sharing* and *caring* domains. Sharing scores were significantly predicted by three variables: Students having a foreign background, currently in higher academic year and belong to a private sector medical college were associated with higher scores on sharing sub-scale. Caring sub-scale scores were positively associated with foreign background and rotation in OPD and wards. Having doctor parents, accommodation and relationship status had no bearing on doctor-patient relationship (p>0.05)

#### **Discussion:**

136

137

138

139

140

141

142

143

144

145

146

147

148

149

150

151

152

153

154

155

156

157

158

159

Our findings suggest that Pakistani medical students very much believe in the taboo of "Doctor Knows Best".(Tor, 2001) They scored even lower than their Nepali counterparts,(Shankar et al., 2006) except in caring domain, making them the most doctor-centered of those samples of medical students in several studies done around the world. Female gender, which is traditionally associated with patientcentered care and is shown to have leaning towards it(Haidet et al., 2002), had statistically the same distribution of PPOS scores as males of this sample (p>0.05). This finding although contradictory to the studies conducted in America and Brazil is consistent with findings in Nepal (another Asian country)(Haidet et al., 2002; Shankar et al., 2006; Ribeiro, Krupat & Amaral, 2007). This consistency might be due to social, religious and cultural differences present in the two continents i.e. Americas and Asia. No clear pattern was established in consecutive academic years in terms of total PPOS scores or caring sub-scale scores. However sharing domain scores showed a clear ascending pattern which suggests that students, as they go into higher academic years, become more aware about the rights of the patients and are willing to share the power of treatment choices with them. This finding is similar to the study done in Brazil(Ribeiro, Krupat & Amaral, 2007) but contradictory to the ones done in USA where good patient-centred care is associated with early academic years.(Haidet et al., 2002) Attributes associated with leaning towards patient-centred care were: studying in a private college, having a foreign background and rotating in wards or opds as opposed to no clinical hours. These attributes were consistent throughout the total PPOS scores and Sharing sub-scale. Private medical colleges have a better teacher to student ratio with a lesser patient load in attached private hospitals as opposed to government owned colleges. This might explain the higher scoring of students of private medical school. Interesting finding is that students who have a clinical rotation (students in clinical years), either in wards or opds, scored better than those who did not have a rotation (students in pre-clinical

160

161

162

163

164

165

166

167

168

169

170

171

172

173

174

175

176

177

178

179

180

181

182

183

years). These finding clearly divide our sample into the ones who just see patient on pages of books while the others who interact with them and see them as a whole. It also illustrates the importance of patient interactions and necessitates the student-patient interaction to begin at an early stage of medical training. Students who rotated in wards showed a stronger positive association with mean scores on PPOS than those who rotated in OPDs which could be due to a continuous flow of patients in opds who get a very brief interaction with doctor/students as opposed to patients in wards who stay there for long durations and give a better chance for students to get to know them and see them as a whole rather than a disease. Better performance by foreign students might be due to not sharing the Asian culture which is associated with doctor-centered care.(Haidet et al., 2002)

When a cast of clay comes out of a mould it bears all the qualities of that mould. Before baking, the clay is pliable and can be bent into any shape but once it is cast in the mould and is baked then it is difficult to impart changes in it because it is shaped forever in the way that mould was designed. That's exactly what medical education does to medical students who come to this field to heal patients(Lloyd-Williams & Dogra, 2004) but instead are taught to heal the disease only. The mould they are put in has no room for the development of characteristics like good communication skills etc. which are necessary for a good patient-centered care. The pressures they are exposed to (Academic, Psychosocial and Health related) further retard their shaping into a patient-centered practitioner (Wagas et al., 2015). However this does not mean that medical students after leaving medical school cannot modify their attitudes but it is much more beneficial to the patients and healthcare system if they are taught to focus on the patient as a whole sooner than later in their medical career. Shaikh et al have reported the prevalence of stress to be 90% in Pakistani medical students.(Shaikh et al., 2004) Further studies have shown that psychological stress can cause poor attitudes towards the chronically ill, decreased empathy and high levels of cynicism(Crandall, Volk & Loemker, 1993) which together amounts to a less favorable patient care. Students who experience these stresses seldom seek help because of the stigma

revolving around psychiatric illnesses. (Waqas et al., 2014) For this reason medical educators should make it mandatory to see the prevalence of such psychiatric illnesses/stressors during the course of medical education and should take prompt actions to protect students from their harmful effect and "nip the evil in the bud".

Another reason for medical students to be more doctor-centered could be due to the teachings of practicing doctors who teach them while attending to their patients. The environment they teach in is contradictory to the ideal students are taught in lecture theatres. (Grilo et al., 2014) Humayun A et al. have found that Pakistani doctors didn't take consent from more than 71% patients and provided adequate confidentiality to less than 24% of their patients. (Humayun et al., 2008) When medical students are taught in such a doctor-centered environment it is natural for them to embody such practices because when a student realizes that doctors, not following the prima facie maxims. (Tor, 2001) are still able to have a very healthy practice then he wonders if formalities like consent or confidentiality even matter in the real world medicine. Doctors in the government owned hospital didn't take consent from more than 90% patients and provided adequate confidentiality to less than 11% of their patients. (Humayun et al., 2008) Teachings of such doctors could explain our finding that medical students from government owned medical school scored lower on PPOS than of private medical school (p<0.05).

#### Conclusion

If we want to produce healers who treat the patient as a whole then medical educators would have to incorporate much more space in the mould of medical education for the essential characteristics (like good communication skills, empathy etc.) necessary to achieve the *prima facie maxims* of modern medicine. Students should be adequately exposed to patients from the beginning of their graduate program and in clinical settings which are more favorable to a patient-centered care. Continuous

monitoring of the students should be done to identify and mend the factors which push them away from a patient-centered caring attitude (e.g. Stress, Burnout) and patient-centered role models should be sought for students to observe and follow. Most of what is learned during the graduate program is through "Hidden Curriculum" which is a set of influences functioning at the level of organizational structure and culture.(Hafferty, 1998) This is mostly true for Pakistan since its biggest medical university (UHS) has, in recent years, introduced Behavioral Sciences as an integral part of the curriculum in 2007 which is yet to produce its effects in medical practice of Pakistan. To fight hidden curriculum both the curriculum designers and college administration would have to act to mitigate its toxic effects on the development of doctor-patient relationship.

217

218

208

209

210

211

212

213

214

215

216

#### Limitations and suggestions for future research:

- 219 Despite our efforts to completely explore the attitude of medical students towards doctor-patient
- 220 relationship we strongly believe that additional factors should be incorporated into further research
- done in the future in this domain.
- I. Academic staff from the respective colleges and hospitals was not included in this study which
- could have aided in measuring the extent of the problem.
- 224 II. We conducted our study in just one city. Further studies should include a broader sample
- comprising of medical students from all the four provinces and all religious and ethnic groups
- 226 to see if these factors have any effect on Patient-Centered Care.
- 227 III. The cross-sectional design of this study limits inferences about causality and temporality.
- 228 IV. Since PPOS just measures the orientation and not the behavior of medical students towards
- Patient-Centered care, future researchers should include means to see the behavior of medical
- students toward this entity.

232	Acknowledgement:
233	We would like to thank Dr. Anjum Anwar Qadri for motivating us to do a research project at
234	undergraduate level and constantly supporting us during the process. We would also thank our
235	statistician, Sir. Asif Hanif, for sparing us time from his busy schedule. We also commend the
236	efforts of Haris Abbas and Fahad Ahmad Khan in the process of data collection and data entry.
237	
238	References
239 240	Beckman HB, Markakis KM, Suchman AL, Frankel RM. 1994. The doctor-patient relationship and malpractice: lessons from plaintiff depositions. <i>Archives of Internal Medicine</i> 154:1365.
241 242	Campbell C, McGauley G. 2005. Doctor-patient relationships in chronic illness: insights from forensic psychiatry. <i>BMJ (Clinical research ed.)</i> 330:667–70.
243 244	Choi CJ, Kim JM, Park YG. 2004. Patient-centered attitudes and communication skills in medical students after clerkship. <i>Korean Journal of Medical Education</i> 16:169–177.
245 246	Crandall SJS, Volk RJ, Loemker V. 1993. Medical students' attitudes toward providing care for the underserved: are we training socially responsible physicians? <i>Jama</i> 269:2519–2523.
247 248	Grilo AM, Santos MC, Rita JS, Gomes AI. 2014. Nurse Education Today Assessment of nursing students and nurses ' orientation towards patient-centeredness. <i>YNEDT</i> 34:35–39.
249 250 251	GROL R, DE MAESENEER J, WHITFIELD M, MOKKINK H. 2000. Disease-Centred Versus Patient-Centred Attitudes: Comparison of General Practition in Belgium, Britain and The Netherlands. <i>Family Practice</i> 7:100–103.
252 253	Hafferty FW. 1998. Beyond Curriculum Reform: Confronting Medicine's Hidden Curriculum. <i>Academic Medicine</i> 73:403–407.
254 255	Haidet P, Dains JE, Paterniti D a, Hechtel L, Chang T, Tseng E, Rogers JC. 2002. Medical student attitudes toward the doctor-patient relationship. <i>Medical education</i> 36:568–74.
256 257 258	Humayun A, Fatima N, Naqqash S, Hussain S, Rasheed A, Imtiaz H, Imam SZ. 2008. Patients' perception and actual practice of informed consent, privacy and confidentiality in general medical outpatient departments of two tertiary care hospitals of Lahore. <i>BMC medical ethics</i> 9:14.

259 260 261	Krupat E, Rosenkranz SL, Yeager CM, Barnard K, Putnam SM, Inui TS. 2000. The practice orientations of physicians and patients: the effect of doctor-patient congruence on satisfaction. <i>Patient education and counseling</i> 39:49–59.
262 263 264	Lloyd-Williams M, Dogra N. 2004. Attitudes of preclinical medical students towards caring for chronically ill and dying patients: does palliative care teaching make a difference? <i>Postgraduate Medical Journal</i> 80:31–34.
265 266	Ribeiro MMF, Krupat E, Amaral CFS. 2007. Brazilian medical students' attitudes towards patient-centered care. <i>Medical teacher</i> 29:e204–8.
267 268	Safran DG, Taira DA, Rogers WH, Kosinski M, Ware Jr JE, Tarlov AR. 1998. Linking primary care performance to outcomes of care. <i>The Journal of family practice</i> 47
269 270	Shaikh BT, Kahloon A, Kazmi M, Khalid H, Nawaz K, Khan NA. 2004. Students, Stress and Coping Strategies: A Case of Pakistani Medical School. 17:346–353.
271 272 273	Shankar PR, Dubey a K, Subish P, Deshpande VY. 2006. Attitudes of first-year medical students towards the doctor patient relationship. <i>JNMA</i> ; <i>journal of the Nepal Medical Association</i> 45:196–203.
274 275	Shankar PR, Piryani RM. 2009. Medical education and medical educators in South Asiaa set of challenges. <i>Journal of the College of Physicians and SurgeonsPakistan : JCPSP</i> 19:52–6.
276 277	Simpson M, Buckman R, Stewart M, Maguire P, Lipkin M, Novack D, Till J. 1991. Doctor-patient communication: the Toronto consensus statement. <i>BMJ (Clinical research ed.)</i> 303:1385–7.
278 279 280	Smith RC, Marshall-Dorsey a a, Osborn GG, Shebroe V, Lyles JS, Stoffelmayr BE, Van Egeren LF, Mettler J, Maduschke K, Stanley JM, Gardiner JC. 2000. Evidence-based guidelines for teaching patient-centered interviewing. <i>Patient education and counseling</i> 39:27–36.
281 282	Stewart MA. 1995. Effective physician-patient communication and health outcomes: a review. <i>CMAJ: Canadian Medical Association Journal</i> 152:1423–1433.
283	Tor PC. 2001. New Challenges Facing the Doctor-Patient. Singapore Medical Journal 42:572–575.
284 285 286	Tsimtsiou Z, Papaharitou S, Kantziou M, Hatzichristou D, Krupat E. 2005. Patient-practitioner orientation scale (PPOS): linguistic adaptation in Greek and validation of a scale that measures attitudes towards doctor-patient relationship. <i>Primary Health Care</i> 17:190–197.
287 288	Waqas A, Zubair M, Ghulam H, Wajih Ullah M, Zubair Tariq M. 2014. Public stigma associated with mental illnesses in Pakistani university students: a cross sectional survey. <i>PeerJ</i> 2:e698.

Waqas A, Khan S, Sharif W, Khalid U, Ali A. 2015. Association of academic stress with sleeping di ffi culties in medical students of a Pakistani medical school: a cross sectional survey.

291

### 292 Supporting Information

293 S1 File. Dataset of the study.

294 S2 File. Ethical review committee certificate of approval.

295

Table-1: Demographic characteristics of the students. (N= 783)				
College				
AIMC	509 (65%)			
СМН	274 (35%)			
Gender				
Male	226 (28.9%)			
Female	557 (71.1%)			
Academic Year				
1st Year	173(22.1%)			
2 <sup>nd</sup> Year	145(18.5%)			
3 <sup>rd</sup> Year	177(22.6%)			
4 <sup>th</sup> Year	183(23.4%)			
5 <sup>th</sup> Year	105(13.4%)			
Country of Origin				
Pakistan	750 (95.8)			
Foreign	33 (4.2%)			
<b>Doctor Parents</b>				
Yes	197 (25.2%)			
No	586 (74.8%)			
Living Status				
Boarder	416 (53.1%)			
Day Scholar	367 (46.9%)			

207	Relationship			
297	Single	722 (92.2%)		
298	Married	21 (2.7%)		
299	In a Relationship	40 (5.1%)		
300	Clinical Rotation			
500	OPD	63 (8.0%)		
301	Ward	401 (51.2)		
302	Not Applicable*	319 (40.7)		
303	*Not Applicable refers to the students from 1st and 2nd academic year who do not			
505	have a clinical rotation in their curriculum.			
304				

PeerJ reviewing PDF | (2015:04:4693:0:0:NEW 18 Apr 2015)

Table-2: Multiple regression model for Total PPOS and sub-scale scores. (N= 783)								
Predictors	В	Std. Error B	Beta	P value				
<b>Mean PPOS scores</b> (Adj. R <sup>2</sup> = .063, P < .001)								
Constant	3.1	.13		< .001				
CMH vs AIMC	13	.04	12	< .001				
Pakistani vs Foreign	.36	.09	.15	< .001				
N/A vs OPD	.26	.07	.14	< .001				
N/A vs Ward	.12	.04	.12	< .001				
Boarder vs day scholar	.06	.04	.06	> .05				
Mean sharing sub-scale scores (Adj. R <sup>2</sup> = .061, P < .001)								
Constant	2.9	.15		< .001				
CMH vs AIMC	23	.05	18	< .001				
Pakistani vs Foreign	.43	.12	.14	< .001				
Study Year	.05	.02	.12	< .001				
Mean Caring sub-scale scores	$(Adj. R^2 = .028)$	3, P < .001)						
Constant	3.141	.125		.000				
Pakistani vs Foreign	.296	.099	.105	< .01				
N/A vs OPD	.275	.077	.133	< .001				
N/A vs Ward	.110	.042	.098	< .01				
Boarder/day scholar	.072	.040	.064	> .05				

<sup>\*</sup>N/A= Student of 1st and 2nd academic year who do not have any clinical rotation in their curriculum.

OPD= Out Patient Department.